

IMPACT OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP ON DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN



**Niamatullah Khan
Dr. Khawaja Sabir Hussain
Syeda Shaista Bano**

**Academy of Educational Planning and Management
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Islamabad**

2017

Cataloging in Publication Data

Main entry under authors:

Niamatullah Khan, Khawaja Sabir Hussain and Syeda Shaista Bano.

Research Study on Impact of Public Private Partnership on Development of Education in Pakistan: – Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad. (AEPAM Publication No.279)

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1. Public Private Partnership | 2. Public Private Education |
| 3. Impact on development of Education | 4. AEPAM - Pakistan |

0.000

ISBN: 978-969-444-106-1

PREFACE

Education is for social capital formation and children are considered as human resource of the future. Therefore access to education remains an important policy intervention since the inception of Pakistan. However, the desired targets could not be achieved due to manifold reasons. As the immediate beneficiary of education is local population, therefore it is considered more appropriate to involve local community in the provision of education. The concept of a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) recognizes the existence of alternative options for providing education. One of the objectives of the National Education Policy (1998-2010) was to ensure that all the boys and girls, desirous of entering Secondary Education, get access to schools. The Policy further recognized that government alone could not achieve policy objectives, and it was imperative to seek the involvement of private sector in the expansion of education. National Education Commission (1959), Education Policy 1979, Sixth and Seventh Five Year Plans, and Vision 2025 strongly advocated the involvement of private sector in the qualitative and quantitative improvement of education at all levels (National Education Policy 1998-2010). The National Education Policy (2009) has pointed at several areas in education where Public Private Partnership (PPP) would be encouraged. Considering the importance of Public Private Partnership the management of AEPAM has decided to conduct this study.

I would like to express my gratitude to all the Education Managers and teachers of Provincial/Regional Education Departments for their cooperation in providing the data, other relevant information, and materials. I do appreciate the services rendered by the research team comprising Dr. Khawaja Sabir Hussain, Incharge, Research Wing, and Syeda Shaista Bano, Deputy Director (Research) and other officials who assisted in data collection from sample districts for this research study. I also appreciate professional contribution of Dr. Ghulam Haider, Deputy Director (Research) for the report. The services of Mr. Zulfiqar Ali Joya, APS for composing this report are highly appreciated.

Niamatullah Khan
Director General

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Ch#</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Page</u>
	Preface	
	Executive summary	
1	Introduction	
	1.1 National Education Policy – 2009	
	1.2 Policy Actions of National Education Policy (2009)	
	1.3 Rationale of the Study	
	1.4 Objectives of the Study	
	1.5 Significance of the Study	
2	Methodology	
	2.1 Respondents of the Study	
	2.2 Sample of the Study	
	2.3 Research Instruments of Study	
	2.4 Procedure for Data Collection and Analysis	
3	Province Wise Analysis of Schemes of Public Private Partnership	
3.1	<i>Balochistan Education Foundation</i>	
	i) BESP Implementation Completion and Result Report (ICRR) by World Bank	
3.2	<i>Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Education Foundation</i>	
	i) Girls Community Schools	
	ii) Iqra Farogh-e-Taleem Education Voucher Scheme (2014-2017)	
	iii) Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi Programme (2012-2018)	
	iv) ETEA Test for Admission	
	v) Citizen Foundation	
	vi) Philanthropist Program	
3.3	<i>Punjab Education Foundation</i>	
	i) Foundation Assisted Schools	
	ii) Education Voucher Scheme (EVS)	
	iii) Public School Support Program (PSSP)	
	iv) New School Program	
3.4	<i>Sindh Education Foundation</i>	

- i) SEF Programs
- ii) Promoting Private Schooling in Rural Sindh (PPRS)
- iii) Sindh Education Foundation Assisted Schools (SAS)
- iv) Early Learning Program (ELP)
- v) Adopt a School Program (AASP)
- vi) Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program (AALTP)
- vii) Middle & High School Program (SMHSP)
- viii) Existing School Support Program (ESSP)
- ix) Field observation regarding Foundation Schools

4 Data Analysis and Interpretation

- 4.1 Analysis of questionnaire of Education Managers
- 4.2 Analysis of questionnaire of Head Teachers and Teachers

5 Findings, Conclusions and Way Forward

- 5.1 Findings
- 5.2 Conclusions
- 5.3 Way Forward

Bibliography

Annexure

LIST OF ABBREVIATION

AALTP	Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program
AASP	Adopt a School Program
AEPAM	Academy of Educational Planning and Management
BEF	Balochistan Education Foundation
BESP	Balochistan Education Support Program
CF	Citizen Foundation
CS	Community School
ELP	Early Learning Program
ESSP	Existing School Support Program
ETEA	Educational Testing and Evaluation Agency
EVS	Education Voucher Scheme
FAS	Foundation Assisted Schools
GoB	Government of Balochistan
KM	Kilo Meter
NGO	Non-Government Organization
OOSC	Out of School Children
PEC	Parent Education Committee
PEF	Punjab Education Foundation
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PPRS	Promoting Private Schools in Rural Sindh
PSSP	Public School Support Program
SAS	SEF Assisted Schools
SEF	Sindh Education Foundation
SMHSP	Sindh Middle and High School Program

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The descriptive research study was designed to investigate impact of Public Private Partnership on the development of education in Pakistan as advocated in the National Education Policy 2009. To materialize the study objectives of the study were to: (i) examine the current status of Public Private Partnership in Pakistan, (ii) investigate the methods/procedures of Public Private Partnership in the Provinces/Regions and (iii) assess the impact of Public Private Partnership in the development of education in Pakistan. Research team of AEPAM visited the offices of Education Foundations of all provinces and in collaboration of concerned officers also visited to few schools. The focus group discussion was arranged on-site with all officers of the concerned Foundations who also assisted to arrange visits of AEPAM team to schools in the sample districts. A stratified sample was drawn from 12 districts of four provinces that included 184 education managers and 220 teachers of selected schools for this study.

Major Findings

The major findings of the study are as under:-

1. Community Schools

The community schools program had been launched in Balochistan, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, and Sindh. The main feature of this program was that community provided the land/accommodation for schools and the Education Foundations provided teachers as per approved criteria i.e. one teacher for 30 students. Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) in 2006 initiated projects 2006-2014 under BESP and 633 community schools were provided land/buildings by the community free of cost. These schools facilitated to enroll 27,000 students with 633 teachers provided by Foundation with average salary of Rs.12,000/- per month.

In Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Education Foundation started Girls Community Schools. These schools were established for those children who could not get admission in formal institutions due to non-availability of government schools in their locality. This scheme was to address out of schools children policy issue and local community was involved and motivated to provide space of at least two rooms with assurance of availability of 30 children. The management of the Foundation helped to provide teachers' salary i.e. Rs.12,000/- per month and followed the criteria i.e. minimum qualification Intermediate. The Village Education Committee was given the responsibility to monitor these schools as the ownership of the local community was felt very important for the sustainability of this scheme. The Foundation had visualized and designed multipronged strategies and launching various programs for providing educational facilities to the masses in the province. These programs indicate that Foundation is playing a vital role in quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement in education as the Foundation usually arranges the provision of education where formal system does not exist in compliance with the strategy Girls Community School were started in the areas where government schools were not available in the radius of 1

kilometer. As per available data 3648 students were enrolled in 37 schools in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and 78 new schools had been enlisted to enroll left over children.

2. Education Voucher Scheme (EVS)

Education Voucher Scheme had been launched in three provinces i.e. Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh and Punjab. In Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Education Foundation had launched voucher scheme for out of school children, where the government schools were not available. For this purpose survey of private schools was conducted and students were asked to get admission in these selected private schools of their own choice or nearest to their residence. The motto of this scheme was provision of education facility at student's door steps. The Foundation formulated a policy to provide monthly fee to children for studying in the approved private schools up to matriculation level. During field visits research teams obtained feedback from the students "if the government drops this scheme then what will be their future". The majority of the students were of the view that they would not be able to continue their education due to poverty and/or non-availability of the government schools. These state of affairs indicate that this scheme was a blessing for those who cannot get education as well as a source of accomplish targets of National Education Policy 2009. According to the Foundation, 30,000 vouchers were being issued to the out of school children in 6 districts of the province. The Foundation was paying the monthly fee at the rate of Rs.500/- per month for primary level, Rs.600/- for middle/elementary and Rs.800/- for high school. Moreover, Rs.2500/- once in a year were being given for uniform whereas all books were provided free of cost to the enrolled students.

Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) had launched Education Voucher Scheme for deserving students on same grounds where government schools are not available. Parents of the children were provided a list of partner schools in surrounding area of their residence and they made choice of school to get admission. Fee vouchers were given to parents paid by the Foundation to schools. In fact this scheme aimed to cater the educational needs of less privileged areas, *katchi abadies* and urban slums. Education Voucher Scheme targeted children who were engaged in income generating activities, orphans, children of widows, single parent, divorcees, parents with special needs/disabilities and those who were at risk of dropping out of school.

In Sindh, similarly Promoting Private Schools in Rural Sindh (PPRS) was an initiative of Sindh Education Foundation (SEF). The PPRS supported the establishment and management of private schools in the un-served localities in 18 districts of Sindh that ranked poor along three indicators-the size of the out of school children population (6-10 years), distance from the nearest primary school, and gender disparity in primary school participation. Sindh Education Foundation provides Rs.500/- per child per month subsidy to PPRS schools. Sindh Education Foundation provides free books to children and ensures capacity building of teachers and schools operators through training programs and workshops. There were 1398 PPRS Schools with enrolment of 304,482 students in the academic year 2016-2017. PPRS is the largest stakeholder in the education sector following the Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh.

Conclusions

It can be concluded that Public Private Partnership is playing a vital role in the quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education in Pakistan as per National Education Policy, 2009:

1. The different PPP programs have been launched by Education Foundations which are playing critical role in education sector. Community schools are established in Balochistan, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, and Sindh. For these schools community provides accommodation and the Foundations provide teachers. Consequently, 27000 students have been enrolled in these schools having 633 new teachers. Education Voucher Schemes have been initiated in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh and Punjab. The main feature of Education Voucher Scheme is to provide education in line with the choice of the students at their door steps. The Foundations provide monthly fee of the children to the approved private schools. The Foundation Assisted Schools Programs are one of the important PPP intervention which aims at increasing access and improving the quality of education. Moreover, Public School Support Program (PSSP) is a unique program launched in Punjab aiming at to provide free of cost quality education in existing low performing public schools. Adopt-A-School-Program (AASP) has been launched by Sindh Education Foundation through which it facilitates private sector and civil society to adopt public sector government schools. Besides these programs, the other PPP programs are Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi Program, ETEA Test for Admission, Philanthropist Program in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Early Learning Program (ELP), Adult and Adolescent Learning and Training Program (AALTP) and SEF Middle & High School Program (SMHSP) for easy access to the quality education to masses.
2. Public Private Partnership is contributing in the socio-economic development of the country by providing employment opportunities to young graduates. Moreover, PPP programs are contributing in enhancing literacy rate and producing simultaneously human capital for the country. This has affected not only the individual's living standard but also as whole to the socio-economic status of masses.
3. The Education Foundations institutions have accountability and regular monitoring system. Parents are satisfied with the quality of education of these institutions.
4. The Foundations have provided opportunities of employment to a large number of graduate/intermediate youth, thus PPP institutions have contributed to minimize unemployment in the country.
5. These education institutions provide free quality education to un-served/poor localities at their door steps. These schools have enrolled a large number of children reducing the number of out of school children in the country.
6. Education Foundations provide opportunities of capacity building of teachers of private sector and school operators through training and workshops.

7. Most of PPP institutions have basic physical facilities like separate classrooms, furniture, separate teacher, drinking water and washrooms etc. which is a supporting learning environment.

8. The PPP program ensures maintenance of discipline, improvement of annual result and grade wise enrolment in education sector as per National Education Policy, 2009 interventions.

Way Forward

1. The Public Private Partnership has proved to be an integral and important part of education service industry in the country. We have witnessed increased public interest and trust in the PPP institutions with the result that share of PPP programs need to be increased gradually maintaining quantity and quality.

2. The National Education Policy 2009 proposed measures to encourage private sector in education at the school level and to bring harmony among the public and private sectors through common standards in quality and regulatory regimes.

3. Public Private Partnership is facing some genuine problems. The attention of policy makers and implementers is required to find out rational solution, so that the masses can benefit from the fruits of Public Private Partnership and country succeed in achieving knowledge base economy and society.

4. Education Foundations in all provinces are contributing for the development of education in the country. They experience to bring out of school children in school either in public or private schools across the country. Therefore it is recommended that policy makers and implementers at Federal and Provincial levels may design pragmatic policy to bring out of school children in school and budgets of these Foundations may be increased with the task of bring all children in school in their respective provinces.

5. It is further recommended that NEMIS team may coordinate the all Heads of Education Foundations and data may be included in Pakistan Education Statistics because during field visits it was observed that no data had been collected by the provincial government.

6. Strategy may be developed with consultation of all stakeholders to provide donor financial assistance to all these Foundations to bring out of school children in school in their respective provinces.

INTRODUCTION

Major thrust areas of National Education Policy, 2009 are access, equity, quality, and governance. It envisages children as human resource of the future and instrumental in the accomplishment of knowledge based society and economy. Without access to quality education, it is impossible to produce quality human resources. These are a few reasons why governments around the world assume the responsibility for providing and financing education, especially basic education. However, this is a great and complex responsibility for any government to meet it adequately. That is why it is important for the governments to explore diverse ways of enhancing and providing educational services. The concept of a Public Private Partnership (PPP) is being recognized as an alternative option for providing education.

One of the objective of the National Education Policy (1998-2010) was to ensure that all the boys and girls, desirous of entering Secondary Education, get access to schools. The Policy further recognized that government alone could not achieve policy objectives, and hence felt imperative to seek the involvement of the private sector in the provision of education. National Education Commission (1959), Education Policy 1979, Sixth and Seventh Five Year Plans, and Vision 2025 all have strongly advocated the involvement of private sector in the qualitative improvement and quantitative expansion of education at all levels.

1.1 National Education Policy - 2009

The National Education Policy (2009) has pointed out several areas in education where Public Private Partnership (PPP) would be encouraged, such as; school construction, textbooks development, libraries development including provision of supplementary reading material, teacher education, transportation, food supplement to poor children, literacy programs and use of information communication technology.

There are many forms that can be evaluated for efficacy and then implemented according to local conditions and requirements. Some options are already successfully operational in the country as:

1. Voucher systems in existing private schools or adoption of unsatisfactory performing public schools (already first practiced in Sindh by Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) and then at a larger scale, by the Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) in poorer districts of Punjab).

2. Using premises and/or facilities of the public schools for higher than the existing level of schooling (first piloted by Punjab Education Department in 2003 and replicated by some other provinces at a small scale).
3. “Adopt a School” programme, particularly by corporate sector and philanthropists.

1.2 Public Private Partnership: National Education Policy (2009) Perspective

1. Available educational resources in the private sector shall be mapped and information made available to all. The resources in this case would include more than simply private schools which already are part of the overall education census.
2. Transparent and clear procedures shall be initiated in the education sector to allow utilization of private sector inputs. Systems shall be developed through involvement of all stakeholders, the public sector, the private sector and the community, keeping in view Ministry’s document “Public Private Partnerships in Pakistan’s Education Sector”.
3. Provincial Governments shall encourage private education at the school level as an additional option available to those who can afford such education. At the same time, provincial governments shall take steps to encourage public sector institutions to draw benefit from the resources available in the private sector.
4. A common curricular framework in general as well as professional education shall be applied to educational institutions in both the public and the private sector. Governments shall take steps to bring the public and private sectors in harmony through common standards, quality and regulatory regimes.
5. Where already a private school exists with additional admission space, the children shall be accommodated in it, through public financing and the public sector new school shall either be developed in separate vicinity or for different levels. Private sector schools shall be provided permission on a need cum quality basis.
6. Provincial and Area Governments shall develop regulations for establishing and running private sector institutions that include transparent accountability procedures. Where such regulatory bodies have already been developed, those shall be reinvigorated.
7. Provincial and Area governments shall take steps to build capacity of the regulators to enable them to effectively monitor compliance by private sector institutions.

8. Non-profit educational institutions should be provided tax incentives.

1.3 Rationale of the Study

The National Education Policy 2009 has emphasized to strengthen Public Private Partnership programs to enhance access of masses to quality education. Consequently, Education Foundations in the respective provinces have launched different programs considering particular environment to address the issues of access, equity and quality in education. In order to finance these programs provincial governments allocated and provided budget to the concerned Education Foundation in their province. Moreover, the Managing Director has also been allowed to get financial assistance from donor agencies. The present governments have taken several steps to address issue of access and quality in education through PPP. Therefore, there was a need to investigate the impact of Public Private Partnership in order to suggest measures to bring out of school children to the mainstream education system, so as to enable the children who are future human resources to contribute in national development.

1.4 Objectives of the Study

Following were the major objectives of the study:

1. To examine the current status of Public Private Partnership in Pakistan.
2. To investigate the methods/procedures of Public Private Partnership in the Provinces/Regions
3. To assess the impact of Public Private Partnership in the development of education in Pakistan

1.5 Significance of the Study

The present study was conducted to investigate the impact of Public Private Partnership on development of education in Pakistan. This study intends to contribute an important constructive input and will help policymakers/ planners to redirect their efforts in relation to the expansion of Education through Public Private Partnership. The research findings and recommendations will provide strategic guidance for the stakeholders at Federal, Provincial, and Regional levels to promote Public Private Partnership (PPP) to maximize access, equity, and quality in education.

METHODOLOGY

This is a descriptive and non-contrived study for which survey approach has been adopted. The following procedure has been followed for the collection of data from the selected districts of all Provinces/areas of Pakistan.

2.1 Respondents of the Study

The population of the study comprises officers of the Education Foundations of all provinces, district management officers, head teachers, and teachers of the involved and supported schools from which respondents of the study have been drawn.

2.2 Sample of the Study

Table 2.2.1: Description of Sample and Selected Districts

S#	Provinces	Districts	Managers	Head Teachers/Teachers
1	Punjab	Lahore	14	20
		Faisalabad	26	48
		Sahiwal	32	27
		Multan	9	16
		Chakwal	11	15
2	Sindh	Karachi	15	11
		Hyderabad	12	4
3	Balochistan	Quetta	15	10
	Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa	Peshawar	5	29
		Mardan	16	20
		Nowshera	14	20
4	AJK	Muzaffarabad	15	0
Total			184	220

2.3 Research Instruments

For the collection of data two different questionnaires were developed. One for the Education Managers and another for Headteachers and Teachers were designed. Pilot testing of the instruments was carried out in Rawalpindi district. In the light of feedback as a result of pilot testing, necessary changes were incorporated in the research instruments i.e. questionnaires. All efforts were made to design comprehensive, workable, valid, and reliable instruments to collect relevant information from the respondents.

2.4 Procedure for Data Collection and analysis

The Research Team of AEPAM visited 12 selected districts of four provinces, Azad Jammu, and Kashmir regions to collect the data. The data were analyzed quantitatively and qualitatively through SPSS. Conclusions were drawn in the light of findings of the study and within the preview of the objectives of the study. Finally recommendations were made for the implementation of National Education Policy, 2009 and designing strategies to bring out of school children in the schools through Public Private Partnership.

PROVINCE-WISE ANALYSIS OF SCHEMES OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

This section presents information analysis regarding the Public Private Partnership practices of public provincial Education Foundations in the country.

3.1 Balochistan Education Foundations (BEF)

Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) was founded in 1994 as an independent and autonomous organization through an Act of the Provincial Assembly with mandate to strengthen private sector schools and raising the standards of education in the province. Through amendments in the BEF Act 2004 and 2006, it was restructured and brought about significant reforms in its governance management and operating procedures.

In 2006, BEF was entrusted role of Apex body in Balochistan Education Support Projects (BESP) 2006-2014 (The World Bank funded initiative). The key objective of the project is the promotion of Public Private and Community Partnerships in order to improve access and quality of primary education for girls in particular. Under the BESP 633 Community Schools have been established where community provided spaces/buildings free of cost. In addition, BEF has constructed 218 school buildings and facilitated schools with solar panels for electricity and standard furniture so as to enhance the child-friendly learning environment. The project has also financial commitment of Government of Balochistan to provide post-project recurrent cost of community schools.

Government of Balochistan as per commitment has allocated and released budget from non-development side to meet salary expenditures of the teachers of BEF community primary schools. In the past, teachers' salary was Rs.4000/- even lower than the minimum labour wage laws. However, the present government recognizing the need raised the salaries to ten thousand plus to enhance the interest and commitment of teacher's of the rural community schools.

BEF plans to get further increase in the teacher's salaries as this will further enhance their commitment to their jobs in remote locations of Balochistan province where most of the teachers are reluctant to provide their teaching services.

	27,000
Students in BEF Community Schools FY 2015-16	
	782
BEF Community School Teachers	
	633
BEF Community Schools	
	32
Districts of Balochistan	

3.1.1 Balochistan Education Support Project (BESP) 2006-2014

In 2006, BEF was entrusted with a role of an Apex body in Balochistan Education Support Project (BESP), 2006-2014 (A World Bank funded initiative worth \$ 22 million). BESP had three components:

- a) Establishment of 650 Community Schools (CS) on a parent's education committee (PEC) model through community school implementing partners (CIPs).
- b) Establishment of 200 new low fee private schools through private school implementing partners (PIPs).
- c) Capacity building of PECs school teachers, school operators, BEF and CIP staff through technical implementing partners (TIPs).

Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) under the supervision and guidance of Secondary Education Department of Government of Balochistan has implemented "The World Bank" funded BESP Project (2006-2014) with great commitment and professional prudence which have been highly applauded by different stakeholders including donor agencies. World Bank hired the services of the Third Party Education Global Practice, Pakistan for preparation of the implementation completion and result Report (ICRR) of BESP. The report confirmed that all the components and targets of the project were successfully achieved by Balochistan Education Foundation and Government of Balochistan.

The 217 rural community schools have also been provided excellent furniture for students which have narrowed the difference between any good urban private school and a rural school in terms of furniture facilities.

In BEF community schools there are 762 teachers who have been working with great dedication and commitment. Government of Balochistan recognizing tremendous contribution of community schools has raised the salaries of teachers to Rs.12000/- per month.

Community schools Features

- *Poor, rural areas student*
- *Teachers 762*
- *Average salary of teacher is Rs.12000/-*
- *Availability of furniture in 217 community schools*

3.2 Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Education Foundation

Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Foundation has formulated multipronged strategies for providing educational facilities to the masses of the province. This indicates that Foundation is playing a vital role in the quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement in education. The Foundation usually arranges provision of education

- *Progress Updates*
- *Beneficiaries:*
- *2012-13 = 7471 students in 100 schools.*
- *2013-14 = 9422 students in 132 schools.*
- *2014-15 = 10128 students in 110 schools.*
- *2015-16 = 3648 students in 37 schools.*
- *78 New schools have been enlisted.*
- *Agreements with the partner schools are effective from Oct 2016.*
- *Further applications are being scrutinized*

where formal system does not exist, for example; Girls Community Schools have been started where government schools are not available in the radius of 1 KM. Similarly Iqra Vouchers scheme has been initiated where government schools are not available to children. Some important Public Private Partnership programs have been explained below:-

3.2.1 Girls Community Schools

This scheme has been started for those children who could not get admission due to the non-availability of government schools near to their homes. In other words, this scheme is to address out of schools children. As per policy local community is motivated to provide space of at least 2 rooms with the availability of 30 children. The management of the Foundation provides teachers salary amounting to Rs.12000/- per month having at least intermediate level of education. The village Education Committee has been formulated which are responsible to monitor these schools. It consequently ensures the ownership of the local community which is very important for the sustainability of this scheme.

Girls Community Schools

- *Intermediate passed women as teacher.*
- *At least 30 children, particularly girls.*
- *Non-availability of Govt. school in the radius of 1 KM.*
- *Mobilized community to provide space, with 2 rooms.*
- *Teachers Honorarium @ 12,000/- (per month) is paid through crossed cheque.*
- *Text books and other learning material provided free.*
- *Look after by Village Education Committee (VEC).*
- *Boys students are also allowed to get admission in these schools*

3.2.2 Iqra Farogh-e-Taleem Education Voucher Scheme (2014-2017)

The Education Foundation has launched Education Voucher Scheme for out of school children in those areas where government schools are not available. For selection of private schools survey of schools is conducted. Students are provided to these approved private schools. Students and parents choose school of their own choice or nearest their door steps. The motto of this scheme is the provision of education as per choice of students at their door steps. The Foundation follows policy to provide monthly fee of the children to the approved private schools. The scheme aims at to provide education to the students' upto matric level. During field visit it was inquired from the students that "if the government drops this scheme then what will be their future"? Majority of the students were of the view that they would not be able to continue their education due to poverty and non-availability of the government schools. This state of affairs indicates that this scheme is a blessing for those who could not get education.

Target

- *30,000 vouchers in 6 Districts for out-of-school children.*
- *Monthly Fee*
- *Primary level Rs.500/-PM*
- *Middle/elementary Rs.600/-*
- *High school level Rs. 800/-*
- *Rs. 2500/- once a year for uniform.*
- *Books are also provided to these children.*

3.2.3 Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi Programme (2012-2018)

This is an important program of the Foundation for those out of school children who could not get admission after primary education. It covers education of students from classes 6 to 10. This project is a golden opportunity for those students who intend to continue education. The Foundation hired the services of a firm to conduct survey of out of school children, which indentified 30,000 out of school children and the Foundation set target to provide free education to 20,000 students at Union Council level where the government schools are not available for classes 6 to 10.

Target

- *To provide free education to 20,000 students in low cost private schools, of those union councils where Govt. schools are not available*

Main features

- *30,000 out-of-school children identified through survey by an external firm.*
- *For the session 2015-16, 16455 vouchers redeemed in 202 schools.*
- *For the 2nd cycle, M/S Grant Thornton an external firm is hired to identify 30,000 out-of-school children.*

3.2.4 ETEA Test for Admission

This is a unique program of the Foundation for the poor talented students of the province. The motto of this scheme is to provide free and quality education from class 7 to university education. The project visualizes 97 poor talented students of government schools of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa getting education in quality educational institution of the province on government expenses. Before the start of the session, Directorate of Elementary and Secondary Education invites application for appearing in the test. Two students from each district of the province are selected for admission to well reputed institutions of the province.

- *Feature of scheme*
- *Poor talented student*
- *Equal chance for male and female student*
- *Student of Each district get chance*

3.2.5 Citizen Foundation

It was observed that Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa government had handed over 5 government schools to citizen Foundation (A non-governmental organization) for operating. This NGO has been given authority to use only school building in other words resources of the government for providing education. If success is achieved this can lead to new direction of Public Private Partnership in the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Province.

3.2.6 Philanthropist Program

This program is similar to adopt a school program, where one individual can adopt a school of one's own choice, for the provision of physical facilities or making school building attractive etc. This can also be graded as a limited program of PPP in KP Province.

On the basis of these facts it can be concluded that in KP Public Private Partnership program are successfully functioning under the direct control of Education Foundation.

However, there are some limitations which are needed to be addressed to ensure a strong Public Private Partnership.

3.3 Punjab Education Foundation (PEF)

The following programs have been undertaken by the Punjab Education Foundation through Public Private Partnership

3.3.1 Foundation Assisted Schools

Foundation Assisted Schools program was initiated in 6 under-developed districts and later on it was expanded to 36 districts. According to this program Punjab Education Foundation provides assistance in fee to private schools located in rural and urban areas of Punjab. The exact number of those schools could not be ascertain which were being provided financial and technical support by PEF. However, purpose of this program is to enhance quality of education through private sector schools working in rural and urban areas of Punjab.

3.3.2 Education Voucher Scheme (EVS)

The Foundation has launched Education Voucher Scheme for deserving students of those areas where government schools are not available. Parents of the children are given list of partner schools nearest to their residence and they have choice to get admission to the school. The fee vouchers are paid by the Foundation. In fact this scheme caters the educational needs of those students who belong to less-privileged areas/*katchi abadies*/urban slums. Vouchers are provided to parents at their door steps and parents enjoy freedom of choice for the selection of EVS partner school for their children. EVS targets children who are engaged in income generating activities, orphans, children of widows/ single parent/ divorcees, parents with special needs/ disabilities and students who are at risk of dropping out of school.

3.3.3 Public School Support Program (PSSP)

Pubic School Support Program (PSSP) is a unique program in Punjab. The purpose of this program is to improve quality of education in low performing public schools. This is a non-commercial, non-profit program with an aim to provide free of cost quality education in existing public schools through involvement of private sector with goals as under:

- i) To increase enrolment in low performing Public Sector Schools.
- ii) To improve quality of education.
- iii) To provide conducive teaching and learning facilities.
- iv) To ensure enrolment of Out of School Children (OOS).

3.3.4 Adoption of Public Sector School Program

It is pertinent to mention that during field visits, the research team observed resistance from the teachers because when the Foundation adopts any public school it transfers the existing teachers to the nearest schools. This resistance is against transfer of teachers because they feel uncomfortable to lose their comfortable zone. Moreover it was also revealed that concerned district Management Officers did not even have information regarding the handing over of their schools functioning under their supervision, to the Foundation. They were of the view that they just receive orders from the top management and had to obey the orders. They also pointed out that some schools which were showing good performance had been given at the disposal of the influential NGOs

Criteria for adaptation of public sector school:

- *Poor performance/low annual result of last two years*
- *Enrolment less than 100 in primary school/elementary*
- *Management of school is given to NGO*
- *Per child fee is paid to operator of school*

3.3.5 New School Program

The Foundation started a new school program in 2008 with the aim to increase enrolment and enhance retention rate in the schools. This program has been specially designed to cater the educational needs of those children who belong to the poor, rural and remote areas across the province. This program aims at addressing disadvantaged population and groups in rural and remote areas with special emphasis on illiterate girls and women.

This program was started in those districts of Punjab where literacy rate was low and ratio of out of school children was high. Through this program enrolment and retention of out of school children is facilitated by adopting various effective strategies.

3.4 Sindh Education Foundation (SEF)

Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) is focusing on efforts to provide access to quality education to local communities especially those in the remote and under developed regions of the province. With approximately 2,447 schools and outreach of 491,555 students by the beginning of academic year 2016-17; SEF becomes one of the largest stakeholders in the education sector after the Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh. The number of schools, teachers and the learners have increased manifold in the last few years that reflects the level of commitment the Foundation shares.

The following programs have been undertaken by the Sindh Education Foundation through Public Private Partnership:

- i) Promoting Private Schooling in Rural Sindh (PPRS)
- ii) SEF Assisted Schools (SAS)
- iii) Early Learning Program (ELP)
- iv) Adopt a School Program (AASP)
- v) Adult and Adolescent Learning and Training Program (AALTP)
- vi) SEF Middle & High School Program (SMHSP)

vii) Existing Schools Support Program (ESSP)

3.4.1 Promoting Private Schooling in Rural Sindh (PPRS)

Promoting Private Schooling in Rural Sindh (PPRS) program is an initiative of the Sindh Education Foundation under the auspices of Public-Private Partnership Sindh. Initially launched under Sindh Education Reform Program-I (SERP-I) in 2008-2009, the program continued as part of SERP-II in 2013-2014 in collaboration with World Bank. The PPRS interventions support establishment and management of private schools in the underserved localities in 18 districts of Sindh that rank poorly along three indicators; i.e. the size of the out-of-school children population (6-10 years), distance to the nearest primary school, and gender disparity in primary school participation. SEF intends to promote long-term public-private partnerships through providing Rs.500/- per child per month subsidy to PPRS in order to create greater access to education in marginalized areas of Sindh. Sindh Education Foundation provides books to PPRS children and ensures capacity building of teachers/schools operators through trainings and workshops. There are total of 1398 PPRS Schools with enrolment of 304,482 students in the academic year 2016-17.

3.4.2 Sindh Education Foundation Assisted Schools (SAS)

The Sindh Education Foundation Assisted Schools (SAS) Program is the amalgamation of Integrated Education Learning Program (IELP) and Rural Based Community School (RBCS) program. It is the Foundation's largest scheme which aims to establish Public Private Partnerships for increasing access of children to education and improving the quality of education (Primary, Elementary, and Secondary) services across the most underserved areas of Sindh. SAS endeavors to shift the paradigm of SEF partners from a profit-orientated approach to education-oriented one. Through this program primary schools are upgraded to elementary and secondary levels, and other facilitations such as establishment of audio visual labs, installment of solar system, computer labs and ICT based teaching learning environment alongwith well equipped infrastructure in selected schools. Moreover subsidy is provided as Rs.500/- per-child per-month for primary education, Rs.700/- per-child per-month for elementary education and Rs. 800/- per-child per-month for secondary education. As per available data 918 schools with enrolment of 157,752 students were functioning during the academic year 2016-17.

3.4.3 Early Learning Program (ELP)

ELP was initiated in 2009 with the sole aim to improve early education through qualitative reforms in 150 targeted government schools across 5 districts of Sindh, i.e. Tando Muhammad Khan, Badin, Khairpur, Noushehra Feroz and Ghotki. There were 150 ELP Schools with enrolment of 10,810 students in the academic year 2016-17.

3.4.4 Adopt a School Program (AASP)

Sindh Education Foundation has launched Adopt-A-School-Program (AASP) in 1998. Through this program Foundation facilitates private sector and civil society to adopt a public or government schools with certain conditions.

The program has made significant progress in qualitative and quantitative terms; starting from 1998, AASP is now supporting 582 government schools with the help of 102 school adopters in 18 districts of the province benefiting over 131,000 children and approximately 4981 teachers during 2016-17.

3.4.5 Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program (AALTP)

Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program (AALTP) is for adolescents and adults, who have missed an opportunity to avail formal education. The AALTP aims to provide accelerated formal primary education for vulnerable adolescents and basic functional literacy for adults together with a certified Skill Development / Vocational Training course for each learner for enabling them with varying opportunities of socio economic growth. The component of education is financially supported by SEF; whereas, training components are funded through the financial help of Government of Sindh. SEF provides Rs. 1000/- per-Learner per-month subsidy for schools. There were 14 AALTP Schools with enrolment of 693 students during the academic year 2016-17 in the province.

3.4.6 Middle & High School Program (SMHSP)

SEF Middle / High School Program (SMHSP) aims to help in filling the massive gap in the post-primary education in the province. The objective of the initiative is to increase the provision of post-primary education through public-private partnership across Sindh province. These schools intend to offer quality education with emphasis on "Student Centered" teaching and learning approach. All Schools are being facilitated to have adequate infrastructure and teaching and learning facilities for supporting a well-rounded student development. There were 117 schools with enrolment of 28,628 students during academic year 2016-17 in the province.

3.4.7 Existing School Support Program (ESSP)

The Existing School Support Program (ESSP) has been launched for supporting the existing schools of the private sector in the province in the academic year 2017-18. The purpose of this program is to reach out to the "Existing low cost private schools" already functioning in the rural, semi urban and urban areas of the province and are serving the poor communities. This program aims at bringing these low-cost private schools under the Foundation's overall regulatory and financial support including monitoring and technical support with a view to ensure sustainability of and quality education in these schools.

3.4.8 Field observations about Schools

Major observations about Sindh Education Foundation schools are as under:

- i) SEF is playing a vital role in the provision of education facilities to the marginal and unprivileged population of Sindh.

- ii) Foundation has emphasized on infrastructure development of involved schools through partners/operators.
- iii) School buildings safety for children and provision of basic needs for learners are being ensured.
- iv) More than 70 percent teachers have been trained; whereas, 90 percent head teachers have got training from SEF. Schools operators are also trained through capacity building SEF programs.
- v) Majority of teachers in associated schools have intermediate level qualifications.
- vi) Transport facility is provided to SEF female teachers.
- vii) Textbooks are provided free to SEF school children.
- viii) A subsidy of Rs. 500/- per child per month is provided in PPRS schools.
- ix) SEF provides support in establishment of Audio Visual Labs and Computer Labs in selected schools.

DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

The section presents data analysis and its interpretation collected through structured questionnaires.

4.1 Perception and Awareness of Education Managers

The study was designed to investigate the impact of Public Private Partnership on the development of education in Pakistan. The perception and awareness of Education Managers was explored through research tool questionnaire along with group discussions.

4.1.1 Need of Public Private Partnership

The respondents were requested to provide their opinion regarding the need of Public Private Partnership for educational development in the country. The majority of the respondents of Education Foundations and concerned Education Managers had opinion that it was not possible for government alone to bring all out of school children in schools due to non-availability of infrastructure. Therefore, Public Private Partnership is very essential to enhance access to education to the masses through involvement of private sector. Their responses are presented in Table 4.1.1

Table 4.1.1 - Need of PPP in Pakistan – Perception Analysis

Yes (%)	No (%)
97	3

97% of Education Managers expressed their opinion that Public Private Partnership was needed to cater the educational needs of the masses (Table 4.1.1).

4.1.2 Development of Education

Table 4.1.2 – Views about PPP as a mean for Development of Education

Yes (%)	No (%)
98	2

The respondents were requested to provide their opinion regarding development of education 98% opined that PPP is a mean for development of education in Pakistan.

4.1.3 Types of Public Private Partnership

It was observed that Public Private Partnership (PPP) program were launched in all provinces but it depended on the nature and needs of provincial concerns and priorities. The Provincial Education Departments have established Education Foundations and each Foundation has launched various PPP programs as per availability of funds and approval of the concerned provincial governments. Therefore, respondents were requested to provide information in this regard. Their responses are presented in Table 4.1.3:-

Table 4.1.3 – Types of Public Private Partnership in Practice

S#	Types	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Education Vouchers Scheme (EVS)	70	30
2	Education Foundation Assisted Schools (FAS)	16	84
3	Community Schools (with provision of accommodation)	85	15
4	Public Sector School Adopt Scheme	16	83

The Table 4.1.3 illustrates that 70% of the respondents reported that Education Vouchers Scheme was launched in their province, 85% of the respondents were of the view that they knew about community schools where community provided accommodation and Foundation gave salary of the teachers. Only 16% respondents were of the view that Education Foundation Assisted Schools were functioning and public sector school adopt scheme had been launched in their province respectively. Data show that 83% negated this question. During field visits it was observed that adopt a public sector school scheme had been launched only in the Punjab province, in fact PEF adopted criteria for taking public sector schools and the management of these schools was given to the NGOs for two or three years with certain conditions. Similarly Education Foundation assisted schools are only functioning in Punjab province while the respondents from other province negated this question.

4.1.4 Advantages of PPP

Table 4.1.4 - Advantage of Public Private Partnership

S#	Aspects	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Ensure strict monitoring and supervision	90	10
2	Maintaining discipline	64	36
3	Increases in grade wise enrolment	56	44
4	Improvement in annual results	66	34
5	Ensures teacher availability and punctuality	69	31
6	Parent satisfaction	68	32

Table 4.1.4 shows that majority of the respondents viewed PPP as ensuring factor for strict monitoring and supervision of schools (90%), availability and punctuality of teachers in schools (69%) and parent satisfaction (68%). Similarly, a majority of participants opined that through PPP program maintenance of discipline (64%), improvement of annual results (66%) and increase in grade wise enrolment (56%) had been achieved and enhanced in the selected schools.

4.1.5 Strategies

Table 4.1.5 - Strategy of Foundations/ NGOs

S#	Strategy	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Strict monitoring and supervision	89	11
2	Ensure availability of teachers	88	12
3	Increase in enrolment	86	14
4	Getting more admission by motivating the parents	65	35
5	Enhance quality of education	77	23
6	Improve annual results	79	21

Table 4.1.5 shows that a large majority of the respondents expressed that Foundation had adopted strategies of strict monitoring and supervision (89%) so as to ensure availability of teachers (88%) and increase in enrolment in the selected schools (86%) 79% and 77% respondents were of the view that strategies of the Foundations had enhanced the quality of education and had brought about improvement in annual results of the selected schools respectively.

4.1.6 Monitoring of Programs

Table 4.1.6 - Monitoring Schedule

Monitoring Schedule	Yes (%)	No (%)
Weekly	1	99
Monthly	90	10
Quarterly	98	2
When it is required	96	4

Data in the Table 4.1.6 depict that more than 90% of the respondents had opinion that the Foundations had adopted monthly and quarterly monitoring schedule, this indicated true picture, because on the basis of enrolment the Foundations paid fee of the students to the concerned either operator/ managers or NGOs

4.1.7 Provision of Physical Facilities

Table 4.1.7 – Availability of Physical Facilities

S#	Physical Facilities	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Separate class rooms	73	27
2	Separate teachers for each class	54	46
3	Drinking water	54	46
4	Furniture	63	38
5	Washrooms	32	68
6	Electricity	39	61
7	Boundary Wall	36	64
9	Computer Lab	7	93

The Table 4.1.7 indicates that 73% of the schools had separate classrooms for their students. 63% of the respondents acknowledged the availability of the furniture for the students. 54% of the schools had separate teachers for each class and drinking water was available in the schools. In fact the Foundations provided one teacher for 30 students and multi-grade teaching was observed during field visits by the AEPAM team.

4.2 Analysis of Data of Head Teachers and Teachers

4.2.1 PPP Practices

Table 4.2.1 - Category of Public Private Partnership (PPP)

S#	Types of PPP	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Education Vouchers Scheme (EVS)	85	15
2	Education Foundation Assisted Schools (FAS)	47	53
3	Community Schools	27	73
4	Adopt a school program (AASP)	25	75
5	Public School Support Program (PSSP)	20	80
6	Early Learning Program (ELP)	20	80

85% of the respondents pointed out that EVS scheme was being implemented in their provinces, 47% indicated that Foundation had provided assistance to private schools and 27% expressed viewed that community schools were functioning in their provinces (Table 4.2.1).

4.2.2 Views of Parents and Community

Table 4.2.2 - Opinion of Parents/Community Regarding the Schools

S#	Statements	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Parents are fully satisfied	70	30
2	Parents prefer to send children to the school	69	31
3	Teaching learning environment improved	67	33
4	Parents feel that new teachers are available in school	70	30
5	Teachers absenteeism has been controlled	68	32

70% of the respondents revealed that parents were satisfied with Foundation selected schools, 69% pointed out that parents preferred to send their children to these schools due to free books and uniforms. Head teaches and teachers expressed that teaching learning environment had improved (67%) teachers' availability had been ensured and teachers' absenteeism has been controlled in the Foundation selected schools (68%) (Table 4.2.2).

4.2.3 Provision of Physical Facilities

Table 4.2.3 - Availability of Physical Facilities in the Schools

S#	Physical Facilities	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Separate class rooms	60	27
2	Separate teachers for each class	55	25
3	Drinking water	70	32
4	Furniture	67	30
5	Washrooms	70	32
6	Electricity	80	36
7	Boundary Wall	82	37
8	Play Ground	65	30
9	Computer Lab	25	11

Table 4.2.3 depicts the provision of physical facilities where 60% of the teachers pointed out separate classrooms were available in the selected schools. During field visits in Punjab province only those government schools which had been handed over to the NGOs had separate rooms. Similarly in Sindh province the Foundation selected schools which were being operated by private owners had separate rooms and separate teachers. 70% of the teachers indicated availability of drinking water and washrooms facilities, 82% and 80% teachers pointed out presence of boundary walls and electricity facility in the selected schools.

4.2.4 Advantages of PPP

Table 4.2.4 - Advantages of Public Private Partnership

S#	Aspects Statements	Yes (%)	No (%)
1	Ensures strict monitoring	63	37
2	Maintaining discipline	64	36
3	Increases in grade wise enrolment	66	34
5	Improvement in annual results	65	35
6	Ensures teacher availability and punctuality	63	37
7	Parent satisfaction	70	30

The data in Table 4.2.4 illustrates that Public Private Partnership had ensured strict monitoring system in these selected schools (63%); 64% teachers pointed out better discipline in these schools. 66% and 65% teachers were of the view that both enrolment and annual results had improved in these schools whereas 63% and 70% of the respondents indicated better availability and punctuality of teachers and satisfaction of parents in these selected schools.

FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND WAY FORWARD

5.1 Major Findings

Various schemes/programs have been implemented in the provinces under Public Private Partnership initiatives which have following major features:-

5.1.1 Community Schools

The community schools program had been launched in Balochistan, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, and Sindh. The main feature of this program was that community had provided space/building free of cost for schools and the Foundation had provided teachers as per approved criteria i.e. one teacher for 30 students. For example; Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) in 2006 started projects BESP 2006-2014 and 633 Community Schools were established, whereas in 27,000 students were enrolled with 633 teachers. The average salary of teacher has been fixed as Rs.12,000/- per month which was paid by the Education Foundation.

Similarly in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Education Foundation started Girls Community Schools program. These schools were established for those children who could not get admission in the government schools due to non-availability near by their locality. This scheme was to address out of schools children policy issue and local community was motivated to provide space of at least two rooms with the availability of 30 children. The management of the Foundation provided teachers' salary i.e. Rs 12000/- per month and followed the selection criteria of teachers i.e. minimum qualification Intermediate. The village Education committees were created which were responsible to monitor these schools as the ownership of the local community was very important for sustainability of this scheme. In fact, the Foundation had designed multipronged strategies by launching various programs for providing educational facilities to the masses of the province. This indicates that Foundations are playing a vital role in quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement in arranging educational facilities in the province. The Foundation usually arranges the provision of education where formal public system does not exist; for example; Girls Community School were started in the areas where government schools were not available in the radius of 1 kilometer. As per available data there were 3648 students were enrolled in 37 schools in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and 78 new schools were enlisted to extend the program.

5.1.2 Education Voucher Scheme (EVS)

It was found that education voucher scheme had been launched in three provinces i.e. Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh, and Punjab. In Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa the Foundation has launched voucher scheme for out of school children, where government schools were not available. The Foundations conducted survey of private schools and students were provided to them for admission in schools of their own choice or nearest to their residence. The motto of this scheme was provision of quality education at the choice of the students at their door steps. The Foundation as per policy used to pay monthly fee of the children to the approved private schools. The most important feature was the provision of free education to the student upto matriculation level. During field visits research teams inquired from the students, if government drops this scheme then what will be their future? Majority of the students responded that they would not be able to continue their education due to poverty and non-availability of places in government schools. This state of affairs indicates that this scheme is a blessing for those who can not get education. According to the Education Foundation 30,000 vouchers are being disbursed to the out of school children in 6 districts of the province. The value of monthly fee vouchers is Rs.500/- per month for primary level, Rs 600/- for middle/elementary and Rs.800/- for high school level. Moreover, Rs.2500/- once a year are given to students for uniform, whereas all books are provided free to the enrolled students.

In Punjab PEF has launched Education Voucher Scheme for deserving students of those localities, where government schools are not available. Parents of the children are given list of private partner schools nearest to their homes. They have the choice to get admission in a private school of their own liking and fees vouchers are paid by the Education Foundation. This scheme aims to cater the educational needs of less privileged areas/katchi abadies/urban slums. Vouchers are provided to households that give them freedom of exercising their choice for the selection of EVS partner school for their children. EVS targets children who are engaged in income generating activities, orphans, children of widows/ single parent/ divorcees, parents with special needs/ disabilities and the students who are at risk of dropping out of schools.

In Sindh, Promoting Private Schools in Rural Sindh (PPRS) is an initiative of Sindh Education Foundation. The PPRS supports establishment and management of private schools in the un-served localities in 18 districts of Sindh that has been ranked poor along three indicators - the size of the out of school children population (6-10 years), distance from the nearest primary school, and gender disparity in primary school participation. SEF provides Rs.500/- per child per month subsidy to PPRS schools. SEF also provides free books to children and ensures capacity building of teachers/schools operators through training and workshops. There were 1398 PPRS Schools of private sector with enrolment of 304,482 students during academic year 2016-2017. PPRS is the largest stakeholder in the education sector following the Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh.

5.1.3 Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi Program (2012-2018)

In Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa this is a very important program of the Education Foundation for those out of school children who could not get admission after primary education. This scheme has been formulated for the students from classes 6 to 10.

5.1.4 ETEA Test for Admission

In Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa this is a unique program of the Foundation for the poor talented students. The motto of this scheme is to provide free and quality education to selected students from class 7 to university education. Under this scheme 97 poor talented students of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa are enrolled in high ranking educational institutions of the province on government expenses.

5.1.5 Citizen Foundation

This NGO has been given authority to use only the buildings of the government schools for education purposes. This is very limited Public Private Partnership in the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa to maximize the use of available resources for education.

5.1.6 Adopt a School Program (AASP)

Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) has launched Adopt a School Program (AASP). Through this program the Foundation facilitates private sector and civil society to adopt a government school. Similarly, in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa the philanthropist program is also a form of “adopt a school program”.

5.1.7 Foundation Assisted Schools

Foundation Assisted Schools program was initially started in 6 under-developed districts of Punjab and later on it expanded in 36 districts. According to this program Punjab Education Foundation provides assistance in fee to private schools, through Public Private Partnership, functioning in the rural and urban areas of Punjab. The Research Team could not get exact number of those schools which were being provided financial and technical support by PEF to enhance quality of education.

The SEF Assisted Schools (SAS) program is the largest scheme of Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) which aims to establish Public Private Partnership for increasing access to education and improving the quality of education (primary, elementary and secondary) services for children across the most un-served areas of Sindh. The current interventions of SEF regarding SAS are: up-gradation of primary schools to the elementary level and elementary schools to secondary level and providing support in the establishing audio visual labs, installation of solar system, computer labs, and ICT based teaching and learning environment alongwith well equipped infrastructure in selected schools. There were 918 SAS with enrolment of 157,752 students in the academic year 2016-2017.

5.1.8 Public School Support Program (PSSP)

Public School Support Program (PSSP) is a unique program in Punjab. The purpose of this program is to improve quality of education in low performing public schools. This is a non-commercial, non-profit program with an aim to provide free of cost quality education in existing public schools through the involvement of private sector with a goal to enhance enrolment in low performance public schools. This program is also meant to provide quality education and enhance enrolment particularly of out of school children (OOSC).

5.1.9 Early Learning Program (ELP)

In Sindh province the ELP was initiated in 2009 with the sole aim to improve pre-primary education through qualitative reforms in 150 targeted government schools. There were 150 ELP Schools with enrolment of 10,810 in the academic year 2016-17.

5.1.10 Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program (AALTP)

In Sindh, the Adolescent and Adult Learning and Training Program (AALTP) aims to provide accelerated formal primary education for vulnerable adolescents and basic functional literacy to adults. SEF provides Rs. 1000/- per-Learner per-month subsidy to schools. There were 14 AALTP Schools with enrolment of 693 students in the academic year 2016-17.

5.1.11 Middle & High School Program (SMHSP)

Sindh Education Foundation Middle / High School Program (SMHSP) aims to help in filling the massive gap in the post-primary education in the province Sindh. The objective of this initiative is to increase the provision of post-primary education through Public Private Partnership across Sindh. There were 117 schools involved in this scheme with enrolment of 28,628 students during the academic year 2016-17 when study was carried out.

5.1.12 Existing School Support Program (ESSP)

The Existing School Support Program (ESSP) has been launched by Sindh Education Foundation for supporting the existing private sector schools in the province during the academic year 2017-2018. The purpose of this program is to reach out to the "Existing low cost private schools" already functioning in the rural, semi urban and urban areas of Sindh province.

5.1.13 Need of Public Private Partnership - Perception

The study aimed at to investigate the impact of Public Private Partnership on the development of education in Pakistan by involving Foundations' officers, managers, head-teachers and teachers. Therefore, the respondents were requested to reflect their perception regarding need of Public Private Partnership in education. The majority of the respondents (97%) opined that it was not possible for government alone to bring all out of school children

in schools due to shortage of infrastructure, therefore Public Private Partnership was very essential to enhance the access to education of the masses.

5.1.14 Advantage of Public Private Partnership

During study the perception regarding advantages of PPP were also investigated. It was revealed that PPP had ensured strict mechanism of monitoring and supervision of schools (90%), availability and punctuality of teachers in schools (69%) and parents' satisfaction (68%). The respondents had also opined that through this program maintenance of discipline (64%), improvement of annual results (66%) and grade wise enrolment had been achieved (64%). This situation analysis reflects significant impact of private public partnership on the development of education in Pakistan.

5.1.15 Strategy of Foundations/ NGOs

The respondents were of the opinion that the Foundations had adopted strategy of strict monitoring and supervision (89%) had ensured availability of teachers (88%) and had also increased the enrolment in the schools (86%). Regarding the quality and annual results the respondents were of the view that strategies of the Foundations had enhanced the quality of education (79%) and brought about improvement in annual results (77%) of the schools. The analysis reveals that the strategies of Foundations are appropriate to achieve the objectives.

5.1.16 Monitoring Schedule

Data indicates the opinion of the respondents that the Foundations had adopted strict monthly and quarterly monitoring schedule. As it had been paying fee of the students to the concerned either operators/managers or NGOs.

5.1.17 Physical Facilities

Regarding the availability of physical facilities in these associated schools, the respondents expressed that the schools had separate classrooms for their students (73%), furniture was available for the students (63%), schools had separate teachers for each class (54%), and facility of drinking water was available in the schools. The Foundations as per policy provides one teacher for 30 students but multi-grade teaching was observed during field visits.

5.1.18 Perception of Parents/Community towards Foundation Supported Schools

Parents' reactions to these Foundations associated schools were also investigated. It was revealed that parents were satisfied with these schools (70%), reasons being free books and uniforms (69%), improved teaching and learning environment (67%), teachers' availability and control on teachers' absenteeism (68%) in these schools.

5.2 Conclusions

It is concluded that public private is playing vital role in the quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education system of Pakistan.

- 5.2.1 The different PPP programs launched through Education Foundations in different provinces of Pakistan are playing critical role in education sector. Community schools have been established in Balochistan, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Sindh. For these schools community provides accommodation and the Education Foundations provide teachers. Total 27000 students have been enrolled in these schools with 633 teachers. Likewise, education voucher schemes have been launched in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh and Punjab. The main feature of education voucher scheme is to provide education at the choice of the students at their door steps. The Foundations provide monthly fee of the children to the approved private schools. The Foundation Assisted Schools Program is one of the important PPP intervention which aims at increasing access to education and improving the quality of education. Moreover, public school support program (PSSP) is a unique program launched in Punjab. The purpose of this program is only to provide free of cost quality education in existing low performing public schools. Adopt-A-School-Program (AASP) was launched by Sindh Education Foundation through which SEF facilitated private sector and civil society to adopt public schools. Besides these programs, the other PPP programs are Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi Program, ETEA Test for Admission, Philanthropist Program in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Early Learning Program (ELP), Adult and Adolescent Learning and Training Program (AALTP) and SEF Middle & High School Program (SMHSP) for easy access to the quality education to masses.
- 5.2.2 The Public Private Partnership is contributing in the socio economic development of the country by providing employment opportunities to young graduates. Moreover, PPP programs are contributing in enhancing literacy rate and producing simultaneously human capital for the country. This has affected not only the individual's living standard but also as whole to the socio economic development of masses.
- 5.2.3 The Education Foundation institutions have accountability and regular monitoring system. Parents are satisfied with the quality of education of these institutions.
- 5.2.4 The Education Foundations have provided opportunities of employment to a large number of graduate/intermediate youth, thus PPP institutions have contributed to eliminate educated unemployment in the country.
- 5.2.5 These education institutions provide free quality education in un-served/poor localities at the door steps of children. In the absence of schools a large number of children are vulnerable to join out of school lot.
- 5.2.6 Education Foundations provide opportunities of capacity building of private sector teachers and school operators through training and workshops.

- 5.2.7 Most of PPP institutions possess basic physical facilities like separate classrooms, furniture, separate teacher, drinking water and washrooms etc.
- 5.2.8 The PPP program has ensured maintenance of discipline in schools, improvement of annual results and grade wise increase in enrolment in the schools.

5.3 Way Forward

- 5.3.1 The Public Private Partnership has proved to be an integral and important part of education service industry in the country. We have witnessed increased public interest and trust in the PPP institutions with the result that share of PPP programs need to be increased gradually maintaining quantity and quality.
- 5.3.2 The National Education Policy 2009 proposed measures to encourage private sector in education at the school level and to bring harmony among the public and private sectors through common standards in quality and regulatory regimes.
- 5.3.3 Public Private Partnership is facing some genuine problems. The attention of policy makers and implementers is required to find out rational solution, so that the masses can benefit from the fruits of Public Private Partnership and country succeed in achieving knowledge base economy and society.
- 5.3.4 Education Foundations in all provinces are contributing for the development of education in the country. They experience to bring out of school children in school either in public or private schools across the country. Therefore it is recommended that policy makers and implementers at Federal and Provincial levels may design pragmatic policy to bring out of school children in school and budgets of these Foundations may be increased with the task of bring all children in school in their respective provinces.
- 5.3.5 It is further recommended that NEMIS team may coordinate the all Heads of Education Foundations and data may be included in Pakistan Education Statistics because during field visits it was observed that no data had been collected by the provincial government.
- 5.3.6 Strategy may be developed with consultation of all stakeholders to provide donor financial assistance to all these Foundations to bring out of school children in school in their respective provinces.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Government of Pakistan (2014). Pakistan Education for ALL, Review Report 2015, Islamabad, NEMIS/Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Punjab Education Foundation: Pre-qualification Document for Pre-Qualification of Firms for Development, Printing, Conduction and Marking of Trained Teachers' and Head Teachers' Test (Issued by) Deputy Director Procurement: - Lahore. 6p.
- Government of Sindh. Education and Literacy Department. Innovative solutions for education through sustainable partnerships. Karachi. www.sindheducation.gov.pk (www.sef.org.pk).
- Government of Balochistan: Progress Report 2015-2016. – Quetta: Balochistan Education Foundation. 2017. 109p.
- American psychological association (2010). Publication manual (6th ed). Washington, DC: Author.
- Government of Pakistan (1959). National Commission on Education, Karachi, Ministry of Education.
- Government of Pakistan (1992). National Education Policy (1992). – Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- Government of Pakistan (1998). National Education Policy (1998-2010)). – Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- Government of Pakistan (2009). National Education Policy (2009). – Islamabad: Ministry of Education Pakistan.
- Harry Anthony Patrinos, et al. (2009). The World Bank. The Role and Impact of Public Private Partnerships in Education. – Washington DC: The World Bank.
- Aliya Khalid and Zahid Javed (2016). The Role of Public Private Partnership in Provision of Physical Facilities in Schools: A sociological Study of District Bhakkar: Bulletin of Education and Research June, 2016. Vol.38, No.1, p.225-234.
- Naeem, Muhammad (2012). Public Private Partnerships for Education Provision in Pakistan: How does Punjab Education Foundation address equity? – Kathmandu, Nepal. Conference on Globalization, Regionalization and Privatization in and of Education in Asia.

USAID. Existing PPP for Education Framework, Policy and Regulations in Pakistan (Assessment Report).

Malik, Allah Bakhsh (2010). Public–Private Partnerships in Education Lessons Learned from the Punjab Education Foundation. - Philippines: Asian Development Bank.

Pakistan Coalition for Education (2015). Public Private Partnership and Public Education in Pakistan: Can PPP benefit Public Education?

**Government of Pakistan
Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM)
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Islamabad**

**IMPACT OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP ON
DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN**

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR EDUCATION MANAGERS

Section I

1. Name of Respondent: _____ Designation: _____
2. Province/Region _____ Gender: Male/Female
3. Official Address: _____
4. Qualifications:
i) Academic: _____ ii) Professional: _____
5. Experience: _____
6. Telephone No. Office _____ Cell #: _____
7. Email: _____

Section II

1. How many Public Private Partnership (PPP) schools are functioning in your district/region? Please provide phase wise list of those schools which have been handed over to PPP.

Schools	Male	Female	Co-education	Total
<i>Primary</i>				
<i>Middle</i>				
<i>High</i>				
Total				

2. What types of Public Private Partnership (PPP) are functioning in your district? (Please tick in the relevant box).

S#	Types of Public Private Schools	Yes	No
1	Education Vouchers Scheme (EVS)		
2	Concession in fee to private schools		
3	Education Foundation Assisted Schools (FAS)		
4	Up gradation of schools through community participation		

5	School Management Committee and Citizen Community Boards		
6	Integrated Education Learning Program (IELP)		
7	Any other, please specify.		

3. In your opinion, do we need Public Private Partnership (PPP) for providing education to the children in your district?

1	Yes
2	No

4. If Yes, please give reasons.

1. _____
2. _____

5. In your opinion what are the weaknesses of schools at the time of given in Public Private Partnership, please tick in the relevant box?

S#	Opinion regarding weakness of schools	Yes	No
1	Low Enrolment		
2	Poor Results		
3	Non availability of effective monitoring		
4	Any other, please specify		

6. What is the strength of these schools after given in Public Private Partnership?

S#	Opinion regarding strength of PPP	Yes	No
1	Ensure strict monitoring and supervision		
2	Maintaining discipline		
3	Increase in grade wise enrolment		
4	Up-gradation of schools		
5	Improvement in annual results		
6	Ensure teacher availability and punctuality		
7	Parent satisfaction		
8	Any other, please specify		

7. What is the reaction of teachers, who are posted somewhere else after given school in Public Private Partnership (PPP)?

S#	Teachers reaction regarding PPP	Yes	No
1	Teacher reservations		
2	Merging of schools will reduce strength of staff		
3	Quality of education will be affected		
4	Any other, please specify		

8. What steps for the improvement of schools Foundations/NGOs have taken after getting the charge of this schools?

S#	Steps Foundations/ NGOs	Yes	No
1	Strict monitoring and supervision		
2	Ensure availability of teachers		
3	Increase in enrolment		
4	Getting more admission by motivating the parents		
5	Enhance quality of education		
6	Improve annual results		
7	Any other, please specify		

9. In your opinion, is Public Private Partnership useful for the development of Education?

1	Yes
2	No

If Yes, please elaborate benefits.

1. _____
2. _____

If No, please write causes/ reasons in support of your answer.

1. _____
2. _____

10. What is the monitoring schedule regarding Public Private Partnership (PPP) schools?

Monitoring Schedule	Already Available		After handed over to PPP	
	Yes	No	Yes	No
Weekly				
Monthly				
Quarterly				
When it is required				
Any other				

11. What types of physical facilities are available in Public Private Partnership (PPP) Schools?

S#	Physical Facilities	Already Available		After Handed to PPP	
		Yes	No	Yes	No
1	Separate class rooms				
2	Separate teachers for each class				
3	Drinking water				
4	Furniture				

5	Washrooms				
6	Electricity				
7	Sui Gas				
8	Boundary Wall				
9	Naib Qasid Class-IV				
10	Computer Lab				
11	Any Other				

Thank You!

Government of Pakistan
Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM)
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Islamabad

**IMPACT OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP ON
DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN**

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR EDUCATION MANAGERS

Section I

1. Name of Respondent: _____ Designation: _____
2. Province/Region _____ Gender: Male/Female
3. Official Address: _____
4. Qualifications:
i) Academic: _____ ii) Professional: _____
5. Experience: _____
6. Telephone No. Office _____ Cell #: _____
7. Email: _____

Section II

1. What type of category Public Private Partnership (PPP) Schools is functioning in your district? (Please tick in the relevant option).

S#	Option/Statements	Yes	No
1	Education Vouchers Scheme (EVS)		
2	Concession in fee to private schools		
3	Education Foundation Assisted Schools (FAS)		
4	Up-gradation of schools through community participation		
5	Through School Management Committee and Citizen Community Boards		
6	Integrated Education Learning Program (IELP)		
7	Any other, please specify.		

2. Please tick the reasons of given your school in Public Private Partnership (PPP).

S#	Reasons of given your school in PPP	Yes	No
1	Low Enrolment		
2	Poor Results		
3	Non availability of effective monitoring		
4	Any other, please specify		

3. What difference did you find after years school was given in Public Private Partnership (PPP)?

1. _____
 2. _____
 3. _____

4. What is the opinion of parents/community regarding given school in PPP?

S#	Statements	Yes	No
1	Parents are fully satisfied		
2	Parents prefer to send children in the school		
3	Teaching learning environment improved		
4	Availability of physical facilities		
5	Parents feels that new teachers are available in school		
6	Teachers absenteeism has been controlled		
7	Discipline improved in the school		

5. Please provide pass percentage (result) of primary/elementary/ secondary students. (Results of terminal/final/board/PEC)

S#	School	Already Available		After Handed over to PPP	
		Male	Female	Male	Female
1	Primary level				
2	Elementary level				
3	Secondary level				
	Total				

6. Please provide Class wise enrolment of your school.

Class	Already Available		After Handed over to PPP	
	Male	Female	Male	Female
KG/ Kachi				
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
Total				

7. Availability of physical facilities in the Schools. Please tick in the relevant box.

S#	Physical Facilities	Already Available		After Handed over to PPP	
		Yes	No	Yes	No
1	Separate class rooms				
2	Separate teachers for each class				
3	Drinking water				
4	Furniture				
5	Washrooms				
6	Electricity				
7	Sui Gas				
8	Boundary Wall				
9	Play Ground				
10	Computer Lab				
11	Any other				

8. In your opinion what are advantages of given school in Public Private Partnership (PPP)?

S#	Advantages after given school to PPP	Yes	No
1	Ensure strict monitoring		
2	Maintaining discipline		
3	Increase in grade wise enrolment		
4	Up-gradation of schools		
5	Improvement in annual results		
6	Ensure teacher availability and punctuality		
7	Parent satisfaction		
8	Any other, please specify		

9. Please give some suggestions to improve policy regarding Public Private Partnership (PPP).

1. _____
2. _____
3. _____

Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa

Detail of EEF Girls Community Schools			
S.No.	District	No. of Schools	No. of Teachers
1	D.I.Khan	66	82
2	Tank	44	44
3	Bannu	64	86
4	Lakki Marwat	55	59
5	Karak	69	76
6	Kohat	45	37
7	Hangu	22	29
8	Peshawar	53	77
9	Charsada	79	133
10	Noshehra	61	62
11	Mardan	66	87
12	Swabi	63	73
13	Malakand	49	55
14	Dir Lower	88	105
15	Dir Upper	48	61
16	Chitral	89	94
17	Swat	72	80
18	Shangla	58	62
19	Buner	48	49
20	Abotabad	57	60
21	Haripur	58	59
22	Mansehra	72	99
23	Torghar	34	36
24	Batgram	33	35
25	Kohistan	47	47
Total		1440	1687