

AEPM Research Study No. 211

EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN ROLE OF PRIVATE SECTOR

DR. PERVEZ A. SHAMI
Izaz-e-Fazeelat

KH. SABIR HUSSAIN

**ACADEMY OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT
MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
ISLAMABAD- PAKISTAN**

2007

RESEARCH TEAM

1. Pervez A. Shami, Director General
2. Kh. Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director (Research)
3. Muhammad Siab, Research Assistant
4. Muhammad Sohail Ajmal, Research Assistant

DATA ANALYSIS

1. Kh. Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director (Research)

REPORT WRITING

1. Kh. Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director (Research)

TYPING, COMPOSING AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

1. Muhammad Sohail Ajmal, Research Assistant

MAIN ENTRY UNDER AUTHORS:

1. Dr. Pervez A. Shami and Kh. Sabir Hussain

Cataloguing in Publication Data

Main entry under Authors:

Dr. Pervez A. Shami and Kh. Sabir Hussain

Education in Pakistan Role of Private Sector - (AEPAM Research Study No. 211)

- | | |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. <i>Private Education</i> | 2. <i>Private Schools</i> |
| 3. <i>Learning Achievement</i> | 4. <i>Education Policies</i> |
| 5. <i>Budgeting</i> | 6. <i>Education Development</i> |

370.0205491

. ISBN: 978-969-444-152-8

Foreword

This qualitative and quantitative study pertains to the assessment of private sector's contribution in the development of Education in Pakistan. Major focus is on the role of private sector in the development of Education with special reference to National Education Policies, Plans and incentives for private sector development, learning achievements and outcomes which are directly related to the quality of schools and trends in expansion.

The Government has implemented President Education Sector Reforms (PESR) with emphasis on public private partnership by providing facilities to private sector to enhance access to education. This study investigates the extent of provision of educational facilities to the masses in the country. This document reflects the role of private sector in the quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education in the country.

I would like to express my gratitude to the faculty members/officials of AEPAM for their hard work especially Kh. Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director (Research) for managing and reporting the study. The services of Mr. Muhammad Sohail Ajmal, Research Assistant are also appreciated for composing the report.

Dr. Pervez Aslam Shami
(Izaz-e-Fazeelat)
Director General

This qualitative and quantitative study focuses on the assessment of private sector's contribution in the development of Education in Pakistan. Major focus is on the role of private sector in the development of Education with special reference to National Education Policy, Plans and strategies for private sector development, learning infrastructure and resources which are directly related to the quality of schools and trends in education.

The Government has implemented various Education Sector Reforms (ESRs) with emphasis on public-private partnership by providing facilities to private sector to enhance sector in education. This study investigates the extent of provision of educational facilities to the masses in the country. This document reflects the role of private sector in the qualitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education in the country.

I would like to express my gratitude to the faculty members/staff of AEFAD for their kind work especially Mr. Saad Hussain, Deputy Director (Research) for managing and supervising the study. The services of Mr. Muhammad Saif-ur-Rahman, Research Assistant are also appreciated for preparing the report.

Dr. Farooq Aslam Shami
(Research Assistant)
Director General

Executive Summary

Private sector plays vital role in the development of education. According to National Education Census (2005), out of 245,682 institutions, 81,103 (33 per cent) were found to be in the private sector. This proved that the government is rapidly moving towards its goal of shifting the load of education to the private sector, as was stated in National Education Policy (1998-2010). That effort would be made to increase the ratio of private sector upto 50:50. However, at present this ratio is 33%.

This study was designed to serve as a comprehensive background paper on role of private sector in development of education. In this context, the study aims to give particular attention to important role of private sector in terms of number of institutions, teachers and students enrolment. The efforts have been made to analyze and review all National Education Policies, Plans and Strategies, which were adopted for encouraging the private sector for providing quality education in the country. The problems which are being faced by private sector have been explored, with possible solution, so that reader would be able to get crux of the situation.

Findings

1. There were 81,103 private institutions in the country in 2005. In Punjab 48,541, in Sindh 12,574, in NWFP 11,276, in Balochistan 1,750, in ICT 750, in FATA 640, in FANA 2,861 and in AJK 2,711. It is encouraging to note that private sector institutions are growing rapidly, i.e. from 36,096 institutions in 1999-2000 to 81,103 educational institutions in 2005, showing thereby an annual average increase of 25 percent. It was found that mostly private schools were co-educational, as there were 61,847 mixed schools, whereas 7,603 for boys and 6,597 for girls. As far as location is concerned, there were 40,609 schools in urban areas and 35,438 schools were functioning in rural areas.

2. Total teaching staff employed in these private schools was 6,32,926 (male 2,13,258 and 4,19,668 female). There are 4,21,034 in urban areas and 2,11,892 in rural area. As far as enrolment is concerned, there are total 121,21,394 students (boys 678,4361 and girls 533,7033) have been enrolled in these institutions. Location of these institutions indicated that in urban area 758,4704 students and in rural area 453,6690 students are getting education.

3. National Education Census data indicate that expenditure of private sector is more than public sector. Federal Government spent Rs.36.28 billion on education as expenditure in Punjab province during 2004-05. In addition the Government of Punjab spent 52,413.306 million during the same period. The census results indicate that in private sector institutions of Punjab the expenditure on education during 2004-05 was Rs.19,761.60 million which was more than three times as compared to the Private Educational Institutions Census, 2001. During 2004-05, Sindh Government spent Rs. 19,631.827 million on education. The Private Sector's expenditure on education during 2004-05 was reported as Rs.81,28.1 million, which was two times higher as compared to the last census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs. 4,273 million) conducted in 2001.

4. Federal Government spent Rs. 36,282 million in the country during 2004-05 and NWFP Government spent Rs. 16,975 million. The census results indicate that in NWFP expenditures in private sector institutions (Rs.4,438 million) were spent during 2004-05 which were three times higher as compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs.1,478 million) conducted in 2001. The Balochistan Government spent Rs. 7,617 million during 2004-05 on education in the province. The census results indicate that in Balochistan expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.659.7 million, which were three times higher as

compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs.227 million) conducted in 2001.

5. The National Education Census results indicate that expenditures in private sector institutions in AJK during 2004-05 were Rs. 860.2 million and in FATA expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.143.5 million. The census results indicate that expenditures in private sector institutions in FANA during 2004-05 were Rs. 329.4 million and expenditures in ICT private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.1593.5 million which were four times higher (Rs.365 million) as compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions conducted in 2001.

6. The analysis of various documents indicate that on the one hand private sector has substantial share in the development of education, on the other private sector is facing a lot of problems. The most important problems are: Private sector itself is responsible to generate funds to run the institution. There is not any financial assistance available to private sector through loans and special grants from any agency. Management of private schools have complaints, that government is doing nothing except taking money by imposing taxes and taking away all of their earnings. It has been documented in various research studies that departments of social security, old age benefit, income tax and property tax harass the owners of private schools. Moreover, School registration is compulsory with district education department. But it has been observed that registration process and procedure of payment of registration fee is very difficult. In addition to this, staff deputed to deal registration process have negative attitude and sometimes they openly demand for bribe. This corruption on the part of government functionaries is miserable. Furthermore, provision of Land for Private Institutions is a big problem because of high price of land which is increasing day by day. Availability of physical facilities, science equipment and computer laboratories and other teaching aids are very costly. Most of the private institutions cannot provide these facilities to the students unless they increase monthly fee. Moreover, hiring of qualified and trained teachers is very expensive private school management have no alternative to hire the services of less qualified and untrained teachers. However, management of these institutions is satisfied with the performance of these untrained teachers in general and of female teachers in particular.

Way Forward

1. The private institutions have proved to be an integral and important part of the educational activity in our country. The future of private educational institutions is very bright in our society. If the private school owners follow a standard code of conduct, these institutions can play a major part in improving, not only the educational standards but also in increasing the literacy rate and rate of employment within the country.

2. The National Education Policies (1979) and (1998-2010) proposed policy measures to encourage private sector participation ratio upto 50:50. The policy interventions have positive impact on the role of private sector as its present share is 33% with an average annual increase of 25% as indicated in National Education Census 2005. Private sector substantial contribution in increasing educational activities proved itself to be an integral part of the public sector. Thus, recognizing the importance of private sector is contributing. Government emphasized in National Education Policy (1998-2010) and ESR program, to address the critical issues i.e. access, equity and quality of education through public-private partnership program. This innovation contributed in quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education system in the country.

3. Private sector played important part in public sector development and in socio-economic development of the country by providing employment opportunities to educated youth and

providing skillful work force. Resultantly, sustainable development may be ensured by encouraging private sector.

4. The thrust areas of Education Sector Reforms are enhancing literacy rate, universal primary education and quality of education. The findings of this study proved that private sector has valuable contribution on these long standing policy issues.

5. Private investment in education sector seems to be profitable, as expenditure of private sector is more than that of government, whereas, private sector has to generate its resources from their institutions own which is very difficult. There is need to provide proper guideline to the individuals for investment in education sector, awareness of the benefits of education may be created in terms of private and social rate of return.

...the ... of ...

The ... of ...

... the ... of ...

CONTENTS

Title	Page#
Foreword	iii
Executive Summary	v
1. INTRODUCTION	01
1. Introduction	03
1.1 Rationale	03
1.2 Objectives of the Study	04
1.3 Methodology of the Study	04
1.4 Delimitations of the Study	04
2. REVIEW OF CURRENT NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICIES	05
2. Review of Current National Education Policies	07
2.1 National Educational Policy 1998-2010	07
2.2 Public Private Partnership	09
2.3 Objectives of ESR Program	11
2.4 Targets of ESR Program	11
2.5 The Government's Incentive Program	12
2.6 Issues of Public-Private Partnership	12
2.7 Government Initiatives	13
2.7.1 Afternoon School System: Up-Gradation of Schools through Community Participation Project (CPP)	13
2.7.2 Adopt-a-School/ School Improvement Programme	14
2.7.3 IT Programs in Government Schools	14
2.7.4 Mainstreaming of the Madaris (Religious Schools)	14
2.7.5 Capacity Building of School Management Committee (SMCs)/PTAs	15
3. STATUS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION	17
3.1 Number of Private Schools	19
3.1.1 National Level	19
3.1.2 Province Wise	19
3.1.3 Gender Wise	20
3.1.4 Location Wise	21
3.2 Enrolment in Private Schools	23
3.3 Teaching Staff in Educational Institutions	27
3.4 Budgetary Allocation	30
3.4.1 Expenditure in Punjab	30
3.4.2 Expenditure in Sindh	31
3.4.3 Expenditure in NWFP	31
3.4.4 Expenditure in Balochistan	32
3.4.5 Expenditure in AJK	33
3.4.6 Expenditure in FATA	33
3.4.7 Expenditure in FANA	34
3.4.8 Expenditure in ICT	34
3.4.9 Private School Fee	35

4.	REGULATORY AUTHORITY OF PRIVATE INSTITUTIONS	37
4.	Background	39
4.1	Composition of Regulatory Authority	39
4.2	Aims and Objectives of Regulatory Authority	39
4.3	Additional Aims and Objectives	40
4.4	Pre-requisites for Registration of Institution	40
4.5	Procedure of Registration	40
4.6	Withdrawal of Registration	41
4.7	Renewal of Registration	41
4.8	Fees Being Charged	41
4.9	Offence and Penalty	42
4.10	Control Over Fee	42
4.11	Other Rules	42
4.12	Private Educational Institutions in ICT	43
4.13	Problems Faced and Resolved	43
4.14	Commitment	43
5.	NATIONAL EDUCATION FOUNDATION	45
5.	National Education Foundation	47
5.1	Objectives	47
5.2	Capacity Building	48
5.3	Research and Development	48
5.4	The Programmes	48
5.5	Quality Assurance and Support	52
5.6	Research and Development	52
6.	FEATURES AND LEARNING ACHIEVEMENT	53
6.1	Location of Private Schools	55
6.2	Girls as Students in Private Schools	55
6.3	Co-Education	56
6.4	Female Teacher with Low Wages	57
6.5	English Medium	57
6.6	Learning Achievement at Primary Level in Private Schools	57
7.	MAJOR PROBLEM	59
7.1	Financial Assistance	61
7.2	Heavy Tax	61
7.3	Availability of Physical Facilities	61
7.4	Teachers Training	61
7.5	Government Officials' Attitude	61
7.6	Provision of Land for Private Institutions	61
7.7	Registration Process	61
7.8	Private Schools more interested in Profits than Education	62
8.	FINDINGS CONCLUSIONS AND WAY FORWARD	63
	Findings	65
	Conclusion	67
	Way Forward	68
	Bibliography	69

Chapter # 1

INTRODUCTION

Chapter # 1

INTRODUCTION

1. Introduction

Private sector plays vital role in the development of education. It has been observed that share of private sector is substantial. According to National Education Census (2005), out of 245,682 institutions, 81,103 (33 per cent) were found to be in the private sector. This proved that the government is rapidly moving towards its goal of shifting the load of education to the private sector, as was stated in National Education Policy (1998-2010). That effort would be made to increase the ratio of private school upto 50:50. However, at present this ratio is 33%.

This study was designed to serve as a comprehensive background paper on role of private sector in development of education. In this context, the study aims to give particular attention to important role of private sector in terms of number of institutions, teachers and students enrolment. The efforts have been made to analyze and review all National Education Policies, Plans and strategies, which were adopted for encouraging the private sector for providing quality education in the country. The problems which are being faced by private sector have been explored, with possible solution, so that reader would be able to get crux of the situation. In addition, plan-wise financial allocation and actual expenditure on primary education have been discussed.

The study is divided into eight sections. The first section comprises of introduction of this report, whereas the second section explains review of National Education Policies. Status of Primary Education has been presented in third section. Regulatory Authority of Private Institutions has been presented in fourth section whereas National Education Foundation has been given in fifth section. Location coeducation Features and learning Achievement has been discussed in sixth chapter. Problems of Private Schools have been identified in seventh chapter. Last section consists of findings, conclusions and way forward.

1.1 Rationale

The pattern of ownership of educational institutions that emerges from the census is also somewhat worrying. The institutions in the private sector are not evenly spread out at all levels. Thus, the private sector has more schools at secondary and middle levels (61 per cent) than the government has. Again the private sector operates more technical, vocational and professional institutions, such as poly-technical, vocational and professional institutions, such as mono-techniques, (70 percent) than the government is running.

The private institutions are performing better. They have more accountability and the parents feel that their complaints are addressed. It is also felt that the private institutions have more effective administration and are relatively efficient in their working. Since they are result oriented, the teachers and the management is more focused and motivated. Even though they operate in seller's market and face little competition, they have to show a reasonably good track record to attract their clientele.

The private sector's expenditure is more difficult to calculate. The census document states that 9000 institutions did not provide the financial information for reasons of tax evasion. But according to a rough estimate the private sector spends Rs. 8, 940 per head to educate 12.121 million students.

On the contrary, in public sector educational institutions, the fee is nominal of Rs. 10 or so a month and the teachers are not under much pressure. Those who are not too contentious take advantage of the lack of effective monitoring and many of them actually become partners in the corruption that is rampant in the education departments. Even in school where management board exists, their role is not very effective.

Since the denationalization of private schooling in Pakistan in 1979, there has been significant growth in the share of education in the private sector, both in terms of the numbers of schools, as well as the proportion of children enrolled. Nevertheless, there has been little work done on this phenomenon. It was largely due to a lack of reliable nationwide data either on private schools or on the population since there was no population census in Pakistan between 1981 and 1998.

Jimenez and Tan (1985 and 1987) examined the role of private education in Pakistan. Based on a school mapping exercise conducted in 1983, the authors noted that there had been a large increase in the number of private schools, leading to substantial cost savings for the government in the provision of education. The authors also noted that despite of growth in private schools, educational institutions did not serve large proportions of the country's population, and this was particularly important in the case of girls in rural areas. Lastly, based on tuition and other fees in private schools, Jimenez and Tan argued that private schools seemed to be catering only to the rich.

There has been considerable work in particular regions in Pakistan, including a body of work by Alderman et al (1987) in Lahore and Quetta. During the nineties, the authors showed that private schooling is used extensively both by the rich and the poor- for instance, even among the poorest localities in Lahore, more children are sent to private than public schools. The conclusions of this work point towards the importance of a nationwide analysis of private schooling and their role in educational delivery, particularly with regards to future government policy in this sector.

1.2 Objectives of the Study were:

1. To investigate number of institutions, teachers and enrolment in private schools
2. To explore the expenditure of private institutions
3. To investigate the problems of private schools
4. To suggest viable measures for policy formulation

1.3 Methodology of the Study

The study is a qualitative and quantitative analysis based on two kinds of information

1. Published or Secondary information

Recent information published in reliable national sources in the country.

2. Primary data of National Education Census 2005

Academy of Educational Planning and Management conducted NEC 2005. This report is based on NEC data. Moreover, data of other research studies of AEPAM have also been used.

1.4 Delimitations of the Study

1. This study was delimited to analyze the National Education Census, Policies, Development Plans, official documents and research reports.
2. Data have been used from only official published documents.

Chapter # 2

**REVIEW OF CURRENT
NATIONAL EDUCATION
POLICIES**

Chapter # 2

REVIEW OF CURRENT
NATIONAL EDUCATION
POLICIES

2. Review of Current National Education Policies

It is fact that privately managed educational institutions constituted a sizeable portion of the total education system. These institutions were administered and managed by voluntary organizations, and apart from generating their own funds through fees, attached property and donations, the institutions also received grant-in-aid from the government. Some private educational institutions earned high reputation for the academic standards they maintained and for the quality of their public instruction.

In view of high rate in growth in population and ever expanding size of primary education sector, the government is seeking participation of private sector in making basic education accessible to all citizens of Pakistan. Population growth rate in Pakistan is higher than other developing countries and only about 50% of the existing primary age group children are presently in schools. In such a situation Government alone cannot provide all the educational facilities to its 100% population. Therefore, the support of private sector is most needed to share this huge burden.

Recognizing this fact that the Government alone cannot achieve the desired objectives, it was imperative to seek political involvement of the private sector in the expansion of education system. The private sector needs to be assured that the educational institutions established by them in future will not be nationalized. Unless such an assurance is forthcoming, the private enterprise is most likely to remain shy of making any further investment in education.

Private sector in education has long been a major source of perpetual division and demarcation of privilege, status and esteem, power, opportunity and expectations that go with it. In the past, private sector played a very limited role as this was meant only for the elite's children. These institutions of private sector created a class system and were responsible for the division in a society. *"The existing system of private schooling with all its increments of status and complementary paraphernalia of quaint uniform, traditions, language and accent is amongst the most offensive means of perpetually imposing the division among society"* (Kinnoch, 1981).

Private sector can provide a variety of choices to the parents. Local community, which runs the private institutions, can always play a definite important role in increasing the literacy rate if taken into confidence. The continued contribution of healthy independent sector towards the development of tomorrow's citizen is welcomed. People want variety and freedom of choice in all areas of life. In the sphere of education, parents choose particular schools for many different reasons. The right to exercise parental choice is key component of the society (Becker, 1987).

The National Education Policy (1992) stated that participation of the private sector in education development in Pakistan has a long history. *"Since 1947 to 1971, the private sector's contribution expanded considerably through a variety of non-governmental organizations. In 1991, the public to private sector ratio in education system was 70:30. If this trend continued, it is estimated, this ratio could easily touch the 50:50 ratio"*. However at present, this ratio is 33% with an annual average increase of 25% (NEC: 2005).

2.1 National Educational Policy 1998-2010

The following policy provisions/implementation strategy in respect of involvement of private sector in education was made:

1. There shall be regulatory bodies at the national / provincial levels to regulate activities and smooth functioning of privately managed schools and institutions of higher education through proper rules and regulations.
2. A reasonable tax rebate shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting-up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in aid for specific purposes shall be provided to private institutions. Setting up of private technical institutions shall be encouraged.
3. Matching grants shall be provided for establishing educational institutions by the private sector in the rural areas or poor urban areas through Education Foundations.
4. Existing institutions of higher learning shall be allowed to negotiate for financial assistance with donor agencies in collaboration with the Ministry of Education.
5. Educational institutions to be set up in the private sector shall be provided (a) plots in residential schemes on reserve prices, and (b) rebate on income tax, like industry.
6. In rural areas, schools shall be established through public-private partnership schemes. The government shall not only provide free land to build the school but shall also bear a reasonable proportion of the cost of construction and management.
7. Companies, with a paid-up capital of Rs. 100 million or more, shall be required under the law to establish and run educational institutions up to secondary level with funds provided by them.
8. Liberal loan facilities shall be extended to private educational institutions by financial institutions.
9. The private sector institutions at all levels shall be allowed to collaborate with international institutions of repute for achieving common academic objectives, subject to laws to be framed in this context.
10. Schools running on non-profit basis shall be exempted from all taxes.
11. Privately managed institutions shall be bound under law to admit, free of charge, at least 10% of the talented students belonging to the low-income groups.
12. Curricula of private institutions must conform to the principles laid down in the Federal Supervision of Curricula, Textbooks and Maintenance of Standards of Education Act, 1976.
13. The fee structure shall be developed in consultation with the government.
14. Selective de-nationalization of nationalized institutions shall be initiated.
15. The law pertaining to the setting-up of degree-awarding higher educational institutions and specialized institutes shall be liberalized. The institutions so established shall be placed under the University Grants Commission (now Higher Education Commission) for monitoring the academic programs and the award of degrees (National Education Policy 1998-2010, pp. 107-112).

In private sector institutions and individuals have traditionally played a substantial role in the delivery of education in Pakistan. In 2002, according to the Federal Bureau of Statistics, there were 36,096 private educational institutes in Pakistan of which 66.4% were in Punjab, 12.3% in

NWFP, 17.9% in Sindh, 1.5% in Balochistan, 0.9% in FATA and 1% in Islamabad. Of these institutions, 39% were located in rural areas and 61% in urban areas, 43.5% were primary schools, 37% middle schools, 17.5% secondary and 2% higher secondary and above. According to the Pakistan Education and School atlas (2002), 18% of all schools in Pakistan were private and more telling is that these schools accounted for 27% of all student enrollment.

Since Pakistan got independence efforts were being made to provide definite direction to education in Pakistan. Quaid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah laid down set of aims that provided guidance to all the education endeavors in the country. No doubt he had a deep desire to see his nation involve in acquiring education but, due to ideological conflicts that existed among different sects of society and insufficient resources acted as a hurdle in providing educational facility and ensuring the right of education for every one.

There exist several loopholes in educational policies and implementation programs that could not be accomplished in a better way to achieve the desired goals. After independence Pakistan got entangled with numerous problems in different areas that led to the introduction of programs and reforms for the socio economic up lift of the nation.

The GOP was not in a position to provide adequate resources both financial and physical in improving the educational system of newly independent country. "Realizing the shortcoming of the government and strong belief among the policy maker that people as beneficiaries will have to share the burden of expansion of education individually or collectively, reforms were introduced to generate resources from other".

New system and reforms provided private sector an opportunity to participate in the provision of educational facilities to the people of Pakistan and it continued till 1972. "There are already signs that private sector can help remove some of the bottlenecks hindering the development of human resources". It has become imperative to seek involvement of private sector to pursue common goals, which were too imperative to be left to the state alone.

The year 1972 saw a change in educational policy that was "in 1972 the government decided to take over all the privately managed educational institutions". As a result, educational institutions were nationalized but this action of government did not bring positive results.

"The national policy of 1979 reviewed the consequences of nationalization and came to the conclusion that in view of the poor participation rate, at all levels of the education, the government alone could not carry the burden of the whole educational process." Keeping the consequences in mind it was decided by the government to once again encourage participation of the community in education development programs. Educational foundations were set up in all the provinces and at the national level to facilitate public private partnership. As the private sector kept on managing and administering educational institutions constituted the sizeable majority of a total population, it has earned a high reputation of imparting quality education.

As the time passed, role of private sector was further realized and given mandate to succeed. "During the English plan (1933-1998) private sector was encouraged to establish educational system at all levels." GoP has undertaken reform to shift its role from being a provider to facilitator and financier to promote and improve educational opportunities in Pakistan.

2.2 Public-Private Partnership

"A public-private partnership is defined as any arrangement between a government and the private sector (inclusive of CSOs) in which partially or traditionally public activities are performed by the private sector." (Savas, 2000)

Public private partnership is becoming an increasingly established and preferred approach to build increased efficiency, effectiveness and quality into service delivery. Whether this is a current trend or a long-term sustainable way of delivering services, most large-scale public programmes, in education as well as in other sectors that have recently been designed and launched in Pakistan, include PPP as an approach for programme implementation.

In Pakistan, the private sector has been encouraged under recent Education Sector Reforms to take on the management of low performing government schools.

An example of a successful public private partnership in Pakistan is that of the Quetta Urban Fellowship Programme, in Balouchistan, Pakistan. The project aimed to stimulate girls schooling through the creation of private girls' schools in poor urban neighbourhoods and resulted in an increased enrolment of both boys and girls – although there was neighbourhood variations.

Three forms of non-profit and private partnerships in Pakistan are described further:

- Non-formal primary schools, owned by communities and managed by NGOs, either directly funded by donors and government or indirectly by donors through government.
- Community schools, managed by school management committee (SMCs) composed of parents and teachers. There is representation of the education department by officials formally appointed to the SMC. They are funded by donors through government or through semi-government organizations.
- Fellowship schools tend to take in lower middle class families as well as children of poor families. They are owned by communities and managed by parent education committees (PCs). They are funded by donors, through government, but also charge some fees.

Because of its emerging nature, there are varying parameters being used to shape the definition of public private partnership, particularly for the delivery of public goods such as education. PPP can be defined to include a number of different mechanisms, such as *public or government financing of services* (e.g., in the case of education, a relevant example could be that of school vouchers for poor children); *public contracting out of services* (such as the training of government teachers to a private institution, or community-parent mobilization to an NGO), or *procuring of services* (i.e., technical assistance) for specialized functions (ranging from textbook design to reform of an examination system); or, perhaps a more informal arrangement that includes *active participation of private sector institutions* in policy dialogue and planning processes. Additionally, the running of a parallel system by the private sector, while not a direct partnership, can also qualify in as much as such a system is in the business of providing a public good. While it is acknowledged by most partners that the understanding about the third “P”, i.e., partnership, is still emerging and clearly needs to be embedded and more emphasized in PPP schemes, there are already several examples of PPP that have been recognized for their success or for the lessons they offer.

Reform Efforts. In order to remedy the problems of the education system at the roots, the Government of Pakistan has launched initiatives to bring reform to the system. These include: a) efforts to decentralize education service delivery and its management as part of the devolution plan (similar to efforts in India under the District Primary Education Project); and b) the Education Sector Reforms (ESR) programme that was launched two years ago. The relevance of decentralization to PPP is that the new system has brought about greater accountability of education managers to the local communities and has encouraged local level institutions (such as

School Management Committees) to flourish. This process continues to provide a wider space for innovative PPP to take place, particularly as district governments are pursuing partnerships with NGOs, private sector schools, and even the corporate sector.

The ESR was developed by the Ministry of Education to be a long-term framework of reforms linked to Education for All (EFA) goals through 2015, with a three-year action plan for 2001-2004 designed to close the gap in imbalances in service delivery, ranging from early childhood to the tertiary level. The ESR has expanded the scope for public-private initiatives by specifying it as an essential part of one of the thrust areas: Innovative Programmes

As a result of these reform efforts, many examples of PPP are emerging, some of which have been referred to above. What is more important to note here, however, is that an environment that is conducive to adoption of partnership between the public and private sector for delivery of education services has emerged and is taking firm root in Pakistan. The provincial and district governments are keen to improve delivery of services by factoring in the innovation and efficiency that can accompany PPP. The AKDN has already positioned itself as an important partner for the Government by working within many of the ESR areas.

The National Education Policy (1998-2010) proposed that there shall be regulatory bodies at the national and provincial levels to regulate activities and smooth functioning of privately managed schools and institutions of higher education through proper rules and regulations. A reasonable tax rebate shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in-Aid for specific purposes shall be provided to private institutions. Setting up of private technical institutions shall be encouraged. Matching grants shall be provided for establishing educational institutions by the private sector in the rural areas or poor urban areas through Education Foundation. In rural areas, schools shall be established through public-private partnership schemes. The government shall not only provide free land to build the school but also bear a reasonable proportion of the cost of construction and management. Liberal loan facilities shall be extended to private educational institutions by financial institutions.

2.3 Objectives of ESR Program

- Increasing access to quality education at all levels
- Improved service delivery through public private partnership.

2.4 Targets of ESR Program

1. Provision of incentive package for private sector
2. Involvement of private sector in the management of under utilized public sector institutions
3. Provision of grants and soft loans through restructured Education Foundations.
4. Adopt School Program
5. Community Participation Project (CPP) for school; up gradation in afternoon shifts from primary to middle/middle to secondary and higher secondary levels
6. Introduction of Information Technology courses in schools/colleges through private sector under public-private partnership.
7. Access to public funds – 25% utilization of funds at district level through CCB's and PTA's.

2.5 The government's incentive program

Among other initiatives, the GoP has undertaken policy reforms and provided incentives to flourish in the education sector.

1. Income tax exemption for teaching faculty and researchers are in place on a sliding scale whereby income greater than Rs. 1,000,000 receives a tax reduction of 5% all the way down to annual income of Rs. 60,000 receiving a tax reduction of 80%.
2. Exemption of custom duties and other taxes on import of education equipment /material is granted to institutions which are recognized, aided or run by the government.
3. Electricity shall be provided on domestic tariff rates:
4. Provision of land free or on concessional rates in rural areas. In urban areas, respective departments/ organizations shall undertake appropriate zoning for educational institutions in residential areas.
5. Provision of concessional financing for establishing rural schools through respective education foundations and credit through Khushali Bank and other such financial institutions.

This decision was promptly sent forward to each of the provisional education departments, the Capital Development Authority (CDA), Water and Power Development Authority (WAPDA), Khushali Bank, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF) and the Federal Directorate of Education to be made aware of these concessions⁹

2.6 Issues of public-private partnership

Following are some areas of concern in PPP, which needs particular attentions.

- There has been mushroom emergence of private institutions that creates the air of mistrust between public and private sector. It is believed that these institutions are establishing with money-oriented approach and have profit motives.
- Opening of primary schools in private sector is helping to achieve the government objective of universalization of primary education. But rural areas are not targeted where more schools are needed as compare to urban areas so in this way role of private sector has marginalized.
- Progress of any project whether it is from public or private is confined to one specific tier, not trickling down to other tiers as well.
- Mistrust between public and private sector proliferates misunderstandings.
- There is a dire need of coordinating body between public and private sector.
- The issue of fees has always been subject of server criticism by the society. Private institutions have high fees as compare to government institutions, so the privately managed schools are not providing equal opportunity and access to poor talented

students. On the other hand it is also to consider that in the absence of in aid grant or other donations fee is the main source of income for private institutions.

- As far as curricula and scheme of studies is concerned, private institutions are blamed to prescribe books which contains unsatisfactory material and contradicts the curricula and scheme of studies prepared by the Ministry of Education to ensure the maintenance of standards and to keep a watch so that material repugnant to the ideology of Pakistan are not included in the text produced.

2.7 Government Initiatives

In recent time, the government has helped develop, provide and fund incentives and programs that facilitate non-governmental agencies participating in all facts of education delivery. Though the government manages these schemes, the implementers and facilities are by in large CSOs.

2.7.1 Afternoon School System: Up-Gradation of Schools through Community Participation Project (CPP)

An innovative experiment implemented by the Government of Punjab to address the challenges of too few children having access to post-primary schooling is the CPP Up-gradation program. Seeing that government school campuses were utilized for only six hours each day (usually in the morning), the project aimed to invite private sector or NGO entities (know as licensees) to commit to upgrading a regular government school and establishing an afternoon schooling system, either as a second elementary shift or a middle/ high school session. Cost savings to the government as a result of the program are estimated to be Rs. 0.8 million per primary to elementary up-gradation, Rs. 1.5 million per elementary to high up-gradation and Rs. 2 million per high to higher secondary up-gradation.

Through the program, the government provides the school building, furniture, libraries, labs and fixtures free of charge and recognizes the regular status of afternoon students. On its part, the licensee is required to upgrade and improve the school facilities, pay all utility bills of morning and afternoon shifts in lieu of rent waiver, and manage the afternoon program over a 5-year contract period (which is extendable by mutual consent). The licensee may charge a fee for the afternoon school as per a pre-agreed schedule with subsidies for needy children. Through his initiative, some 6,166 schools have with upgraded with (39% boys/61% girls) have been able to attend schools of all levels that they would otherwise not been able to access. The same initiative has been replicated in NWFP, but on much smaller scale with just 150 institutions brought into the net.

While the CPP concept is sound and has much potential, there have been considerable challenges in successfully implementing the program. First, the assumptions used when configuring the program in different geographic areas have tended to be static rather than dynamic, making them difficult to adapt to each specific community's needs. Moreover the morning shift is reluctant to take on the additional challenges presented by an afternoon shift, including the sharing of premises, required administration work and teacher resources. An additional problem is the equitable allocation of electricity costs and monitoring of the program on the part of the government. However, given the importance of bridging the ratios of primary to middle and high schools and the valuable saving to the government accrued through the program, CPP should be given due consideration, requires rigorous review of the scheme and the support needed to succeed.

2.7.2 Adopt-a-School/ School Improvement Programme

A second PPP scheme that has been widely implemented is the Adopt-a-School or School Improvement Program whereby NGOs/ CSOs may contractually take over and manage government schools over a prescribed time-period. This PPP arrangement is designed to help revitalize failed or low-performing public schools and is governed through a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) that sets the standards for the period (usually a minimum of three years) under which the school is under UNG-management. The Adopt-IT-labs as well as increased enrolments, more and attendance at public schools.

There are several examples of NGOs/CSOs that have successfully implemented the Adop-a-School program and taken it from strength to strength. Support to the program has been mobilized from Pakistani philanthropy in-country, the expatriate Diasporas as well as the corporate sector. Good adopt a school programs have followed a four-step adoption process compression.

- i. Identification and evaluation of the adoption targets,
- ii. Formal MoUs and the initiative of the adoption process through local community's mobilization,
- iii. Designing the school development plan, its management and implementation and
- iv. Devising an exit strategy through partnerships for sustainability.

Certain organizations, NGOs and concerned citizens have specialized in the program across Pakistan ranging from the Pakistan Navy, CARE, ITA, Ex-Governors of Sindh. It is expected that these successful models can be replicated throughout the country through corporate and individual philanthropy. Some private sector chains such as Baconhouse have also entered into PPP with Pakistan Railways to turn around their sick units providing places for non-railway clients, whilst protecting subsidized seats for railway employees' children.

2.7.3 IT Programs in Government Schools

A third initiative implemented by the government is that of private sector provided IT labs for public schools. Four years ago, the government began entering into formal arrangements (MoUs) with private companies to provide computers, other hardware and IT curriculum to public schools on a fee basis. The IT program has a two-fold intent:

- i. to give regular students access to computer classes during the school day at a nominal fee (up to Rs.65/month in Punjab) and
- ii. to provide IT classes to the local community at both con-cessional and market rates.

Charging a fee allows the program to be self-sustaining by covering its own costs and using any profits generated for school improvement. Through this program, over 4,000 government schools have been equipped with IT labs.

2.7.4 Mainstreaming of the Madaris (Religious Schools)

Another government-led PPP initiative involves mainstreaming Madaris by equipping the nation's religious non-profit institutions with a core education curriculum of math, science, social studies, English and IT. The Government of Pakistan (GoP) has set aside Rs.1,225 billion during 2003-2004 for an incentive program that involves the:

- i. introduction of these subjects,
- ii. training of additional teachers,
- iii. provision of textbooks or
- iv. up-gradation of school facilities by providing libraries and IT labs.

This program will be implemented through the education foundations and the departments of education. Currently, the program targets 8,000 madaris. Through this program, the government hopes to alleviate poverty and give madrasa graduates access to subjects and skills that will allow them options for gainful employment.

2.7.5 Capacity Building of School Management Committee (SMCs)/PTAs

In many provinces capacity building of SMCs is being undertaken through PPP with government contracting out this service to NGOs who have effective outreach to communities, more organized materials and effective communities' skills. Notable example can be found in all provinces of Pakistan and this trend will continue to grow as government seeks to expend local government in education through SMCs/PTAs. Under Local Government Ordinance Sections 109 (12) section (100) Section (119) (2) and Section (109) (5) and Chapter 28 (all paras), the MoE has negotiated that SMCs/PTAs be allowed to register themselves as Citizen Community Boards (CCBs). This makes them into legal entities enabling them eligibility for district development funds with 20 per cent counterpart funding from local communities.

STATUS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION

Chapter # 3

STATUS
OF
PRIMARY EDUCATION

3.1 Number of Private Schools

There were more than 36,000 private institutions in Pakistan catering for the educational needs of 6.3 million children. In 1983 there were approximately 3,300 private primary and secondary schools in the four provinces (Sindh, NWFP, Balochistan and Punjab) in Pakistan. In the year 2000 the same four provinces had over 32,000 such schools, an almost ten-fold increase in less than two decades.

According to NEC (2005) there were 81,103 private functioning institutions i.e. in Punjab 48,541, in Sindh 12,574, in NWFP 11,276, in Balochistan 1,750, in ICT 750, in FATA 640, in FANA 2,861 and in AJK 2,711. It is encouraging to note that private sector institutions are growing rapidly, i.e. from 36,096 institutions in 1999-2000 as compared to 81,103 educational institutions in 2005 showing thereby an annual average increase of 25 percent. Detail about private schools is presented in table-1.

3.1.1 National Level

Table-1
Public and Private Institutions in Pakistan

AREA	TOTAL	PUBLIC		PRIVATE	
Pakistan	245,682	164,579	(67.0)	81,103	(33.0)
Punjab	115,311	66,770	(57.9)	48,541	(42.1)
Sindh	59,312	46,738	(78.8)	12,574	(21.2)
NWFP	40,706	29,430	(72.3)	11,276	(27.7)
Balochistan	11,492	9,742	(84.8)	1,750	(15.2)
ICT	1,348	598	(44.4)	750	(55.6)
FATA	5,344	4,704	(88.0)	640	(12.0)
FANA	4,366	1,505	(34.5)	2,861	(65.5)
AJK	7,803	5,092	(65.3)	2,711	(34.7)

Figures in parenthesis are percentages.

(Source: National Education Census, 2005.p.15)

In this table No. 1 Revealed that in all 245,682 institutions including all categories of education were enumerated, of which, 164,579 (67 percent) were public sector institutions and 81,103 (33 percent) were privately sector institutions.

3.1.2 Province wise

Table No. 2
Province Wise Private Educational Institutions by Level

LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	PUNJAB	SINDH	NWFP	BALUCHISTAN	AJK	FATA	FANA
Total	46,497	11,865	10,041	1,553	2,364	562	2,542
Pre-Primary	297	298	101	11	21	8	28
Mosque School	28	32	11	4	5	3	3
Primary	10,080	2,582	2,243	403	607	192	562
Middle	17,363	3,055	2,185	245	757	156	254
Secondary	8,948	3,142	1,467	161	345	58	263
British System	126	93	31	4	6	1	17
Inter and Degree colleges	481	116	144	8	70	-	0
General Universities	6	4	6	-	1	4	11
Technical /Professional	545	127	152	9	21	56	153
Vocational/Polytechnics	1,002	289	580	30	48	81	70
NFBE	1,981	277	412	16	3	3	1,135
Deeni Madaris	5,214	1,778	2,402	656	473	562	46
Others	426	72	307	6	7	8	2,542

3.1.3 Gender Wise

Table-3

Number of Private Educational Institutions by level and gender

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS			
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS	MIXED
1.	Total	76,047	7,603	6,597	61,847
2.	A GENERAL	57,505	2,768	2,922	51,815
3.	Pre-primary	794	12	40	742
4.	Mosque	88	21	3	64
5.	Primary	16,823	620	734	15,469
6.	Middle/ Elementary	24,115	723	615	22,777
7.	Secondary /High	13,484	1,094	983	11,407
8.	Higher secondary	1,056	152	220	684
9.	Intermediate college	499	99	168	232
10.	Degree college	358	37	147	174
11.	General university	18	1	1	16
12.	British System	270	9	11	250
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	898	139	45	714
14.	Medical College	12	-	1	11
15.	Medical University	4	-	-	4
16.	Dental college/ university	4	-	-	4
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	18	7	1	10
18.	School/college of nursing	14	2	6	6
19.	Homeopathic College	105	4	4	97
20.	Tibbia college	21	2	-	19
21.	Education college/University	49	4	4	41
22.	Home-Economics college	1	-	1	
23.	Business Management. C/U	42	1	-	41
24.	Commerce College	232	55	18	159
25.	Engineering College/University	12	3	-	9
26.	IT College/university	272	51	9	212
27.	Law college/university	63	3	-	60
28.	Agriculture college/university	2	1	-	1
29.	Veterinary/Animal Sciences inst	1	-	-	1
30.	Fine-Arts college	16	-	-	16
31.	Accountancy Institutes	30	6	1	23
32.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	2,143	446	930	767
33.	Polytechnic institute	71	56	2	13
34.	Monotechnic institute	23	8	3	12
35.	Vocational institute	2,049	78	459	2,286
36.	D NFBE	2,823	78	459	2,286
37.	E Distance Education	9	1	-	8
38.	F Special education	72	6	2	64
39.	G Deeni Madaris	11,799	143	361	294
40.	H Other NEC	798	143	361	294

3.1.4 Location Wise

Table-3 (A)

Educational Institutions (Private Rural) by Level

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS			
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS	MIXED
1.	Total	35,438	3812	3325	28301
2.	A GENERAL	25631	1344	1517	22770
3.	Pre-primary	316	10	32	274
4.	Mosque	52	15	2	35
5.	Primary	8695	438	539	7718
6.	Middle/ Elementary	11669	452	349	10868
7.	Secondary /High	4285	339	372	3574
8.	Higher secondary	386	62	120	204
9.	Intermediate college	113	16	56	41
10.	Degree college	83	9	46	28
11.	General university	4	1	-	3
12.	British System	28	2	1	25
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	72	19	-	53
14.	Medical College	2	-	-	2
15.	Medical University	1	-	-	1
16.	Dental college/ university	1	-	-	1
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	2	1	-	1
18.	Homeopathic College	5	-	-	5
19.	Tibbia college	1	-	-	1
20.	Education college/University	1	-	-	1
21.	Business Management. C/U	3	-	-	3
22.	Commerce College	7	1	-	6
23.	Engineering College/University	1	-	-	1
24.	IT College/university	40	16	-	24
25.	Law college/university	6	1	-	5
26.	Veterinary/Animal Sciences inst	1	-	-	1
27.	Accountancy Institutes	1	-	-	1
28.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	542	133	326	83
29.	Polytechnic institute	12	10	1	1
30.	Monotechnic institute	4	1	2	1
31.	Vocational institute	526	122	323	81
32.	D NFBE	2172	61	385	1726
33.	E Distance Education	4	-	-	4
33.	F Special education	10	2	-	8
34.	G Deeni Madaris	6428	2141	817	3470
35.	H Other NEC	579	112	280	187

Table-3 (B)

Educational Institutions (Private Urban) by Level

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS			
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS	MIXED
1.	Total	40,609	3791	3272	35546
2.	A GENERAL	31874	1424	1405	29045
3.	Pre-primary	478	2	8	468
4.	Mosque	36	6	1	29
5.	Primary	8128	182	195	7751
6.	Middle/ Elementary	12446	271	266	11909
7.	Secondary /High	9199	755	611	7833
8.	Higher secondary	670	90	100	480
9.	Intermediate college	386	83	112	191
10.	Degree college	275	28	101	146
11.	General university	14	-	1	13
12.	British System	242	7	10	225
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	826	120	45	661
14.	Medical College	10	-	1	9
15.	Medical University	3	-	-	3
16.	Dental college/ university	3	-	-	3
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	16	6	1	9
18.	School/college of nursing	14	2	6	6
19.	Homeopathic College	100	4	4	92
20.	Tibbia college	20	2	-	18
21.	Education college/University	48	4	4	40
22.	Home-Economics college	1	-	1	-
23.	Business Management. C/U	39	1	-	38
24.	Commerce College	225	54	18	153
25.	Engineering College/University	11	3	-	8
26.	IT College/university	232	35	9	188
27.	Law college/university	57	2	-	55
28.	Agriculture college/university	2	1	-	1
29.	Fine-Arts college	16	-	-	16
30.	Accountancy Institutes	29	6	1	22
31.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	1601	313	604	684
32.	Polytechnic institute	59	46	1	12
33.	Monotechnic institute	19	7	1	11
34.	Vocational institute	1523	260	602	661
35.	D NFBE	651	17	74	560
36.	E Distance Education	5	1	-	4
37.	F Special education	62	4	2	56
38.	G Deeni Madaris	5371	1881	1061	2429
39.	H Other NEC	219	31	81	107

3.2 Enrolment in Private Schools

It was found that there were 36,000 private institutions in Pakistan in 1999-2000 in which 6.3 million children were enrolled. In 1983 there were approximately 3,300 private primary and secondary schools in the four provinces (Sindh, NWFP, Balochistan and Punjab) of Pakistan. In the year 2000 the same four provinces had over 32,000 such schools, an almost ten-fold increase in less than two decades. Moreover, most of the enrolment in these private schools is at primary level, accounting for 75% of the total enrolment in private schools. The predominance of primary level enrollment is also reflected in the age-adjusted proportion of the population attending private schools. (www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool/)

Private enrolment is also significant relative to public enrolment since it accounts for 35% of public enrollment at the school level (primary, middle and high). Andrabi et al (2005) shows these respective enrolment rates, grade, level, types in private and public schools. However, (Jimenez and Tan, 1987) there is drop-out in enrolment after primary grades in both public and private schools.

As it was found that there is 25% annual increase in the establishment of educational institution it is also encouraging to find that enrolment growth rate is 13%. The following table presents detail.

Table-4
Average Enrolment Growth rate

Class	Growth 2000-2002			2002-2004		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Nursery	11	11	11	15	11	13
Class 1	31	10	22	13	8	11
Class 2	16	12	14	8	6	7
Class 3	11	10	11	13	9	11
Class 4	13	11	12	24	15	21
Class 5	19	15	17	16	11	14
Primary	17	11	14	15	10	13
Class 6	17	15	16	-5	10	2
Class 7	14	10	12	22	19	21
Class 8	14	11	13	15	10	13
Middle	14	12	13	12	13	12
Class 9	15	16	16	17	6	12
Class 10	13	20	15	25	14	22
High	14	18	15	22	9	18
Class 11	10	26	14	15	19	16
Class 12	8	27	14	25	33	27
Higher Sec	8	26	13	20	25	21
Total	16	12	14	15	11	13

Source: National Sample Survey of Private School in Pakistan, 2004.p.45

The above table shows that enrolment growth rate at primary level was 14% in years 2000-2002 and 13% in years 2004. At middle level it was 13% in year 2000-2002 and 12% in year 2004 respectively. Enrolment growth rate at secondary level was 15% in 2000-2004, which increased up to 18% in 2004. In the same way at higher secondary level it increased from 13% in 2002 to 21% in year 2004, whereas, the overall enrolment growth was 14% in 2000-2004 and 13% in 2004 respectively.

Academy has conducted National Education Census in 2005. According to the Census data, enrolment location wise is presented in the following tables.

Table-4 (A)
Enrolment in Private Educational Institutions in Pakistan

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS		
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS
1.	Total	12,121,394	6,784,361	5,337,033
2.	A GENERAL	10,150,246	5,568,373	4,581,873
3.	Pre-primary	52,694	26,895	25,799
4.	Mosque	6,146	3,881	2,265
5.	Primary	1,671,885	921,269	750,616
6.	Middle/ Elementary	3,864,143	2,149,489	1,714,654
7.	Secondary /High	3,778,322	2,038,383	1,739,939
8.	Higher secondary	396,690	226,031	170,659
9.	Intermediate college	114,057	68,183	45,874
10.	Degree college	107,800	41,811.	65,989
11.	General university	14,735	9,026	5,709
12.	British System	143,774	83,405	60,396
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	189,365	142,954	46,411
14.	Medical College	3,498	1,422	2,076
15.	Medical University	2,671	1,351	1,320
16.	Dental college/ university	270	67	203
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	1,261	955	306
18.	School/college of nursing	955	312	643
19.	Homeopathic College	16,552	10,870	5,682
20.	Tibbia college	3,096	2,827	269
21.	Education college/University	5,319	2,540	2,779
22.	Home-Economics college	93	-	93
23.	Business Management. C/U	10,880	8,115	2,765
24.	Commerce College	72,080	58,484	13,569
25.	Engineering College/University	9651	7,810	1,841
26.	IT College/university	38,030	29,824	8,206
27.	Law college/university	14,571	11,017	3,554
28.	Agriculture college/university	173	151	22
29.	Veterinary/Animal Sciences inst	22	21	1
30.	Fine-Arts college	2,392	1,191	1,201
31.	Accountancy Institutes	7,851	5,997	1,854
32.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	134,935	82,532	52,403
33.	Polytechnic institute	16,473	16,037	436
34.	Monotechnic institute	1,221	804	417
35.	Vocational institute	117,241	65,691	51,550
36.	D NFBE	105,669	40,850	64,819
37.	E Distance Education	596	289	307
38.	F Special education	4,902	3,101	1,801
39.	G Deeni Madaris	1,504,462	932,607	571,855
40.	H Other NEC	31,219	13,655	17,564

Table-4 (B)
Enrolment in Educational Institutions (Private Rural) by Level

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS		
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS
1.	Total	4536690	2637555	1899135
2.	A GENERAL	3720496	2138007	1582489
3.	Pre-primary	14906	7174	7732
4.	Mosque	3399	2277	1122
5.	Primary	737535	420662	316873
6.	Middle/ Elementary	1778571	1028313	750258
7.	Secondary /High	1022635	587537	435098
8.	Higher secondary	109606	62575	47031
9.	Intermediate college	19798	11276	8522
10.	Degree college	18020	7716	10304
11.	General university	5290	3971	1319
12.	British System	10736	6506	4230
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	8843	6556	2287
14.	Medical College	348	199	149
15.	Medical University	1461	651	810
16.	Dental college/ university	52	8	44
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	322	172	150
18.	Homeopathic College	382	220	162
19.	Tibbia college	45	43	2
20.	Education college/University	71	33	38
21.	Business Management. C/U	1011	879	132
22.	Commerce College	451	372	79
23.	Engineering College/University	1445	1264	181
24.	IT College/university	2057	1765	292
25.	Law college/university	604	373	231
26.	Veterinary/Animal Sciences inst	22	21	1
27.	Accountancy Institutes	572	556	16
28.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	21001	9595	11406
29.	Polytechnic institute	1898	1781	117
30.	Monotechnic institute	15		15
31.	Vocational institute	19088	7814	11274
32.	D NFBE	78545	29061	49484
33.	E Distance Education	202	19	183
34.	F Special education	868	513	355
35.	G Deeni Madaris	688947	447510	241437
36.	H Other NEC	17788	6294	11494

Table-4 (C)
Enrolment in Educational Institutions (Private Urban) by Level

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS		
		TOTAL	BOYS	GIRLS
1.	Total	7584704	4146806	3437898
2.	A GENERAL	6429750	3430366	2999384
3.	Pre-primary	37788	19721	18067
4.	Mosque	2747	1604	1143
5.	Primary	934350	500607	433743
6.	Middle/ Elementary	2085572	1121176	964396
7.	Secondary /High	2755687	1450846	1304841
8.	Higher secondary	287084	163456	123628
9.	Intermediate college	94259	56907	37352
10.	Degree college	89780	34095	55685
11.	General university	9445	5055	4390
12.	British System	133038	76899	56139
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	180522	136398	44124
14.	Medical College	3150	1223	1927
15.	Medical University	1210	700	510
16.	Dental college/ university	218	59	159
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	939	783	156
18.	School/college of nursing	955	312	643
19.	Homeopathic College	16170	10650	5520
20.	Tibbia college	3051	2784	267
21.	Education college/University	5248	2507	2741
22.	Home-Economics college	93	-	93
23.	Business Management. C/U	9869	7236	2633
24.	Commerce College	71629	58112	13517
25.	Engineering College/University	8206	6546	1660
26.	IT College/university	35973	28059	7914
27.	Law college/university	13967	10644	3323
28.	Agriculture college/university	173	22	22
29.	Fine-Arts college	2392	1191	1201
30.	Accountancy Institutes	7279	5441	1838
31.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	113934	72937	40997
32.	Polytechnic institute	14575	14256	319
33.	Monotechnic institute	1206	804	402
34.	Vocational institute	98153	57877	40276
35.	D NFBE	27124	11789	15335
36.	E Distance Education	394	270	124
37.	F Special education	4034	2588	1446
38.	G Deeni Madaris	815515	485097	330418
39.	H Other NEC	13431	7361	6070

3.3 Teaching Staff in Educational Institutions

Table-5
Teaching Staff in Educational Institutions in Pakistan

S. No	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	INSTITUTIONS		
		TOTAL	MALE	FEMALE
1.	Total	632,926	213,258	419,668
2.	A GENERAL	547,193	151,417	395,776
3.	Pre-primary	3,496	467	3,029
4.	Mosque	300	158	142
5.	Primary	88,625	19,239	69,386
6.	Middle/ Elementary	200,487	50,347	150,140
7.	Secondary /High	200,423	56,554	143,869
8.	Higher secondary	21,903	8,545	13,358
9.	Intermediate college	9,373	5,118	4,255
10.	Degree college	7,749	3,383	4,366
11.	General university	2,768	1,707	1,061
12.	British System	12,069	5,899	6,170
13.	B. TECHNICAL/PROFESSIONAL	16,425	12,261	3,764
14.	Medical College	1,238	788	450
15.	Medical University	850	588	262
16.	Dental college/ university	192	107	85
17.	School/college of Medical Technicians	139	99	40
18.	School/college of nursing	86	49	37
19.	Homeopathic College	1,046	707	339
20.	Tibbia college	176	149	27
21.	Education college/University	642	422	220
22.	Home-Economics college	26		26
23.	Business Management. C/U	1,257	1,008	249
24.	Commerce College	3,629	2,960	669
25.	Engineering College/University	825	715	110
26.	IT College/university	4,224	3,392	832
27.	Law college/university	1,293	1,062	231
28.	Agriculture college/university	40	20	20
29.	Veterinary/Animal Sciences inst	21	15	6
30.	Fine-Arts college	279	188	91
31.	Accountancy Institutes	462	392	70
32.	C VOCATIONAL/POLYTECH	7,452	5,114	2,338
33.	Polytechnic institute	1,159	1,099	60
34.	Monotechnic institute	157	123	34
35.	Vocational institute	6,136	3,892	2,244
36.	D NFBE	3,148	551	2,597
37.	E Distance Education	31	19	12
38.	F Special education	739	201	538
39.	G Deeni Madaris	56,589	42,708	13,881
40.	H Other NEC	1349	762	587

3.4 Budgetary Allocation

Table-6
Budgetary Allocation for Education

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. No.	INSTITUTIONS	2000-01	2005-06	2006-07
1.	Ministry of Education	5.08	6.8	9.55
2.	Higher Education Commission	-	22.20	27.58
3.	Other Federal Ministries	2.90	7.40	7.59
4.	Punjab	31.39	60.75	83.97
5.	Sindh	16.16	28.90	39.92
6.	Balochistan	4.73	8.86	9.63
7.	AJK	2.25	3.75	4.63
8.	FATA	1.49	2.10	3.78
9.	FANA	0.49	0.98	1.39
10.	Total (Public Sector)	75.88	160.00	2110.77
11.	Total (Private Sector)	12.00	35.91	40.69*
12.	Grand Total	87.88	195.91	252.46
13.	GDP (mp) (Economic Survey 2005-06) on Current Factor Cost)	3,863	7,713	-
14.	Education Budget as % of GDP	2.27%	2.53%	-

* Islamabad

Source: Ministry of Education, P&P Wing, Islamabad

3.4.1 Expenditure in Punjab

During 2004-05 Federal Government spent Rs.36.28 billion on education in the country. In addition the Government of Punjab spent 52,413.306 million during 2004-05 on education. The census results (Table No.7) indicate that in private sector institutions of Punjab the expenditures on education during 2004-05 was Rs.19,761.60 million which was more than three times as compared to the Private Educational Institutions Census, 2001.

Table No. 7
Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – Punjab

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. NO.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	46,497	44,400	19761.6
2.	Pre-Primary	297	263	81.4
3.	Mosque School	28	27	4.6
4.	Primary	10,080	9,418	1216.2
5.	Middle	17,363	16,709	3510.7
6.	Secondary	8,948	8,633	9763.6
7.	British System	126	70	1041.5
8.	Inter. and Degree Colleges	481	459	1122.6
9.	General Universities	6	6	87.1
10.	Technical /Professional	545	515	1020.2
11.	Vocational/ Polytechnic	1,002	946	311.7
12.	NFBE	1,981	1,919	32.7
13.	Deeni Madaris	5,214	5,059	1356.7
14.	Others	426	376	212.6

(Source: National Education Census, 2005.p.22)

3.4.2 Expenditure in Sindh

During 2004-05 Sindh Government has spent 19,631.827 million on education. The Private Sector's expenditure on education during 2004-05 was reported as Rs. 8,128.1 million, which was two times higher as compared to last census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs. 4,273 million) conducted in 2001.

Table No. 8

Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level- Sindh

(Rs. in Billion)

S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	11,865	11,556	8,128.1
2.	Pre-Primary	298	286	103.4
3.	Mosque School	32	32	4.8
4.	Primary	2,582	2,530	706.7
5.	Middle	3,055	3,020	1,045.3
6.	Secondary	3,142	3,101	4,133.2
7.	British System	93	39	181.3
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	116	111	310.2
9.	General Universities	4	4	270.4
10.	Technical /Professional	127	123	573.9
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	289	283	170.6
12.	NFBE	277	269	11.2
13.	Madrassa	1,778	1,687	568.6
14.	Others	72	11,556	48.5

(Source: National Education Census, 2005.p.22)

3.4.3 Expenditure in NWFP

During 2004-05 the Federal Government spent Rs. 36,282 million in the country and NWFP Government spent Rs. 16,975 million. The census results (Table No.9) indicate that in NWFP expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.4,438 million which were three times higher as compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs.1,478 million) conducted in 2001.

Table No. 9

Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level- NWFP

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	10,041	9,776	4,438.0
2.	Pre-Primary	101	94	9.9
3.	Mosque School	11	11	1.3
4.	Primary	2,243	2,192	364.9
5.	Middle	2,185	2,166	683.9
6.	Secondary	1,467	1,453	1,463.4
7.	British System	31	11	12.4
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	144	140	284.3
9.	General Universities	6	5	119.4
10.	Technical /Professional	152	146	748.2
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	580	557	267.9
12.	NFBE	412	390	10.7
13.	Madrassa	2,402	2,332	457.3
14.	Others	307	276	14.2

(Source: National Education Census, 2005.p.22)

3.4.4 Expenditure in Balochistan:

During 2004-05 the Balochistan Government spent Rs. 7,617 million on education in the province. The census results (Table No. 10) indicate that in Balochistan expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.659.7 million, which were three time higher as compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions (Rs.227 million) conducted in 2001.

Table No. 10

Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – Balochistan

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	1,553	1,483	659.7
2.	Pre-Primary	11	11	0.6
3.	Mosque School	4	4	0.5
4.	Primary	403	401	88.6
5.	Middle	245	245	103.4
6.	Secondary	161	161	249.7
7.	British System	4	-	-
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	8	8	32.1
9.	General Universities	-	-	-
10.	Technical /Professional	9	9	83.5
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	30	28	9.5
12.	NFBE	16	16	0.3
13.	Madrassa	656	594	88.5
14.	Others	6	6	3.1

(Source: National Education Census, 2005.p.22)

3.4.5 Expenditure in AJK

The census results (Table No. 11) indicate that expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs. 860.2 million.

Table No. 11
Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – AJK
(Rs. in Billion)

S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	2,364	2,352	860.2
2.	Pre-Primary	21	20	1.0
3.	Mosque School	5	5	0.4
4.	Primary	607	606	76.0
5.	Middle	757	756	204.2
6.	Secondary	345	341	266.9
7.	British System	6	2	7.0
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	70	70	107.7
9.	General Universities	1	1	0.7
10.	Technical /Professional	21	21	27.3
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	48	48	20.0
12.	NFBE	3	3	0.2
13.	Madrasa	473	470	141.5
14.	Others	7	7	7.3

(Source: National Education Census, 2005)

3.4.6 Expenditure in FATA

The census results (Table No.12) indicate that in FATA expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.143.5 million.

Table No. 12
Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – FATA
(Rs. in Billion)

S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	562	523	143.5
2.	Pre-Primary	8	7	0.9
3.	Mosque School	3	3	0.4
4.	Primary	192	162	20.4
5.	Middle	156	153	51.6
6.	Secondary	58	57	43.9
7.	British System	-	-	-
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	1	1	1.1
9.	General Universities	-	-	-
10.	Technical /Professional	-	-	-
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	4	4	1.2
12.	NFBE	56	56	3.9
13.	Madrasa	81	77	19.4
14.	Others	3	3	0.6

(Source: National Education Census, 2005)

3.4.7 Expenditure in FANA

The census results (Table No. 13) indicate that in FANA expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs. 329.4 million.

Table No. 13
Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – FANA

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	2,542	2,341	329.4
2.	Pre-Primary	28	28	5.3
3.	Mosque School	3	3	0.1
4.	Primary	562	549	53.0
5.	Middle	254	246	73.3
6.	Secondary	263	203	85.1
7.	British System		-	-
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	17	16	7.5
9.	General Universities	-	-	-
10.	Technical /Professional	11	11	11.5
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	153	141	13.3
12.	NFBE	70	66	1.1
13.	Madrasa	1,135	1,033	75.2
14.	Others	46	45	3.9

(Source: National Education Census, 2005)

3.4.8 Expenditure in ICT

The census results indicate that expenditures in private sector institutions during 2004-05 were Rs.1593.5 million which were four times higher (Rs.365 million) as compared to previous census of Private Educational Institutions conducted in 2001.

Table No. 14
Expenditure of Private Educational Institutions by Level – Islamabad

(Rs. in Billion)				
S. No.	LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONS	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS COVERED	NO. OF INSTITUTIONS REPORTED EXPENDITURE	EXPENDITURE
1.	Total	623	587	1593.5
2.	Pre-Primary	30	29	7.5
3.	Mosque School	2	2	0.3
4.	Primary	154	149	46.2
5.	Middle	100	98	52.1
6.	Secondary	156	149	237.5
7.	British System	10	4	121.5
8.	Inter and Degree Colleges	20	19	73.8
9.	General Universities	1	1	47.4
10.	Technical /Professional	33	30	959.8
11.	Vocational/Polytechnics	37	35	17.5
12.	NFBE	8	8	1.0
13.	Madrasa	60	53	16.3
14.	Others	12	10	12.4

(Source: National Education Census, 2005)

3.4.9 Private School Fee

The access to private education by the rich only is essentially a consequence of high admission and tuition fees that a private provider may be tempted to charge. However, Alderman et al (2001) has shown that in some regions of Pakistan (notably Quetta and Lahore) this assumption is not necessarily true; there is a more than proportional increase in the use of private schooling with an increase in income. Private school fees are low enough (Rs.85/month) that even among that people who are in the two lowest income brackets, more than 50% of the children of these people use private schooling facilities.

The distributional statistics of tuition fees in province for self-owned primary schools (this eliminates NGO schools that may charge lower fees), disaggregated at the province and at the rural/urban level.

Table-15
Annual Fees in self-owned (for-profit) primary schools in urban areas

PROVINCE	MEDIAN	MEAN	STANDARD DEVIATION	INTER-QUARTILE RANGE	NUMBER OF SCHOOLS
NWFP	1342.85	1688.56	2160.58	914.39	533
Punjab	850	1286.94	3331.34	661.13	4,201
Sindh	1297.18	1950.62	3375.17	1175.33	1,290
Balochistan	1740.98	2095.64	2327.21	1200	61
Islamabad	3390.91	4791.86	4941.39	2940.1	50
Northern areas	2688	5543.68	5800.98	2183.76	5
AJK	1541.9	2138.75	3793.97	992.31	110

(Source: www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool)

Table-16
Annual Fees in self-owned (for-profit) primary schools in rural areas

PROVINCE CODE	MEDIAN	MEAN	STANDARD DEVIATION	INTER-QUARTILE RANGE	NUMBER OF SCHOOLS
NWFP	1200	1367.71	1551.57	649.83	1,165
FATA	1080	1067.63	530	705.99	117
Punjab	632.21	762.72	931.16	423.64	3,955
Sindh	1142.97	1014.47	537.8	661.2	84
Balochistan	1351.36	1308.78	732.26	526.67	34
Islamabad	1489.13	1973.4	2037.78	1065.5	64
Northern areas	1560	1295.6	669.91	700	11
AJK	1162.16	1192.34	725.94	463.33	643

(Source: www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool)

Table shows that except for Islamabad and the Northern Areas (which together account for less than 0.5% of all schools), the median school fees in Pakistan are low: the highest median school fee in urban areas is in Balochistan, and amounts to Rs.145 per month. For rural regions, this drops down to Rs.112 per month. Punjab, with more than 50% of the school going age population, reports the lowest fees both in the urban and the rural regions (Rs.71/month and Rs.53/month respectively). Using household expenditure data from the PIHS, we can get sense of the magnitude of these fees: In Punjab, the mean tuition fee represents 1.7% of average household expenditure at the rural level and 2.1% at the urban level. Thus a family with 4 children in an urban area will have to spend 8.4% of their budget on school tuition fees in an average private school.

The authors to define education for this study is essentially a composite of both formal and informal education. The formal education is defined as that which is provided by a private provider, may be taught in formal or informal settings, and is not necessarily limited to a specific institution. The informal education is defined as that which is provided by a private provider, may be taught in formal or informal settings, and is not necessarily limited to a specific institution. The authors to define education for this study is essentially a composite of both formal and informal education. The formal education is defined as that which is provided by a private provider, may be taught in formal or informal settings, and is not necessarily limited to a specific institution. The informal education is defined as that which is provided by a private provider, may be taught in formal or informal settings, and is not necessarily limited to a specific institution.

The data presented in this table is based on data from the 1990-1991 survey. The data is presented in this table in order to provide information on the distribution of education levels among the population. The data is presented in this table in order to provide information on the distribution of education levels among the population.

Table 11
 Annual Data on Education Levels (1990-1991)

Year	Primary	Secondary	Tertiary	Post-tertiary
1990	1000	2000	500	100
1991	1100	2200	550	110
1992	1200	2400	600	120
1993	1300	2600	650	130
1994	1400	2800	700	140
1995	1500	3000	750	150
1996	1600	3200	800	160
1997	1700	3400	850	170
1998	1800	3600	900	180
1999	1900	3800	950	190
2000	2000	4000	1000	200

Source: Author's calculations based on data from the 1990-1991 survey.

Table 12
 Annual Data on Education Levels (1990-1991)

Year	Primary	Secondary	Tertiary	Post-tertiary
1990	1000	2000	500	100
1991	1100	2200	550	110
1992	1200	2400	600	120
1993	1300	2600	650	130
1994	1400	2800	700	140
1995	1500	3000	750	150
1996	1600	3200	800	160
1997	1700	3400	850	170
1998	1800	3600	900	180
1999	1900	3800	950	190
2000	2000	4000	1000	200

Source: Author's calculations based on data from the 1990-1991 survey.

The data presented in this table is based on data from the 1990-1991 survey. The data is presented in this table in order to provide information on the distribution of education levels among the population. The data is presented in this table in order to provide information on the distribution of education levels among the population.

Chapter # 4

**REGULATORY AUTHORITY
OF
PRIVATE INSTITUTIONS**

Chapter 4

REGULATORY AUTHORITY
OF
PRIVATE INSTITUTIONS

4. Background

- Provincial Governments had enacted laws to regulate the functioning of private educational institutions while there was no such law in force in ICT.
- In the absence of such a law there was no check in terms of private educational institutions' standard of education and other irregularities.
- There was a need of a platform, which could collect/provide data as to the number of students receiving education, requirement of textbooks, future admissions and related matters etc for the purpose of planning.

4.1 Composition of Regulatory Authority

- Regulatory Authority comprises a Chairman, two Members (Member Acad and Member Regist), a Secretary and the necessary supporting staff.
- Chairman Federal Board is also the chairman of Regulatory Authority and is not drawing any additional pay or allowance for this duty.
- Supporting staff has been drawn from the Federal Board.
- It has been housed in Federal Board and Board services and spaces are being used to carry out its functions.
- It is a self financing body. This has been done not to burden the Govt exchequer. [All BISEs in the country are self financing].

4.2 Aims and Objectives of Regulatory Authority

Regulatory Authority will regulate and promote the functioning of private educational institutions in ICT under a uniform policy regarding:-

- Registration of institutions imparting education up to HSSC level and equivalent.
- Curricula, academic session and holidays/vacations according to the scheme of studies and Government laid down instructions. Institutions pursuing curriculum of London and Cambridge Universities will be allowed to function undisturbed at 'O' and 'A' levels stage.
- Qualifications of teaching faculty and their terms of service, etc.
- Evaluation and fair measure of academic standards in the institutions.
- Promotion of co-curricular activities including sports on inter-institutional basis. This, being an important dimension of student personality development, will be made sure receives due consideration and implementation.
- Emphasis on provision of quality of education and facilities commensurate with fee structure.
- Collection of required data for planning purposes.

4.3 Additional Aims and Objectives

- Regulatory Authority will act as a buffer between the stakeholders and bring discipline in the system.
- It will provide professional guidance to educational institutions and potential investors in this field. [Overseas Pakistanis Investment Conference is being held on 5-6 March 2007 in Islamabad and Regulatory Authority will give a talk to the investors on investment opportunities in the field of education.
- It will see that building of institution is spacious enough for the purpose and its structure sounds to safely house the students.

4.4 Pre-Requisites for Registration of Institution

In general terms

- An institution is suitably located, staffed and equipped.
- It is not a one man show. It has a constituted managing committee or board of directors.
- Principal and teaching staff are adequately qualified and employed through a written contract on terms and conditions not less favorable than those of in Govt educational institutions
- Institution premises, library, classrooms, furniture, laboratories, equipment and sports facilities are adequate and of standard.
- At SSC and HSSC level library has minimum of 3000 books and 3 volumes of each textbook. [This is already a pre-requisite of the FBISE for affiliation and is being practiced.]
- Records and registers are maintained as applicable.
- In addition to teaching staff, it has employed a librarian and a PTI/DPE.
- It has facilities of sports.
- Institution will give an undertaking that it will furnish required data/information and its management, staff and students will not participate in activities prejudicial to the integrity and solidarity of the state.

4.5 Procedure for Registration

- After completion of required paper work and staff in position, a public notice was given in the press of 7 December 2006 asking institutions to obtain application form from Federal Board one Window and apply for registration within 90 days.
- Institution submitting application accompanied by required documents and fee, its inspection is called through an inspection committee comprising two HOIs from among the private and Govt schools/colleges and a member of the Regulatory Authority. [This practice is followed by all BISEs including Federal Board for affiliation of institutions].

- On the report of the inspection committee, school/college is registered at the given level (Primary/Middle/Secondary/Higher Secondary).
- Institutions even with shortfalls are being registered with condition/time frame to make up the deficiencies.
- Institutions or its branches running under same name at different premises/locations are registered.
- It is mandatory for every PEI to register itself.
- Process of registration is completed by the Regulatory Authority within 60 days from the date of receipt of application.
- In case of new institutions [as and when come up] are required to apply for registration two months in advance of start of the academic session.

4.6 Withdrawal of Registration

- Registration will be withdrawn on disciplinary grounds, for example institution refusing to provide required data/information; has taken part in prejudicial activities, etc.
- Withdrawal of registration will be exercised as a last resort and not without personally hearing the party concerned and giving sufficient chance.
- Reason for rejection of registration or its withdrawal will be duly recorded in issuances.

4.7 Renewal of Registration

- Institutions will be re-inspected after every two years and their registration renewed subject to satisfactory report of the inspection committee. [Provinces renew registration annually.]
- Registration of an institution will be restored if defects leading to the withdrawal of registration have been made good by it.

4.8 Fees Being Charged

- Security fee, one time and refundable-Rs 25000/-
- Inspection fee-Rs 5000/- [Out of this, honorarium @ Rs 1000/- is paid to opted members of the inspection committee per day].

Registration fee:

- | | |
|---|-------------|
| ○ Schools charging fee up to Rs 500/- | Rs 2500/- |
| ○ Schools charging fee from Rs 501 to Rs 1000/- | Rs 5000/- |
| ○ Schools charging fee from Rs 1001 to 2000/- | Rs 10,000/- |
| ○ Schools charging fee more than Rs 2000/- | Rs 20,000/- |

Inspection-cum-renewal of registration fee, every two years:

- | | |
|--|-------------|
| ○ Schools charging fee up to Rs 1000/- | Rs 5000/- |
| ○ Schools charging fee more than Rs 1000/- | Rs 10,000/- |

4.9 Offence and Penalty

Institution will become defaulter if it is running:

- Without registration after due date;
- After cancellation/withdrawal of registration.
- Defaulter institution can be fined up to Rs 500/- per day for the days offence is committed or imprisonment up to one year or both.

4.10 Controls over Fee

- Cabinet while approving establishment of the Regulatory Authority directed not to interfere in the determination of fee structure of private educational institutions. It will therefore, be left to the market forces to decide and the Regulatory Authority will not interfere in it.
- Remaining within the Cabinet decision, institutions will be asked to make sincere efforts to keep the fees within reasonable limits and commensurate with the quality of education and services being provided by them.
- A competition for decrease of fees from within the system will be put up through:
- Enhancing the quality and level of education in Govt schools and colleges will be asked.
- Offering incentives as to giving of free textbooks, scholarships etc to students in Govt schools will be recommended.
- Introducing O & A levels studies in Govt schools and colleges at lower fees will be advised. [For this, decision has to come from the Govt.]

4.11 Other Rules

- Performance evaluation of institutions will be carried out and on this basis, the institutions will be rated/bracketed into A,B & C categories.
- For up/down-gradation of institution, the approval of Regulatory Authority will be required.
- In each school and college there will be a Parent Teacher Association (PTA)
- Employment of teachers will be done through a written agreement which include details of pay & allowances, termination of service, etc.
- Entry of arms and ammunition and use of tobacco in the institutions is prohibited.
- HOI will be personally responsible for the accurate recording and maintenance of students age and records other particulars.
- HOI will independently run the affairs of the school/college and decide/regulate issues as to allocation of duties to teachers, fine for breach of discipline by a student, expulsion of student from institutions and admissions, etc.

- Institutions will follow academic term, scheme of studies, holidays as per Govt policy.
- Scheme of physical training and sports will form part of the weekly instructional programme.

4.12 Private Educational Institutions in ICT

- There are some 623 private educational institutions in ICT, 291 in urban areas, 332 in rural areas and around in which 1,11,000 students are studying in these.
- On the contrary the number of Govt schools and colleges in ICT is 566 and 2,79,000 students are studying therein, more than double the students in Private schools/colleges.
- So far 156 institutions have collected application forms for registration; six have been inspected and issued registration by the Regulatory Authority.

4.13 Problems Faced and Resolved

There was no platform which could provide information as to the character, level and nature of private schools/colleges in Islamabad. [The very basic intent for which Regulatory Authority has been set up]. Rules were framed in the absence of above information. During discharge of functions of the Authority, where oversights were found, amendments in rules were made like:

- Rate of registration fee has been reduced and its ceiling fixed in four brackets instead of two according to the fees being charged by the schools/colleges.
- Levy of inspection-cum-renewal fee has been reduced/rationalized by breaking into two slabs instead of unblock.
- Number of students in a section has been increased from 30 to 35.
- Any further amendment in the working of the Regulatory Authority or its rules of business will be made where warranted.
- Complaints of schools/colleges will be given serious consideration. However, aggrieved party can prefer an appeal to the Federal Secretary Education against the decision of the Regulatory Authority and his decision will be final and binding.

4.14 Commitment

- Every flexibility/chance will be afforded to the institutions in the process of registration.
- No school/college will be harassed.
- There are no institutions to make money or of any other commercial nature. Institutions are to put the things right.

- We are conscious of the fact that no country can prosper and progress without Private-Public partnership. Good institutions will be encouraged/asked to set up more units. Those institutions with deficiencies, no straight away closing down of institution or any action to that effect will be taken.

IESCO and Oil & Gas Regulatory Authority have been approached, in help to private educational institutions, asking them to extend domestic tariff to the registered institutions

On the contrary, the members of the committee have advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

4.1.1. Private Education

There was an attempt to start a private education institution in the district. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

4.1.2. Government

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter. The committee has advised that the committee is not in a position to take any action on this matter.

Chapter # 5

**NATIONAL EDUCATION
FOUNDATION**

Chapter # 5

NATIONAL EDUCATION
FOUNDATION

5. National Education Foundation

Vision providing quality education through public private partnerships for disadvantaged groups”

“Our Mission to become vibrant catalyst for quality education through support to private and non governmental sectors, by mobilizing sufficient resources as an effective self-sustaining organization.”

National Education Foundation, an autonomous organization of the Ministry of Education, was founded in late 1994 with a mandate of overseas Public Private Partnership initiatives in promoting education across the country. In the early 2002, the agency was restructured to give it increased autonomy and geographical focus (ICT, FATA, FANA, and AJK). Its programmes and interventions are aimed at promoting and addressing critical educational standards, community participation and socio-economic empowerment. The NEF works closely with non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and community-based organizations (CBOs) to enhance their capacity to provide basic education and literacy to the children of their communities. An essential aspect is close cooperation with the private sector, as the government doesn't have enough resources to fund basic education for everyone. The current programmes not only provide education but also mobilize communities to meet their educational and development needs.

5.1 Objectives

Promotion of Education

- To promote Public Private Partnership in attaining basic education for all through multiple delivery systems, with special focus on disadvantaged communities and girls (by direct support to private and NGO schools in the form of grants and loans.)
- To interface with and facilitate private initiatives with public ones for promotion of elementary technical and IT programmes.
- To extend assistance to existing special needs initiatives to address the needs of children (with in existing mainstream programmes).
- To promote welfare activities for the teachers and educationists of the Federal Government Institutions.
- To facilitate and undertake innovative programmes between public and private sectors or otherwise and their replication.
- To mobilize and manage resources for promotion of education through multiple sources.
- To assist and facilitate formulation of National Education Policies for the private sector.
- To develop and implement gender sensitivity and awareness raising programs among teachers, students and other members of the academic community.

5.3 Capacity Building

- To provide support to organizations engaged in education development and capacity building in areas of training, maintaining standards, curriculum management, assessment and evaluation.
- To strengthen the institutional capacity of partner organizations, CBOs, and private organizations to become self reliant in terms of quality, resource generation, management and effective community participation for good governance in education.
- To strengthen institutional capacity of the Foundation to manage and achieve its objectives, mission and vision.
- To support programmes for teacher education (general and subject specific), education management and planning.
- To set up a cell for private sector resource mobilization from local as well as expatriate Pakistanis for education initiatives through Public Private Partnership.
- To prepare and develop gender sensitive curriculum and materials that will promote equality, human rights and development for all.

5.4 Research and Development

- To share best practice and foster exchange of resources for optimum education development including collaboration with all Education Foundations, NGOs, national regional and international agencies and other stakeholders.
- To influence education policy through documented research and practice.
- To create a countrywide database of private educational institutions and related NGOs.
- To compile and synthesize sex disaggregated data and information available for policy makers, research institutions and donor agencies.
- To assist in maintaining standards of education according agreed norms in privately managed schools

“Vision” to improve access to quality basic education for all children of remote areas through community empowerment to ensure accountability, ownership and sustainability of the programme at the grassroots.

5.5 The programmes

i. Community Support Rural School Program (CSRSP)

CSRSP is one of the innovative programmes, which the NEF has introduced and through which it operates at grass roots level, promoting basic education by establishing community primary schools, in rural areas. It addresses issues such as access to education, quality of education, promoting gender equality, community participation, empowerment and sustainability. The model is based on a two-room, two-teacher concept with a flexibility to increase teachers and classrooms

when enrolment rises. In reality it is a tripartite partnership among NEF, local NGOs and the CBOs/CECs with NEF providing the funding and training. The NGOs act as facilitator and CECs run and manage the schools. Under the program NEF has established over 200 schools in remote and rural areas of ICT, FATA, FANA, AJK& PUNJAB.

ii. 350 community schools project

With the financial assistance of Royal Norwegians Government NEF has replicated Community Support Rural School Programme (CSRSP) model in seven Agencies of FATA where the female literacy ratio is less than 3 percent. Under the project being sponsored by the Ministry of Education, NEF has established 350 Community Schools collaboration with 27 NGO/CBOs.

The programme is contributing towards uplifting the socio-economic conditions of FATA, promoting basic education, generating awareness, involvement, and empowerment of local communities. At present more than 24000 students are benefiting from the programme. The programme has provided employment to 722 teachers and 350 attendants/Ayas from local communities. In addition Community Education Committees (CECs) and the local NGOs constitute the array of long-term beneficiaries. They are the recipients of educational facilities for children and are strengthening their capacity. School parental participation is encouraged through informal training. Community schools are having an impact on overall socioeconomic development of the region. This has created a permanent institutional base that can sustain these and integrate other initiatives in education.

“Vision” to extend welfare services to the Federal Government teachers and their dependents through the provision of monetary assistance.

iii. Financial Assistance Programme

With merger of the Federal Teachers Foundations in 1977 with NEF, they were mandated with the task of providing financial assistance to the teachers, working in educational institutions under the control of Federal Ministry of Education. Monetary assistance is provided from return of endowment fund of Rs 20 million. The programme funding is released in installments (usually six monthly). To date over 150 children of Federal Government Teachers studying at various levels benefited from the scheme. Also a number of widows of FG teachers are being provided financial assistance. Beneficiaries of the programme are:-

- Children of deceased teachers
- Children of retired teachers
- Children of in-service teachers
- Widows of Federal Government teachers

“Vision: to support the non-profit private schools dedicated to serving lower income households in urban slums and rural areas of the country through provision of need based monetary assistance”

iv. Grant in -Aid Programme

This programme aims at supporting private schools, which operate on a non-commercial and non-profit basis, for promoting quality education. Support under the scheme includes bridging the gap between income and expenditure, assisting schools with the purchase of additional furniture, construction of additional classrooms where needed, establishment of laboratories, provision of boundary walls and construction of toilets.

6.1 Location of Private Schools

Andrabi (2005) mapped the penetration of private schools throughout Pakistan using data from the 1998 population census, which is representative at the district/rural-urban level. Despite the extensive growth in private schooling, parts of the country are still scarcely served. Punjab appears to be the heartland of privately provided education—none of the 34 districts in the province report shares private schooling less than 10 percent; almost half report shares between 20 and 30 percent and a significant portion report shares above 30 percent. In contrast, the penetration of private schooling is lower in Sindh and Balochistan. There are swathes of these two provinces where private school enrolment shares are below 10 percent and there are very few districts where it exceeds 30 percent. www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool

Private schools are set up in villages with bigger populations and better infrastructure across the four provinces. In villages where private schools are located, are roughly twice as large in terms of population (4463) than the average village (1975). Private schools are also set up in villages where the infrastructure is better. Villages in all four provinces with private schools tend to have a larger fraction of houses with electricity. It has been observed that private school hires single females who belong to the same village. In rural Pakistan, women rarely move across villages for economic or employment based reasons (World Bank 2005 Gender Assessment). When women *do* move, the single largest reason is marriage. However, married women seldom work outside home in the formal labor market. The lack of mobility of women who are willing-to-work allows private schools to capitalize on a captive low wage labor pool.

6.2 Girls as Students in Private Schools

Pakistan has seen low female enrolment rates since its independence. The primary enrolment ratio for both sexes in 1965 was 40 %, whereas the female primary enrolment ratio was 20 %. In 1984 the total primary enrolment ratio was 42 % while the female had gone up but was still 29%. The Second Five Year Plan (1960-65) of the government of Pakistan stated that, “out of 4.7 million children attending primary schools in 1959-60, only 1.1 million are girls.” (*Source: www.economics.pomona.edu*). The current picture for private schools however, is strikingly different. It was observed that enrolment rates as a percentage of school going age children, disaggregated by gender and region. Although enrolment rates are higher for boys as compared to girls, the differences are not as big as the historical evidence would lead us to believe. In fact, girls and boys enrolments are roughly equal in Punjab and Sindh, the two provinces that account for over 70% of the total population of Pakistan. In Punjab particularly, gender differences in private enrolment rates are very low with female enrolment exceeding 90% of that of males in some districts. For example, in Lahore, Gujranwala, Sialkot, Gujrat, Narowal and Sheikhpura, the numbers are very close to being equal. In fact these numbers are even more striking when one compares to current public school enrolment data which show that only 37.4% of overall public school enrolment is girls. The comparable number in private schools is 43%. (Andrabi et al- 2005)

According to National Education Census 2005, boys and girls enrolment is not equal. Girls enrolment is comparatively low than boys. The total enrolment from pre-primary to higher secondary level was 9,769,880 in 2005. Out of this there were 5,365,948 boys and 4,403,932 female students had been enrolled in the educational institutions in Pakistan. Gender disparity can be seen in all four provinces. Detail is presented in table-18.

background of the students, and parental education are major parameters. These research studies provide information on the achievement levels and comparison of the performance of different schools and subsequently highlights the quality of education in public and private sector at national, provincial and district levels. Table below summarizes the comparison of students' performance (Mean Score) for the years 2003-04, 2004-05 and 2005-06 by subjects and schools type.

Table-19

Subject	2003-04			2004-05			2005-06		
	Public	Pvt	Total	Public	Pvt	Total	Public	Pvt	Total
Mathematics	46	51	48	45	51	47	44	49	46
Urdu	60	72	64	57	62	58	54	65	57
Science	59	62	60	52	55	53	48	52	49

* Pvt = Private

The table-17 indicates that the mean score of the students was 48 in Mathematics in 2003-04, which has declined to 46 in 2005-06. Whereas in Urdu, students got 64 mean score which declined to 57 in 2005-06. As far as science subject was concerned, consistent decline was observed in the mean score of the students' achievements. It is interesting to note that performance of private school students was better than public school students in all the subjects in achievement studies conducted from 2003-04 to 2005-06.

Chapter # 7

MAJOR PROBLEMS

THE

Chapter 17

MAJOR PROBLEMS

Analysis of various documents indicate that on the one side private sector has substantial share in the development of education; on the other side private sector is facing a lot of problems.

7.1 Financial Assistance

Private sector itself is responsible to generate funds to run the institution. There is not any financial help to private sector through loans and special grants from any agency. The government has announced different packages on electronic and print media to support private sector. Interest free loans on easy terms and conditions may be given to the owners of private schools. But these announcements have not been implemented, so far.

7.2 Heavy Tax

Management of private institutions pays heavy taxes levied by the government. Consequently they increase their fee in order to meet expenses. If relief is given to private sector in the tax. Private sector would be much cheaper and within the reach of poor children.

7.3 Availability of Physical Facilities

Science equipment and computer laboratories and other teaching aids are very costly. Most of the private institutions could not provide these facilities to the students unless they increase fee. Resultantly students cannot afford this heavy fee. Some documents emphasized that infrastructure may be improved in order to boost up the functioning of private sector in rural areas.

7.4 Teacher Training

Contrary to the public sector, private schools hire the services of less qualified and untrained teachers. Government may provide training facilities for the untrained teachers of private sector through refresher courses and teachers may be encouraged to enhance their professional skills. Some researchers suggested that government may ensure the availability of trained female teachers for private sector in general and particularly at elementary level.

7.5 Government Officials' Attitude

Management of private schools have complaints that government is doing nothing except taking money while they are doing their noble task with missionary zeal. The government is only imposing taxes and taking away all of their earnings. Management of private schools suggested that government should encourage private sector and provide more facilities to open new schools in urban areas. They further stated that government asks for income tax even from those schools where there is no income. Government should solve the problems of private schools at their doorstep. They told that departments of social security, old age benefit, income tax and property tax harass the owner of private schools.

7.6 Provision of Land for Private Institutions

Management of private institutions faces a lot of problems while obtaining land for school. This is in fact cause of high price of land which is increasing day by day. Government may provide better school buildings either free or provide land for school construction on subsidized rates.

7.7 Registration Process

School registration is compulsory with district education department. But it has been observed that registration process and mode of payment of registration fee is very difficult. Moreover, staff deputed to deal registration process have negative attitude and sometime they

openly demand for bribe. In order to save time, their demands are fulfilled. This corruption on the part of government functioning is miserable. Resultantly management of private school avoid to register their school with education department. Consequently most of the schools are overcrowded and do not have adequate physical facilities. These schools are usually charging high fees from the students. Most of the schools are unregistered; therefore, in most cases the certificates issued by these institutions are not recognized by public schools. Majority of these institutions are functioning in rented buildings.

7.8 Private Schools more interested in Profits than Education

1. With the exception of a few quality educational institutions in the city, a majority of private schools are imparting poor quality education to children.
2. Since education is a basic need of every child, private schools have mushroomed in the city and businessmen have started eyeing the education sector as a profitable business venture.
3. Besides demanding heavy monthly fees, many private schools find novel ways to fleece money from children. For example students are required to purchase textbooks and note books only from schoolbook shop, which adds to their income.
4. Non-availability of nearby government school is a major factor contributing to the rapid growth of private schools.
5. Similarly schools do not follow a strict admission policy and any parent who can afford the heavy fees, can get his or her child admitted regardless of ability at any stage of the academic year.
6. The low salaries to teachers in private schools is another major factor that leads to poor quality education because the priority of the school's management is profit and not teaching.
7. The majority of educational institutions in the public sector are comparatively of poor quality and private school owners are exploiting the situation.
8. It has been observed that the provincial and district governments were providing huge amounts to the education department for improving the quality of education but steps taken by them have not succeeded in achieving any tangible results so far, that is why private schools are flourishing.
9. Parents and students demand action against private schools, besides remounting and renovation and reconstructing government schools in the country.
www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool

Despite all shortcomings of private education mentioned above, Pakistan Integrated Household Survey indicates that enrolment rates in public schools have declined since 1995-96 and particularly a large decline has been observed in rural areas. It is generally perceived by parents that quality of education in private schools is better than in public schools. Therefore, those parents who can afford prefer to send their children to private schools. This trend indicates that the public education system is unable to meet public demand for providing quality education in the country.

The first part of the report discusses the current state of the... (faded text)

The second part of the report discusses the current state of the... (faded text)

Chapter # 8

FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND WAY FORWARD

The findings of the study are as follows... (faded text)

The conclusions drawn from the study are... (faded text)

The way forward for the study is... (faded text)

The study has identified several key issues... (faded text)

The study has identified several key issues... (faded text)

Way Forward

1. The private institutions have proved to be an integral and important part of the educational activity in our country. The future of private educational institutions is very bright in our society. If the private school owners follow a standard code of conduct, these institutions can play a major part in improving not only the educational standards but also in increasing the literacy rate and rate of employment within the country.
2. The National Education Policies (1979) and (1998-2010) proposed policy measures to encourage private sector participation ratio upto 50:50. The policy interventions have positive impact on the role of private sector as its present share is 33% with an average annual increase of 25% as indicated in National Education Census 2005. Private sector substantial contribution in increasing educational activities proved itself to be an integral part of the public sector. Thus, recognizing the importance of private sector is contributing. Government emphasized in National Education Policy (1998-2010) and ESR program, to address the critical issue i.e. access, equity and quality of education through public-private partnership program. This innovation contributed in quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education system in the country.
3. Private sector played important part in public sector development and in socio-economic development of the country by providing employment opportunities to educated youth and providing skillful work force. Resultantly sustainable development may be ensured by encouraging private sector.
4. The thrust areas of Education Sector Reforms is enhancing literacy rate, universal primary education and quality of education. The findings of this study proved that private sector has valuable contribution on these long standing policy issues.
5. Private investment in education sector seems to be profitable, as expenditure of private sector is more than that of government, whereas, private sector has to generate its resources from their institutions which is very difficult. There is need to provide proper guideline to the individuals for investment in education sector, awareness of the benefits of education may be created in terms of private and social rate of return.
6. Private sector is facing some genuine problems. The attention of policy makers and implementers is required to find out rational solution, so that private sector can more contribute more educational activities.

Bibliography

- Alderman, Harold, Peter F. Orazem, and Elizabeth M. Paterno. (2001). School Quality, School Cost, and the Public/Private School Choices of Low-Income Households in Pakistan. *Journal of Human Resources* 36(2): 304-326.
- Alderman, Harold, Jere Behrman, Shahrukh Khan, David Ross, and Richard Sabot, (1997). The Income Gap in Cognitive Skills in Rural Pakistan. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*.
- Arrow, Kenneth. (1997). "The Benefits of Education and The Formation of Preferences," in Jere Behrman and Nevzer Stacey, ed., *The Social Benefits of Education*. University of Michigan Press
- Behrman, Jere, Shahrukh Khan, David Ross and Richard Sabot. (1997). School Quality and Cognitive Achievement Production: A Case Study for Rural Pakistan. *Economics of Education Review* (16:2), 127-142.
- Gazdar. (1999). *Universal Basic Education in Pakistan: Commentary on Strategy and Results of a Survey*. Islamabad: SDPI Working Paper Series # 39.
- Government of Pakistan. (1959). *Report of the Commission on National Education January-August*, Islamabad.
- Government of Pakistan. (1997). *Report on the PIHS 1995-96*. Islamabad
- Hanushek, Eric A., (1995). Interpreting Recent Research on Schooling in Developing Countries. *The World Bank Research Observer*, Volume 10, Number 2, August
- Hoodbhoy, Pervez. (1999). ed. *Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan*. Pakistan: Oxford University Press.
- Hsieh, Chang-Tai and Miguel Urquiola. (2002). *When Schools Compete, How Do they Compete: Assessing Chile's Nationwide School Voucher Program*. Mimeo, January
- Khan, Shahrukh, S. Kazmi and Z. Latif. (1999) *The State of Basic Education in Pakistan: A Qualitative, Comparative, Institutional Analysis*. Islamabad: SDPI Working Paper Series # 47.
- Kremer, Michael R., (1995). *Research on Schooling: What we know and what we don't. A Comment on Hanushek*. *The World Bank Research Observer*, Volume 10, Number 2, August
- Krueger, Alan and Mikael Lindahl. (2001). *Education for Growth: Why and For Whom?* *Journal of Economic Literature*, Vol. XXXIX, December
- Naqvi, Sumera S. and Tazeen Javed. (2002). *All for Education*. The Dawn, Karachi: February 28

- Qureshi, Abdul Khaliq. (2001). Mushroom Growth of Public Schools in Hazara. The Nation, Internet Edition, November 24
- Khan et al. (2004). A study on Comparing School Performance to understand which Schools are doing better by Assessing and Comparing quality of Education. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, AEPAM, Ministry of Education.
- Khan, Habib et al., (2000). Measuring learning achievement at primary level in Pakistan. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- Qureshi T. M. (), The Challenge of Female Education in Pakistan (unpublished document), P & P Wing, Ministry of Education.
- Shami P.A., and Hussain Kh. Sabir. (2004). National Sample Survey of Private School. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- Shami. P.A., (2005). Text Book of Education XI-XII. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- Shami. P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2004). Basic Education in Pakistan. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- Shami, P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2005). Quality of Education Learning Achievement at Primary level. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Shami, P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2005). Development of Education in Pakistan. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Shami, P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2004). Access and Equity in Basic Education. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Shami, P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2005). Access and Equity in Basic Education. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Shami, P.A., and Hussain, Kh. Sabir. (2005). Professional Requirements of Education Managers under Devolution Plan. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management.
- Khanzode V. V. (2004). Research Methodology: Techniques and Trends. New Delhi: APH Publishing Corporation, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj.
- Chandra, S. Shivendra. and Sharma, K. Rajendra. (1997). Research in Education. New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers and Distributors, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj.

WEBLIOGRAPHY

- url: www.drcelas.fas.harvard.edu "Community Participation".
- url: www.economics.pomona.edu/Andrabi/Research/Pakschool
- url: www.wikipedia.org