

**EVALUATION
OF
PRESIDENT'S ONE THOUSAND
SCHOLARSHIP SCHEME**

BY

DR. MUHAMMAD NASIM QAISRANI

Academy of Educational Planning & Management
Ministry of Education
Islamabad

May, 1991.

EVALUATION
OF
PRESIDENT'S ONE THOUSAND
SCHOLARSHIP SCHEME

by

Director of Educational Planning & Statistics
Ministry of Education
1971

CONTENTS

Page No.

CHAPTER-I

Introduction	
Background of Educational Inequality	
Policy Efforts to Equalize Educational Opportunities	
National Education Conference (1947)	
Commission on National Education (1959)	
Education Policy 1969	
Education Policy (1972-78)	
Statement of the Problem	
Methodology	

CHAPTER-II

Management and Award of Scholarship	
Launching of the Scheme	
Eligibility conditions	
Distribution of Scholarships	
Rates of Scholarships	
Conditions for renewal	
Administrative Arrangements	

CHAPTER-III

Data Analysis and Interpretation	
Implementation Procedure	
Level of Utilization	
Adequacy of the Scholarship	
Publicity of the Scheme	
Adequacy of the parents income	
Summary of the Chapter	

CHAPTER-IV

Summary	
Findings	
Recommendations	

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

President's One Thousand Scholarship (POTS) Scheme was introduced by the Federal Government to assist the needy and talented students for post-secondary education. The scholarship is offered for six years subject to the condition that the scholar maintains first class in all subsequent examinations. Province and district-wise distribution of these scholarships is made on the basis of population. Within the district, the scholarships are awarded to boys and girls in the ratio of 50:50.

This scheme was introduced in 1973, but throughout this period, the scheme did not work efficiently contrary to expectations at the time of introduction. For various reasons, a great number of scholarships could not be utilized in the first instance or retained by the scholars in subsequent years.

The purpose of this study was to find out the factors responsible for poor performance of this scheme and make recommendations so that scholarships provided under this scheme are fully utilized.

The researcher analyzed the (a) implementation procedure (b) level of utilization (c) adequacy of the amount of scholarship (d) publicity of the scheme and (e) adequacy of parent's income as the principal factors involved in the administration and management of this scheme.

Sources of information for this study included (a) relevant documents of the Ministry of Education (b) interview with selected District Education Officers (c) a questionnaire administered to the students and (d) informal interviews with provincial scholarship officers.

The findings of the study included the following:

1. A great number of scholarships remained un-utilized. In the first year 78.27% scholarships were utilized. In the second year, the level of utilization went down to 59.69%. In the 3rd, 4th, 5th and 6th year, the level of utilization was drastically reduced to between 10 and 12 percent.

The scholarships remained under-utilized in the first year because of delay in making decision for the award of scholarships. The renewal of scholarship from 1st year to 2nd year depends upon students' performance in the annual examination. If a student fails to maintain 1st class in the first year, his scholarship is discontinued. The difference in level of utilization between 1st year and 2nd year was mainly due to this factor. The low level of utilization in third year and onward was again due to the facts that (a) a large majority of students failed to obtain 1st class in intermediate and degree examinations (b) those who did obtain 1st class might be getting other kind of scholarships which had better terms and conditions.

2. Several channels were involved in the administration and management of this scheme. Some of these that resulted in un-necessary delay were (a) selection process (b) renewal of the award and (c) payment of stipend to students. While the recipients of various provincial and federal government scholarships received confirmation of award

within three months and payment cheques on monthly basis, the scholars of this scheme received confirmation of award after 9 to 12 months and stipend once a year sometimes these were received after the termination of their studies.

3. A typical student for modest living had to spend Rs.725/- to Rs.755/- per month on his tuition, boarding, lodging and on other necessities at college level. These expenditures increase with the level of education. At university level and in professional institutions, a student needs approximately Rs.1200/- per month. The scholarship meets only 12% for non-boarders, and 22% of boarder students' expenditure at college level; and, 17% (non-boarders) and 24% boarders expenditures at university level. This can be interpreted that the incentive provided by the government is weak and fails to attract the students. Various other scholarship schemes introduced by the federal and provincial governments meet 35-45% of students' expenditure. Moreover, these schemes have a provision for books and stationery allowance. That is why students prefer to secure other kinds of scholarships. POTS scheme is their last choice.

4. This scheme was not very well publicized. It is only through the national press that students come to know about this facility. There is every possibility to believe that a majority of the students, particularly, living in rural areas who have no access to newspaper may not be aware of this facility. Moreover, the duration of this scholarship is six years. This aspect of the scheme needs greater publicity because the scholar can continue his education peacefully upto post-graduation; whereas, most of the scholarships awarded by federal and provincial governments are only of two years duration.

5. A typical Pakistani family earning equal to or less than Rs.2000/- per month cannot afford to educate their children in colleges/universities/professional institutions. As a matter of fact this class has a marginal representation in the national education system. POTS scheme which was primarily aimed at helping the poor segment of society, has not probably benefitted its target population.

In the light of these findings, it is recommended that:

1. Administrative and management process be simplified and streamlined. A scholarship committee at divisional level should be constitute consisting of the following instead of existing district scholarship committees:

Director of Education (Colleges).	Chairman
Chairman Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education.	Member
One Principal (Male)	Member
One Principal (Female)	Member

It is expected that the formulation of such a Committee will expedite the decision making process and will help in better utilization of scholarships. The present rate (21.73%) of un-utilized scholar-ships in the first year will be drastically reduced.

2. The scholarships should be awarded for a period of two years instead of present practice of one year. In this way approximately 15% to 20% rate of wastage between 1st year and 2nd year will be reduced.

3. Scholarship rates are very small and meet only 12% for non-boarders and 22% of boarder students expenditure at college level and 17% (non-boarders) and 24% (boarder) student's expenditures at university level. The amount of scholarship must be raised to make the scheme beneficial to the poor.

It is truly proposed that the POTS scheme should cover at least 50% of the student's expenditures. The proposed amounts are as follows:

	<u>Non-Boarder</u>	<u>Boarder</u>
F.A./F.Sc./Polytechnic Commercial Institutes.	Rs.350	Rs.450
B.A./B.Sc.	Rs.450	Rs.550
M.A./M.Sc./MBBS/ B.Sc. Agriculture/Engg.	Rs.550	Rs.650

In order to combat inflation/dearness there should be a 10% built-in increase per annum in the scholarship amount. In addition, scholars may be paid books/stationery allowance equivalent to one month's amount of stipend every year.

4. According to existing practices, all the students whose parents' income is equal to or less than Rs.2,000 per month are equally eligible for the award of scholarship. Once this condition for eligibility is determined, the students are selected purely on merit basis regardless of other considerations such as (a) the difference in parent's income within the prescribed limit (b) rural domicile, etc. Therefore, parent's level of income be used as one of the criteria for the award of scholarship. For this purpose, the following formula may be used instead of the existing simplistic approach for the grant of scholarship.

Merit Index = Two thousand - student's parent's income + marks obtained by the student + 100 points for rural domicile.

It is expected that adoption of this formula will give greater weightage to the poor people and will award priorities in the order of (a) poverty (b) merit (c) rural domicile.

5. The system of publicity may further be improved. In addition to advertisement in the national and local press, the Directorate of Education must notify all colleges under its jurisdiction about the availability and terms and conditions of the scholarship. The college Principal should notify it to students and display it on the notice board and admission prospects/forms and other documents.

CHAPTER-I

INTRODUCTION:

Redistribution of educational facilities among various sections of society has been central to all educational development programmes initiated in the post independence period in Pakistan. For this purpose several special measures were proposed in different policy documents to make educational facilities available to those sections of society who had limited access to the system. President's One Thousand Scholarship (POTS) scheme, a subject of inquiry of this report, was introduced on the recommendation of Education Policy (1972-80) to enable the talented students belonging to under-privileged sections of society to continue post secondary education.

2. Background of Educational Inequality:

Looking at the behavior of Pakistan's educational system in historical perspective, two kinds of inequalities can be observed.

2.1. Inequality of educational opportunities within the public schools (conditions prevailing in different schools, range of courses available, provision of academic and co-curricular facilities, prestige certificates and diplomas) had been prevalent since long. During the British period such schools came into existence for the education of children of the elite groups. The Chief College, Lahore, the missionary schools and some residential public schools situated in different parts of the country belonged to this category. These schools offered a superior type of curriculum and were wholly or substantially financed by the government. These institutions had a tradition of admitting students coming from the upper strata and elite of the society and were inaccessible to the poor sections of the society. The students who attended these school acquired an automatic advantage over those who could not. In this way concept of equality of citizens was violated.

2.2. The second type of inequality has been taking place at the threshold of the school system. The roots of this type of inequality can be traced back to the introduction of downward filtration theory during the colonial period which envisaged that education and culture provided at the mountain top would flow down to bottom - from elites to poor classes, from universities and colleges to primary schools and from urban areas to rural settlements. The discrimination taking place at this point further perpetuated in post-independence period through different stages of the educational progression. The people belonging to under-privileged groups such as women, the poor and rural people are more likely to be weeded out of the system at the end of primary school, secondary school or before entry to higher education.¹

3. Policy Efforts to Equalize Educational Opportunities:

With the attainment of independence, the successive governments in Pakistan imbedded with Islamic concept of equality of human beings and social justice vowed to eliminate inequality and redistribute educational facilities affirmatively among all sections of the society. Different financial incentives and scholarship schemes were introduced and implemented for the students with very high achievement scores and belonging to have not groups. In this

regard, the policy making process confronted with four types of issues (a) what should be purpose for awarding the scholarships? (b) What should be the conditions of eligibility for the award of scholarships? (c) How much should be the amount of scholarship? (d) What should be the procedure for the award, management and disbursement of scholarships? Different policy documents resolved these issues differently. A review of these efforts is given below.

3.1. National Education Conference (1947):

The Pakistan National Education Conference (PNEC), held in Karachi in 1947 soon after the attainment of independence, appointed a Special Committee on the education of backward and disadvantaged classes. The committee was directed to consider ways and means for the social and educational uplift of the backward people.

The Committee observed:

"We would emphasize that, since talent exists at every level of society, facilities for education should be provided in such a manner that the poorer sections of the population as far as possible are offered equal opportunities. Because the country needs promising young people and because a beginning should be made in democratizing higher education..... The cost of higher education have increased to such an extent that it is now scarcely within the reach of the less well to do sections of the community, especially where large families are concerned..... Limited resources do not permit to reduce the cost of higher education..... But we visualize as a normal system in which every promising boy or girl whatever the financial means of his parents, will be provided with opportunities, to the fullest extent of his talent and aptitude."²

3.1.1. The committee laid down the following conditions for the award of scholarships:

1. The primary consideration in the award of scholarships should be the merit of the candidate but steps be taken to ensure that provinces..... are adequately represented in the final list of awards.
2. The scholarships should be opened for the following courses of studies:
 - (a) intermediate with science and commerce;
 - (b).... B.Sc. & M.Sc.;
 - (c) engineering and technology;
 - (d).... medicine;
 - (e).... agriculture and
 - (f)..... teacher training.
3. However, female students offering arts subjects in the intermediate and graduate courses should be eligible for the award of scholarships provided they give an

undertaking that they will pursue teacher's training course at the end of their approved courses of studies. If they do not fulfil this condition they will refund the amount of their scholarship.³

3.1.2. In fixing the amount of scholarship, the committee suggested the following guidelines for consideration.

- (a) Fees payable by the scholar to the college or university for enrollment, tuition, games and examination.
- (b) Maintenance charges, whether in hostel or as day scholar including maintenance during holidays.
- (c) Reasonable expenditure, on text books, stationery and other incidentals.
- (d) Reasonable expenditures on clothing.⁴
- (e) Financial position of the candidate's parents or guardians and deduct in each case the value of any scholarship or financial assistance which the scholar may be receiving from other sources.

The above recommendations in operational terms mean that the award of scholarships was based on merit-cum-quota for pursuing specific programme of studies and the amount of scholarship was not fixed but depended upon student's expenditures and parents income. However, it is understood that government accepted the responsibility of fully financing the students having no other sources of income.

3.1.3. The application for the award of scholarship were required to be submitted on the prescribed forms through the head of the institution last attended by the candidate: in case of candidates already enrolled in colleges or universities through the Vice Chancellor; and in all other cases by the DPI's of the provinces to the Ministry of Education.

3.2. Commission on National Education (1959)

The Commission on National Education (CNE) 1959, termed education system as part of the concept of social justice and recommended that its benefits and opportunities be provided equally to all citizens. The Commission outlined the following reasons for the award of scholarships:

"So long as our per capita income is low, some of our ablest students will not be able to afford higher education, thus depriving the nation of the benefit of trained talents. There is need for a large number of scholarships at different stages. So long as state is unable to provide free education for all, it must at least try to provide free education to those who are most deserving of it and who will be able to contribute most to the development of nation. It is through such a system of scholarships that we can make the most meaningful equalization of educational opportunity. Our interest in such a programme of scholarship is motivated by an other consideration that the education system must be geared to serve the cause of national progress. This can be done only if

we develop in our people, through the schools, a high level of technical competence in all spheres... engineering, agriculture, technology business, teaching and every other field. Large numbers of our most talented young people never have a chance to realize their capabilities through education. There is little doubt that the largest single obstacle in the path of the able student who wishes to continue his education is the lack of funds to do so. In the interest of national welfare we cannot allow poverty to deprive the individual of the opportunities his abilities deserves or the country of the talent it so desperately needs. In our effort to equalize educational opportunity through scholarships we have an excellent vehicle for the identification and training of our most able students.⁵

3.2.1. The Commission recommended the following rules and regulations for the award of scholarships:

1. All scholarships should be awarded on merit basis.
2. The scholarship programme should be used to channel able students into those fields of study where the need for trained personnel is greatest.
3. Scholarship programme should break down the regional barriers by encouraging students from one region of the country to study in another.⁶

3.2.2. The Commission further observed that the amount of scholarship should vary from individual to individual depending upon the financial needs of student and the type of institution.

- a) Those for day students covering the cost of fees and incidentals.
- b) Those for resident students, covering fees, boarding, lodging and incidental costs and
- c) those for residential schools which would require additional expenses and would have to be substantially higher to permit poor talented students to join.⁷

It can be observed from the proceeding statements that the Commission had several purposes in recommending award of scholarship to the students such as (a) equalizing educational opportunities (b) Human resource development by encouraging the talented students to pursue scientific and technological education and (c) national integration by encouraging students of one region of the country to pursue education in other regions. The principal criteria for the award of scholarship were (a) student's merit (b) specific field of study (c) parent's income. The amount of scholarship depended upon student's financial needs.

3.3. Education Policy 1969:

This policy recognized the role of education as an instrument of social change and development and as a factor in the creation of a democratic social order by ensuring an equal access to educational opportunities. The emphasis on the universal and egalitarian aspects of

education is also necessary in the interest of social and cultural harmony and peaceful and orderly evolution of a democratic society. Equal access to educational opportunities is important to safeguard against the division of society into several segments. Education has to be understood as a continuous and life long activity.

The policy commenting on the behavior of the national education system in the past stated that certain feature of the education policy have been contributing to the emergence of a privileged class and unless these are recognized and corrective action taken, the problem will attain gigantic proportions. The policy diagnosed the following factors creating inequality in the provision of educational facilities to the people.

- a) Medium of instruction: by requiring the medium of instruction at the higher levels of learning to be English, the system discriminates against those students who have not had the benefit of English knowing.
- b) Missionary institutions: Most of these institutions are expensive and provide a better standard of education than do the normal schools. The students who attend these schools acquire an automatic advantage over those who do not.
- c) Cadet Colleges: There exist a number of institutions, the educational standard of which are higher than those of the normal institutions. Some of these are government run, while other are operated privately. The students who attend these schools acquire an automatic advantage over those who do not. In this way concept of equality of citizens is violated. Moreover, existence of double system of education was creating hegemony and polarization in the society which could be dangerous for national integration.
- d) Uneven Geographic coverage: Educational opportunities are not equally available throughout the country. Remote areas such as Balochistan, the Frontier Regions and the Hill Tracts have very limited facilities and people from these areas do not therefore get a fair chance to develop.
- e) A large population in rural areas and also in low income groups in urban areas remained deprived of incentives, which could take them to schools or enable them to continue higher education.
- f) Women remained abysmally under represented at all levels of the national education system.⁸

Therefore, this policy recommended that (a) admission to the government supported institutions should be based purely on merit basis with full scholarships provision to those who cannot afford. Similarly, all private schools which charge fees of more than Rs.30 per month should be required to select at least 25% of their students on merit and provide them free education.

The policy was supposed to be implemented through 4th Five year Plan (1970-75). However, due to separation of East Pakistan, it could not be implemented.

3.4. Education Policy (1972-80):

Education policy of 1972 infused with the rhetoric of egalitarianism in society, envisaged to provide equal educational opportunities to all irrespective of place of residence, sex and financial background, to benefit from the educational facilities available in the country.

3.4.1. In order to implement this decision, the government therefore decided:

1. to make education free up to high school level;
2. nationalized private institutions and opened the doors of these institutions to all on the basis of merit;
3. introduced a nationwide scheme of 1000 scholarships for the education of the children of the working class. Under the scheme, every year 1000 scholarships would be granted to:
 - (a) Children of the poor parents.
 - (b).... Children of labourers and factory workers and
 - (c) Children of other persons in low income groups.⁹

3.4.2. This scheme of scholarship is of significant importance. The then Minister for Finance, Planning and Development during his budget speech on June 17, 1972 stated the following purpose of this scheme.

"In addition to the provisions made in the labour policy for education of the children of the working classes, the government has decided to introduce from the next year a new scheme to be known as the President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme (POTS)".¹⁰

As is evident from the statement, this scheme of scholarship primarily aimed at helping poor students, unlike the schemes in the past; which culminated on merit and specific field of studies.

4. Statement of the Problem:

At the time of inception of scheme, government envisaged that all 1000 scholarships will be availed of fully in the first two years after the award of the scholarship. In B.A./B.Sc. it was expected that number of beneficiaries would come down to 500 approximately because extension of scholarship depended on obtaining first class in F.A./F.Sc. examination. In M.A./M.Sc. this will be reduced to half of those who continued scholarship during B.A./B.Sc. Approximately 50 students pursuing professional education would also benefit from this scheme.

The Central Development Working Party (CDWP) in its meeting held on 3.7.1988 observed that:

"Strategy of the scheme does not appear to be successful. About 90% of the students could not retain the scholarship after two years possibly due to one of the following reasons (a) the intermediate examination (b) did not continue their studies (c) did not know that scholarship will continue due to lack of publicity."¹¹

This study attempts to analyze the issues pointed out by CDWP in its meeting held on 3.7.1989 in the optimal utilization of scholarship scheme and goes further to find out other reasons as to why this scheme is not functioning properly? The specific objectives of the study include the following.

4.1. Objectives:

- i) To know the adequacy of the implementation procedure of the scheme.
- ii) To examine the suitability of rates of scholarships for various levels.
- iii) To adjudge the justification of parents/guardians income ceiling conditions for eligibility.
- iv) To examine the reasons for success or failure of the strategy of the scheme through ability of students to retain scholarship throughout their studies.
- v) To examine the criteria of constituting the scholarship committees by the Ministry of Education.
- vi) To know the status of year-wise publicity for award of scholarship.
- vii) To make suitable recommendations for the improvement of scheme.

4.2. Methodology:

In order to answer these questions, information was obtained from various primary and secondary sources.

1. Documents of the Ministry of Education. These included:
 - (a) Original scheme approved by ECNEC.
 - (b) Documents related to year-wise award and renewal of scholarship.
 - (c) Various scholarship schemes introduced by the Ministry of Education and provincial departments of education.
2. Interview with selected District Education Officers to know the problems and difficulties faced by them in the execution and implementation of this scheme. These interviews were taken with one DEO in AJK, one in Balochistan, one in NWFP, two in Sindh and three in Punjab.

The names of districts included in the sample are the following:

- ▶ Punjab:Gujranwala, Faisalabad and Multan.
- ▶ Sindh:Jacobabad, Sukkur.
- ▶ NWFP:.....Dera Ismail Khan.
- ▶ Balochistan: Quetta.
- ▶ AJK:Muzaffarabad.

This sample was taken on selective basis.

3. A questionnaire was administered to students receiving scholarships in the above mentioned districts. The purpose of this questionnaire was to know the (a) socio-economic background of the students (b) problems faced by them in the award and renewal of scholarship (c) adequacy of the scholarship and (d) to seek their opinion and suggestions in the improvement of the scheme. The questionnaires could be received back from Quetta and Muzaffarabad because of following reasons:

- (a) In Quetta there were only 3 to 4 students receiving the scholarships. Colleges and University in that province remained closed for a long time period. Therefore students could not be traced.
- (b) Although Muzaffarabad has a quota of seven scholarships but virtually there was no scholarship holder in that district.

4. Informal interviews were also held with the scholarship officers in the provincial Departments of Education in order to know how they manage their internal scholarship schemes.

5. The documents of the Ministry of Education, the opinion of the District Education Officers, responses of the students, and the information obtained from scholarship officers working in the Provincial Directorates of Public Instructions were analyzed and are summarized in accordance with specified objectives of the study.

REFERENCES

1. Naik, J.P. and Syed Noorullah. *History of Education in India* -- 2nd ed. Bombay. Macmillian 1959.
2. Pakistan. Education Division. *Educational Conference Proceedings*, held at Karachi. 1947. pp.26-30.
3. Ibid; pp. 26-30.
4. Ibid; pp. 26-30.
5. Pakistan. *Commission on National Education: report (1959)*. Karachi: Government Printing Press, 1959. pp.11-13, 245-250.
6. Ibid; pp.246-247.
7. Ibid; pp.246-247.
8. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, Education and Scientific Research. *The New Education Policy*. Islamabad: 1970 pp.2-3, 17-18.
9. Pakistan. Ministry of Education. *The Education Policy (1972-80)*. Islamabad: 1977. pp.1-2.
10. Ibid; pp. 25-27.
11. Pakistan. Ministry of Finance, Planning and Development. *Budget; 1972*. Islamabad: 1972.
12. Pakistan. Central Development Working Party. *Minutes of the meeting*, held Islamabad, July 3, 1988.

CHAPTER-II

Management of Scholarship Scheme

1. Launching of the Scheme:

As per recommendations of Education Policy (1972-80) the President's One Thousand Scholarship (POTS) Scheme was sponsored by the Federal Government to encourage and assist the poor and needy students throughout the country. The Ministry of Education on 23.4.1973 prepared the project and submitted it to the Executive Committee of National Economic Council (ECNEC) for approval. The ECNEC in its meeting on October 10, 1973 approved the scheme for implementation.

After the approval of the scheme the then Education Secretary appointed a committee consisting of the following members for framing the rules for the award of POTS scheme.

- | | |
|---|----------------------|
| 1. Joint Educational Adviser (JEA) | Chairmen |
| 2. Deputy Educational Adviser F.G.I. Wing | Member |
| 3. Deputy Educational Adviser S&W Wing | Member |
| 4. One representative from each of the Provincial Education Department. | Member |
| 5. A representative from FANA and FATA. | Member |
| 6. Nominee of the Inter Board Committee of Chairmen. | Member |
| 7. Assistant Educational Advisor (Internal Scholarship) | Member/
Secretary |

The above committee laid down the following procedure for the award of Scholarships.

2. Eligibility:

The awards will be granted on the result of secondary school certificate examination to those students who have secured at least first division and possess good conduct and behavior.

2.1. The scholarships will be awarded to whole time students who are studying or intend to study in the recognized institutions in Pakistan. Those who have appeared in matric as private candidates are also eligible.

2.2. The scholarships will be awarded on merit to students who do not receive financial assistance such as scholarship/stipend etc. for the purpose of education from any other source. In case, a student is getting financial assistance for education from any other sources, he/she will have to surrender and refund the amount of scholarship already held by him before he/she is awarded scholarships under POTS Scheme.

2.3. The scholarship will be granted on year to year basis and will continue up to the completion of post-graduate studies by the awardee subject to the condition that they get first division in their subsequent public examination.

2.4. The scholarship will be awarded to both boys and girls students on district merit basis in the ratio of 50:50 if sufficient number of eligible female candidates are available.

2.5. A certificate of good conduct and satisfactory progress from the head of the institution will have to be produced by the awardee every year in absence of which the scholarship may be discontinued.

2.6. The students who are boarders will have to submit a certificate to this effect alongwith the applications duly signed by the Hostel Superintendent/Principal of the College.

2.7. Nominations of deserving candidates shall be forwarded by the provincial governments to the Ministry of Education against respective provincial quotas, and nominations from centrally administered areas shall be invited by the Ministry of Education directly. All these nominations shall be considered for final approval by a special committee to be set up by the President for this purpose.

2.8. The first preference, as already stated will be given to the marks secured in the examination. After ascertaining academic merit parent's income will be the next criteria for grant of scholarship. That is if two students secure equal marks, then their parents income will be the final criteria for the grant of scholarship. Preference will be given to those who belong to lower income groups. The scholarship will be awarded to the children of people such as peasants, labourers, factory workers and others in the low income group in the following order.

<u>Parents Monthly Income</u>	<u>Order of Priority</u>
Rs.200/-	1st
Rs.300/-	2nd
Rs.400/-	3rd
Rs.500/-	4th

Preference will be given in the descending order of the above income groups.

3. **Distribution of Scholarship:**

For the purpose of fairness, the scholarship award formula has been based on two principles: (a) distribution of regional population in Pakistan and (b) student's sex. These are described as below:

A. Distribution based on population:

The scholarships will be awarded on the basis of population in four provinces, FATA, FANA and AJK. Within a given province, the awards will be further divided according to the prevailing distribution of population in each district. Table I given below presents the scholarship for various provinces/ regions in Pakistan.

TABLE-I

Name of the Area	No. of Scholarships
Punjab	558 including 16 reserved for minority.
Sindh	209 including 6 reserved for minority.
NWFP	126 including 3 reserved for minority.
Balochistan	36 including 1 reserved for minority.
AJK	23 including 1 reserved for minority.
Tribal Areas	38 including 1 reserved for minority.
Northern Areas and	10 including 1 reserved for minority.
TOTAL :- 1000	

Within the province, every district will have a quota according to its population.

B. Distribution based on sex:

Once the number of scholarships has been determined for each district based on population count, these will be further divided in ratio of 50:50 among the boys and girls.

4. Rates of Scholarship:

The rates of scholarship are as follows:-

TABLE-2

	Non-Boarder (Rs. per month)	Boarder (Rs. per month)
1. FA/F.Sc/Polytechnic	50	100
2. BA/B.Sc	75	150

3.	MA/M.Sc./MBBS	150	250
4.	B.Sc./M.Sc. Engg.	150	250

Source: Ministry of Education, President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme, (P-C-1).

These rates were revised in 1988 and the new rates of scholarship at various levels of education are as follows:

TABLE-3

CLASS	NON-BOARDER	BOARDER
FA/F.Sc./Polytechnic	Rs. 83/- PM	Rs.167 PM
BA/B.Sc./etc.	Rs.125/- PM	Rs.208 PM
MA/M.Sc./Professional Courses.	Rs.200/- PM	Rs.292 PM

Source: Ministry of Education vide letter No.F.3-1/88-Sch-1 dated October 18, 1988.

5. Conditions for renewal:

5.1. Continuation of scholarships will be subject to the conditions that the awardee gets first division in the subsequent public examination.

5.2. The application of renewal will be submitted to the DEO Office through the institutional head. The DEO will forward this application to the Ministry of Education.

6. Implementation and Administrative Arrangements:

After the formulation of rules and regulations for the award of the scholarship, the Ministry of Education prepared the budget for POTS Scheme on 23.4.1973. The scheme was approved at a capital cost of Rs.5.85 million by the Executive Committee of National Economic Council (ECNEC) with the following ADP allocation.

TABLE-4
Allocation of Funds for Scholarship scheme

Year	Amount
1972-73	0.9
1973-74	1.8
1974-75	3.15
TOTAL:	5.85

Source: ECNEC vide Cabinet Division's O.M. No.ENC 51M/73 date 12.10.1973.

The Federal Ministry of Education on 4.5.1974 requested the Chairman ECNEC that due to escalation in the cost of living the amount of Rs.400/- as income ceiling for the award of scholarship, may be raised to Rs.500/-. It was further requested that the requirements of first division may also be waived off in case of Balochistan/FATA, FANA and Rural Areas of Sindh.⁵

The ECNEC in its meeting held on 25th June, 1975 deliberated on the above issues.

6.3. The Cabinet Secretariat of the Cabinet Division notified the decision of the ECNEC on 20-7-1975 as reproduced below:-

"In partial modification of its earlier decision in case No.ENC-91/5/73, the ECNEC decided that (i) the scheme should cover Azad Kashmir also (ii) the income ceiling for the award of scholarship would be raised to Rs.500/- per month (iii) if a first divisioner is not available (a) amongst the blind, deaf, dumb and physically disabled students and (b) in Balochistan, Northern Areas, Azad Kashmir and the FATA, the scholarship should be given to a good second divisioner and (iv) in the case of agriculturists of rural areas subsistence land holding, should qualify for the grant of scholarship."⁶

The scheme did not work smoothly, the amount allocated for this purpose remained under utilized in the first few years.

The utilization of ADP alongwith beneficiaries of the scheme is as under:-

TABLE-5

ADP Allocation and Utilization
1972-73 1974-75

(Rs. in million)			
Year	ADP Allocation	Utilization	Percentage of Utilization
1972-73	Nil	Nil. Due to	-- un-approved status of the scheme.
1973-74	1.8	0.9	50%
1974-75	3.15	1.00	27%

Source:ECNEC vide Cabinet Division's O.M.No.ENC-1M/77, dated February 27, 1977.⁷

The ECNEC suggested to the Ministry of Education to set up a committee to look into the working of this scholarship scheme.

6.4. The Ministry of Education set up the following Special Committee with the approval of the Prime Minister as advised by the ECNEC:-

- | | |
|--|------------------|
| (a) Minister for Education | Chairman |
| (b) Secretary Education. | Member |
| (c) One MNA/MPA from each Province to be nominated by CM. | -do- |
| (d) One officer of the Ministry of Education to be nominated by CM. ⁵ | Member/Secretary |

6.5. The sub-committee set-up with the approval of Prime Minister was notified vide this Ministry's letter No.F.1-8/73-IS dated 27.5.1974 and its first meeting was convened on 8th and 10th June, 1974 under the Chairmanship of the Minister for Education and Provincial Coordination.

6.6. The scheme was approved the ECNEC vide Cab. Div. O.M. No.ENC-1/M/77 dated 22.2.1977 and its administrative approval was issued by Ministry of Education on 11.3.1977. The nominations received from the Provincial Departments were finalized at the level of Education Secretary/Adviser Education instead of Special Selection Committee approved by the Prime Minister due to non-functioning of the democratic institution.⁸

6.7. Again in 1982 the Ministry of Education constituted a National Scholarship Coordination Committee consisting of the following to advise the Ministry on the improvement/bottlenecks of on-going scholarship scheme:-

- | | |
|---|----------|
| 1. Education Secretary,
Ministry of Education. | Chairman |
| 2. J.S. (Training),
Establishment Division. | Member |
| 3. F.A. (Edu.)
Ministry of Finance. | --do-- |
| 4. Additional Secretary,
Education Department, Government of Punjab, Lahore. | --do-- |
| 5. Additional Secretary,
Education Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi. | --do-- |
| 6. Director of Education (Colleges),
Government of Balochistan, Quetta. | --do-- |
| 7. Joint Secretary (Education)
Government of A.J.K., Muzaffarabad. | --do-- |
| 8. Nominee of Inter Board Committee Chairmen,
Islamabad. | --do-- |

- | | | |
|-----|---|--------|
| 9. | JEA (I.C.W.)
Ministry of Education, Islamabad. | --do-- |
| 10. | DEA (Scholarships)
Ministry of Education, Islamabad. | --do-- |
| 11. | E.O. (Scholarship)
Ministry of Education, Islamabad. | --do-- |

6.8. In light of the recommendations of National Scholarship Coordination Committee, the Education Secretary addressed a letter to the Provincial Chief Secretaries in July, 1983 which is reproduced below for understanding the rationale of change in the policy:-

"President's thousand scholarships are awarded for education, upto M.A./M.Sc., to the needy and talented students who obtain first division in the matriculation examination. Under the present arrangements nominations for this award are invited from the Provincial Education Departments. This requires action at various tiers of administration with the result that the execution of the programme is invariably delayed. In many years we were unable to collect the required number of nominations from the Provinces and the unfilled vacancies had to be abandoned. In order to overcome these difficulties we are proposing that the execution of the programme be totally decentralized. The decisions may be at the district level. For this purpose, the following committee may be established in each district:

- | | | |
|----|---|------------------|
| 1. | Deputy Commissioner | Chairman |
| 2. | Chairman District Council. | Member |
| 3. | Chairman District Committee or representative of the Mayor; and | Member |
| 4. | District Education Officer. | Member/Secretary |

The district-wise allocation of scholarships is already firmed up. The selection would be left to the above Committee. The grants would be released through the Committee for disbursement."⁹

6.9. The National Scholarship Coordination Committee in its meeting held on 19.11.1984 also recommended;

"The condition of the ceiling of income for grant of all Federal and Provincial meritorious including President's Thousand Scholarships was revised. The ceiling of parent's income for grant of Indigenous stipend was raised from Rs.1000/- per month to Rs.1500/- per month."¹⁰

6.10. In October, 1988, Development Working Party, recommended to the Ministry of Education that in order to ensure/facilitate timely nominations of the scholars/awardees, the

1. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

2. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

3. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

4. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

5. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

6. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

7. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

8. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

9. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

10. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

11. National Ministry of Education No 15/100-50/1, dated 10.10.1988

CHAPTER-III

Data Analysis and Interpretation

President's One Thousand Scholarship (POTS) Scheme has unique characteristics among all the schemes in practice at federal and provincial level. It was initiated primarily for the needy students throughout the country including minorities. The scheme aimed at providing financial assistance to boys and girls in the ratio of 50:50 at district level.

However, the performance of the scheme did not prove to be effective as it was envisaged at the time of planning and launching of the scheme.

This study attempted to find out the factors which could be responsible for poor performance and to make recommendations for the development of appropriate strategy so that scholarships provided under this scheme are fully utilized.

The author analyzed the (a) implementation procedure (b) level of utilization (c) adequacy of the amount of scholarship (d) publicity of the scholarship (e) adequacy of the parents income as principal factors involved in the administration and management of this scheme.

For this purpose the sources of data used in this study included:

- 1) Documents of the Ministry of Education.
- 2) Interview with selected District Education Officers.
- 3) A questionnaire administered to students receiving scholarships in the selected districts.
- 4) Informal interview were also held with scholarship officers in the Provincial Departments of Education.

The information obtained from these sources was analyzed and consolidated with respect to objectives as specified in first chapter.

2. Implementation Procedure:

At the time of launching of scheme in 1973 it was decided that the provincial governments will invite applications and scrutinize those in accordance with the conditions and criteria as laid down by the federal government. The nominations from the Federally administered areas were to be invited by the Ministry of Education directly. The Provincial Governments collected the nomination from districts according to their quota and forwarded the same to Federal Government which finally approved the nominees for award of scholarship. Later on this procedure was changed. According to existing arrangements,

Federal Ministry of Education announces the award of scholarship through national press. Printed application forms are supplied to District Education Officers. The students obtain the form and submit it to the DEO through their college principal or institutional head.

DEO (Male) is the Secretary of scholarship committee and Director of Education (Colleges) is the chairman. Director of Education (Schools) and DEO (female) are the other two members of the Committee. After receiving applications District Education Officer approaches the Chairman of the Committee i.e. the Director of Education (Colleges) and other members of the Committee to convene a meeting.

Chairman of the committee and other members are not necessarily to be based in the same city. It takes a great deal of correspondence between the members to fix a date for holding the meeting. Moreover it involves a huge amount of money on TA/DA of the officers to attend the meeting.

It may also be pointed out that DEO belongs to the school cadre and is placed in BPS 17-18 while Director of Education (Colleges) belongs to college cadre and is placed in BPS 19-20. The DEO's have pointed out that because of difference in ranks, it becomes difficult for them to convene the scholarship committee meeting in time.

Usually in all parts of the country it takes nine months to one year from the date of submission of application to receiving the scholarship money. The detail of this process are given below:

1. Submission of applications to DEO.	1 month
2. Scrutiny of the applications	1-2 month
3. Holding of award committee meeting.	2 months
4. Approval of the Ministry of Education.	2 months
5. Communication of the Ministry to DEO office and subsequently to students.	1-2 month
6. Payments from Ministry to DEO to institutional heads and finally disbursement to students.	2-3 months

Total Time taken:

9 to 12 months

In certain parts of the country, it takes longer time to the committee to hold a meeting. For example, Balochistan has 17 districts headed by one Director of Education. Since some of the districts are at far off places, therefore Director of Education being busy with other assignments is unable to reach every district. That is why that 11 out of 17 districts have never availed of Presidents One thousand scholarship facility since the inception of the scheme.

Process of renewal is again lengthy. At the end of each year, District Education Officer approaches the concerned principals or institutional heads for getting the progress report of the scholars. Different types of problems emerge at this stage.

- i) Examination in colleges are not usually held in time, until and unless examination is held and result is declared, a student is unable to produce his performance report for renewal of his scholarship.
- ii) Scholarships are administered and facilitated by the DEO of the districts of domicile of students while the student may be pursuing his/her studies in another district/province or Board. In order to renew the scholarship, the student has to apply to his district of domicile. This is again a cumbersome procedure.
- iii) Various Boards and Universities because of strikes and other unusual circumstances do not conduct the examination in time and it takes a longer time to declare the results. After the declaration of the results, student has to get admission into new programmes. After getting admission, the application for renewal has to be certified by the institutional head and then forwarded to DEO. DEO forwards it to the federal Ministry of Education. After the approval of the Ministry, the student is notified about the extension of his award.
- iv) Procedure of payment to students is also lengthy. After the final selection of the nominee, the Ministry of Education sends a cross cheque to the District Education Officer. This cheque is usually drawn in favour of some Bank in Islamabad. The District Education Officer credits this cheque into his account. After the clearance of the cheque, the DEO disburses the money to the students through their institutional heads. Sometimes cheques from Islamabad are stuck up in between the way from the Ministry to student's institutions.

The DEOs are of the opinion that:

1. Large number of scholarships remain under utilized because of delay in convening meetings for the award of scholarships. The process for renewal of scholarships is also lengthy.
2. There is no provision for maintaining a waiting list roster, if a scholarship holder gets an other award, he relinquishes the POTS award. As a result POTS award is last for ever.
3. Stipend to students is usually made once a year, at the end of the academic year. Sometimes students receive their cheques after the completion of their academic programme. In this way, the purpose of the scholarship scheme to help the students is lost.

3. Level of Utilization:

At the time of the introduction of the scheme it was envisaged that all the facilities will be fully availed of in the first two years. In BA/B.Sc., it was expected that the number of beneficiaries would come down to 500 approximately because extension of scholarship depended on obtaining first class in FA/F.Sc. examination. In MA/M.Sc. this will be reduced to half of those who continued scholarship during BA/B.Sc. Approximately 50 students pursuing professional education would also benefit from this scheme. However, the rate of utilization of scholarships is far below then expected. The table given below presents the actual situation.

TABLE-6

**LEVEL OF UTILIZATION OF SCHOLARSHIPS
1973-74 - 1988-89**

YEAR	Ist Year	IInd Year	IIIrd Year	IVth Year	Vth Year	VI Year
<i>Expected</i>	1000	1000	500	500	250	250
<i>Actual Utilization:</i>						
1973	955	955	92	92	92	92
1974	999	999	89	89	89	89
1975	1000	1000	92	92	92	92
1976	851	851	110	110	110	110
1977	925	925	95	95	95	95
1978	844	844	90	90	90	90
1979	858	858	57	57	57	57
1980	548	548	26	26	26	26
1981	889	889	39	39	39	39
1982	123	26	26	26	26	--
1983	548	67	11	11	--	--
1984	692	96	7	--	--	--
1985	693	46	--	--	--	--
1986	816	816	--	--	--	--
1987	--	--	--	--	--	--
1988/89	1000	934	80	--	--	--
Average	78.27%	59.69%	12.52%	12.11%	12.00%	100%

Source: Government of Pakistan. Documents on President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme. Ministry of Education, (S&W Wing).

It can be observed from the table that level of utilization of scholarships during the past 17 years is far below than expected.

The table indicates:

- i) only 78.27% of the scholarships are utilized in the first year.
- ii) In the second year the utilization level further goes down to 59.69%. As it can also be observed from the table that between 1982-85, less than 10% scholarships were renewed in the second year.
- iii) In the 3rd year, the level goes down to 12.52%.
- iv) In 4th, 5th and 6th year the utilization level is between 10 and 12 percent.

This phenomenon can further be illustrated by comparing the budget allocation and utilization.

Table-7 presents the ADP allocation and utilization:

TABLE-7

A.D.P. ALLOCATION AND UTILIZATION
1973-74 - 1987-88

	ALLOCATION	UTILIZATION	UTILIZED PERCENTAGE
1973-74	1.8	0.9	50.00%
1977-78	3.15	1.00	27.00%
1976-77	3.13	1.00	31.94%
1977-78	3.75	1.20	32.00%
1978-79	4.35	0.50	11.49%
1979-80	4.47	0.598	13.37%
1980-81	4.47	0.700	15.65%
1981-82	-	-	-
1982-83	-	-	-
1983-84	3.01	1.90	63.12%
1984.85	3.311	1.48	44.69%
1985-86	0.938	0.70	74.69%
1986-87	1.500	1.372	91.66%
1987-88	4.186	1.8	43.00%
TOTAL:	38.065	13.155	34.55%

Source: Government of Pakistan. Documents on President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme. Ministry of Education, (S&W Wing).

* Those could be various reasons for this low level of renewal in the second year of the award of scholarship. In 1980, the District Education Officer, Multan returned Rs.81,000 to the Ministry of Education with the remarks that some of POTS scheme scholars have received merit scholarship and thus relinquished this scholarship. (Annexure-II).

It can be observed from the table that funds allocated for this purpose were never fully utilized. On average, over a period of 15 years the level of budget utilization is only 34.55%. This evidence again confirms the existence of deficiencies in the Planning and Management of this scheme.

Some of the reasons pointed out by the DEOs are as follows:

1. In the first year, students apply for more than one scholarship.

If they receive offer from more than one sources, then they relinquish President's One Thousand Scholarship because this scheme is less attractive as compared to other schemes launched by federal and provincial governments.

2. There is no provision of keeping waiting list record, therefore scholarships vacated by the principal candidates remain un-utilized.
 3. The renewal of scholarship from 1st year to 11nd year depends upon students performance in the annual examination. A student has to maintain 1st class in all the subsequent examinations. It has been pointed out by DEO's that those students who secure marks 58% or 59%, in the first year examination, their scholarship is discontinued. The difference in level of utilization between first year and second year is mainly due to this factor.
 4. A large number of scholarships approximately 90% are not renewed in third year. This is mainly due to the facts that (a) a large majority of students fail to obtain 1st class in their FA/F.Sc. examination (b) those students who do obtain 1st class might be getting other types of scholarships which have better terms and conditions.
4. Adequacy of the scholarship:

There are two types of expenditures which a students has to bear. These include tuition and other compulsory fees and cost of living. Average cost of living and tuition fees as pointed by the students is as follows:

TABLE-8
AVERAGE ANNUAL EXPENDITURES PER STUDENT

		(per month)
1.	Tuition fees	Rs. 25
2.	Books, Stationery and reading material.	Rs.100
3.	Accommodation	Rs. 30 (in case of hostel)
4.	Food	Rs. 500
5.	Miscellaneous	Rs. 100
	TOTAL:	<u>Rs.725</u>
		in case of day scholars and 755 in case of boarders.

Note: Most of the respondents were students of FA/F.Sc. class.

There were some variations in provinces but by and large the expenditures are the same.

Fees rate are in government institutions. Private and other reputable institutions charge much higher than government institutions.

These are average expenditures both academic as well as cost of living incurred by a typical student at intermediate level. However, since the students knew that one of the purposes of this study was to reform the scheme, therefore, there is a possibility that they may have exaggerated their expenditures. However this apprehension is not confirmed from the data obtained from secondary sources.

Abid Amin Barki (et. al) in their research paper "*Higher Education and Its Access to Different Socio-economic Groups in Pakistan*" have made the following estimates:

TABLE-9
AVERAGE ANNUAL EXPENDITURES PER STUDENT
1988

ITEMS	SECONDARY	COLLEGE	UNIVERSITY
Fees	75	210	225
Books/Photocopies	132	876	1319
Clothing/Uniform	242	939	1919
Stationery/Supplies	118	281	482
Pocket money	722	1809	2300
Conveyance	155	804	1258
Meals	-	-	4857
Miscellaneous	76	435	1495
Total:	1520	5354	14328

Source: A.A. Barki et. al. "Higher Education and its Access to Different Socio-economic groups in Pakistan." In S.N. Hyder (ed) *Human Resource Development and Utilization: Issues and Problems*, Islamabad, Pakistan, Manpower Institute 1988, PP.92.

Barki's estimation are based upon students who are non-boarders and this estimate do not include food charges and hostel fees. Instead he has added conveyance charges and pocket money.

The Government of Pakistan has made the following estimates of fees structures at various levels of education.

TABLE-10

FEE STRUCTURE FOR DIFFERENT LEVELS OF EDUCATION

	ADMISSION	TUITION	UNION	EXAMINATION	OTHERS**	TOTAL
F.A.	10.00	15.00	4.00	35.00*	77.00	141
F.Sc.	10.00	20.00	4.00	35.00	85.00	154
B.A.	10.00	20.00	4.00	100.00	80.00	214
B.Sc.	10.00	25.00	4.00	100.00	90.00	224
M.A.	20.00	25.00	24.00	100.00	277.00	446
M.Sc.	20.00	30.00	24.00	100.00	350.00	524
<i>Professional</i>						
Engineering	100.00	20.00	8.00	80.00	170.00	378
Medicines	20.00	40.00	5.00	175.00	170.00	510
Commerce	80.00	32.00	12.00	13.00	150.00	277
Law	80.00	25.00	10.00	150.00	150.00	415

Source: Government of Pakistan: National Education Conference: Working Paper: Islamabad: Ministry of Education, 1989.

* These expenditures charged annually, once a year.

** Others include Sports fund, Medical fund, caution money, library security, breakage charges especially from science students, college magazine, etc. Some funds are charged on annual basis. It is to mention here that these rates slightly differ from province to province or institution to institution.

These estimates do not include books/stationery, reading material, food, accommodation and other miscellaneous expenditures.

There is no significant difference in the calculation of expenditures by all the three sources. Barki's calculations seem to be a bit higher. This may be due to the fact that Barki has based his finding on a survey conducted in urban areas where students have to spend some money on conveyance while the survey conducted by this author included medium level cities and small towns.

This analysis indicates that student has to spend approximately Rs.725-755 at college level and Rs.1200 on University level and in professional institutions.

Amount of money paid to students under the President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme is given below:

TABLE-11

CLASS	NON-BOARDER (Rs. per month)	BOARDERS (Rs. per month)
F.A./F.Sc. Polytechnic.	83	167
B.A./B.Sc.	125	208
M.A./M.Sc.	200	292

Source: Calculated from Ministry of Education letter No.F.3-1/88/Sch-I dated 18.10.1988.

A comparison of Table 8 & 9 and 10 with 11 indicates that scholarship meets only 12-24% of the student expenditures at various levels of education. Therefore, it is not a big incentive to continue education.

2. Another way to know the adequacy of this scheme is to compare it with other scholarship schemes sponsored by federal and provincial governments. The tables 12, 13, 14, 15 given below give a comparison of various schemes.

TABLE-12
SCHOLARSHIPS AWARDED BY THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS
POST SECONDARY SCHOOL

Sl. No.	Scholarship	Province	Amount		Books Allowance	No. of Scholarships
			Boarder	Non-Boarder		
1.	Merit Scholarship	Punjab	240	120	150	375
2.	--do--	Sindh	80	40	150	N.A
3.	--do--	N.W.F.P.	45	25	150	40
4.	--do--	Balochistan	95	35	150	795
5.	Financial Aid	A.J.K.	100	100	--	Award on the basis of financial condition of the student.

Source: Information obtained from provincial Governments, through Inter Board Committee of Chairmen, Islamabad.

It can be observed from the above table that scholarships offered by provincial governments have better terms and conditions. Not only, the monthly stipend is more (except

in case of NWFP) than under the POTS scheme but also students receive a modest amount of money as books allowance. In this way students are paid 35 to 45% of their total expenditures.

TABLE-13
SCHOLARSHIPS AWARDED BY THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS
POST HIGHER SECONDARY SCHOOL

Sl. No.	Scholarship	Province	Amount		Books Allowance	No. of Scholarships
			Boarder	Non-Boarder		
1.	Merit Scholarship	Punjab	300	150	--	170
2.	--do--	Sindh	120	60	--	NA
3.	--do--	N.W.F.P.	65	30	250	30
4.	--do--	Balochistan	110	Science: 50 Other: 40	250	370
5.	Financial	A.J.K.	Upto Rs.500	Award Aid the basis of financial condition of the student.		

Source: Information obtained from provincial Governments, through Inter Board Committee of Chairmen, Islamabad.

Again it is obvious from the table, that at past higher secondary level, the scholarships offered by the provincial governments are more prestigious than POTS.

TABLE-14
SCHOLARSHIPS AWARDED BY THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS
AT POST GRADUATE LEVEL AFTER BA/B.Sc.

Sl. No.	Scholarship	Province	Amount		Books Allowance	No. of Scholarships
			Boarder	Non-Boarder		
1.	Merit Scholarship	Punjab	400	200	--	--
2.	--do--	Sindh	125	100	--	NA
3.	--do--	N.W.F.P.	120	80	--	NA
4.	--do--	Balochistan	150 (MA/ M.Sc) 350 (Professional)	--	--	277

Source: Information obtained from provincial Governments of Pakistan, through federal Ministry of Education.

Merit scholarships are awarded by the Provincial Governments of Punjab, Sindh, NWFP and Balochistan at the post secondary school, post higher secondary school and post degree level.

The amount of this scholarship varies from province to province. The minimum scholarship is given in the NWFP and the maximum amount in the province of the Punjab. Number of scholarships also vary from province to province.

Government of Azad Jammu and Kashmir, does not give merit scholarship. Instead, financial aid is given to students out of Zakat and Ushar Fund. No rate of the aid is fixed. For classes IX and X normally Rs.50/- are given, whereas for class XI and XII the rate is Rs.100/-. Maximum rate is Rs.500/- for pursuing medical education.

TABLE-15
FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS SCHOLARSHIP SCHEMES

NAME OF SCHOLARSHIP	NO. OF SCHOLARSHIP	AMOUNT	DURATION
1. Merit Scholarship	30 for every board	Rs.250	Two years
2. Merit cash scholarship	1. 12 for each board 2. 6 for each university	Rs.25 to Rs.250	Two years
3. Nishan-e-Haider	3 for each board	Rs.400	Six years
4. Allama Iqbal Gold Medal.	--	Rs.500 Rs.750	
5. Marn-Bugti Agency	20	Rs.200 p.m.	
6. Leepa Valley Scholarship	3	Rs.250 p.m.	

Source: Government of Pakistan, "Scholarships of the Government of Pakistan". Islamabad, Ministry of Education. PP.6-7.

This table indicates that the terms and conditions of President's one thousand scholarship scheme are less attractive as compared to other schemes sponsored by federal and provincial governments. One of the practical disadvantage of this phenomenon is that at the time of submitting applications for scholarships, a student applies for more than one scholarship. Consequently if he/she receives offer from more than one agency, since President one thousand scholarships is less prestigious and carries comparatively small amount, therefore students decline to accept this offer and opt for the better one. Similarly at higher stages, students prefer to get other types of scholarships offered by the federal government/provincial government and concerned institutions.

The following conclusions can be derived from the above discussion.

1. A typical student has to spend at least Rs.725-755 per month on his tuition, boarding, lodging and on other necessities at college level. The expenditures increase with the level of education. At university level, and in professional education a student needs approximately Rs.1194 per month for a modest living.
2. Various scholarship schemes introduced by the Government at provincial and federal level have better terms and conditions. More over, most of these have a provision of books and stationery allowance. Such schemes compensate a student from 33 to 45 percent of their total expenditures.
3. President one thousand scholarship scheme does not have a provision for books/stationery allowances. In this way, this scheme meets only 15-24% of the students expenditures.

These are some of the reason that the scholarships are not fully utilized. This can be interpreted that the incentive provided by the government is weak and fails to attract the students.

5. **Publicity of the Scheme:**

One of the factor as pointed out in the DDWP observation with regard to under utilization of this scheme is lack of publicity about the terms and conditions of scholarship. This fact could not be discovered during interviews with District Education Officers because a large number of students apply for this scholarship at the first instance.

TABLE-16

**NO. OF APPLICANTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE SCHOLARSHIP
IN VARIOUS DISTRICTS OF PAKISTAN**

	NO. OF SCHOLARSHIPS AVAILABLE	NO. OF APPLICANTS
D.I. Khan	7	20
Multan	49	300
Gujranwala	32	200
Faisalabad	38	350
Jacobabad	10	77
Sukkur	12	72
Quetta	3	10

Note: These figures are the averages during the past 3 years.

The table indicates that a considerable number of candidates apply for this scholarship. Most of students were from urban areas. However, the only medium of publicity is the advertisement given by the Ministry of Education through national newspapers where a large majority of students may not have access to newspapers.

District Education Officers or the college administration has no arrangements for informing the students about the availability and terms and conditions of the scholarship. All the scholars have confirmed that their source of information was only the advertisement in the national newspapers. A large number of colleges are situated at tehsil level. Therefore, students coming from rural background and studying in colleges of small towns may not be able to get information and process their application in time.

6. Adequacy of the Parents Income:

Per capita monthly income is Rs.526 at current prices in 1987-88 and the household income of Rs.2363. Approximately half of the families earn less than national per capita. In fact this was the section of population whose children were supposed to be the principal beneficiary of this scholarship scheme.

A typical Pakistan family earning approximately less than or equal to national house hold income cannot afford to educate their children in colleges and universities/professional educational institutions. As a matter of fact this class of people is non-existent at college and university level.

We support our point of view with some secondary sources. A survey conducted in Quaid-i-Azam university, Islamabad to know the socio-economic background of the students has produced the following findings.

TABLE-17

INCOME CLASSIFICATION OF PARENTS/GUARDIAN AS SPECIFIED BY STUDENT

Monthly Income	Number of Cases	% of the Total
1000 AND LESS	11	5.00
1001 TO 2000	44	5.00
2001 TO 3000	45	20.00
3001 TO 4000	33	15.00
4001 TO 5000	18	8.20
5000 AND ABOVE	69	31.04

Source: Abid Aman Barki, et. al. "Higher Education and Its Access to Different Socio-Economic Groups in Pakistan" in S.N. Hyder (ed.), Human Resource Development and Utilization: Issues and Problems, Islamabad, PMI, 1988. PP.82.

It can be observed from the table that a small minority of the students i.e. only 10% is coming from the families having income less than Rs.2000 per month while 35.4% belong to the families having income between Rs.2001 to Rs.4000 per month. A large number of students approximately 40% belong to income groups having monthly income of Rs.4001 and above.

As a matter of fact, the poor class is totally out of coverage of higher education in Pakistan. They are filtered out of the system at some basic levels of education. This point is further illustrated from the following evidences.

2. The management process is very lengthy. It takes the students from 9 to 12 months to apply for the award and received the scholarship money.
3. The amount of scholarship is inadequate and meets only 12 to 24% of expenditures incurred by students at various levels of education.
4. The scheme is not very well published. It is advertised only in the national press. A majority of the students living in rural areas may not have access to newspaper.
5. Poor section of the society, particularly the children of the landless workers have marginal representation at higher levels of education.

REFERENCES

1. Pakistan. Ministry of Education. *Documents on President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme*. p.6.
2. Pakistan. Ministry of Education. *Ibid* p.12.
3. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, vide letter No.F.2-9/76, dated 4.8.1988.
4. Abid Aman Barki (et. al). "Higher Education and its access to different socio-economics groups in Pakistan: S.N.Hyder (ed.) *Human Resource Development and utilization: issues and problems*. Islamabad: Pakistan Manpower Institute, 1988. pp.92-93.
5. Pakistan. *National Education Conference: Working Paper*. Ministry of Education: Islamabad. 1989.
6. Pakistan. Ministry of Education letter No.F.3-1/88/Sch-I.
7. "Scholarship Schemes of Government of Pakistan". Islamabad: Ministry of Education. pp.6-7.
8. Abid Aman Barki. *Op.cited*. PP.82-83.
9. Pakistan Economic Adviser's Wing. *Economic Survey of Pakistan: 1989-90*, Islamabad: Finance Division, 1990.
10. Abid Aman Barki. *Op.cit*. PP. 83-84.

CHAPTER-IV

Summary, Findings and Recommendations:

This study was undertaken to find out the factors which impeded the smooth working of President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme. The specific objectives of the study included (a) to know the status of year-wise level of utilization of scholarship and (b) to know the adequacy of the implementation procedure of the scheme (c) to examine the suitability of rates of scholarships for various levels (d) to adjudge the justification of parents/guardians income ceiling conditions for eligibility (e) to examine the reasons for success or failure of students to retain scholarship throughout their studies (f) to examine the criteria of constituting the scholarship committees by the Ministry of Education (g) to make suitable recommendations for the improvement of the scheme.

In order to answer these questions information was collected from different sources such as (a) documents of the Ministry of Education. (b) Interview with selected District Education Officers. (c) Informal interview with scholarship officers in the provinces. (d) Research on Education in Pakistan and (e) through a questionnaire administered to the students. The purpose of this questionnaire was to know (i) socio-economic background of the student (ii) problems faced by the student in the award and renewal of the scholarship and (iii) to know their pinion and suggestions in the improvement of the scheme.

All these information were analyzed independently but are integrated in this report in accordance with specified objectives of the study.

Findings:

A great number of scholarships remained un-utilized. In the first year 78.27% scholarships were utilized. In the second year the level of utilization went down to 59.69% approximately. In the 3rd, 4th, 5th and Sixth year the utilization level is drastically reduced to between 10% and 12%.

Scholarships remained underutilized in the first year because of delay in making decision for the award of scholarships. Moreover, at the time of admission in first year; students apply for several types of scholarships offered by federal and provincial governments. If the students receive offer from more than one source, they relinquish POT scholarship because it carries small money as compared to other schemes.

2. There is no provision for maintaining a waiting list record. If an awardee leaves the institution or relinquishes the award, the scholarship, under the present arrangements cannot be passed on to an other student. In this way a considerable number of POTS scholarships are lapsed.

3. The renewal of scholarship from 1st year to 2nd year depended upon student's performance in the annual examination. In order to retain the scholarship, a student has to maintain first class in all the subsequent examinations. A student if unfortunately obtained 58%

education. Therefore, the involvement of Chairman of BISE will help in streamlining all types of scholarship including POTS scheme.

- (c) DEOs have always complained about the non-cooperative attitudes of principals in the management of this scheme in general but particularly at the time of renewal of scholarships. The presence of principals on this committee will automatically provide necessary co-operation to the scholarship committee. The principals may be nominated by the Director of Education himself.

It is expected that formation of such a committee will help in the better utilization of scholarships. The present rate (21.73%) of under-utilization in the first year will be drastically reduced. Moreover, the present duration of 9 to 12 months taken by the students to apply for the scholarship and receive the cheque will be reduced to minimum.

The committee may make decisions about all types of scholarships under its jurisdiction at the same time. This will help in eliminating the overlapping of various scholarship schemes.

The decision of the scholarship committee should be final. As soon as decision is made, the scholarship committee should send a list of awardees to the Ministry of Education only for information.

Upon the receipt of selection list from the Divisions, the Federal Ministry of Education may immediately transfer the funds to the Directorate of Education.

The Director of Education should take necessary measures so that students are paid scholarship money on monthly basis.

2. The present practice of awarding scholarships for six years should be continued. But the scholarships should be renewed after two years. The present practice of renewing scholarships every year should be discontinued. In this way present 20% rate of wastage between first and second year will be reduced to approximately zero percent. In this regard another suggestion is also given.

In the first instance, scholarship should be awarded for two years. If a student obtains 1st class in the third year, his scholarship should be renewed. Again in the fifth year, if he/she obtains 1st class, the scholarship should be extended for another two year period.

Suppose a student fails to obtain 1st class in third year or 5th year, his stipend should be discontinued but scholarship should remain alive and non-relapseable. The funds of lapsed scholarships should be awarded to poor students. No doubt, much office work will have to be done by the Directors of Education, but this will greatly help the poor talented students.

3. At present, all the student whose parents income is less than Rs.2000 per month are equally eligible for the award of scholarship. But once this conditions for eligibility is determined the students are awarded scholarships purely on merit basis. Therefore, parents level of income be made on integral part of the criteria for the award of the scholarship. For this purpose, the following formula may be used.

Merit index = Two thousand - Parent's income + Marks obtained by the student + 100 points for rural domicile:

It is expected that the adoption of this formula will compensate the poor and the rural people.

At present scholarship rates are very small and meet only 15% to 24% of the students expenditures. The amount of scholarship must be raised to make the scheme beneficial to the poor in true sense of the term. It may cover at least 50% of the students expenditures. The proposed amounts are as follows:

	<u>Non-Boarder</u>	<u>Boarder</u>
F.A./F.Sc./Commercial Colleges	Rs.350	Rs.450
B.A./B.Sc.	Rs.450	Rs.550
M.A./M.Sc./MBBS/ B.Sc. Agriculture/Engg.	Rs.550	Rs.650

In order to combat inflation/dearness there should be a 10% automatic increase per annum in the scholarship amount.

In addition, student may be paid books/stationery allowance equivalent to one month stipend every year. The system of publicity may further be improved. In addition to advertisement in the national and local press, the Directorate of Education must notify all colleges under its jurisdiction about the availability and terms and conditions of the scholarship. The college Principal notify it to students and put it on the notice board.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Barki, Abid Aman. (et. al). "Higher Education and its Access to Different Socio-Economics groups in Pakistan" (in: S.N.Hyder (ed.) *Human Resource Development and utilization: issues and problems* Islamabad: Pakistan Manpower Institute, 1988.
2. Pakistan. Economic Adviser's Wing. *Economic Survey of Pakistan: 1989-90*.
3. Naik, J.P. and Syed Noorullah. History of Education in India. -- 2nd ed. Bombay: Macmillan, 1959.
4. Pakistan. Education Division. *Educational Conference Proceedings*; held at Karachi. 1947.
5. Pakistan. *Commission on National Education*, Report (1959), Karachi: Government Printing Press, 1959. pp.11-13, 245-250.
6. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, Education and Scientific Research. *The New Education Policy*. Islamabad: 1970. pp.2-3, 17-18.
7. Pakistan. Ministry of Education. *The Education Policy (1972-80)*. Islamabad: 1977. pp.1-2, 25-27.
8. Pakistan. Ministry of Finance, Planning and Development. *Budget; 1972*. Islamabad: 1972.
9. Pakistan. Ministry of Education. "President's One Thousand Scholarship Scheme." PC-I.
10. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, *vide* letter No.F.3-1/88-Sch-I, dated 10.10.1988.
11. Pakistan. ECNEC, *vide* Cabinet Division's O.M.No.ENC-51M/73, dated 12.10.1973.
12. Pakistan. Ministry of Education letter No.F.1-8/73-LB-IS, dated 4.5.1974.
13. Pakistan. ECNEC, *vide* case No.ENC/24/175, dated 25.6.1975.
14. Pakistan. Cabinet Division Corrigendum No.ENC-1/M/75, dated 20.7.1975.
15. Pakistan. ECNEC *vide* Cabinet Division's O.M.No.ENC-1M/177, dated 27.2.1977.
16. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, *vide* letter No.F.2-9/76 P&D, dated 27.2.1977.
17. Pakistan. Ministry of Education letter No.F.2-2/81-Sch-I, dated 19.7.1983.
18. Pakistan. Ministry of Education letter No.F.3-1/88-Sch-I, dated 18.10.1988.
19. Pakistan. Ministry of Education No.F.3-5/86-Sch-I, dated 16.10.1988.

20. Pakistan. Ministry of Education, *vide* letter No.F.2-9/76, dated 4.8.1988.
21. Pakistan. *National Education Conference. Working Paper.*
Ministry of Education, Islamabad: 1989.
22. Pakistan. Ministry of Education letter No.F.3-1/88/Sch-I.