R.52

(Draft, not to be quoted)

MOSQUE AND PRIMARY SCHOOLS

(A comparative study)

by

Haroona Jatoi Islam Baloch Sabir Hussain

ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING & MANAGEMENT
Ministry of Education
Islamabad

May, 1998

AEPAM 372.10424 J 31 M

MOSQUE AND PRIMARY SCHOOLS

(A comparative study)

by

Haroona Jatoi Islam Baloch Sabir Hussain

ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING & MANAGEMENT
Ministry of Education
Islamabad

May, 1998

CONTENTS

		Page #
1.	Background	1
2.	Objectives	4
3.	Significance of study	4
4.	Scope of study	4
5.	Limitations of the study	5
6.	Methodology	5
7.	Policies' Statement	6
8.	Related Literature	7
	8.1 Mosque Schools 8.2 Primary Schools	7
9.	Analyses of the data	15
10.	Findings	24
11.	Conclusions	25
	- Bibliography - Annexures	

List of Tables

1	Number of Mosque and Primary Schools
11	Enrolment in Mosque and Primary Schools
111	Teachers in Mosque and Primary Schools
IV	Students, Teachers, Schools (Mosque and Primary)
٧	Student, Teacher, and School Ratio.
VI	Buildings of Mosque and Primary Schools.
VII	Professional Qualification of Mosque and Primary School Teachers.
VIII	Number of classes taught by Teachers of Mosque and Primary School Teachers.
IX	Pass percentage of Students of Mosque and Primary School Teachers.
X	Teaching Methodologies in Mosque and Primary Schools.
XI	Items for use in Mosque and Primary Schools.
XII	Basic Facilities Mosque and Primary Schools.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In Pakistan a large number of children are found out of school and the Government continues to explore the ways to bring these children in schools. One such initiative, the Mosque Schools Policy was introduced in 1978-79 with the stated intent to revitalize this institution which has immense potential of educating the masses using it as a place of learning for children particularly for out of school children. These mosque schools were opened for the following major reasons:-

- To increase literacy rates by providing easy access to children in small settlements in rural areas.
- The mosque is a traditional center of learning in muslim society. Community
 participation in reviving this tradition through mosque schools which was
 expected to raise motivation level for parents to send their children to school.
- Major savings in government capital expenditure for primary education provision were expected as physical facilities were presumed to be available at mosques.

The school timing, curriculum, teachers' qualification, and supervision of Mosque and Primary school were the same. The only difference between these two systems was that the Mosque schools usually were providing only three years of schooling while normal primary schools were providing five years of schooling. The primary schools were in government buildings with three to five teachers and mosque schools were in mosques with one teacher and one Imam of mosque. Later on most of mosque schools were provided the same facilities as provided to primary schools, therefore, its basic concept of low unit cost has not remained same as it was conceived by the education planners.

This study was carried out by the AEPAM on the request of Inter Provincial Development Committee (IPDC). The major of jectives of the study are:-

- to compare the performance of the students of Mosque schools with students of primary schools;
- to examine/compare the physical facilities available in these institutions;
- to examine/compare the academic facilities (teaching and supporting staff) available in these institutions;
- to compare the financial input/output with respect to the enrolment.

The questionnaires were prepared and field visits undertook, primary and mosque schools were visited. Students teachers and parents of both school systems were interviewed.

The findings suggestions can be briefly presented as following:

- Majority of mosque school teachers have to teach all five classes and primary school teachers teach single class.
- Inspite of multigrade teaching in mosque schools, students pass percentage is better than primary school students under single grade teaching.
- Primary school teachers are using more teaching techniques than mosque school teachers.
- Mosque schools, except three basic items i.e. black board, chalk and duster, have less items then primary schools.
- Primary schools have more basic facilities than mosque schools.
- After the analysis of national data it has come out that the more girls are enrolled in primary schools than mosque schools, therefore for the promotion of girls education only primary schools, girls or mix, be considered.
- Inspite of low unit cost the mosque schools are providing the same pass
 percentage of students as of primary schools, therefore, for the expansion of
 primary education, in general, more mosque schools may be opened.
- The number of mosque schools be increased by opening in each and every locality particularly in rural areas.
- Community be persuaded to send all girls in mosque schools.
- Student:school ratio in mosque schools be increased from 1:36 to 1:90 or more. And special training for mosque school system be provided to mosque school teacher and Imam.
- The multigrade teaching can be adopted even in urban areas in case the shortage of teachers due to financial constraints.
- Even untrained teachers on fixed pay may be appointed in mosque and primary schools.

I. BACKGROUND

One need not to dwell to heavily upon the fact that Pakistan inherited a weak educational set-up at the time of independence. There was a mass of illiterates while insufficient institutions existed to impart education to the children. Moreover, the education system itself did not suit the aspirations and demands of an independent nation. Therefore, a National Education Conference was convened in 1947 which recommended that universalization of primary education as its first priority and also recommended provision of adult literacy.

Since then, basic education has long been declared a priority for national development in official policy documents and in public pronouncements. Over the years, there have been several initiatives by the Governments to improve the situation of primary education and adult literacy. Yet, no significant impact had been felt with regard to primary enrolment, completion and performance, and in the percentage growth rate in the literate population. In addition to all of this, standard of higher education is not upto the mark. Research capabilities of higher institutions cannot compete with the world. Analytical abilities have not yet attained desired levels.

At the same time the economy has been growing at a 6% growth rate and social, especially education, indicators remain poor. Levels of literacy between 35 and 40 percent result from low access to schools and a high dropout rate. Irrelevant curricula, un-stimulating teaching practices and unattractive environments do not offer incentive to poor families.

Child labour, poverty of the families, and teacher absenteeism are other contributing factors which need considerable attention.

In terms of access to primary school, of the estimated 20 million school-age population, 13 million or approximately 70 per cent are enrolled in school. Half the number of children who enroll do not complete school. The implication is that input into the

education system, i.e. school influstructure, teachers and materials, whether provided by the government or donor and other development agencies, has not been matched by outcomes in terms of completion and student performance. This situation has raised serious concerns about such process parameters as quality of school administration and management, supervisory practices, teaching methods and the role of local communities in the education process. The present government has taken each of these problem very seriously and corrective measure has been taken.

A person is functionally literate when he has acquired the knowledge and skills in reading and writing which enables him to engage effectively in all those activities of future social, cultural, and economic development. The role of primary education can not be denied for the promotion of literacy and expansion of education. It has rightly been called the primary education as foundation stone on which literate culture can be erected.

Ever since the creation of Pakistan several proposals have been made to enhance the education in the country. All education policy planners have pur forwarded so many steps and strategies to universalize primary education in the country. Some had given suggestions to increase primary schools; to make primary education computsory; to open muhalla, mosque schools; and to open literacy centers etc but yet this country has not achieved the desired goals of primary education.

Pakistan is confronted with quantitative as well as qualitative issues in education. It is a fact that in Pakistan a large number of children are found out of school and the Government continues to explore the ways to bring these children in schools. One such initiative, the Mosque Schools Policy was introduced in 1978-79 with the stated intent to revitalize this institution which has immense potential of educating the masses using it as a place of learning for children particularly for out of school children. These mosque schools were opened for the following major reasons:-

- To increase literacy rates by providing easy access to children in small settlements in rural areas.
- The mosque is a traditional center of learning in muslim society. Community
 participation in reviving this tradition through mosque schools which was
 expected to raise motivation level for parents to send their children to school.
- Major savings in government capital expenditure for primary education provision were expected as physical facilities were presumed to be available at mosques.

This policy was a creative effort to bring the children who did not reach by the normal government schools while, at the same time, keeping costs relatively low by using an existing institutional structure.

The school timing, curriculum, teachers' qualification, and supervision of Mosque and Primary school was same. The early difference between these two systems was that the Mosque schools usually were providing only three years of schooling while normal primary schools were providing five years of schooling. The primary schools were in government buildings with three to five teachers and mosque schools were in mosques with one teacher and one Imam of mosque. Later on most of mosque schools were provided the same facilities as provided to primary schools, therefore, its basic concept of low unit cost has not remained same as it was conceived by the education planners.

This study was identified in Inter Provincial Development Committee (IPDC) meeting, IPDC is a form initiated in 1983 to give an oppurtunity to dealing officers in educational planning at Federal and Provincial levels. This forum felt it necessary to find out the comparative status of mosque and primary schools. Therefore, a research study has assigned to Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM) with the following objectives:-

2. OBJECTIVES

The major objectives of the study are.-

- to compare the performance of the students of Mosque schools with students of primary schools;
- to examine/compare the physical facilities available in these institutions;
- to examine/compare the academic facilities (teaching and supporting staff) available in these institutions;
- to compare the financial input/output with respect to the enrolment.

3. SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY

All education policies have been mentioning about the shortage of schools and funds required to open new schools for the children who did not have access to schooling. Therefore, Mosque School Policy was introduced in 1978-79 to utilize the mosque buildings for school purposes. At the beginning this concept had worked fruitfully but later on loosed its importance in some areas/provinces of Pakistan.

This pilot study would point out the initial problems as why the concept of mosque schools did not achieve its desired goals. This study will identify research study which can find out the reasons of failure or the need more success and suggest policy options for the government. If the suggestions are found effective then its benefits will be for all out of school children. It will be helpful not only for out of school children but simultaneously increase the literacy level in Pakistan.

4. SCOPE OF THE STUDY

This pilot study is intended to guide the educational planners, administrators, teachers, students, and communities' attitude towards mosque schools in sample areas at national level.

5. LIMITATION OF THE STUDY

Main constraint is resources. Since the AEPAM has limited resources and could not launch such studies at national level bence this pilot study has been carried out initially to find out the main reasons of failure of Mosque school system. FedMIS data has been used for this study and a number of variables have been used. In addition to this, another primary data set of 22 sample schools (11 mosque & 11 primary) has been used for the study. Parents of students of mosque schools of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were also interviewed to find out their point of view. The Questionnaires are attached at annexures 1, 11 and 111. The questionnaire for parents was also translated into Urdu for easy administration and a copy is enclosed at annexure IV.

6. METHODOLOGY

The annual school census in Islamabad District. FATA, FANA, and AJK, is conducted by MIS Division of Academy of Educational Planning and management (AEPAM), Ministry of Education Islamabad. The provincial information is collected and compiled at respective provinces. The AEPAM receives the provincial data from each provincial MIS and finally compiles a national data book called "Pakistan Education Statistics" and this secondary data has been used in this study. Out of the FedMIS data set, the following variables have been used for the study:-

- Schools
- Teachers
- Students
- Physical facility (building only)

As mentioned earlier, a sample of about 11 mosque and 11 primary school teachers, parents of the students of mosque and primary schools. Headmistresses of primary schools of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were also interviewed by researchers in the context of comparison of mosque and primary schools on account of variables mentioned above within the scope of the study and objectives mentioned above.

7. POLICIES' STATEMENTS

According to the National Education Policy 1998-2010, description about the primary and mosque schools is:

The presently about 145,960 including around 37,000 mosque schools. One third of primary schools are female schools. In addition to that 7,177 non-formal primary education schools are run by Prime Minister's Literacy Commission.

Presently, a total of 339,500 teachers are working in public sector and teaching at the primary level. Roughly 33 percent or 117,600 are female teachers.

The shortage of physical facilities and equipment is critical in primary schools.

According to the latest estimates, about 25,000 primary schools are without school buildings.

Many of the schools are without boundary walls. Most of the one room schools in the rural areas, are made of mud, bamboo and galvanized iron sheets. Majority of schools do not have latrines and water facilities. There is also a shortage of desks and chairs. Some schools do not even have mats for the school for pupils to sit on. However, blackboards and pieces of chalks are available in most of the schools. Teaching kits were developed and distributed to 30 percent of primary schools in Pakistan.

The following physical targets for primary education system were mentioned in this education policy:

- About 45000 new primary schools, 17000 in year 2002-3 and 28000 in year 2010, will be opened. About 20000 more mosque schools will be opened till 2010.
- Double shift in 20000 existing primary schools will be started. 45000 primary schools will be upgraded.
- 99700 more primary school teachers will be recruited till year 2010.

The objectives of the present education policy ragarding primary education are:

- Enactment of compulsory primary education.
- 90 percent enrollment at primary level by the year 2002-3 and 100 percent by the year 2010.
- Retention of primary education cycle upto 90 percent students (both boys and girls) by the year 2010.
- Achievement of maximum level of learning by 90 percent primary class students by the year 2010.

8. RELATED LITERATURE

The main purpose of relevant literature is to look on mosque and primary schools as "What is the difference between these two systems? The related literature in this regard has been reviewed in context of following variables:-

- i. Enrollments
- ii. Teachers
- iii. Physical Facilities
- vi. Community
- v. Administration, and
- vi. General views about the system.

8.1 Mosque Schools

8.1.1 Enrollment

According to an study on mosque schools in Sindh by Teacher's Recourse Centre (1989) in Karachi, a total of 262282 pupils were enrolled in 9723 mosque schools and girls' enrollment was just 26.4 percent. In the period 1990-91, a total number of 471 students (both sexes) were enrolled in 12 sample mosque schools, among these 144 dropped out and only 14 female students simply dropped out due to social compulsion. It suggests that less enrollment and dropout of girls in mosque schools does take place.

Khani (1981) finds out that in some of Mosque schools the average total enrolment is much higher than formal primary schools where the average is some 60 pupils per school.

8.1.2 Teachers

Khan (1981) presents that before launching the programme of admission in mosque schools in 1979-80 certain steps were taken to ensure the success of the programme. These steps included the selection of dedicated teachers who could adjust to the new patterns of teaching.

Chandhary (1989), has supported the mosque school policy and states that only people with missionary zeal teach in mosque schools. They take personal interest in imparting knowledge to the students. Most of mosque school teachers belong to the same community, hence people trust upon the local teachers and send their daughters to schools willingly.

Majeed (1992), of Pakistan Academy for Rural Development Peshawar has suggested that the training courses at least once in a year be organized for the teachers of mosque schools thereby providing them an opportunity to upgrade their knowledge and skills. This report further states that about 2/3 of the teachers would leave their job if they get a full time employment outside the villages, mainly due to very low allowances of teachers.

Nevertheless, their over all impressions regarding the mosque schools were encouraging.

8.1.3 Physical Facilities

Khan (1981), has states that since the mosque provides building, covered area, mats and other facilities, there is no need for development expenditure.

A study of mosque schools in Sindh stated that most of the sample schools were functioning in one room only. In 92 percent of the schools the working space was observed to be overcrowded.

Majeed (1992), of Pakistan Academy for rural development Peshawar has suggested that the basic facilities including free books/ stationary; tables and chairs for the teachers; increments and allowances; school uniform; first aid; and provision of scholarships to talented students of mosque schools be provided which will strengthen the whole programme.

8.1.4 Community Involvement

Ali (1990), says that honest and dedicated field staff put life into the programme and motivated the community to participate in the mosque schools system. It is significant that the urban areas have not taken much notice of the mosque schools except perhaps in the busties and urban slum areas, where there is neither a government school in the vicinity nor are the parents able to afford the fees either of the local government of private schools.

Majeed (1992), Pakistan Academy for Rural Development Peshawar present a point of view that 96 (80%) of the sample parents preferred mosque schools for education of their children over government primary schools. Again a majority, 98% (118) of the parents disclosed the Mosque schools were most beneficial for the village community.

Chaudhary (1989), has also supported this view that mosque schools are community organized and trusted schools. Hence parents willingly send their girls to such institutions. The parents know that their daughters will be taught Quran and Sunnah, alongwith formal curricula, hence they allow them to go to the schools (mosque schools). Poor parents cannot afford to purchase uniform or books etc required in regular primary school, therefore, the mosque schools should be opened in such community where primary schools have not been set up.

Khan (1981), said that the up keep of the mosque and its maintenance is the responsibility of community and the government is required to provide only non development expenditure.

8.1.5 Administration/Policy Implementation

Warwick, Reimers and McGinn (1991), found out that the implementation of the mosque schools policy differed from the original strategy. Classes were often held in buildings at some distance from the mosque rather than in the mosque itself.

They further said that though the government's intention was to use the mosque schools as a second-best alternative in areas where there were no regular primary schools. In some regions the schools were built close to existing government primary schools. Some mosque schools also provided the full five years of primary education rather than just three years. In short, when the policy was actually carried out, changes were made to increase its effectiveness and solve some of the problems it created.

All (1990), says that there is no denying the fact that the separate administrative structure and some honest and dedicated field staff put life into the mosque schools programme and motivated the community to participate. The merger of the mosque schools with primary education's formal administration has proved detrimental to both.

A study of Mosque schools in Sindh by Teacher's Recourse Centre (TRG-1989), mentions that the mosque school system has been successful in Sindh. Its integration into the regular primary school system will not serve any useful purpose. It is also recommended in this study that the mosque school system should be continued as an independent system and mosque schools should be opened in where primary schools have not been set up.

Matthews (1995), in his report Management of Elementary Education in Punjab said that mosque schools have been steadily increasing in numbers, e.g. in 1984-85 schools year there were 8070 while in the 1992-93 school year there were 12328. Notwithstanding this growth in numbers, government policy is to gradually upgrade them all so that they become full primary schools (Classes I to V). This is to be done by using land adjacent to the mosque free of cost to the government and by providing a second teacher and a classroom.

Siddiqui. (1990), stated that the mosque school experiment was rated as success.

Under the fifth plan (1978-83), the number of mosque schools opened was 8,200. During the Sixth Plan (1983-88) 17193, were opened and this number will increase further and 20,000 mosque schools will be opened under Seventh Plan (1988-93).

8.1.6 General

Ali (1990), has said that one must take into account that at one stage the government of Punjab had declared the mosque schools programme a failure and decided to shelve it.

Later the Decision was reversed, but no where has it been so popular as in Sindh.

Pakistan Academy for Rural Development Peshawar (PARDP) has mentioned that masjid schools have been functioning effectively for about 26 years and it is recommended that these non-formal learning institutions at the village level may continue to work for the benefit of the masses.

8.2 Primary Schools

8.2.1 Enrollment

Ministry of Education, PNE Wing (1987), mentioned that 70 percent of girls of school-going-age remain out of school and 70 percent of the enrolled girls leave school without completing primary education. This trend can not carry the nation forward to universal primary education. To increase the participation of girls in education, we have to search for alternative innovative programmes.

Malik and Tauhid (1985), suggest that the drop out rate for both sexes in class I (section called Pakki) is 12.7 percent at national level for the year 1984-85. It is slightly higher for females i.e. 13.9 percent. In urban areas, 14.1 percent and 10.4 percent in rural areas. Repeaters rates do not vary much in national and urban and rural schools. Primary school teacher is the very influential as he can determine the age of the child at the time of admission and can retain as many students in class Kachi or Adna as he likes.

8.2.2 Teachers

Lyons and Pritchard (1976), have said that there is lot of criticism regarding the lack of commitment of many teachers, some of whom were said to supplement their income by other employment. And the rural teachers, especially in very small schools, suffered from professional isolation. The impression gained from visits to several urban and rural schools and from discussions with inspectors was of many inadequate buildings in a poor state of repair providing a depressing environment for learning even of a stereotyped kind. Very many schools lack essential teaching equipment and visual or other aids to learning and in general teachers had displayed little initiative in seeking to remedy these deficiencies.

Malik and Tauhid (1985), stated that teachers are not specially trained to teach such levels as Kachi class. In many schools, these two classes Kachi and Pakki sit jumbled together. They are taught and supervised by the single teacher who casually attends to class Kachi. Mostly teachers over look drop outs because of non availability of basic facilities to retain the children for longer time in the school.

Bude and Chowdhri in an evaluation report mentioned that education in primary schools is characterized by a poor quality of instruction resulting in low learning achievements by the children. Many teachers are still untrained or cling to oppressive methods of keeping children in classes without providing proper opportunities for learning. All this discourages any increase in attendance and contributes to high dropout rates. To overcome the boredom and inefficiency in the present schools and make these contribute to meaningful learning, teachers must to be exposed to different ways of handling children. They should also be equipped with skills to teach in a more relaxed and efficient way.

A book "Multigrde Teaching in Single Teacher Primary Schools" by UNESCO (1989), tells about primary schools in Pakistan that there is a view that we should have a different curriculum and textbooks for multigrade schools and an other for schools where one teacher teaches one class but this is not logical. Apart from financial and other

considerations, it poses very serious questions. The two streams running parallel will never meet, thus the long term results will not be positive when the students from two different streams join at the secondary stage.

8.2.3 Physical Facilities

A book "Multigrde Teaching in Single Teacher Primary Schools" by UNESCO (1989), tells about primary schools in Pakistan that multigrade schools particularly those in remote areas are given step-motherly treatment in terms of physical facilities although as a matter of fact and natural justice, a single teacher teaching more than one class deserves more facilities in terms of school buildings, furniture, teaching material/aids, etc, so that he can be compensated for the difficulties and his burden becomes light. He needs more funds to develop teaching aids from locally available cheap material.

Lyons and Pritchard (1976), said that most of primary schools lack essential teaching equipment and visual aids or other feeding material for learning.

A study by Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU-1984), mentions that many urban and large majority of rural schools present a very miserable picture. Most of the schools are working in two-room buildings in many cases, they are being run in single mud built room, originally meant to be a animal shelter. The buildings have no veranda or shade from the blazing sun in summer and to shelter from the chilling cold in winter. They have neither boundary walls nor any play grounds nearby. All the five classes sit in the same room. There exists no question of electricity and electrical equipment to facilitate students.

AfOU's study further stated that the schools have poor seating arrangements.

Sometimes child bring small pieces of mat or sack from home for seating purpose. Including the irrigated plains of Punjab and Sindh, there is no arrangement of drinking water in many primary schools in the country. Where ever handpumps have been installed they remain out of order for most of the year.

Malik and Tauhid (1985), said that teachers over look drop outs because of non availability of basic facilities to retain the kids for longer time in the school. Over all physical facilities and supervisory arrangements are better in Sindh, NWFP, and AJK than the two provinces of Punjab and Balochistan where as in FATA these are under utilized.

8.2.4 Community Involvement

Lyons and Pritchard (1976), said that the frequent criticism was heard of the lack of commitment of many teachers, some of whom were said to supplement their income by other employment. That very many primary schools indeed appeared to depend on the support of the community, as finance from the authorities could supply only a limited number of classrooms".

"Multigrade Teaching in Primary Schools" by UNESCO (1989), observed that the success of the teaching-learning process entirely depends on the attitude of the teacher. If he has a will to do he will create resources by himself by mobilizing the available resources seeking the cooperation of the community and thereby achieve better results.

8.2.5 Administration/Policy Implementation

Warwick, Reimers and McGinn (1991), have written that the government should concentrate on formal education alone. All the funds diverted to other schemes, for example, Nai Roshni schools could help create more primary schools. Therefore more funds should be channeled to formal primary school expansion. Money spent on accelerated literacy is not a very good option.

According to AIOU (1984), the students of primary schools have already shabby and patched dress and they are accustomed to this kind of environment in their daily life. Hence it makes no difference for them, whether they are at school or at home, except that at home they have to look after the cattle and at school, they have to sit calmly on the bare ground for the whole day long.

9. ANALYSIS

The purpose of this study is to provide comparative information about mosque and primary schools in Pakistan as what is the ratio of teacher:student, teacher:school, student:school, in the context of urban:rural, male:female, and building.

Table I

Number of Mosque and Primary Schools 1995-96. (PAKISTAN)

				THE RESERVE AND THE PARTY OF	Control Street Avenue		
Schools		Mosque			Primary		
	Urban	Rural	Total	Urban	Rural	Total	
Boys	2545	25131	27676	4197	48389	52586	
Girls	0005	0034	00039	4195	32545	36740	
Mixed	636	8058	8694	805	3712	4517	
Total	3186	33223	36409	9197	86646	93843	
Dabietan Dilyantian	Cartain tone	THE CHANGE	STREET STREET		0.000 // //	Control of the control	

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table I shows that Pakistan has 36409 Mosque Schools (MS), 3186 (8.7%) in Urban and 33223 (91.2%) in rural areas. The majority of MS (91%) are in rural areas. Out of total mosque schools 27676 (76%) are for boys and 39 (0.1%) for girls & 8694 (23.8%) are mixed schools. Therefore it can be said that 23.9 percent mosque schools are providing education to girls.

This table further indicates 93843 primary schools, out of these 9197 (9.8%) are in Urban and 86646 (92.3%) are in rural areas. And 52586 (56%) for boys and girls have access to schooling on 36740 girls ans 4517 mixed (total 43.9%) primary schools.

Table II

(PAKISTAN)

Enrolment (million) in Mosque and Primary Schools 1995-96.

Schools -		Mosque			Primary		
	Urban	Rural	Total	Urban	Rural	Total	
Boys	0.14	0.98	1.12	0.98	4.40	5.38	
Girls	0.03	0.16	0.20	0.88	2.58	3.47	
Total	0.18	1.15	1.33	1.87	6.98	8.85	

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table II shows that total 1.33 million students are enrolled in Mosque Schools. Out of this 1.15 million are in rural and 0.18 million in urban areas. And 1.12 millions are boys and 0.20 million are girls students.

Table II further indicates that 8.85 million students are enrolled in primary schools. Out of this 6.98 million in rural and 1.87 million in urban areas, and 5.38 million boys and 3.47 million are girls students.

Table III
Teachers in Mosque and Primary Schools 1995-96. (PAKISTAN)

Schools -		Mosque			Primary			
	Urban	Rural	Total	Urban	Rural	Total		
Boys	5378	41443	46821	28978	132607	161585		
Girls	533	414	947	32974	75385	108359		
Total	5911	41857	47768	61952	207992	269944		

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table III shows 47768 teachers in Mosque Schools, out of these 5911 in Urban and 41857 in rural areas, and 46821 male and 947 are female teachers.

Table III further indicates 283521 teachers in primary schools. Out of these 207992 in rural and 61952 are in urban areas. And 161585 male and 108359 are female teachers.

Table IV

Students:Teachers:Sch	ools (Mosque & Prima	ry) 1995-96	(PAKISTAN)	
Schools		Total		
	Students	Teachers	Schools	
Mosque	1.33 (M)	47768	36409	
Primary	8.85 (M)	283521	93843	
Total	10.19 (M)	331289	130252	

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table IV shows about 10.19 million students in Mosque and primary schools, out of these 1.33 million (13%) in mosque schools and 8.85 million (86.9%) are in primary schools.

It further indicates total 331289 teachers, 283521 (85.5 %) teachers in primary schools and 47768 (14.4 %) teachers are in Mosque schools.

Table IV also shows the total number of Mosque and Primary schools is 130252. Out of these 93843 (72 %) are primary schools, and 36409 (27.9 %) Mosque schools.

Table V

	Student: Teacher:	(PAKISTAN)	
	School	Mosque	Primary
1.	Teacher:Student Ratio	1:27.9	1:31.2
2.	School:Teacher Ratio	1:1.3	1:3
3.	School:Student Ratio	1:36.6	1:94.3

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table V shows that in Mosque school, there is one teacher is for 27.9 students and in primary schools, one teacher is for 31.2 students. And this ratio is approximately the same.

Row No.2 of table V shows one teacher for one Mosque schools (1:1.3) while three teachers (1:3) for one primary school. Primary schools have more teachers than mosque schools.

Row No.3 of table V indicates the school:student ratio as one Mosque school has 36.6 students and one primary schools has 94.3 students.

The teacher:student ratio in both school systems is manageable as one teacher has to teach only 27.9 to 31.2 students respectively. The finding from table V are that in mosque schools mostly multigrade teaching is adopted while single grade teaching is prevailing in primary schools.

Table VI

Buildings of Mosque and Primary Schools - 1995-96 (PAKISTAN)

Schools		Mosque			Primary	
[#] Building	Urban	Rural	Total	Urban	Rural	Total
Available	1077	13110	14187	7381	70661	78042
Not Available	2109	20113	22222	1816	13985	15801
Total	3186	33223	36409	9197	84646	93843

Source: Pakistan Education Statistics 1995-96, AEPAM, Islamabad.

Table VI shows that the school buildings are available in 14187 (39.9 %) Mosque schools and 78042 (83.1 %) primary schools. About 60 percent mosque and 16 percent primary schools have no buildings. Majority of primary schools have buildings and majority of mosque schools have no building. The logic behind this may be that the mosque schools are usually working in mosques where most of required physical facilities for schools are available therefore these schools are not provided buildings.

As mentioned earlier, about primary data, used in table VII to XII, that 11 primary and 11 mosque school teachers, four Headmistresses, and 9 parents of students of these 22 sample schools were interviewed in Rawalpindi and Islamabad and the following tables are formulated based on that information:

Table VII

Professional Qualification of Mosque and Primary School Teachers

Teacher -	Teacher - Formal Qualification			Professional Qualification		
	Matric	FA/FSc	BA/BSc	PTC	CT	B.Ed
Mosque School	6	4	1	9	2	0
Primary School	6	2	3	5	4	1

Table VII shows that the professional qualification of primary school teachers is higher than mosque school teachers i.e. three BA/BSc are primary school teachers while only one is in mosque schools. Out of 11 teachers of mosque schools 9 are PTC while primary schools have only 5 such teachers and most of primary teachers are CT and BEd.

Table VIII

Number of classes taught by Mosque and Primary
School Teachers, 1997

Taking Classes

Teacher -

	One	One to Two	One to Three	One to Five			
Mosque Schools	1	0	1	9			
Primary Schools	8	2	0				

Table VIII indicates that majority of Mosque school teachers have to teach all five classes and primary school teachers to teach single class. It means that the multigrade teaching in mosque and single grade teaching in primary schools are taking place.

Pass percentage of Students of Mosque and Primary School Teachers

Tencher		Pass Percentage of Students					
	Less then 60%	60 to 80%	81 to 90%	91 to 100%			
Mosque Schools	P.	0	5	5			
Primary Schools	0	2	5	4			

Table 1X shows that the pass percentage of 10 mosque schools and 9 primary schools is from 81 to 100 percentage. The pass percentage of 1 mosque school is less then 60 percent while pass percentage of 2 primary schools is from 60 to 80 percent marks.

Though this indication is approximately the same but inspite of multigrade teaching in mosque schools, students pass percentage is better then primary school students who are enrolled under single grade teaching system/schools.

Table X
Teaching Techniques adopted by Mosque and Primary School
Teachers

Teaching Techniques	M.S	P.S	Teaching Techniques	M.S	P.S
1. Translation	10	10	9. Role Playing	3	7
2. Playway	1	4	10. Question Answer	6	8
3. Activity	2	3	11. Observation	2	4
4. Story Telling/ Description	6	8	12. Field Trip	3	4
5. Assignment	- 6	9	13. Rote Memorization	10	3
6. Discovery	1	4	14. Teacher directed	3	6
7. Problem solving	3	7	15. Tr: & Student directed	9	7
8. Discussion	4	5	16. Recitation	10	8
=M S Masaura School Tor	where D S	Dein	Pary School Teachers		

=M.S. Mosque School Teachers, P.S. Primary School Teachers.

Table X shows that the majority of mosque school teachers are concentrating on translation, teacher and student directed, recitation, and rote memorization.

Primary school teachers are adopting all of the above listed teaching techniques generally.

Translation, assignment, story telling/description, question answer, recitation, problem solving, role playing, and teacher and student directed discussion.

This table indicates that primary school teachers are using more teaching techniques then mosque school teachers.

Table XI

Items for use in Mosque & Primary Schools

Items -	M.S	P.S	Items	M.S	P.S
1. Blackboard	11	- 11	6. Duster	9	10
2. Maps	01	9	7. Teaching Kit	1	5
3. Charts	01	11	8. Teacher Guide	2	4
4. Globes	01	6	9. Curriculum Scheme	1	3
5. Chalk (M.S. Mosque School Te	II achers, P.S.	11 Primary	10. Time Table y School Teachers.)	5	11

Table XI shows that mosque schools, except three basic items i.e. black board, chalk, and duster have less items then primary schools.

Table XII

Basic Facilities in Mosque and Primary Schools

Facilities in -	Mosque Schools			1	Primary Schools		
	NA	Adqt:	In-adqt:	NA	Adqt:	In-adqt:	
1. Shelter	0	6	. 5	0	10	1	
2. Drinking water	1	8	3	0	9	2	
3. Enough rooms/space	0	3	8	0	4	7	
4. Electricity	2	7	2	2	5	4	
5. Light	2	8	I	1	5	5	
6. Boundary wall	6	4	1.	1	- 5	5	
7. Play ground	11	0	0	7	2	2	
8. Lavatory	9	2	0	2	6	3	
N.A=Not available	Modi-Maedinie	m-add	t=Inadequat	Ç.			

Table XII shows that the primary schools have more basic facilities then mosque schools particularly shelter, boundary wall, play ground, and lavatory, while drinking water, electricity, and light facilities are approximately the same in mosque and primary schools.

Moreover, about 9 parents (8 of students of Mosque schools and 1 parent of student of primary school) were asked about performance of mosque schools and their reply was that they were satisfied by the performance of children in mosque schools. But most of them complained about inadequate building, class rooms, and shortage of teachers. They were further asked whether they had visited mosque schools frequently and their reply was yes.

10. FINDINGS

From the above description of data,

10.1 From Table I to VI (National Data)

- About 91 percent of mosque and 92 percent primary schools exist in rural areas of Pakistan.
- About 24 percent of mosque and 44 percent primary schools are for girls.
- The girls primary schools are more than girls mosque schools.
- Both primary and mosque schools are providing education to 10.19 million students (6.51 million boys & 3.67 million girls).
- Out of this total enrolment 10.19 million, the enrolment of mosque schools is just 13 percent and remaining 86.9 percent enrolment is of primary schools.
- 84.5 percent boys and 15.4 percent girls are enrolled in mosque schools.
- 60.8 percent boys and 39.1 percent girls are enrolled in primary schools.
- 98 percent male and 2 percent female teachers are teaching in mosque schools.
- 59.8 percent male and 40 percent female teachers are working in primary schools
- In mosque and primary schools one teacher is for 27.9 and 31.2 students respectively.
- Ratio of teacher: school in mosque schools is one teacher for one mosque school while in primary three teachers for one primary school.
- Ratio of student:school in mosque schools is 36 students for one school while 94.3 students for one primary school.
- Multigrade schooling in mosque schools and singlegrade schooling in primary schools is a common practice.
- 83.1 percent of primary and 39.9 percent of mosque schools have buildings. It means 17 percent primary and 60 percent mosque schools have no buildings.

10.2 Table VII to XII

- Professional qualifications of primary school teachers is higher than mosque school teachers.
- Majority of Mosque school teachers have to teach all five classes and primary school teachers have to teach single classes.
- Inspite of multigrade teaching in mosque schools, students pass percentage is better then primary school students who are getting education under single grade teaching.
- Primary school teachers are using more teaching techniques than mosque school teachers.
- Mosque schools, except three basic items i.e. black board, chalk and duster, have less items then primary schools.
- Primary schools have more basic facilities then mosque schools.

11. CONCLUSIONS

- After the analysis of national data, it has come out that the more girls are enrolled in primary schools than mosque schools, therefore for the promotion of girls education only primary schools, girls or mix, be considered.
- The pass percentage of students is concerned it has emerged that inspite of low unit cost the mosque schools are providing the same pass percentage of students as of primary schools, therefore, for the expansion of primary education, in general, more mosque schools should be opened.
- The number of mosque schools be increased by opening in each and every locality particularly in rural areas.
- Community be persuaded to send all girls in mosque schools.
- Student:school ratio in mosque schools be increased from 1:36 to 1:90 or more. And a special training for mosque school system be provided to mosque school teachers and Imams.
- A thorough inquiry be arranged as whey 60 percent mosque schools have no building though are called mosque schools. If there is any problem from community side that can be settled by Ehtesaab Committee.

- The multigrade teaching can be adopted even in urban areas in case the shortage of teachers due to financial constraints.
- Even untrained teachers on fixed pay may be appointed in mosque and primary schools.
- The finance be diverted to the appointments of more teachers rather than providing some other facilities.
- More graduates or post graduates can be procured as teachers on fixed pay for mosque schools.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Anderson, M.B. and N.P.. Chaudhry. 1989. The Impact of Mosque Schools Policy on Girls' Access to Education in Pakistan. Cambridge, Mass.: Project BRIDGES, Harvard University. Papers on Primary Education in Pakistan, report No.7.
- Arif Majeed. 1992. The other Side of Education: An evaluation of Masjid Maktab Project. Pakistan Academy for Rural Development. Khyber Mail Press. Peshawar. Pakistan.
- Anita Ghulam Ali. 1990. Situation Analysis of Basic Education in Sindh 1990.
 Department of Education. Government Sindh. Karachi. Pakistan.
- Government of Sindh. Education Scenario of Sindh with special reference to Primary Education and Literacy. Government of Sindh. Karachi.
- Government of Pakistan. Promotion of Girls Education at Primary Level. 1987. PNE wing. Ministry of Education. Government of Pakistan. Islamabad.
- Khan, K.A. 1981. The Mosque schools in Pakistan: an experiment in integrating noneformal and formal education. International Institute for Educational Planning, UNESCO, Paris.
- Matthews, P.W. 1995. The Management of Elementary Education in Punjab: First Report. Punjab Middle Schooling Project. The Academy for Educational Development. Department of Education. Government of Punjab. 1995.
- Mazhar-ul-Haq Siddiqi. 1990. "Education Past, present and future" AEPAM. Islamabad.
- Multigrade Teaching in Single Teacher Primary Schools. 1989. APEID. UNESCO. Bangkok.
- Muhammad Arif Zia. 1984. Report of the National Pilot Training Workshop on the Learning Needs and Problems of Primary School Children in Pakistan. Faculty of Education. AIOU. Islamabad. Pakistan.
- Raymond F.Lyons and Mervyn W.Prtitchard. 1976. Primary school inspection: a supporting service for education. IIEP. UNESCO. Paris.
- Said Rasul Malik and Mirza Tauhiduddin Ahmed. 1985. A Study on Drop outs in Primary Schools in Pakistan: A sample Survey. AEPAM. Ministry of Education. Islamabad. 1985.

- Udo Bude and Shaheen Chowdhri, Improving Primary School Teaching: An
 Evaluation of the Field Based Teacher Development Programme in the Northern
 Areas of Pakistan, Aga Khan Foundation, German Foundation for International
 Development.
- World Bank. Pakistan Education Sector Strategy Review. 1988.
- World Bank "A Study of Mosque Schools in Sindh with Special Reference to Girls' Education". 1989. World Bank. Teachers' Resource Centre Karachi, Pakistan.
- Warwick, D.P., Fernando R, and N.F.Mcginn. 1991. The Implementation of Educational Innovtions in Pakistan: Cases and Concepts. Harvard Institute for International Development. Harvard University, USA.

C:\mosque\report2

ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT MINISTRY OF EDUCATION ISLAMABAD

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MOSQUE SCHOOLS VS PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN PAKISTAN TEACHERS' INTERVIEW

1.	Teacher's Name	2. Se	×		
			Male	Female	
3.	school's Name & A	ddress			
4.	BPS	Present pay			
5.	Total Enrollment	Teachers		Classroom	
6.	Educational Quali	fications (Tick t	he box of	Highest qualification	on achieved
			Years		
		Matric FA/F.Sc B.A/B.Sc./B.Com M.A/M.Sc./M.Com Any other			
7.	Training Untrained PTC JV SV CT OT B.Ed (14+1) B.Ed (12+3) M.Ed Other (Please	Yearsspecify)			
8.	Do you need more	training?			
	No Yes				

9. If yes, what kind of training would you like?
- days bonchor2 Verre
10. How many years have you taught as an untrained teacher? Years
11. How many years have you taught as a trained teacher? Years
12. How many years have you taught in this school? Years
13. Which of the following have been helpful to you in your teaching?
a) Head teacher/ Headmaster b) Other teachers/ colleagues c) Supervisor d) Pre-service training e) In-service training f) Your own experience as a student g) Any other (Please specify)
14. Do you enjoy being a teacher?
Yes
15. Do you plan to remain a teacher?
Yes
16. Did you teach last year in this School?
YesNo
17. If yes, what grade(s) did you teach last year in this school?
Grade: 1 Grade: 2 Grade: 3 Grade: 4 Grade: 5
18. Do you know about the mosque3 school
Yes

If yes primary	, what do you think is the difference bet ry school?	ween mosque school and
Are yo	ou familiarised with the objectives of mos Yes No	que school.
		eir objectives (please
Do you	u have community support?	
	Yes	
If yes	s, what kind of support.	
Do you	u feel community prefer to send their chi 1?	ldren in Mosque/Primary
	Mosque	
	Primary	
Why re	easons.	
	Primary	eaching.
	Are your lf yes specif	Are you familiarised with the objectives of mos Yes No If yes, whether mosque schools have achieved the specify). Do you have community support? Yes No If yes, what kind of support. Do you feel community prefer to send their chillschool?

27.	k) 1) m) n) o) p) q) r) s)	Question Answer Observation Analytic/Synthetic Field trip Teacher directed Teacher & Student di Recitation Rote memorisation Other (Please speci	fy)	ck the rele	evant Box)
	a) b) c) d) e) f) g) h) i)	Balckboard Maps Charts Globes Chalk Duster Teaching kit Teacher guide Curriculum scheme Time table	Yes		
28.	How	would you rank basic	facilities in y		
	a) b) c) d) e) f) g) h)	Schelter Drinking water Enough room/ space for children Electricity Light Boundry wall Play ground Latrine			

ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT MINISTRY OF EDUCATION ISLAMABAD

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MOSQUE SCHOOLS VS PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN PAKISTAN

DEO/SDEO/SUPERVISERS' INTERVIEW

1.	Supervisor's Name		_2. Sex	Male	Female		
3.	Address						
	Markette assessment	Present pa					
5.	Educational Qualificat	ions (Tio	ck the box	of Highes	t qualific	cation	achieved)
	Matri FA/F. B.A/B	Sc./B.Com					
6.	Training						
	Untrained PTC JV SV CT OT B.Ed (14+1) B.Ed (12+3) M.Ed Other (Please special	(y)					
7.	Year of Graduation of	professio	nal train	ing. Yea	r		
8.	Place of Origin						
		<u>Federal</u>	Punjab	sindh	NWFP	AJK	PATA/FANE
Na	Province District ame of City or Village					E	

9. P	Place of work
	rince Pederal Punjab Sindh NWFP AJK FATA/FAN of City or Village
10.	How many schools are your supervising?
11.	How many of these are Mosque schools?
	How much teaching experience you have? Years
13.	How much administrative experience you have? Years
14.	For how long you are working as headteacher/Supervisor of this school/office? Years
15.	Is the concept of Mosque school clear to you?
	No Yes
16.	Is mosque school effective than regular school?
17.	If the Mosque school is effective, then should it be regularised?
	No Yes
18.	Please explain the reasons which make mosque/regular school more effective
19.	Have you ever studied the objectives of the Mosque school system in the educational policies. No Yes
20.	Do you supervise your teachers' teaching?
	No Yes

21.	Do yo	u give the instructions to your teachers during your visit to school?
		Yes
22.	If ye	s, what kind of instructions you impart?
23.	How w	
		Not available Adequate Inadequate
	a) b) c) d) e) f) g) h)	Shelter Drinking Water Enough room/ space for children Electricity Light Boundry Wall Play ground Latrine
		kind of physical facilities are available in the mosque schools? is the qualitative difference between regular/mosque schools?
	Ans	



ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT MINISTRY OF EDUCATION ISLAMABAD

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MOSQUE SCHOOL VS: PRIMARY SCHOOL IN PAKISTAN

							School I	.D. No	W. F.
1. Sch	ool Name								
School I.D. No. 1. School Name 2. Full Address: 3. School Level: 1. Primary 2. Mosque 4. Union Council or Town Committee/Muncipal Corporation: 5. Type of School 1. Boys 2. Girls 3. Co-Education 6. Location: 7. Performance of students during last three years 1992-93 1993-94 1994-95 Total Appeared Pass Total Enrol- in Exam. Enrol- ment Class-1 Class-2 Class-3 Class-4 Class-5 Total Signature of Data Collector Signature of Headmaster									
3. Sch	ool Level	: 1. Prim	ary	2	. Mosque				
4. Uni	on Counci	l or :ee/Muncipa	1 Corp	oration:					
					ls 3. Co-	Educat	ion		
6. Loc	ation:-	1.	Urban	2. Rur	al				
7. Perfo	rmance of	students	during	last th	ree years				
	199	2-93			1993-94			1994-95	
	Enrol-		CALCADO CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY	Enrol-		The Property of the Control	Enrol-	ed in	Pass %
Class-2 Class-3 Class-4									
Total				Marie O.		EX			
Signatu	re of Data	a Collecto			Signat	cure o	f Headma	ster	

سوالنامه برائے والدین/مقامی افراد
نوط: - (ناخوانره والدین سے یہی معلومات انرطولی شکل میں عاصل کی جائیں گئی)
نا کا سیات (2) تعلیمی تا بلیت
(3) پرخ (14) ضلع
(5) صوبہ موبہ سوال بنر 1:- کیا آپ کے بچے کسی پرامرُی سکول میں پڑھھتے ہیں ۔
ال الم الم الم الم الله الله الله الله ا
U4 Uni
سوال بنر 3:- آپ کے پیچے کن جماعتوں میں زیر تعلیم ہیں بہلی جماعت جماعت دوئم
- جاءت سوتم - جاءت جهام - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم - جاءت بهنم

سول بر ١٩ :- بيرسكول آب كي تصريب كنا دوريه

سوال نبری :- آپ کے پیچ کس ذریع سے سکول جاتے ہیں -

Ju
"ما نگرا دکشه
سائيكل/موٹرسائيكل
بس ا دین
و ين
دیگرومناه تکرین .

سوال بری : - کی آپ بجر ں کی تعلیمی حالت سے مطمئن ہیں -

U'z	
ائين	

سوال بر از از ای کاجواب در نہیں، یں ہے . تد اس کی دھا است کریں .
سوال بنرع: • کیا آب کے بچوں کو مکول سے گفر پر کرنے کیلیے کام ملت ہے
الم ال الم الم الم الم الم الله الله الل
UŁ
vii

سوال بزه ۱: - اگر آپ کا جاب " یان " یی ہے تر مندرج ذیل مفاین/ کا ی سے کس مفرن/ کام ین مدد کرتے ہیں

lisse	برهاني ا	55	مضاين
			ادُدو
			دیا صی
			سائنس
	*		اسلامیات
			,
			معلومات عامم

سوال بر 11: - اگر سوال بر 19. دو بنین ، ین سے تر اس کی در اس کی ۔ دو بات بیان کریں ۔ دو بات بیان کریں ۔

میں نا خوا نده بدل علی وقت بنیں ملت کام بہرت مشکل ہوتا ہے کام بہرت مشکل ہوتا ہے کام بہرت زیادہ ہوتا ہے



سوال بزر 12: - كيا آي جي بالمركا عدل من بحول كي يرفعا في سيمطين بي -

Uk
ori

سوال بز 13:- اگرآپ مطمئن بنیں تو وجوہات بیان کریں

سوال برا ۱۱: - موجوده براغری سکول مین آب که تبدیلیان بخریز کرتے ہیں -

سوال برق 1: - كيا آ پي اي اي اي اي اي سور كول بن جاتے ہيں -

یاں نین

سوال بخر 16: - اگر آئے ای بات ہیں تو اس ال بی جاتے ہیں تو کون مواتع ہیر ؟

پچوں کے داخلہ کے ہوتی پر یوم دالدین کے موّق پر اکڑ جاتا ہوں (ہرماہ) جب بجے کی شکایت ہو . نتابع کے موقع پر جب سکول بیں کوئی تقریب ہو . کوئی اور دجہ دھا ہے کہیں .

سوال برایا: ۔ آ ہے سو بچوں کی تعلیمی میدد سے سال ہیں کتنی بار ملتی ہے ۔

بنین ملتی ایک باد دوباد تین باد

E