

**Provincial Seminar
on
Gender Disparities in Education-Karachi
(October 22-23, 2009)**

**Organized by
Academy of Educational Planning and Management
Ministry of Education
In Collaboration with Pakistan National Commission for UNESCO
Through participation Program 2008-2009**

Compiled by

**Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi
Khawaja Sabir Hussain**

**Academy of Educational Planning and Management
Ministry of Education
Islamabad-Pakistan**

2009

© AEPAM, Islamabad. 2009

Organizers/ Focal Persons

1. Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi, Director General
2. Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director

Assisted by

1. Asif Hussain, Research Officer
2. Muhammad Sohail Ajmal, Research Assistant
3. Fazal-ur-Rehman, Assistant
4. Zahoor Shah, Stenotypist
5. Tahir Shahzad, Stenotypist

Cataloging in Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Provincial seminar on Gender Disparities in Education
(2009: Karachi)

Gender disparities in education: Proceedings of the Provincial Seminar, held at Karachi, October 22-23, 2009, in Collaboration with PNCU/ compiled by Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi and Khawaja Sabir Hussain-(AEPAM Seminar/Training Course No. 227)

1. Gender Disparities – Education - Congresses 2. Gender Equality i. Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi ii. Khawaja Sabir Hussain

376

ISBN 978-969-444-164-1

Preface

Gender disparities in education at all level is a long standing policy-issue. Since the formulation in first Education Conference 1947 all National Education Policies and Development Plans emphasized on access to education, equity and provision of quality education to all the citizens. One of the goals of Millennium Development is “to eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and in all level by 2015.” Being signatory of Education for All Dakar Conference, government of Pakistan is making every possible effort to reduce the gender disparities in education by introducing various reforms in education sector since 2000, such as Education Sector Reforms and Action Plan, Education for All. Although we made progress in achieving Millennium Development Goals, but there is still need of integrated efforts for achieving these targets.

Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM) in collaboration with Pakistan National Commission for UNESCO designed a project on “gender disparity in education” under participation program of UNESCO 2008-09. According to the agreement four Provincial and a National seminar on gender disparities in education were to be organized by AEPAM.

The first provincial seminar was held at Institute of Educational Development, The Agha Khan University, Karachi from October 22-23, 2009. In this seminar twenty nine middle level Education Managers, Planners and Policy Makers have participated. Various key policy-issues were discussed. Eminent scholars were invited to deliver lectures on the themes of the seminar to sensitize the participants regarding gender disparities.

I appreciate the efforts made by Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director and the team members for organizing this seminar at Karachi. I also appreciate the services of Mr.

Muhammad Sohail Ajmal, Research Assistant for typing and

composing this report.

Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi
Director General
AEPAM

Gender disparities in education at all levels is a long standing
Millennium Development is "to eliminate gender disparity in
primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and in all
levels by 2015". Being signatory of Education for All Dakar
Commitment Government of Pakistan is making every possible
effort to reduce the gender disparities in education by
introducing various reforms in education sector since 2002, such
as Education Sector Reforms and Action Plan, Education for All.
Although we make progress in achieving Millennium
Development Goals, but there is still need of integrated efforts
for achieving these targets.

Academy of Educational Planning and Management
(AEPAM) in collaboration with Pakistan National Commission
for UNESCO designed a project on "gender disparity in
education" under partnership program of UNESCO 2004-09.
According to the agreement four Provincial and a National
Seminar on gender disparities in education were to be organized
by AEPAM.

The first provincial seminar was held at Institute of
Educational Development, The Aga Khan University, Karachi
from October 22-23, 2009. In this seminar twenty nine middle
level education managers, planners and Policy Makers have
participated. Various key policy issues were discussed. Seminar
scholars were invited to deliver lectures on the theme of the
seminar to sensitize the participants regarding gender disparities.

I appreciate the efforts made by Khawaja Saira Hossain,
Deputy Director and the team members for organizing this
seminar at Karachi. I also appreciate the services of Mr.

LIST OF CONTENTS

S. No.	Contents	Page No.
1.	Introduction	1
2.	Objectives of the Seminar	2
3.	Themes of the Seminar	2
4.	Methodology of the Seminar	3
5.	Inaugural Session	5
6.	Gender Mainstreaming in Education Policy Making and Educational Planning	9
7.	Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities	11
8.	Group Formulation to Investigate Gender Disparities in Education District versus Provincial	13
9.	Gender Issues in Educational Planning	17
10.	Gender Disparities, Equity and Related Issues	23
11.	Presentation by the Participants/ Evaluation of the Seminar	25
12.	Concluding Ceremony	26

APPENDIX

Appendix-1	27
Appendix-2	29
Appendix-3	31
Appendix-4	33
Appendix-5	37
Appendix-6	41
Appendix-7	45

Introduction

Since the inception of Pakistan every successive government made efforts to provide universal primary education and improve quality of education in the country. All National Education Policies and Development Plans emphasized on access to education, equity and quality of education. National Education Policy 1998-2010 expressed the feature of making arrangement for reducing gender disparities at all levels. The thrust of Social Action Programs was to reduce the gender disparities emphasizing on girls education specifically in rural areas.

One of the goals of millennium development was 'to eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005 and at all levels by 2015'. Being signatory, Government of Pakistan made every possible effort to reduce gender disparities in education by introducing various reforms i.e. Education Sector Reforms (ESR), Education for All (EFA) and Action Plan but these interventions could not reduce gender disparities in education particularly in rural area.

There are many reasons of gender disparities in education which vary from province to province and district to district in Pakistan. However, the most important factors are economic, social and cultural. Research Studies conducted by various organizations identified that in Pakistan enrolment is low. High dropouts at elementary and secondary level are also found. Furthermore, girls have less access to education because of distance, security, early marriage, poverty, non-availability of physical facilities, particularly toilets for girls' students and teachers.

The modern era of information technology has turned the world into global village. The world is moving very fast due to technological advancements. Economic progress and prosperity cannot be brought in the country until and unless the gender disparities in education are removed from all levels of education. As education is the only source for human capital formation which is key for socio-economic change in any society. Human

Resource Development is pre-requisite for sustainable economic development and establishment of informed societies to take benefit of technological advancements. This can be achieved by providing equal opportunities for boys and girls participants in rural and urban areas.

Considering the gravity of this crucial issue AEPAM intended to organize provincial seminar on gender disparities in education in order to address this very critical policy issue so as strategy can be developed for reducing these disparities in education. Resultantly balance society for proper human resource development can be promoted.

Objectives of the Seminar

The following were the main objectives of the seminar

- i. To investigate gender disparity from district perspective versus provincial.
- ii. To share good experiences of gender equity in various districts of Sindh.
- iii. To discuss ways and means to institutionalize dialogue between government and civil society.
- iv. To address gender issues at various districts of Sindh.

Themes of the Seminar

The following themes were identified and presented by the resource persons.

- i. Gender Mainstreaming in Education Policy Making and Planning.
- ii. Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities.
- iii. Gender Issues in Educational Planning.
- iv. Gender Disparities, Equity and Related Issues.
- v. Group work regarding gender disparities in Sindh Province.

Methodology of the Seminar

The management of AEPAM requested Director, Institute of Educational Development (IED) Agha Khan University for provision of venue for the seminar. The Provincial Education Secretary, Government of Sindh was asked for nominations of their officers for the seminar. Furthermore, the head of other education departments were also invited for sending their nominations of officers. Detail is as under:

- i. The Chairman, Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education, Karachi.
- ii. The Managing Director, Sindh Education Foundation, Karachi.
- iii. The Managing Director, National Book Foundation, Karachi.
- iv. District Management (EDO), Karachi.
- v. The Chairman of Education Department, Karachi University, Karachi.
- vi. The Director, Institute of Educational Development, Agha Khan University, Karachi.

List of participants is attached (Appendix-1). Schedule of the seminar (Appendix-2) and list of resource persons is attached at (Appendix- 3). Pretest and Evaluation was made in order to get information about knowledge of the participants regarding gender disparities. All the resource persons provided photocopies of the papers, which were distributed among the participants. After each presentation detailed discussion was held and resource persons answered to the queries of the participants. At the end of the seminar post evaluation was made in order to evaluate the impact of the seminar. Dr. Muhammad Memon, Director Institute of Educational Development, Agha Khan University, being Chief Guest awarded certificates to the participants.

The management of ABPM requested Director, Institute of Educational Development (IED) Alga Khan University for provision of venue for the seminar. The Provincial Education Secretary, Government of Sindh was asked for nominations of their officers for the seminar. Furthermore, the head of other education departments were also invited for sending their nominations of officers. Detail is as under.

- i. The Chairman, Board of Intermediates and Secondary Education, Karachi.
- ii. The Managing Director, Sindh Education Foundation, Karachi.
- iii. The Managing Director, National Book Foundation, Karachi.
- iv. District Management (EDO), Karachi.
- v. The Chairman of Education Department, Karachi University, Karachi.
- vi. The Director, Institute of Educational Development, Alga Khan University, Karachi.

List of participants is attached (Appendix-1), Schedule of the seminar (Appendix-2) and list of resource persons is attached at Appendix-3. Format and Evaluation was made in order to get information about knowledge of the participants regarding gender disparities. All the resource persons provided photocopies of the papers, which were distributed among the participants. After each presentation detailed discussion was held and resource persons answered to the queries of the participants. At the end of the seminar post evaluation was made in order to evaluate the impact of the seminar. Dr. Muhammad Noman, Director Institute of Educational Development, Alga Khan University, being Chief Guest awarded certificates to the participants.

Proceedings of the Seminar (October 22, 2009)

Inaugural Session



The Inaugural session of the Seminar on Gender Disparities in Education took place in Institute of Educational Development, Agha Khan University Karachi on October 22, 2009. The session was started with the recitation of the Holy Quran. Then brief introduction of the participants was made with the Chief Guest Dr. Dilshad Ashraf, Head of Research Unit of Institute of Educational Development. Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director/ Project Coordinator, AEPAM welcomed the participants of the seminar. He briefly described the objectives/themes of the seminar and invited the chief guest to address the participants.

Dr. Dilshad Ashraf started her address with the name of Allah. She appreciated the efforts made by the Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM) for providing assistance to the Ministry of Education in policy formulation, planning, implementation, monitoring and supporting educational reforms in the country.

She made a quick review of the National education policies and related documents. She was of the view that “gradual shift in the nature of emphasis on female education in education policies over the years was found as earlier Education Policies considered value of educating female as instrumental in improving their efficiency for fulfilling familial responsibilities and to prepare them for traditionally female professions (e.g. teaching), the later Education policies since 1970 (e.g. National Education Policy 1998-2010) laid greater emphasis on education as right of all- a gender encompassing approach.”

She further said that this consistent emphasis on female participation in education and to eliminate equally consistent gender disparities in education have led to launch projects which had a declared aim to address the issue of lesser female participation in education which include Education Sector Reforms, Social Action Program Northern Area Education Project.

She said that National Education Policy 2009 document reflects the issue general inequity “It is common knowledge, as well as a proven outcome of many studies that discrimination exists in the education system in various forms. The inequity has been the result of poor implementation and social customs. Over the years, little attention has been paid to rectify the situation.”

Dr. Dilshad said that “the issue of equity runs through the entire education system and has serious implications for sustainable and equitable development in the country. Unless the issue is seriously recognized and assessed in all its manifestations, a realistic policy to relieve the situation will not evolve”.

She highlighted that this seminar presents an opportunity to recognize and assess the issue of gender disparity with a micro lens. “We all understand that social fabric of our society is diverse and varies from context to context which invariably leads to different situation as far as male and female access to and participation in education is concerned.”

She was of the view that we all sitting here today to understand that process of initiating change has to be multidimensional. To tackle the issue of gender disparities in education we need to review that how our policy, practices of educational management, teaching and learning at grassroots have capacity and are prepared to contribute and accommodate change in education system.

At the end, she thanked the management of AEPAM for organizing seminar in Institute of Educational Development the Agha Khan University, Karachi.

But was of the view that we all think here today is



multidimensional. To tackle the issue of gender disparities in education we need to review the role of policy, practices of educational management, teaching and learning in schools, their capacity and are prepared to contribute and accommodate change in education system.

At the end, she thanked the management of AEFAN for organizing seminar in Institute of Educational Development the Aga Khan University, Karachi.

Gender Mainstreaming in Education, Policy Making and Educational Planning

Prof. Dr. Rashida Qureshi
IED, Agha Khan University
Karachi

The first session of the seminar was taken by Dr. Rashida Qureshi, IED-AKU. She explained the brief history of gender disparities in education and highlighted the nature of gender mainstreaming. She also elaborated the meaning of gender mainstreaming and explained the importance of gender mainstreaming in policy making. Dr. Rashida highlighted the significance of gender mainstreaming. She was of the view that throughout the world, women suffer disadvantage and the differences varies from country to country and from region to region, because disadvantage is caused by cultural, historical and social factors. She further said that “gender mainstreaming advances women to reach their developmental potential since programs and policies will be analyzed from the perspectives of men and women.”

She said that “the recognizing gender equality is critical to the achievement of other development goals including poverty reduction, gender mainstreaming minimizes negative impacts by ensuring that need and concerns are addressed and it also ensures that development programs and policies are people centered and sustain the effects of development.” She further explained that limited and uncoordinated institutional mechanism for gender mainstreaming at national level are main hindrance in the way of gender mainstreaming. Lack of gender disaggregated data in most of the government sectors and department such as health and education are among the hindering factor in gender mainstreaming.”

She was of the view that availability of gender disaggregated data in some sectors and collaborative efforts between

government and NGOs working towards improving the interpretation of various policies including education can provide

opportunities for gender mainstreaming. Capacity/skills building of staff from sectors/programs/ projects can be helpful in gender mainstreaming, she concluded.

(H), Azha Khan University
Lahore

The first session of the seminar was taken by Dr. Rashida Qureshi, HED-ARU. She explained the brief history of gender disparities in education and highlighted the status of gender mainstreaming. She also elaborated the meaning of gender mainstreaming and explained the importance of gender mainstreaming in policy making. Dr. Rashida highlighted the significance of gender mainstreaming. She was of the view that throughout the world women suffer disadvantage and the differences vary from country to country and from region to region because disadvantage is caused by cultural, historical and social factors. She further said that "gender mainstreaming advances women to reach their developmental potential since programs and policies will be analyzed from the perspective of men and women."

She said that "the recognizing gender equality is critical to the achievement of other development goals including poverty reduction. Gender mainstreaming minimizes negative impacts by ensuring the needs and concerns are addressed and it also ensures that development programs and policies are people centered and sustain the effects of development." She further explained that "gender and non-gendered institutional mechanisms for gender mainstreaming at national level are main hindrance in the way of gender mainstreaming. Lack of gender disaggregated data is main hindrance in the government sectors and departments such as health and education are among the hindrance factors in gender mainstreaming."

She was of the view that availability of gender disaggregated data in some sectors and collaborative efforts between

Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities

Dr. Rashida Qureshi

IED, Agha Khan University
Karachi

The second session of the seminar was also taken by Dr. Rashida Qureshi, IED, AKU. She started her lecture with the following points:

- International commitments
- Gender equality in education
- How to assess the role of educational institutions
- Strategies for reducing disparities

Millennium Development Goals

- MDG 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education
- MDG 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women

Education for All Goals

She also highlighted the goals of Education for All.

- Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- Achieving a 50 percent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
- Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.

She said that “gender equality in education is also one of the

MDG and EFA commitments”. She raised various questions about the role of educational institutions in gender equality in education.

- International commitments
- Gender equality in education
- How to assess the role of educational institutions
- Strategies for reducing disparities

Millennium Development Goals

- MDG 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women
- MDG 5: Achieve Universal Primary Education

Education for All Goals

She also highlighted the goals of Education for All.

- Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete low and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- Achieving a 50 percent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
- Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring full, fair and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.

Group Formulation to Investigate Gender Disparities in Education District versus Provincial

Khawaja Sabir Hussain

Deputy Director/ Project Coordinator
AEPAM

The third session was taken by Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director/Project Coordinator, AEPAM. He divided participants into three groups. The detail of these groups is as follows:

Group – A

Assignment: Gender disparities in elementary education: issues, challenges and solutions (Appendix-4)

Participants:

- Asifa Sohail
- Arshad Baig
- Farzana Naqvi
- Haleema Younus
- Rubina Rehman
- Shamim Akhtar
- Syed Taj Muhammad Shah
- Tayyaba Zarif
- Dr. Almina Pardhan
- Mrza Irshad Abbasi
- Aziz-u-Nis

Group – B

Assignment: Causes of gender disparities in Elementary education (Appendix-5)

Participants:

- Kashif Akhtar
- Suraiya Yousufi
- Zakia Sultana
- Syed Maqbol Ali
- Farida Ismat
- Rashida Begum
- Asif Shehzad
- Muhammad Babur
- Sabira Nighat Zaidi
- Imtiaz Ahmad

Group – C

Assignment: Causes of gender disparities in education
(Appendix-6)

Participants:

- Anjum Afshan
- Abdul Rauf Kandhro
- Rehana Naeem
- Naheed Kauser
- Kausar Waqar
- Mussarat Bachani
- G.M. Dhakan
- Samina Rehman
- Naeem Zaidi

After group formulation, the resource person explained the disparities in GER at primary level.

REGION/ PROVINCE		GER PRIMARY (AGE-5-9)				
		2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	
Pakistan	Male	94	94	99	97	
	Female	77	80	81	83	
	Both	86	87	91	91	
	Rural	79	80	84	83	
	Urban	104	106	106	106	
	GPI	0.82	0.85	0.82	0.86	
Sindh	Male	84	88	88	87	
	Female	65	71	68	72	
	Both	75	80	79	80	
		GPI	0.77	0.81	0.77	0.83

Source: Economic Survey 2004-05, 2006-07

The participants were requested to identify reasons of gender disparities in education in Sindh province.

The resource person also explained gender disparities in NER at primary level

REGION/ PROVINCE		NER PRIMARY (AGE-5-9)			
		2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08
Pakistan	Male	56	56	60	59
	Female	48	48	51	52
	Both	52	53	56	55
	Rural	48	47	52	51
	Urban	64	65	66	66
		GPI	0.86	0.86	0.85
Sindh	Male	53	54	56	55
	Female	42	47	43	46
	Both	48	50	50	51
		GPI	0.79	0.87	0.77

Source: Economic Survey of Pakistan 2004-05 to 2007-08

He further requested the participants to prepare group report

on the causes of disparities in NER at primary level.

Points for Group Discussion

He further provided following points for discussion.

- Gender disparities in education due to that less number of girls than boys are enrolled at each level of education Why?
- Gender disparity is more pronounced in rural than in urban areas Why?
- Shortage of girls' schools, lack of facilities (boundary wall, toilets, etc.) and teacher absenteeism particularly in rural area Why?
- Non-functional schools in Sindh province Why?
- Non-availability of female teachers in rural areas for recruitment on merit basis.
- Security of girls students and female teachers.
- Distance from home to school.

The groups were given fruit for thought, what are the causes of gender disparities in various districts of Sindh province, common issues, challenges and solution of the problems. Each group was supposed to prepare group report on various issues of gender disparities in education.

**Proceedings of the Seminar
(October 23, 2009)
Gender Issues in Education Planning**



Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi
Director General
AEPAM, Islamabad

The first session of the second day was taken by Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi, Director General, AEPAM. She started her lecture by asking various questions on gender disparities in education by the participants. She also explained the following concepts related with gender.

Gender Equality in Education

Ensuring gender equality for girls and boys means that they have equal opportunities to enter school, as well as to participate in, and benefit from the range of subjects or other learning experiences offered in classrooms and schools. Through gender-sensitive curricula, learning materials, and teaching-learning processes, girls and boys become equally equipped with the life skills and attitudes that they will need to achieve their fullest potential, within and outside of the educational system, regardless of their sex.

The National Education Policy (1998-2010)

The National Education Policy (1998-2010) emphasized to achieve universal primary education and increase in participation rate enhancement of retention and completion of primary education cycle. To achieve these, it includes the following policy provisions, relevant to improving female education:

Focus Area	Relevance to Gender Disparity
Disparities and imbalances of all types shall be eliminated so as to promote equity.	This focuses mainly on gender, location (urban-rural) and regional disparities.
Access to elementary education shall be increased through effective and optimum utilization of existing facilities and services as well as provision of new facilities and services.	Improvement in access to education would help to reduce gender disparities at elementary level.
Quality of elementary education shall be improved with improvements in teachers' training and competence.	Provision training of female teachers can help to promote the quality of girls' education.
Non-formal system shall be adopted as complementary to formal system.	Non-formal system in Pakistan is based on the notion of providing education (and literacy) mostly to out-of-school girls and women living in far and remote areas where there are no formal education facilities for girls.

The National Education Policy (1998-2010) addressed the major issues:

- it seeks to correct the imbalances (between genders, locations and provinces) in education
- promote equity among various segments of society.
- lack of access, especially of girls, through formal and non-formal systems
- non-government and private schooling systems.
- aims at enhancing access and quality of education through improvement in teachers' training and competence.

Education Sector Reforms (2001-05)

A comprehensive package of educational reforms with medium term targets introduced by the government was the Education Sector Reforms (ESR) Action Plan for 2001-2005. The ESR was developed by the Ministry of Education to be a long-term framework of reforms linked to 'Education for All' goals through 2015, with three year action plan for 2001-04 designed to reduce the gap in imbalances of service delivery. The main features of ESR's reform agenda was to have a strategy for improving education, including all areas of EFA and entailing legislative, administrative and financial actions at all levels.

The ESR Action Plan targets were aligned to national reforms and priorities. The ESR targets focused on sub-sectors:

- National literacy campaign—Integrated approach to poverty reduction
- Universal primary/elementary education
- Improving the quality of education: curriculum reform, text book, teacher education and training, examination reforms and assessment
- Technical stream at secondary level and polytechnics/mono-technics at district level
- Higher education sector
- Public private partnership

The above mentioned thrust areas emphasized for providing educational opportunity to boys and girls across the country. The further specific areas related to gender disparities are given below:

Focus Area	Relevance to Gender Disparity
Universalization of primary education and adult literacy.	This implies complete elimination of gender disparities in education.
Improvement in the quality of education through better teachers, upgraded training options, curriculum and textbook reforms, and competency based examination system.	This focused to increase in enrollment; reducing drop-out and improve learning achievements for both girls and boys.
Introducing a third stream of gender and area specific technical and vocational education at secondary level with innovative approaches for students' counseling.	The focused was on female employment and empowerment.
Setting up mono-technique/polytechnics at district and tehsil levels.	The focused to improve technical skills among girls/women.

National Education Policy 2009

The Government of Pakistan, the Ministry of Education has recently announced National Education Policy 2009. This policy commits to provide education facility to all citizens of the country. The specific areas addressed are given below:

Focus Area/vision	Relevance to Gender Disparity
<p>Ministry of Education adopted vision</p> <p>Our education system must provide quality education to our children and youth to enable them to realize their individual potential and contribute to development of society and nation, creating a sense of Pakistani nationhood, the concepts of tolerance, social justice, democracy, their regional and local culture and history based on</p>	<p>Gender neutral vision has been adopted so that equal opportunities can be provided to the citizens.</p>

the basic ideology enunciated in the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.	
Aim and Objectives	
To widen access to education for all and to improve the quality of education, particularly in its dimension of being relevant to the needs of the economy.	This objective also emphasized on access to Education For All.
To equalize access to education through provision of special facilities for girls and boys alike, under-privileged/marginalized groups and handicapped children and adults.	This focuses on equal access to boys and girls and other disparities.
To eradicate illiteracy within the shortest possible time through universalizing of quality elementary education and enables them to make informed choices in life.	This focuses on universal elementary education. The ultimate goal is to provide equal opportunities to the citizens.

The lecture was ended with thanks.

Gender Disparities, Equity and Related Issues



Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi
Director General, AEPAM

The second session was also taken by Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi, Director General AEPAM. She started her lecture by explaining the concept of gender. She explained that Gender refers to the social roles, responsibilities and behavior created in our families, our societies and our cultures. The concept of gender also includes the expectations held about the characteristics, aptitudes and likely behavior of both women and men.”

Dr. Jatoi was of the view that “these roles and expectations are learnt and passed on from one generation to the next. It is not biologically predetermined, nor is it fixed forever- they can be changed to achieve equity and equality for both women and men.”

She further explained gender analysis, that it is the collection and analysis of sex-disaggregated information. Men and women both perform different roles. This leads to women and men having different experience, knowledge, talents and needs. Gender analysis explores these differences. Policies, programs and projects can identify and deal with the different needs of men and women. Gender analysis also facilitates the strategic use of distinct knowledge and skills possessed by women and men.”

She was of the opinion that “Gender Equality means that women and men have equal conditions for realizing their full human potentials and for contributing to, and benefiting from

economic, social, cultural and political development; as an outcome.”

She said that “gender equality is therefore the equal valuing by society of the similarities and the differences of men and women, and the roles they play. It is based on women and men being full partners in homes communities and societies”.

Dr. Haroona also elaborated the gender equity. She highlighted that gender equity is the process of being fair to men and women. To ensure fairness, measures must often be put in place to compensate for the historical and social disadvantages that prevent women and men from operating on a level playing field. Equity is a means. Equality and equitable outcome are the results.”

She also shared experiences of her life on designing various policy regarding gender disparities in education.

Presentations by the Participants/ Evaluation of the Seminar

Khawaja Sabir Hussain

Deputy Director/ Project Coordinator
AEPAM, Islamabad

The final session of the seminar was taken by Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director/ Project Coordinator. He invited the group leaders for the presentation of their group reports. The following were the group assignments.

Group – A

Assignment: Gender disparities in elementary education: issues, challenges and solutions (Appendix-4)

After the presentation participants were invited for raising questions regarding the presentation. A number of participants raised various questions which were answered by the group leader. This participation was ended with clapping of the participants.

Group – B

Assignment: Causes of gender disparities in Elementary education (Appendix-5)

The presentation of Group-B was made by the group leader. After the presentation participants were invited for questions regarding the presentation. A number of participants raised various questions which were answered by the group leader. This session was also ended with clapping of the participants.

Group – C

Assignment: Causes of gender disparities in education (Appendix-6)

After the presentation participants were invited for questions

regarding the presentation. A number of participants raised various questions which were answered by the group leader.

The lecture was ended with thanks.

Concluding Ceremony



Dr. Muhammad Memon, Director, Institute of Educational Development, Agha Khan University, Karachi was the Chief Guest of the concluding ceremony. He distributed participation certificates among the participants. In the concluding remarks, Dr. Memon he appreciated the efforts being made by the management of AEPAM for highlighting the issue of gender disparities in education. He was of the view that gender disparities in education is an important policy issue and it must be addressed on priority basis. He said that reasons for gender disparities in education are complex and vary from province to province and districts to districts in Pakistan but they often persist owing to the poor economic condition and social structure across the country.

(Appendix-1)

List of Participants

1. Ms. Haleema Younus, Lecturer, AKU, Karachi
2. Dr. Almina Perdhan, Assistant Professor, AKU-IED, Karachi
3. Dr. Kauser Waqar, Senior Instructor, AKU-IED, Karachi
4. Mr. Muhammad Babur, Instructor, Karachi
5. Mr. Ghulam Muhammad Dhakan, Resident Director, NBF, Karachi
6. Syed Maqbool Ali, Manager, NBF, Karachi
7. Ms. Samina Rahman, Prof. Reader, NBF, Karachi
8. Mrs. Irshad Abbasi, Director, NBF, Karachi
9. Mr. Abdul Rauf Kandhro, DyDEO (E), EDO Office, Karachi
10. Mirza Arshad Baig, Headmaster, Education Department, Karachi
11. Ms. Sabra Nickhat Zaidi, Headmistress, EDO office, Karachi
12. Mr. Nasim Zaidi, Headmaster, Education Department, Karachi
13. Ms. Farzana Naqvi, Headmistress, Education Department, Karachi
14. Ms. Farida Ismat, Headmistress, Education Department, Karachi
15. Ms. Zakia Sultana, Headmistress, Education Department, Karachi
16. Ms. Shamim Akhtar, Headmistress, Education Department, Karachi
17. Ms. Tayyab Zarif, Training & Development Associate, SEF, Karachi
18. Ms. Musarat Zulfiqar Bachani, Asst. Program, SEF, Karachi
19. Mr. Asif Shahzad, Program Manager, CSSP/SEF, Karachi
20. Mrs. Anjum Afshan, Principal & Member, KBSE, Karachi
21. Ms. Naheed Kausar, ADOE (F), Education Department, Karachi
22. Ms. Suraiya Yousafi, Head mistress, Education Department, Karachi
23. Mrs. Rehana Naeem, HST, Education Department, Karachi

24. Mr. Kashif Akhtar, ADOE, Education Department, Karachi

25. Mrs. Rashida Begum, Headmistress, Education Department, Karachi

26. Syed Taj Muhammad Shah, ADEO, Education Department, Karachi

27. Ms. Asifa Sohail, Instructor, AKU, Karachi

28. Ms. Aziz un Nisa, Lecturer, Education Department, Karachi

29. Mr. Imtiaz Ahmed, Lecturer, Education Department, Karachi

(Appendix-2)

Two Days Seminar On
“GENDER DISPARITIES IN EDUCATION”

October 22-23, 2009

Karachi

Day/Date	9:00 a.m. – 10:30 a.m.		11:00 a.m. – 12:15 p.m.	12:15 p.m – 01:30 p.m.		02:30 p.m. – 03:45 p.m.
October 22, 2009 Thursday	Inauguration: Registration, Pre test, Introduction and Course Objectives	Tea Break: 10:30 – 11:00 a.m.	Gender Mainstreaming in Education Policy making and Planning	Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities	Prayer and Lunch: 01:30 – 02:30 p.m.	Group Work Distt. Vs Provincial (in various districts of Sindh)
October 23, 2009 Friday	Gender Issues in Educational Planning		Gender Disparities, Equity and Related Issues	Presentations by the Participants		Concluding Ceremony

Two Days Seminar On
LEARNING DISPARITIES IN EDUCATION
October 22-23, 2008
Kurachi
2008

10:30 am - 12:00 pm	Lunch and Prayers: 12:30 - 1:30 pm	12:15 pm - 1:30 pm	1:45 pm - 3:15 pm	Tea break: 3:30 - 4:00 pm	4:15 pm - 5:30 pm
2:00 pm - 3:30 pm 3:45 pm - 5:00 pm 5:15 pm - 6:30 pm 6:45 pm - 8:00 pm		2:00 pm - 3:30 pm 3:45 pm - 5:00 pm 5:15 pm - 6:30 pm 6:45 pm - 8:00 pm	2:00 pm - 3:30 pm 3:45 pm - 5:00 pm 5:15 pm - 6:30 pm 6:45 pm - 8:00 pm		2:00 pm - 3:30 pm 3:45 pm - 5:00 pm 5:15 pm - 6:30 pm 6:45 pm - 8:00 pm

(Appendix-3)

List of Resource Persons

1. Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatui, Director General, AEPAM, Islamabad
2. Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director/Project Coordinator, Islamabad
3. Dr. Rashida Qureshi, Assistant Professor, IED, The Agha Khan University, Karachi.

List of Resource Persons

1. Prof. Dr. Hassan Javed, Director General, ARPAJ, Islamabad.
2. Khwaja Saad Hassan, Deputy Director-General, Islamabad.
3. Dr. Khalida Qureshi, Assistant Professor, IED, The Open University, Karachi.

(Appendix-4)

**Gender Disparities in Elementary Education:
Issues, Challenges and Solutions**

Group- A

Asifa Sohail (Group Leader)

Arshad Baig

Farzana Naqvi

Haleema Younus

Rubina Rehman

Shamim Akhtar

Syed Taj Muhammad Shah

Tayyaba Zarif

Dr. Almina Pardhan

Mrza Irshad Abbasi

Aziz-u-Nisa

**Provincial Seminar on
“Gender Disparities in Education”
IED, The Agha Khan University
Karachi**

Common Issues

- Uneducated/ignorant parents
- Social restrictions
- Distant schools
- Security issues
- Education expenses
- Religious misinterpretations
- Commutation
- Poverty

Social Restrictions and Religious Misinterpretations

i. Role of community leaders and pesh-imams

As study has identified that where pesh-imam is against education the attendance in school is very low pesh-imams are found positive about education but only for boys.

Districts of Sindh under discussion

Karachi
Mirpur Khas
Umar Kot
Sanghar
Tharparkar

Uneducated/Ignorant Parents

- Report of CIEF International 1997
- Parental education is key factor in low school attendance of female child
- 85% of mothers in rural areas had less than four years of education
- Rural girls aged 9-12 years are bound to stay at home and help the mother in domestic work.

Education Expenses

- Major annual expenses textbooks, stationary and uniform
- Full set of text books is one of the reasons for drop out of girls from school
- Government of Sindh has taken as Policy about uniform which is no more obligating. Moreover in 63% of rural school children still wear uniform (CIET International, 1997)

Challenges

- Lack of awareness about the value of education
- Conservative behavior of society/community. Parents are not willing to send their girls to school after Grade 1-2
- Non-availability of local female teachers
- Cost of sending girls to schools is higher than keeping them at home for assisting parents at their work
- Teachers' Absenteeism

Solutions

- To integrate vocational training within the curriculum
- To have evening schools instead of morning
- To revise academic calendar in terms of exams and syllabus
- To have awareness programs through visiting rural areas and through media

- * Major annual expenses: textbooks, stationery and uniform
- * Full set of text books is one of the reasons for drop out of girls from school
- * Government of India has taken as Policy about uniform which is no more obligating. Moreover in 83% of rural school children still wear uniforms (CIET International, 1997)

Challenges

- * Lack of awareness about the value of education
- * Conservative behavior of society/community. Parents are not willing to send their girls to school after Grade 1-2
- * Non-availability of local female teachers
- * Cost of sending girls to schools is higher than keeping them at home for sending parents at their work
- * Teachers' Absenteeism

Solutions

- * To integrate vocational training within the curriculum
- * To have evening schools instead of morning
- * To revise academic calendar in terms of exams and syllabus
- * To have awareness programs through visiting rural areas and through media

(Appendix-5)

Causes of Gender Disparities in Elementary Education

Year	Literacy Rate
1973	30.2%
1981	31.0%
1992	42.2%
2008	57.7%

Group- B

Kashif Akhtar

Suraiya Yousufi (Group Leader)

Zakia Sultana

Syed Maqbol Ali

Farida Ismat

Rashida Begum

Asif Shehzad

Muhammad Babur

Sabira Nighat Zaidi

Imtiaz Ahmad

Provincial Seminar on
“Gender Disparities in Education”
IED, The Agha Khan University
Karachi

Introduction

There are 23 districts in Sindh Province. Literacy rate in Sindh Province is progressing slowly. Table given below shows the literacy rate in Sindh.

Year	Literacy Rate
1972	30.2%
1981	31.05%
1998	45.29%
2008	57.7%

Sources: (8) (9) wikipedia

Education sector in Pakistan is facing problem regarding universal primary education like other developing countries.

Elementary education is a very important part of the entire structure of education. At this stage the child starts going to a formal institution. This level of education provides the foundation of the child's physical, mental, emotional intellectual and social development. Government of Pakistan has introduced Reforms and has taken various initiatives to increase enrolment of the girl child. Hence, causes of low enrolment are manifold. few of them are as follows:

1. **Dull curricula:** The curricula is not designed according to the psychological and sociological needs of the children. It does not attract them to school.
2. **Lack of well-trained teachers:** Mostly there are shortage of trained teachers in primary schools specially in the rural areas.
3. **Poverty or poor condition of parents:** It is not enough that primary education is made free because the masses are poor. They cannot afford even afford writing materials, nutritious food etc.

4. ***Helping hands at home:*** Many girls are not sent to school, because of the social stigma. They are required at home to look after young brothers and sisters. The girls are withdrawn from school.
5. ***Lack of proper infrastructure:*** Primary schools especially in rural areas do not have proper building, furniture and equipments. In some places the schools are held in tents or in very poor conditioned buildings. Even some of the schools do not have even the black boards and chalks.
6. ***Girls' Security:*** Distance from home to school is long, which creates security problems for girls students.
7. ***Poor Administration:*** Most of the primary schools are victims of poor administration. District management officers do not have sufficient facilities to supervise the school. Consequently teacher's absenteeism is a common problem in rural area.
8. Quality of elementary education is not up to the mark.
9. Geographical Condition: Unfavorable geographical conditions are also one of the cause of drop out.
10. Lack of coordination between school and home (teachers and parents).
11. Early Marriages.

Above mentioned causes are main problems of low enrolment of the girl child in the province of Sindh.

4. Helping hands at home: Many girls are not sent to school.

Because of the social stigma, they are refused a home to look after young brothers and sisters. The girls are withdrawn from school.

5. Lack of proper infrastructure: Primary schools especially in rural areas do not have proper building, furniture and equipment. In some places the schools are held in tents or in very poor conditioned buildings. Even some of the schools do not have even the black boards and desks.

6. Child's Journey: Distance from home to school is long, which creates security problems for girls students.

7. Poor Administration: Most of the primary schools are victims of poor administration. District management officers do not have sufficient facilities to supervise the school. Consequently teacher's absenteeism is a common problem in rural area.

8. Quality of elementary education is not up to the mark.

9. Geographical Condition (topographic-geographical conditions are sources of the cause of drop out.

10. Lack of coordination between school and home (teacher and parents).

11. Early Marriage.

Above mentioned causes are main problems of low enrolment of the girl child in the province of Jharkhand.

(Appendix-6)

Causes of Gender Disparities in Education

Group- C

Anjum Afshan (Group Leader)

Abdul Rauf Kandhro

Rehana Naeem

Naheed Kauser

Kausar Waqar

Mussarat Bachani

G.M. Dhakan

Samina Rehman

Naeem Zaidi

**Provincial Seminar on
“Gender Disparities in Education”
IED, The Agha Khan University
Karachi**

A 2007 UNESCO and UNICEF report addressed the issue of

education from a rights-based approach. Three interrelated rights were specified and must be addressed in concert in order to provide education for all:

- **The right of access to education** – Education must be available for, accessible to and inclusive of all children.
- **The right to quality education** --- Education needs to be child-centered, relevant and embrace a broad curriculum, and be appropriately resourced and be monitored.
- **The right to respect within the learning environment** Education must be provided in a way that is consistent with human rights, equal respect for culture, religion and language and free from all forms of violence.

Causes of low literacy rate of girls in various districts of Sindh

The low enrollment rates at the primary level. Consequently wide gender disparities exist. There are many reasons, some of them are as under:

- lack of trained teachers
- deficiency of proper teaching materials
- poor physical infrastructure of schools indicate the poor performance of this sector.
- More than 5.5 million primary school age children (5-9) are out of schools due to poor socio economic background of children.
- Approximately 45% drop out at the primary level.
- Teacher absenteeism is a common practice in schools especially in the rural areas.
- Instructional supervision is weak at the elementary level.
- About one-fourth of primary school teachers are untrained and the present training infrastructure does not appear to improve the quality of instruction.

- Learning materials are inadequate and of poor quality. Teaching methods are hard and uncongenial for learning and motivating pupils.
- Schools are far away from their homes and transport is not available.
- Girls are supposed to work with mothers at homes.
- Girls don't have decision making opportunities.
- Due to lack of basic facilities such as boundary walls toilets and supply of water in primary and elementary schools parents think that their children especially girls are unsafe.
- Curriculum doesn't address their needs
- Negative parental attitudes towards education. Particularly girl's education.
- Investment son instead of girl child.

Solutions

- School programs must consider social, economic and cultural barriers. Flexible school schedules can be allowed girls to attend schools.
- Infrastructure should be improved and basic facilities should be provided in all the schools.
- Awareness programs for parents can be launched through SMCs
- Trained female teachers should be appointed
- Quality of teaching should be improved through updated trainings programs.
- Need base and flexible curricula should be implemented.
- School buildings should be constructed in each locality so that accessibility to all girls child can be enhanced.

Learning materials are developed and of high quality



- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available
- I would like to see more of this type of material available

Conclusion

- School programs that consider social, emotional, and physical wellness provide a holistic approach to learning and are more effective than traditional academic-only programs.
- Instruments should be designed and used to measure social, emotional, and physical wellness in all the schools.
- A common program for parents can be developed through schools.
- Family-based teachers should be supported.
- Types of testing should be improved through digital learning programs.
- Parent and teacher training should be implemented.
- A social hierarchy should be supported in each school to the possibility in all the schools can be enhanced.

Evaluation of Seminar

The evaluation was administered before starting session of the seminar. Factors were administered before starting session of the seminar and post test was administered before the concluding session. The results are presented in table 1.

Table 1: Pre and Post test Comparative Analysis

Topic	Pre-Test Results (Mean ± SD)				Post-Test Results (Mean ± SD)			
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Gender Disparities in Education	1.5	2.0	2.5	3.0	2.5	3.0	3.5	4.0
Gender Disparities in Health	1.0	1.5	2.0	2.5	2.0	2.5	3.0	3.5
Gender Disparities in Employment	1.0	1.5	2.0	2.5	2.0	2.5	3.0	3.5
Gender Disparities in Political Participation	1.0	1.5	2.0	2.5	2.0	2.5	3.0	3.5

The Table 1 shows the 200 participants had moderate knowledge about gender issues whereas they showed 400 participants had moderate and 400 participants had high knowledge about gender issues. The 200 participants had moderate knowledge which increased up to 400 participants and high knowledge regarding gender issues. Similarly 200 participants had moderate knowledge about gender issues for various gender dimensions whereas the 400 participants had high knowledge in the regard. As for as gender mainstreaming is concerned only 100 participants had an average knowledge whereas 300 participants had an average knowledge.

**Provincial Seminar on
"Gender Disparities in Education"
IED, The Agha Khan University
Karachi**

Evaluation of Seminar

The evaluation of the seminar was conducted at the end of seminar. Pretest was administered before starting session of the seminar and post test was administered before the concluding session. The results are presented in table 1.

Table 1: Pre and Post test Comparative Analysis

Topics	How much knowledge do you have About Gender Disparity				How much knowledge do you have after attending this Seminar			
	<i>No</i>	<i>Low</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>High</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Low</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>High</i>
Gender Issues in Educational Planning	65%	3%	35%	-	-	7%	48%	45%
Gender Disparities, Equity and Related issues	31%	28%	33%	7%	-	14%	31%	55%
Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities	10%	55%	28%	-	-	31%	21%	48%
Gender Mainstreaming in Education Policy making and Planning	21%	55%	17%	-	-	24%	35%	41%

The Table 1 shows that 35% participants had moderate knowledge about gender issues whereas after attending the seminar 48% participants had moderate and 45% participants had high knowledge about gender issues. 33% participant had moderate knowledge which increased upto 31% moderate and 55% participants had high knowledge regarding gender disparities. Similarly 28% participant had moderate knowledge about strategies for reducing gender disparities, whereas after attending the seminar 48% had high knowledge in this regard. As far as gender mainstreaming is concerned only 17% participants had moderate knowledge before seminar, whereas after attending seminar 41% and 35% had high and moderate knowledge about this concept respectively.

Evaluation of the Resource Person

The evaluation of the resource person was conducted. The results are presented in table 2.

Table 2: Evaluation of Resource Person

Topics & Resource Persons	Relevance of Topic (Please Tick)			Presentation (Please Tick)			Material Presented (Please Tick)		
	Most %	Relevant %	Irrelevant %	Very Good %	Good %	Satisfactory %	Very Good %	Good %	Satisfactory %
Gender Issues in Educational Planning (Prof. Dr. Haroon)	55	45	-	55	45	-	38	31	31
Gender Disparities, Equity and Related Issues (Prof. Dr. Haroona Jatoi)	55	45	-	52	48	-	21	31	48
Strategies for Reducing Gender Disparities (Dr. Rashida Qureshi)	55	45	-	48	52	-	28	31	41
Gender Mainstreaming in Education Policy Making and Planning (Dr. Rashida Qureshi)	55	45	-	48	52	-	38	34	28

Table 2 illustrate that 55% participants had opinion that Dr. Haroona Jatoi presented most relevant topic; 55% and 38% participants were of the view that her presentation and material was very good respectively. As regard gender disparities in view of the 55%, 52% and 21% of the participants that she presented most relevant topic, her presentation was very good and material was also very good respectively. Similarly 55% participant had opinion that topics of Dr. Rashida, were most relevant and she presented in very good manner and her material was also very good.

Table 3: Description of Seminar

Description	Very relevant	Relevant	Partially relevant
Was the seminar relevant to your professional needs?	45%	55%	-

The table 3 indicates that 45% participants were of the view that description of the seminar was very relevant to their professional needs. Whereas 55% participants were of the opinion that the seminar was relevant to their professional needs.

Table 4: Expectation about Seminar

Description	Your expectations	Better than expectations	Short of expectations
Was the Seminar up to the expectation.	55%	31%	14%

The table 4 shows that 55% participants had opinion that the seminar was up to their expectations, while 31% participants were of the view that the seminar was better than their expectations.

Table 5: Design and sequence of seminar

Description	Fully consistent	Partially consistent	Not consistent
Was the seminar well designed and in logical sequence	55%	45%	-

Table 5 shows that 55% participants were of the opinion that seminar was well designed in logical sequence. Whereas 45% participants were of the view that the seminar was partially consistent.

Table 6: Contents of Seminar

Description	Fully relevant	Partially relevant	Not relevant
The contents of the seminar properly justified	69%	31%	-

Table 6 indicates that 69% participants had opinion that the seminar was fully relevant and the contents of the seminar were properly justified according to their professional needs whereas 31% participants were of the view that it was partially relevant to their professional needs.

Table 7: Objectives of seminar

Description	Full achieved	Partially achieved	Not achieved
After attending this seminar, do you think that the objectives were achieved.	80%	20%	-

The table 7 shows that 80% participants were of the opinion that the objectives of seminar were fully achieved whereas 20% participants were of the view that the objectives were partially achieved.

Table 8: Teaching Method

Description	Yes	No
Approach was practical oriented	72%	28%

Table 8 shows that 72% participants were of the opinion that approach of the seminar was practical oriented, whereas 28% participants opposed this view.

Table 9: Concepts and Methodology

Description	Yes	No
Concepts and methodology based on illustrations	69%	31%

Table 9 indicates that 69% participants were of the view that concepts and methodology of the seminar was based on illustration, whereas 31% participants were of the opinion that the concepts and methodology of the seminar was not based on illustrations.

Table 10: Themes of seminar

Description	Very relevant	Relevant	Partially relevant
Were the themes presented in the seminar relevant to problems?	52%	34%	14%

Table 10 shows that 52% participants had opinion that themes presented in the seminar were very relevant to their problems, 34% participants were of the view that themes presented in the seminar were relevant, whereas 14% participants were of the opinion that the themes presented in the seminar were partially relevant to their problems.

Table 11: Motivational level

Description	Very highly interactive	Highly interactive	Average
The motivational level to participate during seminar	31%	52%	17%

Table 11 shows that 31% participants were of the opinion that motivational level to participate was very highly interactive, while 52% participants had opinion that it was highly interactive.

Table 12: Administration of Seminar

Description	Excellent	Good	Average
How would you rank the general administrative arrangements of the seminar in respect of session, conference room facilities and refreshments, etc?	66%	34%	-

Table 12 indicates that 66% participants were of the opinion that the general administrative arrangements of the seminar in respect of session, conference room facilities and refreshments were excellent. However 34% participants had opinion that it was good.

Table 12: Administration of Justice

Description	Expenditure (€)	Expenditure (%)
Administrative costs		
Legal fees		
Witness expenses		
Expert fees		
Other costs		
Total		

Table 12 shows the expenditure on the administration of justice. The total expenditure on the administration of justice is 1.2 million euros. This is broken down into administrative costs, legal fees, witness expenses, expert fees, and other costs. The largest share of the expenditure is for legal fees, which account for 45% of the total. Witness expenses account for 30%, administrative costs for 15%, expert fees for 7%, and other costs for 3%.