

Basic Education in Pakistan

Dr. P.A. Shami
Izaz-e-Fazeelat
Kh. Sabir Hussain

Academy of Educational Planning and Management
Ministry of Education
Islamabad

January 2005



Cataloguing in Publication Data

Main entry under Authors:

Dr. P.A. Shami and Kh. Sabir Hussain

Basic Education in Pakistan.- (AEPAM Research Study No.181).

- | | |
|-------------------------------|--|
| 1. <i>Basic Education</i> | 2. <i>Primary Education</i> |
| 3. <i>Learning Activities</i> | 4. <i>Student Achievement</i> |
| 5. <i>Adult Literacy</i> | 6. <i>Early Childhood Education</i> |
| 7. <i>Private Education</i> | 8. <i>Education for All</i> 9. <i>Pakistan</i> |

372.5491

ISBN: 969-444-126-9

Content		
	Title	Page#
	Foreword	v
	Executive Summary	vii
Chapter 1	Introduction of the study	01
	1.1 Introduction	03
	1.2 Objectives of the Study	03
	1.3 Focus of the Study	03
	1.4 Methodology of the Study	04
	1.5 Delimitation of the study	05
Chapter 2	Constitutional Responsibilities of Education	07
	2. Constitution of Pakistan	09
Chapter 3	Primary Education in Pakistan	11
	3. Situation Analysis	13
	3.1 Reviews and Analysis of National Education Policies	14
	3.1.1 Education Policies 1947-82	14
	3.1.2 Education Policies in the 1990s	14
	3.2 Physical Targets of National Education Policy (1998-2010)	15
	3.3 Education Sector Reforms (ESR)	18
	3.4 Primary Education EFA Goals	18
	3.5 Review of Targets and Achievements of Five-Year Development Plans	19
	3.6 Future Requirements of Primary Education - Estimated figures	22
	3.7 Review of Primary Education Development Projects	26
	3.7.1 Primary Education Project	27
	3.7.2 Girls Primary Education Development Project I and II	27
	3.7.3 Primary Education Development and Expansion Project in AJK	27
	3.7.4 NWFP Basic Education Project	27
	3.7.5 Sindh Primary Education Development Project	27
	3.7.6 Balochistan Primary Education Development Programs	28
	3.8 Social Action Program (SAP)	28
	3.9 Drop Out at Primary Level	30
	3.9.1 Dropout reasons - as given by parents	31
	3.9.2 Teachers' views about dropout at primary level	32
	3.10 Major Problems and Obstacles	33
	3.11 Causes of low enrolment of girls	35
Chapter 4	Learning Achievements at Primary Level	37
	4. Learning Achievements and Outcomes	39
	4.1 Primary Students' Achievement: National Survey Results	39
	4.2 Causes of Low Learning Achievement	42

Chapter 5	Adult Literacy		45
	5.1	Situation Analysis	47
	5.2	Causes of Low Literacy Rate	54
	5.3	Adult Literacy Project	54
	5.4	ESR Program for Literacy	54
	5.5	Future Estimates	56
Chapter 6	Early Childhood Education		61
	6.	Early Childhood Education	63
Chapter 7	Role of Private Sector in Expansion of Basic Education		67
	7.1	National Education Policy 1998-2010	70
	7.2	Public Private Partnership	71
	7.3	Expansion of Private Sector	73
	7.4	Enrolment Growth rate in Public Sector	74
	7.5	Quality of Education in Private Sector	74
Chapter 8	Education for All		77
	8.	Education For All (EFA) Perspective	79
	8.1	National EFA Plan - Goals and Targets	81
	8.2	EFA Planning and Capacity Building	82
	8.3	EFA Planning and Capacity Building at Provincial Level	83
	8.4	District EFA Plans	84
	8.5	Sub-district/Tehsil Level EFA Planning	84
	8.6	Union Council level EFA Planning	84
	8.7	International Development Partners - EFA Forum	85
	8.8	Implementation Status	85
Chapter 9	Conclusions and Recommendations		87
	9.	Conclusions and Recommendations	89
	9.1	Access to Basic Education	89
	9.2	Reasons of Dropout	89
	9.3	Lack of community ownership	89
	9.4	Weak Governance	90
	9.5	The Social Action Program	90
	9.6	Financial Constraints	90
	9.7	Lack of Incentives for Private Sector/NGO Participation	91
	Bibliography		95

FOREWORD

This study pertains to Basic Education in Pakistan with the focus on Critical analysis of National Education Policies and Plans on primary education, identification of problems and obstacles in achieving universal primary education, examining the role of private sector in the development of Basic Education, Learning achievements and outcomes which are directly related to the growth of schools and trends in expansion.

The Government has implemented Education Sector Reforms (ESR) program with emphasis to provide access to basic education. This study investigates the extent of availability of basic education through various National Education Policies and interventions. The role of private sector in the quantitative expansion and qualitative improvement of education in the country has also been explained.

I would like to express my gratitude to the faculty members/officials of AEPAM for their hard work especially Kh. Sabir Hussain, Deputy Director (Research) for managing and reporting the study. The services of Mr. Muhammad Akram, Stenographer are also appreciated for composing the report.

Dr. Pervaz Aslam Shami
(Izaz-e-Fazeelat)
Director General

Executive Summary

This study was designed, to serve as a comprehensive research report on basic education with the aims to give particular attention to important changes that occurred in the education sector since independence. The efforts have been made to analyze and review all National Education Policies, Development Plans and Strategies, which were adopted for providing basic education in the country. So that reader would be able to get crux of the situation.

The study is divided into nine sections. The first section comprises of introduction of this report whereas the second section explains constitutional responsibility of providing education to the citizens. In the third section situation analysis on primary education, review of National Education Policies, Development Plans and objectives of ESR Program have been explained. In addition, future estimated figures about primary education have also been discussed in this section. Reasons of high dropout rate, causes of low learning achievements and major problems of providing basic education have been described in section four. Fifth chapter has a lot of information about Adult Literacy, Literacy and Plan Allocations, Targets and Strategies and Adult Literacy Project. Early Childhood Education has been explained in section six of the report. Seventh chapter explains information regarding Goals of Private Sector in the expansion of basic education in Pakistan. Section eight describes Education for All in the perspective of Dakar Conference. In addition, it contains EFA Plan to District and Union Council level. Ninth section consists of findings, conclusions and recommendations.

This study attempts to review and examine the country's specific policies and programs, existing provisions and strategies, which have been adopted to enhance access for basic education in Pakistan.

In this context, the study will focus on:-

- i) Critical analysis of National Education Policies and Plans on primary education
- ii) Identification of problems and obstacles in achieving universal primary education
- iii) Examining the role of private sector in the development of Basic Education
- iv) Learning achievements and outcomes
- v) Adult Literacy

Major findings

1. According to the constitution, education is a provincial subject. The public education delivery structure is based on a multi-tier system, with provincial

Education Secretary being the executive head. It slips down through district and tehsil levels, to the village level. The red tapism and frequent transfer of teachers, seriously affect the working of schools. More importantly an overly centralized management hampers effective day to day administration of local schools.

2. Lack of access to basic education is the foremost of all issues. Statistics clearly indicate not only primary enrolment rates are generally low, but wide disparities exist in enrolments across provinces, genders and locations (urban vs. rural). Besides these, the tribal, ethnic and social taboos and minorities are hurdles in providing education to the people.
3. Apart from access, the quality of education is very poor, especially in the public sector and rural areas. A dilapidated infrastructure, lack of proper facilities, irrelevant curricula, etc., along with untrained teaching staff, staff absenteeism, paucity of books and teaching aids adversely affect the quality of education. This results in low levels of learning achievement, and wastage of resources through grade repetitions, and high drop-out rates.
4. Majority of boys and girls could not be enrolled in the schools because of Expensive education, Non-availability of schools, Remote schools, No facility for further education, Providing help at home, Teachers' harsh behaviour and Less conveyance to remote schools. The reasons for leaving school during the academic year were expensive education, Lack of parents' interest, Large family size, Remote schools, Security problems, Non-availability of good teachers, harsh behaviour of teachers and corporal punishment.
5. The participation of local community at the grassroot level is key to the success of basic education programs, especially in the rural areas. This participation has been lacking in the countryside, where parents and communities neither understand the value of education nor contribute to it in any way. The recent non-formal basic education (NFBE) program, which focuses on girls' education, requires active community involvement. The "home school" based on accommodation provided by the community, and the setting up of parent-teacher associations and village education communities ensure regular participation and monitoring by the parents, and other village influentials.
6. The Social Action Program (SAP) focused on the improvement of access, and quality of education. To encourage girls' enrolment, some provinces had revised their recruitment rules for teachers, allowing experienced female teachers to resume job even after a gap in service. Some provinces

had even lowered the qualification requirements for female teachers, besides giving them extra financial incentives. Social Action Plan focused on achieving improved governance through decentralization. More powers with the local authorities would also require better standards of monitoring, which can be achieved through active participation of school committees, comprising parents, teachers and other local leaders.

7. The public resource base for education has not broadened over the past decade but, unusually low amounts were spent on primary education against higher amounts on universities and professional colleges. In addition, a recent survey has revealed the issue of "ghost schools" i.e., schools which only exist on paper, and cause huge losses to the exchequer. Viewed in the backdrop of the present economic constraints, it is not possible to substantially increase the allocation to education, or other social services. However, it would be practical to curtail investments in mortar and bricks, use the available infrastructure, and re-allocate funds by increasing user charges, in tertiary education (university and professional colleges), to cross-subsidize primary education. Hence in the face of financial constraints, the public sector can not tackle the issue alone. There is a need for community involvement and participation of the non-government sectors, to strengthen the education system, especially in the rural and deprived areas.
 8. Although the private/non-government sector, has participated well in the provision of basic education, yet most of its investments are concentrated in the urban areas. The data show that 65% of private schools are located in urban areas. In the early 1990s, Education Foundations were established in the provinces, which announced matching contributions to private investors. Other kinds of fiscal incentives, such as tax exemptions to investments in rural schools, etc. are needed; but more importantly, the provision of physical facilities e.g., electricity, safety, water, sanitation, telecommunications, etc. is needed which would improve the quality of rural life and attract private investors.
-

Recommendations

Based on some major issues, which have emerged, the Study recommends the following:

1. The major issue in education in Pakistan is low financial public sector investment. Although education enjoys the highest priority on the social sector agenda, yet allocations are not provided according to the requirements. It is strange to note that in the federal and provincial budgets, public sector allocations to education have steadily declined over the past five years from 2.7% of GDP in 1995-97 to 1.8% of GDP in 2001-2002. It is, therefore, recommended that all efforts should be made to enhance the budgetary allocation to education to 4% of GDP. In addition, innovative approaches should be adopted to generate additional resources for increasing funds for the education sector, especially to primary education, adult literacy and early childhood education if Dakar targets have to be met by 2015.
2. It has been observed that at present, an extremely high proportion (over 95%) of education budgets at the provincial levels are spent on recurrent heads, particularly on salaries of teaching staff, with negligible proportions i.e., below 5%, remaining for development expenditures due to delays and budgetary cuts in view of shortfall in resources. It is recommended that developmental budget should be increased, so that infrastructure can be strengthened for providing basic educational facilities.
3. It was found that education suffers from inefficient financial management and outdated procedures which have adversely affected the implementation of education programs and projects. The development projects are prepared by the Ministry/Departments of Education, which are approved, by the Planning and Development Division/ Department (through PDWP, CDWP and ECNEC) but the funds are allocated by the Finance Division (through Priorities Committee, APCC, and NEC). It is not unusual to observe that funds particularly for higher-cost projects are seldom allocated according to the approved phasing due to thin funding. This is mainly due to low budgetary allocation to education, which entails repeated revision of projects based on escalated costs, hampering their implementation. It is recommended that obstacles in management and procedural systems hindering the efficient utilization of allocated resources should be removed through an overhaul of the financial procedures governing release of funds.
4. It was found that the overall enrolment growth rate was 13% in private sector whereas it was only 3% in public sector this indicates that private

sector is playing vital role in the development of education, but financial assistance is not being provided to private sector. It is recommended that financial assistance may be given to private sector.

Though considerable progress has been observed during the past decade in the participation of NGOs and private sectors in the field of education, especially primary and university education, but more involvement of NGOs and private organizations would benefit the delivery of education services. To facilitate this, the national and provincial education foundations also need to play a more active role in guiding and coordinating NGOs and private organizations in "adopting" public schools and supporting rural community schools to achieve rapid progress in achieving the Dakar goals.

Chapter # 1

INTRODUCTION OF THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION

This study was designed, to serve as a comprehensive background paper on basic education. In this context, the study aims to give particular attention to important changes that occurred in the education sector since independence. The efforts have been made to analyze and review all National Education Policies, Plans and strategies, which were adopted for providing basic education in the country. A summary about the policy targets and strategies in primary Education was prepared, so that reader would be able to get crux of the situation. In addition plan-wise financial allocation and actual expenditure on primary education have been discussed.

The study is divided into nine sections. The first section comprises of introduction of this report whereas the second section explains constitutional responsibility of providing education to the citizens. In the third section situation analysis on primary education, review of National Education Policies, Development Plans and objective of ESR Program have been explained. In addition, future estimated figures about primary education have also been discussed in this section. Reasons of high dropout rate, causes of low learning achievements and major problems in providing basic education has been described in section four. Fifth chapter has a lot of information about Adult Literacy, Literacy and Plan Allocations, Targets and Strategies and Adult Literacy Project. Early Childhood Education has been explained in section six of the report. Seventh chapter explains information regarding Goals of Private Sector in the expansion of basic education in Pakistan. Section eight describes Education for All in the perspective of Dakar Conference. In addition, it contains EFA Plan to District and Union Council level. Ninth section consists of findings, conclusions and recommendations.

1.2 Objectives of the Study

This study attempts to review and examine the country's specific policies and programs, existing provisions and strategies, which have been adopted to enhance access for basic education in Pakistan.

1.3 Focus of the Study

In this context, the study will focus on:-

1. Critical analysis of National Education Policies and Plans on primary education
 2. Identification of problems and obstacles in achieving universal primary education
 3. Examining the role of private sector in the development of Basic Education
 4. Learning achievements and outcomes
 5. Adult Literacy
-

1.4 Methodology of the Study

The study is a qualitative and quantitative analysis based on two kinds of information

1. Published or Secondary information

Recent information published in reliable national sources in the country.

2. Primary data or field-based information

Data regarding above analysis and actual situation about the availability of educational facilities have been presented. This data was collected by Academy of Educational Planning and Management through various research studies i.e. Access and Equity in Basic Education and National Sample Survey on Private Schools.

3. Review of Literature

- Financing of Education in Pakistan
- Literacy trends in Pakistan
- Basic Education in Pakistan
- Population Censuses Reports (1998) of the four provinces and federal areas i.e., Punjab, Sindh, NWFP, Balochistan, FATA and ICT;
- Population projections by National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS);
- Perspective Development Plan (2001-2011);
- Education Sector Reforms: Action Plan (2001-2005);
- Annual provincial and federal budget documents (various years);
- Foreign Economic Assistance (various issues);
- National and Provincial Educational Management Information Systems (EMIS);
- Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (1998/99 and 2001/02);
- District Education for All-Plans for district Chakwal & FANA; and the National Plan of Action for Education for All (2001-2015).
- Documents related to Poverty Reduction Strategy.
- National Plan of Action on Education For All (2001-2015), Pakistan.
- "A report of the Education For All 2000.
- "Education Sector Reform Action Plan 2001-02, 2005-06.
- A Study on Assessing Visual-Graphics Literacy
- Basic Education in Pakistan, 1999.
- Female Teachers in Rural Schools.
- Education for All 2000 - Assessment Country Report Pakistan.
- The Challenge of Basic Education in Pakistan 1991.
- Education for All 2001.

1.5 Delimitations of the Study

1. This study was delimited to analyze the National Education Policies, Development Plans, other official documents and research reports on basic education.
 2. Data have been used from only official published documents.
-

Chapter # 2

**CONSTITUTIONAL RESPONSIBILITY
OF
EDUCATION**

2. CONSTITUTION OF PAKISTAN

The Constitution (1973) ensures equality and well being of all citizens, and no discrimination on the basis of sex, caste, creed or race. Article 37 indicates that: "The State shall: a) promote with special care the educational and economic interests of backward classes or areas; b) remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory education within the minimum possible period; c) make technical and professional education generally available and higher education equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.

The government's resolve to enforce the compulsory legislation to achieve universal primary education by the year 2010 is amply manifested in the provisions incorporated both in the National Education Policy (1998-2010) and the Ninth Five Year Plan (1999-2004).

The Provincial governments promulgated the Compulsory Primary Education Act. It is expected that all children of primary age group (5-9) will be in schools by the year 2002-06, and the gross enrolment will rise to 105% by the year 2010.

Pakistan also has international commitments to protect basic human rights and gender equality. These includes:

- **The Universal Declaration of Human Rights** (1948);
- **International Labour Standards and ILO Basic Human Rights Conventions**, e.g. Freedom of Association and Protection of the Rights to Organize (1948); Discrimination in Employment and Occupation (1958);
- **The Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women** (1985);
- **Education for All**, Jomtien, (1990);
- **Convention on the Rights of the Child**, (CRC) ratified by Pakistan in (1990);
- **Agenda 21**, United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, Rio, (1992);
- **Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action**, Vienna Conference on Human Rights, (1993);
- **The Programme of Action**, International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, (1994);
- **Platform for Social Development**, World Summit on Social Development, Copenhagen, (1995);
- **Beijing Platform for Action**, Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, (1995);
- **Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women**, (CEDAW), Pakistan acceded in (1996);

Chapter # 3

*PRIMARY EDUCATION
IN
PAKISTAN*

3. SITUATION ANALYSIS

Primary education is the foundation on which all subsequent stages of education are built and is the very basic ingredient for human resource development. Concern over the state of primary education, particularly the issue of low enrolment and high dropout rates, have been duly expressed in all National Education Policies and five year Plans. But situation is still not satisfactory.

Recent estimates indicate that there were total 150,809 primary schools in 2002-2003 with an enrolment of 615,273 in pre-primary and 176,044,85 in primary level with 433,461 teachers at this level. Further detail is as under:

Public + Private primary school profile 2002-2003

Table-1

Primary				
	Boys	Girls	Mixed	Total
Number of School	74,008	43,858	32,943	1,50,809
Total enrolment pre-primary	403,861	211,412	-	615,273
Total enrolment primary	10,297,596	7,307,389	-	17,604,485
Number of Teachers	241,802	191,659	-	433,461

Source: Pakistan School Education Statistics, 2002-2003 NEMIS AEPAM, Islamabad

Although the overall net primary enrolment is about 67% but there are gender and location (urban and rural) discrepancies at this level. Detail is presented in table below.

Net Primary Enrolment Rates (%) by Gender and Location in 2002

Table-2

Gender	Urban	Rural
Boys	87	66
Girls	81	53

Source: EFA Wing, Ministry of Education

There were a total of 28021 middle schools with an enrolment of 391,8146 and 236,274 teachers. Detail is presented in table-3.

Public + Private Middle school profile 2002-2003

Table-3

	Middle			
	Boys	Girls	Mixed	Total
Number of School	7035	6553	14,433	28021
Total enrolment	2,366,836	1,551,310	-	3,918,146
Number of Teachers	90,446	145,828	-	236,274

Source: Pakistan School Education Statistics, 2002-2003 NEMIS AEPAM, Islamabad

3.1 Reviews and Analysis of National Education Policies

3.1.1 Education policies 1947-82

In 1947, only a few months after independence an all Pakistan Education conference was convened. This conference recommended that free and compulsory education should be introduced for a period of five years, and it should gradually be raised to eight years. The Commission on National Education (1959) recommended compulsory education for all children between five and ten years of age. However, the New Education Policy (1970) fixed 1980 as target date for achieving universal primary education. Whereas, the National Education Policy (1972-80) aimed at free and universal education till class X to be achieved in two phases. Education till class VIII was made free from 1992. The free education was extended to class IX and X in 1974. The National Education Policy (1979) phased the target dates 1987 for boys and 1992 for girls.

3.1.2 Education Policies in the 1990s.

During the current decade, two education policies were announced: (i) the Education Policy of 1992, and (ii) the Education Policy (1998-2010). In addition to these policies, the Social Action Program (SAP) also lays great emphasis on primary education.

The Education Policy (1992) focused on: (i) achieving universal primary education, eliminating drop-out rates, and fulfilling the basic learning needs by the year 2002, (ii) stressing women's education, (iii) raising the quality of public instruction through an extensive in-service teachers' training program, (iv) diversification of vocational streams, along with expansion of graduate and postgraduate level courses, (v) reforming of examination system, (vi) introducing computer education at school level, and (vi) encouraging the participation of private sector in education.

The main features of the new Education Policy (1998-2010) include:

- Quality of elementary education shall be improved.

- Access to elementary education shall be increased, through effective and optimum utilization of existing facilities and services, as well as provision of new facilities and services.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Character-building, oriented towards humanism, tolerance, and moral build up on Islamic lines at elementary level shall be assigned top priority.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teachers' competence shall be improved and the relevance of training programmes for teachers shall be ensured.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kachi class at primary level shall be introduced as part of the effort to improve the achievement of pupils.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The role of the family, school, community, non-governmental organizations and media in the provision of elementary education shall be maximized.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disparities and imbalances of all types shall be eliminated so as to promote equity.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High priority shall be accorded to the provision of elementary education to the out-of-school children.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial resource base of elementary education shall be diversified.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Non-formal system shall be adopted as complementary to formal system.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A monitoring system shall be developed to obtain timely and reliable information on enrolment, retention, completion and achievement. In addition, qualitative monitoring of achievement shall be introduced.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management and supervision shall be improved through greater decentralization and accountability.

3.2 Physical Targets of National Education Policy (1998-2010)

In order to increase the access and improve the quality of elementary education, the following additional facilities will be provided:

Physical Targets in Elementary Education**Table-4**

Facilities/Services	Benchmark 1996/97	Policy Target	9th Plan Targets (2000-2003)
New Formal Primary Schools	145,000	190,000 (+45,000)	162,000 (+17,000)
Mosque Schools	37,000	57,000 (+20,000)	40,000 (+3,000)
Double Shift in Existing Primary Schools		20,000	20,000
Non-Formal Basic Education Schools	7,117	2,50,000 (+242,823)	82,177 (+75,000)
Up-gradation of Primary Schools to Middle/Elementary Level	15,000	60,000 (+45,000)	30,000 (+15,000)
Recruitment of Additional Teachers for Primary Schools	339,500	527,000 (+187,500)	382,200 (+42,700)

Source: *National Education Policy (1998-2010 P.29)*

More than half a dozen Education Policies have been designed since the inception of Pakistan. The targets fixed by the policies make an interesting study because of shifting target dates to longer periods. More-over no consistent strategies were adopted to achieve the U.P.E. National Education Commission (1959) changed the strategy by emphasizing compulsory religious education. The New Education Policy (1970) shifted the strategy towards the attraction of the schools so that dropout rate could be reduced.

Detail is given in the following table about the targets dates with strategies.

Summary Table-5
Policy Targets and Strategies Summary

Policy	Targets	Strategies
1947 Pakistan Education Conference	Free and Compulsory Education UPE within two decades by 1967	- Free and Compulsory - Levying a special Tax to finance primary education. - Primary School Age Group between 6-11 years. - Encourage private sector to open primary schools.
1959 National Education Commission	UPE within a period of 15 years by 1974.	- Compulsory and universal primary education - Compulsory religious education. - Female teachers for primary education. - Resource mobilization for additional funds.
1970 The New Education Policy	Universal Enrolment upto class V by 1980	- Attractive schools to eliminate drop out - Rapid expansion - Emphasis on female enrolment. - Female teachers for primary education
1972 The Education Policy	UPE for boys by 1979 for girls by 1984	- Free primary education - Priority to rural areas - Emphasis on female enrolment - Standardized low cost school buildings
1979 National Education Policy	UPE for boys by 1986- 87 for girls by 1992	-Rapid expansion of female education with opening of mosque and Mohalla schools. Efforts to reduce drop-outs
1992-2002 National Education Policy	UPE through community participation 100% participation by 2002 Restructuring the existing Education System	- Training and recruiting new primary teachers - Active participation of community for UPE - Special programme to retain female students - Provision of Special Federal Fund for Primary Schools
1998-2010 National Education Policy	Enhancing participation rate from 71% to 90% by 2003 and 105% by 2010. Reduction of disparities by 2010 Opening of 45000 New Formal Primary Schools.	- Revision of service structure of teachers. - Uniform curricula for public and private schools. - Political will for objective achievement and resource mobilization of Primary schools. - Free and compulsory primary education. Act shall be enacted and enforced in phased manner. - Revision of the examination and assessment system.

3.3 Education Sector Reforms (ESR)

Education Sector Reforms (ESR) program was built on the long term perspective of National Education Policy (1998-2010) and ten year perspective development plan 2001-2011. ESR is the comprehensive sector wise program to address the issues of low educational attainment, lack of access to schooling, and educational inequities by gender and location.

a) Education Sector Reforms Objectives

- Universalization of primary education and adult literacy.
- Strengthening the quality of education through better teachers, upgraded training options, curriculum & textbook reforms, and competency based examination system.

b) Education Sector Reforms targets for Basic Education during 2001-2005 are:

<u>Sub-Sector</u>	<u>Bench Mark 2001</u>		<u>Target 2005</u>	
Literacy	from	49 %	to	60 %
Gross Primary Enrolment	from	83 %	to	100 %
Net Primary Enrolment	from	66 %	to	76 %
Middle School Enrolment	from	47.5 %	to	55 %

3.4 Primary Education EFA Goals.

- i) Ensuring that by 2015 all children with special emphasis on girls and children in difficult circumstances have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality;
- ii) Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2015 and achieving gender equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality; and
- iii) Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

3.5 Review of Targets and Achievements of Five-Year Development Plans

The first five-year development plan was developed in 1955-60. Since then we have implemented eight development plans and 9th is under implementation. In these development plans, primary education has been given proper weight. More financial resources have been allocated in subsequent plan, as compared to previous ones for the development of Primary Education.

Several plan documents proposed target dates to achieve universalization of primary education. However, these dates were politically motivated and unrealistic. In every plan the shifting of dates indicated the non-seriousness of government commitment, which is also manifested from financial allocations.

Universalization of Primary Education Target Dates (Plan-Wise)

Table-6

Plan	Target date
First Plan (1955-60)	1975
Second Plan (1960-65)	1975
Third Plan (1965-70)	1980
Non-Plan (1970-78)	1979 (Boys) 1984 (Girls)
Fifth Plan (1978-83)	1987
Sixth Plan (1983-88)	1988 (Boys) 1992 (Girls)
Seventh Plan (1988-93)	1993
Eighth Plan (1993-98)	1998

Source: Development Five-Year Plans (1955- 1998)

Plan-Wise financial allocation details are given in the following table.

Plan-Wise Financial Situation of Primary Education
Table-7

Plans	Education Budget (Rs. Million)	Allocation to Primary Education (Rs. Million)	Percentage Share	Inter-Plan increase (%)
First Plan 1955-60	304.93	51.4	16.85	---
Second Plan 1960-65	490.0	78.0	15.92	60.7
Third Plan 1965-70	1086.6	67.51	6.21	121.7
Non-Plan 1970-78	2998.14	473.93	15.81	175.9
Fifth Plan 1978-83	10698.0	3049.7	28.51	256.8
Sixth Plan 1983-88	18830.0	7000.0	37.17	76.0
Seventh Plan 1988-93	22684.78	10128.0	44.64	20.5
Eighth Plan 1993-98	69031.70	32669.0	47.32	204.3
Ninth Plan 1998-2003	120020.0	69860.0	57.80	73.8

Source: Five Years Development Plans

This table-7 shows that percentage of financial allocation has been increased gradually. The share of Primary education in the first plan was 16.85% which was reduced in the second and third plans upto 6.21%. However, the successive plans had substantial share. The fifth plan allocated 28.51% of the total budget whereas this had been increased upto 37.17% in the sixth plan. The seventh plan increased from 37.17% to 44.64% whereas eighth plan allocation was 47.32% of the total budget.

However, this financial allocation did not bring desired result because merely allocation in the plans cannot achieve the target unless actual expenditure is made. Plan-Wise actual expenditure is shown in the table 8.

**Plan-Wise Allocation, Expenditure on Primary Education
(1955-2003)**

Table -8

Plan	Allocation for primary education (in millions) rupees	Actual expenditure on primary education (in million) rupees	Expenditure in (percentages)
1955-60	51.4	21.2	41.0
1960-65	78.0	19.0	24.0
1965-70	67.5	25.0	37.0
1970-78	473.93	444.0	94.0
1978-83	3049.7	1413.1	46.3
1983-88	7000.0	3533.0	50.5
1988-93	10128.0	6399.2	63.0
1993-98	32669.0	23340.4	71.4
1998-2003	69860.0	-	-

Source:

1. *Agenda for Educational Development 1988-93.*
2. *Seventh Five Years Plan (1988/89-1992/93).*
3. *Education: Past, Present and Future*

Plan-Wise Participation Rates at Primary Level Of Education
Table-9

Five years Plans	Bench Mark	Target	Achievement
First Plan 1955-60	52	58	36
Second Plan 1960-65	36	56	45
Third Plan 1965-70	45	70	46
Non Plan 1970-78	46	65	54
Fifth Plan 1978-83	54	68	48
Sixth Plan 1983-88	48	75	64
Seventh Plan 1988-93	64	79.7	68.9
Eighth Plan 1993-98	68.9	87.7	72.4
Ninth Plan 1998-2003	72.4	90	-

Source: 1. Primary Education Improvement Desired Measures National Education Council August, 1986
2. Five Years Development Plans
3. Policies and Plans Review, 1947-1998

3.6 Future Requirements of Primary Education - Estimated Figures

Basic information obtained from provincial population census reports, population projections by NIPS, the net enrolment in primary education will reach 17.536 million students in 2015/16. Of these, 10.041 million will be boys and 8.495 million will be girls.

Primary Net Enrolments (by Gender and Location) to be achieved by 2015/16

Table-10

(in millions)

Enrolments (million)	Benchmark (2002)	Target (2015/16)
Urban	5.101	7.735
- Male	2.713	4.441
- Female	2.388	3.294
Rural	7.400	10.801
- Male	4.243	5.600
- Female	3.157	5.201

Note: The population projections were obtained from NIPS.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, 2003; Islamabad

Based on the EFA goals of universal free and compulsory primary education of good quality, the study estimates the total cost requirement of the achieving these goals by 2015/16. The total cost on primary education to be incurred by the public sector is estimated to be around Rs. 955,571 million, with Rs. 582,300 million projected to maintain the present participation rate and Rs. 373,271 million to finance the additional students for the achievement of the EFA goal related to universal primary education.

Following are the cost estimates of providing universal primary education by 2015/16 to all girls and boys in Pakistan.

For urban areas, the total cost of achieving universal primary education is Rs. 48,579 million for boys (with almost 40% on development heads) and Rs. 51,923 million (with 44% on development heads) for girls.

Total Cost of achieving Universal Primary Education in Urban Areas in Pakistan

Table-11

(In million)

	Boys			Girls		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	3702	1297	2590	3136	1058	4537
Recurrent	1337	4163	5905	1,126	3,444	5,679
Total	5039	5460	8495	4262	4502	10216-
Sindh						
Development	3644	2012	465	3607	1929	3002
Recurrent	1,327	4,699	6,352	1,332	4,702	7,219
Total	4971	6711	6817	4939	6631	10221
NWFP						
Development	513	940	1237	394	794	1558
Recurrent	173	905	1,878	128	717	1,708
Total	686	1845	3115	522	1511	3266
Balochistan						
Development	253	829	902	258	714	1328
Recurrent	81	587	1,346	85	556	1,413
Total	334	1416	2248	343	1270	2741
Pakistan*						
Development	8265	5330	5408	7580	4694	10686
Recurrent	2,974	10,631	15,971	2738	9694	16531
Total	11239	15961	21379	10310	14388	27217

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO 2003, Islamabad.

For rural areas, the cost of achieving primary education for boys is Rs. 139.881 million (with Rs. 43,690 million i.e., almost 30% as development costs) and Rs. 132,887 million (with Rs. 52,153 million i.e., 40% in development costs) for girls table-12.

Total Cost of achieving Universal Primary Education in Rural Areas in Pakistan
Table-12

(In Million)

	BOYS			GIRLS		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	11750	6488	1197	7995	3803	6281
Recurrent	4944	17846	24050	3349	11490	17180
Total	1694	24334	25247	11344	15294	23461
Sindh						
Development	3856	3077	284	3165	2266	2267
Recurrent	1633	6557	9164	1339	5343	8247
Total	5489	9634	9448	4504	7609	10514
NWFP						
Development	3275	5235	833	2996	4319	7420
Recurrent	1325	6528	10372	1333	6002	12058
Total	4600	11765	11205	4218	10321	19478
Balochistan						
Development	1255	2961	636	1088	1839	3411
Recurrent	507	3008	5188	448	2354	4958
Total	1762	5969	5824	1536	1493	8369
Pakistan*						
Development	21002	19181	3507	16206	13726	22221
Recurrent	8767	35693	51731	6760	27244	46730
Total	29769	54874	55238	22966	40970	68951

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

For Pakistan, the total resource requirement for achieving universal primary education for both boys and girls in both urban and rural areas is Rs. 955,571 table-13.

Total Cost of achieving Universal Primary Education in Pakistan

Table-13

(In Million)

	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	TOTAL
Punjab				
Development	26582	12646	14604	53,832
Recurrent	10756	36942	52814	100,512
Total	37338	49588	67417	152,344
Sindh				
Development	14271	9284	6017	29,572
Recurrent	5630	21301	30982	57,912
Total	19901	30584	36999	87,484
NWFP				
Development	7178	11287	11048	29,514
Recurrent	2849	14152	26016	43,017
Total	10027	25439	37064	72,531
Balochistan				
Development	2854	6342	6276	15,472
Recurrent	1121	6505	12905	20,530
Total	3974	12846	19181	36,002
Pakistan*				
Development	53054	42931	41823	137,807
Recurrent	21239	83262	130963	235,464
Total (Additional)	74293	126192	172786	373,271
Existing Schools' Cost	103636	210283	268381	582,300
TOTAL REQUIREMENT	177929	336475	441167	955,571

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, 2003; Islamabad

3.7 Review of Primary Education Development Projects

Efforts are being made to eradicate illiteracy and promote primary education in all provinces of Pakistan, including AJK, in collaboration with the Provincial Education Departments and foreign donor agencies. A number of development projects in the area of primary education are being implemented with the assistance of the World Bank, Asian Development Bank, OPEC, EEC, USAID, UNDP, UNESCO, UNICEF, JICA, NORAD, GTZ and other donor agencies.

An overview of the major Primary Education Development Projects implemented during the 1990's is as follows:

3.7.1 Primary Education Project

For qualitative improvement and quantitative expansion of primary education in the province of Punjab, the Third Primary Education Project was launched, costing US\$252.35 million. The cost included a loan of US\$145. Million from the World Bank and a grant of US\$ 17.5 Million from the EEC. Under this project, 8993 Primary Schools were constructed and made functional in Punjab. New text books based on an integrated curricula were developed and introduced in Punjab.

3.7.2 Girls Primary Education Development Project I and II

With the financial assistance of the Asian Development Bank, a project costing Rs. 1762.95 Million was completed in 1996 in four Provinces. Under this project, 880 Community Model Schools were established and made functional in rural areas by providing all required educational inputs. The second phase of the project has been in progress since January 1998, and the total cost of the project is US\$.78 million (ADB US\$.45 million, OPEC 16 million, GOP 17 Million). The project aims at establishing 900 Community Model Schools, 173 Teacher Resource Centers and Quality Improvement Cells.

3.7.3 Primary Education Development and Expansion Project in AJK.

A Primary Education Development and Expansion Project was launched in AJK with the assistance of OPEC fund; Rs.108.9 million. The amount was utilized for construction of 255 primary schools.

3.7.4 NWFP Basic Education Project

With a view to improve the literacy rate and the quality of elementary level education, the Primary Education NWFP Project, costing Rs. 13510 million, has been in operation since 1994-95. It has been co-financed by several donor agencies. Of the total cost, 27 per cent will be provided by the donors, while the remaining 73 per cent is being provided by the NWFP Government. Construction work of 3181 schools was completed and 1100 new teachers were appointed during the first two years of this project. Moreover, procurement of instructional material worth Rs.72 million is underway.

3.7.5 Sindh Primary Education Development Project

The Sindh Primary Education Development Project has been revised to accommodate some changes in the scope and cost of the project. It was started in September 1990 at a cost of Rs.4284.3 million. 3748 two-room primary schools (of the target 5250) were constructed by 1996. Similarly, 170 five-room primary schools (of the target 475) were established. Moreover, 1864 additional class-rooms were added to existing buildings, 5299 teachers were trained and 655 girls were provided with scholarships by 1996.

3.7.6 Balochistan Primary Education Development Programme

The Balochistan Primary Education Development Programme (1993-98) was launched with the financial assistance and collaboration of World Bank. The programme included inputs such as:

- Construction of 3000 new girls schools and 2000 boys schools;
- Repair of 2800 schools;
- Mobile and Teacher Training programs; and
- Instructional materials for 1000 schools.

3.8 Social Action Program (SAP)

During the 1980s, Pakistan had the fifth fastest growing economy in the world. However, in terms of human development, the country ranked 120th on the human development index. Three major reasons identified for the slow-moving indicators included:

- (i) Resources allocated to social sectors were too low;
- (ii) Rapidly growing population, and
- (iii) Serious implementation constraints, on the efficient and productive use of resources, that were made available to the social sectors.

As response to this grave imbalance, the government developed a Social Action Program (SAP) in 1992/93, which addressed the needs of primary education (especially female education), primary health, population welfare, and rural water supply and sanitation. The first phase of SAP (1992-96), launched at a total cost of US\$ 7.7 billion, intended to improve the coverage, quality and effectiveness of service delivery in these sectors. Actively supported by the donor community, SAP was developed and implemented at the provincial level.

The overall SAP strategy comprised three critical elements:

- Improving implementation: by addressing the issues related to poor planning and budgeting, institutional constraints such as bureaucratic delays in release of budgeted funds, lack of trained staff, staff absenteeism, and lack of input supplies, etc. so that social service delivery can be improved.
- Improving program design: by shifting focus to basic services rather than higher-level services, and targeting poor women and girls especially in far flung rural areas, and by improving service quality to improve the access to social services

- Increasing level of effort: by increasing government expenditure on basic social services.
- Education Component of SAP: Education is the most important component of SAP, enjoying the highest share of resources allocated. SAP places great emphasis on primary schooling, particularly with reference to increasing enrolment, and improving the quality of education imparted, with special emphasis on female and rural areas.

In education, SAP followed a demand driven strategy that aimed at:

- Improving the efficiency with which public education services are provided
- Increasing access to schools and
- Improving the quality of schooling provided.

A range of measures designed to achieve these objectives included:

- Decentralization of management systems
- Up-gradation and implementation of planning, budgeting and monitoring systems
- Upward adjustment of teacher staffing levels, with freeze on primary teacher recruitment lifted.
- Control through supervision on absenteeism, high transfer rates, and poor teacher performance.
- Significant increase in budgets, and spending on books and other teaching materials.
- Increased access to schooling through school construction, school extension and classroom renovation.
- Promotion of greater community involvement in school management

Reviews suggest that SAP-I has had a positive impact on the provision of quality education in rural areas. There has been a quantitative shift in awareness about the importance of education, as women and girls have been primary beneficiaries of the improved education system. However, little progress appears to have been made in institutional reforms. Also, SAP implementation remained poorly coordinated. Procurement procedures overlapped, attempts at promoting community participation were weak, and monitoring and evaluation systems remained under-developed.

The second phase of SAP (1997-2001/2), costing over US \$ 10 billion, has been evolved to consolidate the outcomes of the first phase with the following cross-sectoral objectives to improve quality, efficiency, sustainability and governance:

- Continue increasing the non-salary portion of the recurrent budget, to ensure adequate provision of quality inputs
- Improve governance through merit-based staff recruitment; facilitate site selection and employment incentives, and measures to reduce absenteeism among staff.
- Strengthen government systems of service delivery through improved planning, management, monitoring and implementation, including financing non-government provision of services, and
- Increase community and beneficiary participation.

Under SAP-II, the scope of some areas has been widened, with extended education to include middle-level schooling, health expanded to incorporate tehsil-level facilities (tehsil hospitals), and peri-urban areas covered under water supply and sanitation. The important role of non-formal education (NFE), as a means of improving literacy and educational levels, has also been recognized.

3.9 Drop-out at Primary Level

The most common responses to this question, as reported by Pakistan Integrated House hold Survey 1996/97, varied between rural and urban areas. In the rural areas, 20% boys dropped out because they had to help at work, 17% as school was too expensive, 8% had to help at home, and another 8% thought education was not useful. Of the rural girls, 16% said they had to help at home, 13% that school was too expensive, for 11% school was too far away and another 11% said, "parents did not allow". Almost 21% urban boys, who dropped out from school, said that school was too expensive, 13% said they had to help at home, and 11% that education was not useful. About 23% urban girls dropped out of school because it was too expensive, 14% said "parents did not allow," and 12% that they had to help at home.

As mentioned in the methodology of this report that data being used in this report was collected by AEPAM for the research study namely, "Access and Equity in Basic Education". In this study 5-point scale was used for getting information from the respondents. The following two tables have been prepared on the basis of first three points, i.e. very important, important and less important. The responses of the parents and teachers regarding dropouts are presented in the following table-14.

3.9.1 Dropout reasons- parents

Reasons offered by parents about dropout at primary level
Table-14

S. No	Reasons of leaving Primary school	Boys student			Girls student		
		Very Imp.	Imp.	Less Imp.	Very Imp.	Imp.	Less Imp.
1	Education too expensive	66	15	8	66	14	6
2	Distance from home to school	35	27	18	52	25	9
3	Repeated failures	36	27	17	33	29	18
4	Teacher's harsh behavior	27	27	20	26	29	21
5	Help in domestic work	28	29	23	33	29	20
6	Lack of interest of parents	39	28	13	38	28	14
7	Large family size	36	26	16	34	28	16
8	Security problems	23	28	23	43	25	12
9	Availability of toilets	23	23	23	30	22	22
10	Lack of good teachers	34	25	17	33	25	18
11	Difficult syllabus	28	26	22	28	25	23
12	Beating of the student/ saza	24	25	25	23	23	28
13	Because of marriage	23	19	31	39	20	20

In case of boys the table-14 mentions that 81% of parents considered the expensiveness of education an important factor for boys to leave the school. Similarly 62% parents thought that schools were at long distances and their family size was large and that's why their boys/children had to discontinue their education. Further more, 54% parents took teachers' harsh behavior as one reason of school leaving for boys. For 59% parents, another reason of leaving school for boys was lack of good teachers. Similarly, 67% parents considered lack of interest of parents also a reason for leaving the school.

As far as syllabus is concerned, 54% parents took difficult syllabus an important reason of leaving the school. Other important reasons of leaving school were helping the parents in domestic work, security problems, physical punishment and early marriages.

In case of girls the table-14 indicates that 80% parents said that expensive education was an important reason of leaving the schools, 77% parents viewed long distance from home to school as another reason. Whereas 55% parents told teachers' harsh behavior was another important reason for leaving the school. Similarly, for 62% parents, involvement of girls in domestic work, for 66%. Parents, lack of interest of parents, for 62% parents, large family size, for 68% parents, security problems of girls, for 52% parents, non-availability of toilets, for 58% parents, lack of good teachers, for 53% parents, difficult syllabus, for 46% parents, physical punishment and for 59% parents, marriage of girls were other important reasons for girls to leave the school.

3.9.2 Teachers' views about dropout at primary level

Teachers teach in the classroom. They are usually expected to have good understanding of the behaviour of the students. The views of the teachers are very important about student's leaving the school. Their responses are presented in table-15.

Teachers' reasons about dropout at primary level

Table-15

S. No	Reasons for leaving Primary school	Boys students			Girls students		
		Very Imp.	Imp.	Less Imp.	Very Imp.	Imp.	Less Imp.
1	Education too Expensive	50	16	17	52	18	11
2	Lack of interest of parents	44	38	6	55	24	6
3	Large family size	15	42	23	45	25	13
4	Distance from home to school	18	22	37	40	23	19
5	Security problem of children	15	21	37	43	22	14
6	Repeated failures	21	30	24	19	28	25
7	Teachers' harsh Behaviour	24	22	27	23	25	25
8	Child not willing	25	28	22	21	27	23
9	Excessive home work	14	27	33	21	28	31
10	Availability of drinking water	21	18	32	22	21	30
11	Availability of students toilets	22	19	32	23	26	27
12	Availability of Electricity	22	18	31	23	23	27
13	Lack of good teachers	29	27	22	33	23	22
14	Difficult syllabus	23	27	25	27	23	26
15	Beating the student/ Saza	24	26	23	24	21	29
16	Because of marriage of boy	25	29	24	33	24	16

In case of boys students, it is evident from the above table-15 that 66% teachers had the opinion that expensive education was an important reason for boys to leave the school. Whereas 82% teachers took lack of interest of parents as important reason of leaving the school. 57% teachers considered large family size as an important reason for boys students to leave the school. Similarly, for 53% teachers, it was unwillingness of children; for 56% teachers, it was lack of good teachers; for 54% teachers, it was marriage of boys; for 50% teachers, it was physical punishment.

Many other reasons of school leaving included distance of school, teacher's harshness, security problems, difficult syllabus, non-availability of drinking water and toilets etc.

Teachers also gave their opinion about girls' students for leaving the school. The table- illustrates that according to 70% teachers, girls students left school because of expensive education; 79% teachers took lack of interest of parents as one reason for girls to leave the school; 70% teachers considered large family size as one of the reasons for girls to stop education. Similarly, for 65% teachers, the girls had to discontinue education because of security problem. Among many other reasons for girls to discontinue school were teachers harsh behavior, unwillingness of girls towards education, excessive home work, non-availability of drinking water and toilets, electricity; lack of good teachers, difficult syllabus and physical punishment given by teachers in the school.

3.10 Major Problems and Obstacles

Some Research studies have been carried out on Basic Education

A) Ghafoor et al (1990) study on " relationship between five year schooling and literacy status of parent's reported that:

- i) Poverty is the main problem, which does not permit children of poor families either to join or continue education.
- ii) Children of literate parents have more interest in education. The families where fathers or mothers are literate, children's enthusiasm for education is greater.
- iii) Illiterate parents are found to be conservative; sticking to their traditional values. Their conservatism has a strong negative effect on female education. (Ghafoor, et al 1990, pp. 42).

B) According to Chaudhary et al (1988) study on Incentives for Rural Female Students in Pakistan:

- i) Incentive in the form of monetary as well as non- monetary is very essential if we really want to increase the enrolment of students in rural areas.
- ii) Parents generally don't send their girls to school because of direct cost of schooling.
- iii) The girls were going to boys schools and mosque schools if there was no girls school in the community. The study reported functioning of two schools in one building one for boys and other for girls: the upper portion was used as girls' school and ground floor was used as boys' school. (Chaudhary, et al 1988, pp. 43-35).

C) BRIDGES study McGinn; et al (1989) indicated:

- i) the difference in opportunity to enroll in school was very high in Balochistan, where there were 3 schools for boys and 1 for girls.
- ii) The study further reported availability of 3 schools for boys for every 2 girls schools in NWFP and about 6 schools for boys for every 4 for girls school in Punjab and Sindh.
- iii) In Islamabad district, there is same number of schools for boys and for girls that is, the ratio is 1 to 1. Sindh has the largest proportion of "mixed" schools (45.6%), and NWFP the least (only 1%). (McGinn, et al, 1989, pp.3-4)

D) Butt (2000) conducted a study on investigation on "the factors of low enrolment Ratio of girls in Elementary schools of Rawalpindi". This study found that:

- i) The enrolment of rural girls middle school was 1.8 times less than boys. This indicated that the glaring inequalities existed between boys and girls.
- ii) The study found out that poverty was the main problem which did not permit children of poor families either to join or continue education (Butt 2002, pp.185-188).

E) Khan et al (2004) conducted a study on "Access and Equity in Basic Education". The following conclusion drawn about access to primary schools are: Majority of boys and girls could not be enrolled in the schools because of:

- i) Expensive education
- ii) Non-availability of schools

- iii) Remote schools
- iv) No facility for further education
- v) Providing help at home
- vi) Teachers' harsh behaviour
- vii) Less conveyance to remote schools

As far as the reasons of repetition, and dropout are concerned, following conclusions were drawn.

Reasons for repeating a class work

- i. Lack of available guidance at home
- ii. Lack of students' interest
- iii. Students' absenteeism
- iv. Difficult syllabus
- v. General weakness in studies

The reasons for leaving school during the academic year were:

- a) Expensive education
- b) Lack of parents' interest
- c) Large family size
- d) Remote schools
- e) Security problem

3.11 Causes of low enrolment of girls

Following is a list of the basic causes of low enrolment of girls at primary level of education, and continuing gender gaps in literacy and participation rates, as identified by different research studies.

1. Poverty, illiteracy and conservatism of the parents are generating negative attitudes against the education of girls.
2. Low base level of female education at the time of independence and the persistent obsession of parents, planners and community leaders that the first available educational facility must be reserved for boys.
3. Demand for separate girls schools and lack of adequate financial support.
4. Non-availability of qualified and experienced female school teachers and neglect of basic physical facilities for girls schools.

5. Lack of incentives for girls to attend schools and for teachers to take up teaching duties with commitment and devotion.
6. Irrelevant curricula and ineffective teaching methodology for multi-grade teaching in schools where two teachers teach five classes in one or two rooms.
7. Inhibiting role of uneducated mothers and severe attitudinal barriers to girls' education in the rural and tribal areas.
8. Non-existence of girls' primary schools or non-availability of schools at an accessible distance.
9. Heavy population growth-rate and the burden of household work falling on young girls.
10. Absence of essential facilities like drinking water mats for squatting or benches for sitting, urinals and space for playing in existing girls schools.
11. Apathy of the community and an ineffective supervisory system.
12. Poor impact of non-governmental organizations on the motivation of parents and girls.

Chapter # 4

***LEARNING ACHIEVEMENTS
AT
PRIMARY LEVEL***

4. LEARNING ACHIEVEMENTS AND OUTCOMES

Learning achievements have been low in primary school education in Pakistan. According to Human Development in South Asia 1998, the basic competencies of children in a nationwide sample of 11-12 year old primary school completers, were very low, as only 35% could read with comprehension, and only 17.4% could write a letter. Quoting another study, the same source says that fewer than 10% of the representative samples were competent in basic reading and comprehension.

According to a national survey report, "Determinants of Primary Students' Achievement," which focuses on students and teachers of class V of government, as well as privately/NGO operated primary schools, the test results of students as well as teachers, have generally been quite positive. However, in some key areas, including conceptual development, the performance has been less than satisfactory. This is the pattern throughout the country, though there are variations from one province/area to another. It is point of concern that by the fifth school year, the students are unacquainted with some very basic facts, about their country, and do not understand even the rudimentary concepts of the subjects taught.

4.1 Primary Students' Achievement: National Survey Results

The major findings of a survey of 365 government, 76 private, and 21 NGO/trust primary schools, comprising 9,900 students and 782 teachers, were:

- The overall average scores showed that boys were unable to answer 41%, and the girls 38% questions accurately.
- Girls performed better than boys in all provinces/areas, except in Northern Areas
- There were wide provincial/area differences in overall achievement, with the following ranking: (i) Punjab recorded the highest scores, with 70% girls and 69% boys answering correctly (ii) ICT (iii) FATA (iv) AJ&K (v) Balochistan (vi) NWFP and (vii) Northern Areas. [Sindh survey had to be dispensed with for some reasons].
- In the mathematics test, the average scores in the numerical component were 69% for boys and 66% for girls, while in the narrative component, these were 36% for boys and 33% for girls.
- 77% students were unable to answer questions on mathematical proportions
- 57% students believed that the sun moves around the earth
- 33% students did not know the name of the country's capital
- 29% students did not know the name of the President of Pakistan

Source: (Determinants of Primary Students' Achievement; MSU; 1995)

Grade repetition reflects basic competency. It also implies that extra resources are used for schooling, which could be used to educate the child a grade higher instead, or educate another child not currently in the education system. According to Pakistan Integrated Household Survey results, the overall grade repetition rates are 11%, but slightly higher for rural boys (18%) and rural girls (13%) in katchi grade and Class I, and 17% for urban girls in Class I.

Shah (1984) reported an average percentage score of 38 in Mathematics of grade-V students and average percentage score of 38 in science of grade IV students (Shah, 1984, pp.211). The Bridges study on "Teacher Characteristics and Students' Achievement in Mathematics and Science, reported as the average (mean) score of 11.7 for Mathematics IV, 12.4 average score for Mathematics V, average score of 13.8 for Science IV and average score of 16.3 for Science V (Warwick and Rimers, 1989, pp.3).

Rugh et al (1991) found the mean percentage score of 21 for Mathematics, and 30 for science. Rugh's study indicated a decline in achievement score for Mathematics from 35 percent in 1984 to 21 percent in 1989 (Rugh et al, 1991, pp.11).

The Harvard study (1992) on "Teacher Certification: Value Added or Money Wasted" reported that the teacher's formal education and experience had a positive effect on the achievement of students in science and Mathematics. While teacher's certification did not improve the classroom practices (Warwick and Rimers, 1992, pp.27-28).

Warwick and Rimers (1992), in another research, reported that teacher's qualification and subject knowledge had strong correlation with students' achievement. Teachers own subject knowledge and formal education had more impact on student's performance than did their pre-service training (Warwick and Rimers, 1992).

A national survey carried out by MSU (1995) to identify "Determinants of Primary Students Achievements, reported students' achievement of an average percentage score of 46 in Mathematics, 74 in general knowledge and 69 in comprehension. This study reported an improvement of 25 percent points during 1989-1995 in Mathematics. In addition, boys' performance was better than the girls in Mathematics by scoring three percent higher points (MSU-SAP, 1995).

Action Aid Pakistan Survey (1999) reported achievement of average percent score of 60 in Mathematics, 67 in Urdu and 71 in the general knowledge of students of public schools. It also indicated better performance of boys over girls (Education For All-The Year 2000 Assessment, Pakistan Country Report, 2000, pp.44-45).

AEPAM (2000) study entitled "Measuring Learning Achievement at Primary level in Pakistan" reported that overall average scores of students for both Science and

Urdu was 72 whereas for Mathematics, it was 58 of grade V students. (Khan et al, 2000, p.14).

AEPAM (2002) study entitled "Factors Associated with Learning Achievement of Grade-V Students in Public Schools," reported that mean percentage score in Mathematics was 48, whereas for Urdu it was 60 and 65 for Science of grade V students. The same study reported that teachers' academic and professional qualification had a positive impact on students' achievement. (Khan & Shah., 2000,pp.38-44).

Farooq. (2003) Study on "The impact of teachers' characteristics on learning achievement of students at primary level in Rawalpindi district," reported that the total mean percentage score of students in Mathematics was 54 and in sciences it was 64. The study further indicated mean percentage score of 51 in Mathematics for boys and 58 for girls. The mean percentage score in science was 59 for boys and 66 for girls (Farooq, 2003, pp.3).

Haq (1998) quoted the findings of various studies on learning/achievements that indicated a very low level of students' learning/achievement. He particularly stated the low achievement of basic competencies of children in a nation wide sample of 11 to 12 year old primary school completers. He stated that 34 percent could read with comprehension and 17 percent could write a letter. An other study reported by Haq, indicated that less than 10 percent of the representative sample were competent in basic reading and comprehension (Haq, M., & Haq, K., 1998,pp.77)

Education Ability Test (Level 5) consisting of 50 items for the subject: Language, Mathematics, Science & General Information, and Reasoning was developed by National Institute of Psychology (NIP), Quad-I-Azam University, Islamabad to evaluate students' cognitive educational outcomes. The test items were constructed keeping in view the curriculum and textbooks of grade 4,5,6 and 7. The test was developed for students of grades 4,5, and 6. The mean scores for complete test for students of grades 4,5 and 6 were 24.32,27.55 and 36.17 respectively. The overall increase in the mean scores between various grades was significant. (Ansari Z.A, P.N.Tariq & M.Iftikhar, 1990 pp. 7-11).

Ayub (2001) conducted a study on "measuring students achievement in relation to parent involvement." This research indicated that parents' involvement in the educational activities of their children had a positive impact on their achievement. It also found that parents and family environment are important factors responsible for improving the achievement level of students in schools (Ayub 2001,pp.60).

Academy (2004) has conducted a study on Learning Achievement in 5 grade five students in three subject i.e. Science, Mathematics and Urdu language. The average percentage scores in these three subjects are given under:-



Average Percentage Score by Region/District

Districts	Mathematics			Urdu			Science		
	Public	Pvt.	Total	Public	Pvt.	Total	Public	Pvt.	Total
Islamabad	43	43	43	59	66	62	60	54	58
Multan	54	51	53	68	81	73	67	58	63
Attock	45	41	44	58	68	61	55	57	55
Bhakkar	59	59	59	68	76	71	66	61	64
Thatta	37	67	46	56	77	63	51	58	53
Khairpur	54	59	56	67	76	70	72	66	70
Khuzdar	29	26	28	47	58	50	48	55	51
Zhob	54	35	48	62	65	63	62	55	60
D.I.Khan	51	69	57	65	80	70	61	80	68
Kohistan	44	52	46	50	71	57	48	62	53
Khyber Agency	41	46	43	52	63	56	51	54	52
FR Kohat	59	68	62	73	80	75	66	77	70
Gilgit	43	58	48	62	77	67	62	75	67
Rawalakot	37	45	40	56	74	63	57	61	58
National	46	51	48	60	72	64	59	62	60

Pvt. = Private

Source: Comparing school performance to understand which schools are doing better by assessing and comparing quality of education (2004 P-viii)

The national mean score in Mathematics, Urdu, and Science was 48, 64 and 60 respectively. It was observed that in Mathematics the performance of the most of the students was not satisfactory. Whereas the performance in Science and Urdu was satisfactory. It is evident from the above table that the students of private schools outperformed the students of public schools. A significant difference was observed between the performance of public and private schools. The result indicated that the quality of education was better in private schools as compared to public schools. Gender differences indicated that girls' performance was significantly better than boys in all subjects including Mathematics where usually the boys performed better than the girls. As far as location is concerned, urban students have performed significantly better than the rural students.

4.2 Causes of Low Learning Achievement

The analysis suggests that the teachers' poor performance is the major cause of the very low standards of academic achievement. The incompetence of teachers, in turn, is related to the low level of their educational qualifications, and although the pre-service

training of teachers has some bearing on the students' achievement. The in-service training has no impact on the students.

The learning achievement of students also remains low, because among other factors such as:

- Student absenteeism results in low academic achievement.
- Students in private schools perform better than their counterparts in government schools; even though there is no significant difference in the competence of teachers in the two types of schools
- The gender of the teacher plays an important role in students' achievement. Students taught by females, or by both females and males, tend to score higher at a later stage.
- Students entering the school at an earlier age, perform better than those who enter at a later stage.
- Students repeating a class tend to remain under-achievers as compared to the rest of the class, and
- Literacy of parents has a positive impact on students' achievement, the impact being more pronounced in case of literate father rather than literate mother.

The following steps are essential to improve students' achievement at the primary level:

- A systematic review of the primary education system in the country is needed to evolve appropriate strategies.
- The content and approach of the teacher training programs need to be evaluated, with a view to promoting competence of the teachers.
- The overall management and learning atmosphere in government schools needs to be improved.
- The promotion of mixed schools with mixed teaching arrangements, or with female teachers, could help to advance students' achievements.
- Parent-teacher committees could be activated, to orient parents about sending their children to school at the proper age.

Some remedial system should be introduced for the under-achievers, so that they may not eventually drop out of school.

Chapter # 5

ADULT LITERACY

5. ADULT LITERACY

5.1 Situation Analysis

Basic education is a fundamental human right and Literacy being a key learning tool is the first step towards basic education. It is said that illiteracy breeds a vicious cycle i.e., the illiterate is poor, the poor are powerless and the powerless are illiterate. Literacy is not just attaining the skills of reading and writing but providing people with the skills to learn, protect and empower themselves in society and effectively contribute to decision-making at various levels. The United Nations Literacy Decade (2003-12) is focusing on the promotion of literacy, especially for the poorest and most marginalized groups. As follow-up of its international commitments, the Government of Pakistan is placing emphasis on literacy in its recent National Education Policies, well-documented in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper.

Literacy rate for both sexes is estimated at 54.0 percent in the current year. Literacy rates for male and female are estimated at 66.25 percent and 41.75 percent in the current year respectively, which were 56.48 percent and 32.59 percent in 1998. Under the Education Sector Reforms, the National Literacy Campaign envisages making 13.5 million people literate to enhance the literacy rate to 60% by 2006. In this connection around 270,000 adult literacy centers will be opened for this purpose. Table-17 reports statistics on literacy rate and population growth.

Table-17
Literacy Rate – Population and GDP Growth

Year	Literacy	Change by Percentage Point	Population Growth* (Million)
1996	40.9	1.3	2.47
1997	42.2	1.3	2.45
1998	43.6	1.4	2.42
1999	45.0	1.4	2.34
2000	47.1	2.1	3.40
2001	49.0	1.9	2.06
2002	50.5	1.5	2.00
2003	51.6	1.1	1.94
2004	54.0	1.5	1.90

Source: *The population growth is for fiscal year "Federal Bureau of Statistics".



UNESCO, 1951 (First Definition of Literacy)

1. "A person is literate who can with full understanding, both read and write a short, simple statement on his/her everyday life."

The phrase "Every Day Life" – Contains an in-built requirement for evolution as life becomes more complex.

In this formal definition, we have the essence of "Functional Literacy." In 1990, "Functional Literacy" was defined as:

"A person who can engage in all those activities in which literacy is required for effective functioning of his group and community and also for enabling him to continue to use reading, writing and calculation for his own and the community's development."
(UNESCO, 1992)

2. Three levels of literacy have been defined by UNESCO:

- Basic
- Middle
- Self-learning

Each is explained below.

3. Basic Level (Level I)

Target Group

- i) Adults who have never been to school or who have dropped out of school before acquiring literacy skills.
- ii) Adults unable to read and write simple words, paragraphs or any other type of written statement without the help of a teacher.

4. Requirements of Level I

When adults have completed this level, they should have mastered the following skills:

Reading	Writing	Numeracy	Other
Read newspaper headlines and sub-headings	Write own name and address	Count and reorganize figures 1-1000	Communicate clearly
Read and understand posters	Communicate in writing using simple language	Add and subtract up to 3 digits	Use literacy skills in daily life
Read and understand simple printed paragraphs	Write simple letters	Understand the principles of simple addition, subtraction, multiplication and division	
Read and recognize figures 1-1000	Write numerical numbers 1-1000		

5. Middle Level (Level II)

Target Group

Adults who have completed basic level and/or acquired basic skills.

6. Requirements of Level II

When adults have completed this level, they should have mastered the following skills.

Reading	Writing	Numeracy	Other
Read and comprehend stories, songs, directions, instructions and simple parts of newspapers	Write simple notes and letters	Demonstrate proficiency in adding and subtracting	Further improvement in communication and literacy
Identify the main idea of what has been read	Fill out simple forms and receipts (bills)	Apply basic skills in multiplying and dividing	
Understand basic measurements (money, weight, length, volume). Solve simple numerical problems (family budget, marketing).			

7. Self Learning Level (Level III)

Target Group

Adults who have completed intermediate level or can study independently and who are willing to use books and other resources in search of knowledge.

8. Requirements of Level III

When adults have completed this level, they should have mastered skills such as the following:

Reading	Writing	Numeracy	Other
Analyze and synthesize main ideas of what they read.	Write one/two pages on certain topics.	Add and subtract large numbers with accuracy and speed.	Further improvement in communications and literacy skills.
Discuss with others what they have read.	Write personal letters, applications, report, inquiries, etc.	Multiply up to 5 digit numbers and functions	
Read and interpret simple graphs.	Draw graphs and geometric figures.	Divide up to 3 digit numbers and functions	

[Note: By the end of Level III learners should be able to learn by themselves.]

9. It will be observed that initially literacy was confined to acquisition of basic skills of 3 levels. Over a period of time, basic literacy was converted into functional literacy and it may change further with sophistication of our daily-use gadgets and spread of new ideas. This transformation of literacy is, in fact, associated with its importance for society as a whole and the person as an individual.

10. The evolving definitions of Adult Literacy in Pakistan are given below followed by definitions of Adult Literacy in India and China. Table 1 presents a chronological history (from 1947-98) of Pakistan Government's (unsuccessful) efforts to improve literacy in Pakistan.

Pakistan's Definition of Literacy

Census Year	Definition of Literacy	Percentage of Literacy
1951	One who can read a clear print in any language	16.4%
1961	One who is able to read with understanding a simple letter in any language	16.3%
1972	One who is able to read and write in some language with understanding	21.7%
1981	One who can read a newspaper and write a simple letter	26.2%
1998	One who can read a newspaper and write a simple letter	45%
PIHS (1998) Ministry of Education (March 2002)	One who can read and write in any language with understanding and can add and subtract.	45%

Table-18
Adult Literacy – Plan Allocations, Targets and Strategies

Plan	Allocation (Rs. In Million)	Target (Million Persons)	Strategies
First Five Year Plan 1955-60	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through Village Aid Programme. • School as a community center.
Second Five Year Plan 1960-65	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School as a Community center
Third Five Year Plan 1965-70	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pilot projects of intensive nature on experimental basis
Non-Plan Period 1970-78	2.3	5.0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advisory Council for Adult Literacy and Adult Education recommended. • National Education Corps. • Armed forces to play a role • Industrial establishment to run literacy classes for workers.
Fifth Five Year Plan 1978-83	50.0	8.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Population 10-45 years to be covered. • Pakistan Television Literacy Program to be augmented.
Sixth Five Year Plan 1983-88	750.0 834.0 (Actual Expenditure)	15.0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Population 10-24 years to be covered • Establishment of LAMEC • NGOs and local governments to be involved. • Fresh matriculates to take up literacy work for one year • Debarring illiterates form employment.
Seventh Five Year Plan 1988-93	300.0	12.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Universalization of Primary Education • Non-formal Education Programs • NGOs.
Eighth Five Year Plan 1993-98	1750.0 (SAP)	16.86	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Universalization of Primary Education. • NGOs to develop and launch community based literacy programs. • Integration of literacy in Rural and Urban Community Development programs.
Ninth Five Year Plan 1998-2003	12455.00	55% Literacy by 2003, 70% literacy by 2010	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Functional Literacy Centers for Education of Adults • Establishment of new 75000 NFBE schools

*Source: Human Development in South Asia 2002, Mahbub-ul-Haq Human Development Center, Oxford University Press, Karachi.

Table-19
Adult Literacy Policy Targets and Strategies (1947-2010)

Policy	Target (Literates/ Literacy Rate)	Strategies
1947 Pakistan Education Conference	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adult education by provinces • College students to participate in literacy campaign • Existing school buildings and staff to be used
1959 Commission on National Education	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of school children as the teachers of their illiterate parents • College students as adult literacy teachers • Each one teach one • Media use for adult education
1970 The New Education Policy	5.0 Million to be made literate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Functional education • Employers to make the employees literate • National Education Corps • Non-Formal Education Programmes
1972 The Education Policy	11.0 (Millions)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Massive literacy Programmes • Literacy Centers in schools, factories, farms, union council halls and other community places.
1979 National Education Policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 35% by 1982-85 • 40% by 1992-93 • 80% by 2000 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mosque schools and Mohalla schools. • Student volunteers corps • Use of television for literacy • Creation of literacy and Mass Education Commission
1992 National Education Policy, 1992	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 50% by 1995 • 70% by 2002 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary Education Compulsory • Involvement of NGOs • Massive efforts to enhance literacy rate • Literacy programmes will be integrated with skill based community programmes • Use of electronic and print media • Awards to meritorious work in adult literacy • Appropriate legislation to allocate funds for promotion of adult literacy, (non-transferable and non lapsable)
National Education Policy, 1998-2010	<p>By 2002-2003</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 55% • 70% Male • 40% Female <p>By 2010</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 70% • 85% Male • 55.5 Female 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decentralization of planning mechanism • Special attention to out-of-school children • Emphasis on maximum utilization of resources e.g. GoP, NGO community initiatives, Boy Scouts and Girl Guides. • Increase in Non-Formal Basic Edu-Community centers from 70000 to 82000 by 2000 • Media involvement to impart life skills to the neo-literate.

*Source: Human Development in South Asia 2002, Mahbub-ul-Haq Human Development Center, Oxford University Press, Karachi.

5.2 Causes of Low Literacy Rate

These include:

- i. due to lack of political will and absence of consistency in policy, adult literacy programmes were not given the needed/desired priority in EFA programmes;
- ii. resources/funds earmarked for adult literacy programmes were hardly 1% of the education budget; further, allocated funds could never be provided on time;
- iii. absence of a strong coordination and organizational structure with the result that interaction among the principal actors in the field of adult literacy remained weak;
- iv. professional base of adult literacy initiatives remained under-developed due to lack of training of instructors; no formalized curriculum; and a virtual non-existence of effective research; and
- v. monitoring and evaluation mechanism at the grassroot level could not be strengthened, which adversely affected the internal efficiency and effectiveness of the literacy programmes and projects.

5.3 Adult Literacy Project

Under ICT-Adult Literacy Project, approved in December 2001, 704 Adult Literacy Centers (ALCs) have been established in ICT by June 2003. In these centers, girls/women of age 15+ get literacy classes. In each center, approximately 25 learners are enrolled; 98% of which are female. During the current financial year 2003-04, an allocation of Rs. 12.500 (Million) has been made for opening 466 ALCs; out of which, 131 ALCs will start functioning with effect from 25 March 2004. A comprehensive Teachers Training Course for these centers has been accomplished on 16-3-2004. As per PC-1, 50% learners who completed the Literacy cycle satisfactorily will be given skill training linked with the micro-credit facilities to start their business.

5.4 ESR Program For Literacy

Objective

Improvement in literacy rate and universalization of primary education.

Target

To make 13.5 million males & females literate (10+ age group) in order to increase literacy rate from 47% to 62% during 2001-2004:

Strategy for Implementation:

- Setting up the President's Task Force on Human Development: an initiative of Expatriate Pakistanis for integrated human development
- Implementation by District and Provincial Governments,
 - Targets will be district specific
 - Each literacy cycle of 6-8 months
 - Mass Media Mobilization Campaign

Supporting Organizations:

- The campaign will be supported by the following.
- President's Task Force on Human Development; advocacy, strategy, policy guidelines, implementation, institutional procedures, & mobilization of expatriates.
 - Literacy Cell, EFA Wing: co-ordination, standard-setting, evaluation & research.
 - AIOU: material development Training & mass-media campaign.
 - NGOs, CBOs, Girl Guides and Boy Scouts-grass-root implementation.
 - Ministry of Information & Media Development
 - Pak Army: Identification of sites, training, & monitoring.

Table-20
Targets and Budget Summary:

	Year I	Year II	Year III	Total
Literacy Centers	45,000	90,000	135,000	270,000
Enrolment	2.25 million	4.50 million	6.75 million	13.5 million
Increase Literacy Rate	2%	5%	8%	15%
Cost in Rs.	1.5 million	3.00 million	4.5 million	9.0 billion

Source:

Selected Programs according to need and age group:

- I. The Accelerated Community Primary Schools Project targeting age group 10-14 years is a non-formal primary programme over three years.
- II. The Literacy for Empowerment Project targeting age group 5+ is of one year duration combining literacy with functional skills for income generation (linked to micro-credit).

Table-21

Number of Adult Literates (by Gender and Location)

Enrolments (million)	Benchmark (2002)	Target (2015/16)
Urban	26.447	52.674
- Male	15.293	27.562
- Female	11.154	25.112
Rural	28.857	73.025
- Male	20.362	37.395
- Female	8.495	35.630

Note: The population projections were obtained from NIPS.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

5.5 Future Estimates

Based on the EFA goals of improving the levels of adult literacy rates by 50% and improving its quality, the study estimates the total cost requirement of the achieving 86% adult literacy for all Pakistani males and females by 2015/16.

For urban areas, the cost of adult literacy programme is estimated at Rs. 35,816 million (with Rs. 14,472 million as development costs) for males and Rs. 40,747 million (with Rs. 16,464 million as development expenses) for females (Table-22).

Table-22
Total Cost (in Rs. m) of Adult Literacy in Urban Areas of Pakistan

	MALES			FEMALES		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	1,440	3,022	3,599	1,483	3,190	3,921
Recurrent	2,124	4,457	5,308	2,188	4,705	5,784
Total	3,564	7,479	8,907	3,671	7,894	9,706
Sindh						
Development	779	1,613	1,725	852	1,874	2,189
Recurrent	1,148	2,379	2,545	1,257	2,764	3,229
Total	1,927	3,991	4,270	2,109	4,639	5,418
NWFP						
Development	208	448	618	261	593	864
Recurrent	307	661	911	385	875	1,274
Total	516	1,109	1,528	647	1,468	2,137
Balochistan						
Development	134	277	360	146	332	471
Recurrent	198	409	520	215	490	694
Total	333	686	890	362	822	1,165
Pakistan*						
Development	2,610	5,455	6,407	2,792	6,095	7,577
Recurrent	3,849	8,045	9,450	4,118	8,989	11,176
Total	6,459	13,500	15,857	6,910	15,084	18,752

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003



Table-23
Total Cost of Adult Literacy in Rural Areas of Pakistan

(in Million)

	MALES			FEMALES		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	2480	4,530	4,036	3,522	6,562	6,612
Recurrent	3658	6,683	5,954	5,195	9,679	9,754
Total	6138	11,213	9,990	8,717	16,241	16,366
Sindh						
Development	746	1,330	1,143	1,181	2,205	2,205
Recurrent	1,101	1,961	1,686	1,741	3,253	3,252
Total	1849	3,291	2,829	2,922	5,458	5,457
NWFP						
Development	712	1,314	1,325	1,203	2,323	2,596
Recurrent	1,050	1,938	1,955	1,774	3,426	3,829
Total	1,762	3,252	3,280	2,977	5,749	6,425
Balochistan						
Development	277	464	474	390	732	807
Recurrent	409	685	699	575	1,079	1,190
Total	687	1,149	1,174	965	1,810	1,997
Pakistan*						
Development	4,458	8,107	7,525	1,600	12,439	12,964
Recurrent	6,575	11,957	11,099	9,736	18,348	19,123
Total	11,032	20,064	18,624	16,336	30,787	32,088

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

The total cost of achieving 86% adult literacy rates for all Pakistani males and females is Rs. 208,197 million, with Rs. 83,028 million as development costs and Rs. 125,169 million in recurrent expenses.

Table-24
Total Cost of Adult Literacy in Pakistan (in million)

	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	TOTAL
Punjab				
Development	8,925	17,303	18,169	44,398
Recurrent	13,456	26,087	27,392	66,935
Total	22,381	43,390	45,561	111,332
Sindh				
Development	3,558	7,022	7,262	17,842
Recurrent	5,364	10,586	10,948	26,898
Total	8,922	17,608	18,210	44,739
NWFP				
Development	2,384	4,678	5,402	12,465
Recurrent	3,594	7,053	8,145	18,791
Total	5,978	11,731	13,547	31,256
Balochistan				
Development	948	1,805	2,111	4,864
Recurrent	1,429	2,721	3,183	7,333
Total	2,377	4,526	5,294	12,197
Pakistan*				
Development	16,460	32,095	34,472	83,028
Recurrent	24,814	48,385	51,970	125,169
Total	41,274	80,443	86,443	208,197

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

Chapter # 6

***EARLY CHILDHOOD
EDUCATION***

6. EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION

According to the EFA goals of expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children, the study estimates the resource requirement of raising the present participation rate from 25% to 50%.

Table-25

ECE Enrolment by Gender and Location

	Benchmark (2002)	Target (2015/16)
Enrolments (000)		
Urban	542	1,519
- Male	310	780
- Female	232	739
Rural	1,835	2,485
- Male	1,137	1,284
- Female	698	1,201

Note: The population projections were obtained from NIPS.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

For urban areas, the total cost of reaching 50% participation rate for both boys and girls in early childhood education is Rs. 13,134 million for boys and Rs. 14,343 million for girls (Table 26).

Table-26
Total Cost (in Rs. m) of Early Childhood Education in Urban Areas

	Boys			Girls		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	218	481	711	222	476	695
Recurrent	214	1,354	3,326	217	1,342	3,294
Total	432	1,834	4,037	440	1,819	3,989
Sindh						
Development	231	381	483	269	437	533
Recurrent	231	1,255	2,745	269	1,451	3,129
Total	462	1,636	3,229	538	1,889	3,662
NWFP						
Development	19	54	49	35	79	84
Recurrent	17	135	308	33	215	496
Total	35	189	357	68	295	580
Balochistan						
Development	21	49	53	25	60	68
Recurrent	20	132	307	23	156	369
Total	40	180	360	48	216	436
Pakistan*						
Development	502	992	1,324	567	1,085	1,413
Recurrent	494	2,956	6,866	555	3,250	7,472
Total	996	3,949	8,189	1,123	4,335	8,885

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

For rural areas, the nature of population projections for the younger age groups has led to a wide gender difference in total costs of early childhood education: for boys, the total cost is Rs. 4,863 million while for girls it is Rs. 15,294 table-27.

Table-27
Total Cost (in Rs. m) of Early Childhood Education in Rural Areas

	Boys			Girls		
	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16
Punjab						
Development	18	112	325	231	504	642
Recurring	17	180	882	228	1,422	3,367
Total	35	292	1,207	459	1,926	4,009
Sindh						
Development	85	167	160	201	267	254
Recurring	84	490	1,058	204	1,008	1,956
Total	169	657	1,218	405	1,275	2,210
NWFP						
Development	13	55	10	114	220	153
Recurring	11	131	236	111	669	1,343
Total	24	186	247	225	889	1,496
Balochistan						
Development	23	49	23	58	107	88
Recurring	24	139	271	56	328	677
Total	47	188	294	114	435	765
Pakistan*						
Development	151	420	531	651	1,189	1,217
Recurring	143	1018	2,600	644	3,693	7,900
Total	294	1,438	3,131	1,295	4,881	9,117

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, Islamabad 2003

Table-28
Total Cost of Early Childhood Education in Pakistan

(in Million)

	2003-06	2006-11	2011-16	TOTAL
Punjab				
Development	691	1,576	2,378	4,645
Recurring	723	4,404	11,028	16,155
Total	1,414	13,406	5,980	20,800
Sindh				
Development	789	1,255	1,434	3,478
Recurring	839	4,288	8,984	14,111
Total	1,628	5,543	10,418	17,589
NWFP				
Development	181	410	297	888
Recurring	183	1,177	2,403	3,764
Total	364	1,587	2,701	4,652
Balochistan				
Development	128	266	233	626
Recurring	131	773	1,639	2,542
Total	259	1,038	1,872	3,168
Pakistan*				
Development	1,876	3,695	4,496	10,067
Recurring	1,962	11,163	25,138	38,262
Total	3,838	14,858	29,633	48,329

* Estimates for Pakistan include estimates for FATA and ICT.

Source: Financing of Education in Pakistan, UNESCO, 2003; Islamabad

Chapter # 7

***ROLE OF PRIVATE SECTOR
IN
THE DEVELOPMENT OF BASIC
EDUCATION***

7. ROLE OF PRIVATE SECTOR IN EXPANSION OF BASIC EDUCATION

Prior to 1972, privately managed educational institutions constituted a sizeable portion of the total education system. These institutions were administered and managed by voluntary organizations, and apart from generating their own funds through fees, attached property and donations, the institutions also received grant-in-aid from the government. Some private educational institutions earned a high reputation for the academic standards they maintained and for the quality of their public instruction.

In view of high rate in growth in population and ever expanding size of primary education sector, the government is seeking participation of private sector in making basic education accessible to all citizens of Pakistan. Population growth rate in Pakistan is higher than other developing countries and only about 50% of the existing primary age group children are presently in schools. In such a situation Government alone cannot provide all the educational facilities to its 100% population. Therefore the support of private sector is most needed to share this huge burden.

Recognizing this fact that the Government alone cannot achieve the desired objectives. It was imperative to seek political involvement of the private sector in the expansion of education system. The private sector needs to be assured that the educational institutions established by them in future will not be nationalized. Unless such an assurance is forthcoming, the private enterprise is most likely to remain shy of making any further investment in education.

Private sector in education has long been a major source of perpetual division and demarcation of privilege, status and esteem, power, opportunity and expectations that go with it. In the past, private sector played a very limited role as this was meant only for the elite's children. These institutions of private sector created a class system and were responsible for the division in a society. "The existing of private schooling with all its increments of status and complementary paraphernalia of quaint uniform, traditions, language and accent is amongst the most offensive means of perpetually imposing the division among society" (Kinnoch, 1981).

Private sector can provide a variety of choices to the parents. Local community, which runs the private institutions, can always play a definite important role in increasing the literacy rate if taken into confidence. The continued contribution of healthy independent sector towards the development of tomorrow's citizen is welcomed. People want variety and freedom of choice in all areas of life. In the sphere of education, parents choose particular schools for many different reasons. The right to exercise parental choice is key component of the society (Becker, 1987).

The National Education Policy (1992) stated that participation of the private sector in education development in Pakistan has a long history. Since 1947 to 1971, the private sector's contribution expanded considerably through a variety of non-governmental organizations. In 1991, the public to private sector ratio in education system was 70:30. If this trend continued, it is estimated, this ratio could easily touch the 50:50 ratio.

7.1 National Educational Policy 1998-2010

The following policy provisions/implementation strategy in respect of involvement of private sector in education was made:

1. There shall be regulatory bodies at the national / provincial levels to regulate activities and smooth functioning of privately managed schools and institutions of higher education through proper rules and regulations.
2. A reasonable tax rebate shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting-up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in aid for specific purposes shall be provided to private institutions. Setting up of private technical institutions shall be encouraged.
3. Matching grants shall be provided for establishing educational institutions by the private sector in the rural areas or poor urban areas through Education Foundations.
4. Existing institutions of higher learning shall be allowed to negotiate for financial assistance with donor agencies in collaboration with the Ministry of Education.
5. Educational institutions to be set up in the private sector shall be provided (a) plots in residential schemes on reserve prices, and (b) rebate on income tax, like industry.
6. In rural areas, schools shall be established through public-private partnership schemes. The government shall not only provide free land to build the school but shall also bear a reasonable proportion of the cost of construction and management.
7. Companies, with a paid-up capital of Rs. 100 million or more, shall be required under the law to establish and run educational institutions up to secondary level with funds provided by them.
8. Liberal loan facilities shall be extended to private educational institutions by financial institutions.

9. The private sector institutions at all levels shall be allowed to collaborate with international institutions of repute for achieving common academic objectives, subject to laws to be framed in this context.
10. Schools running on non-profit basis shall be exempted from all taxes.
11. Privately managed institutions shall be bound under law to admit, free of charge, at least 10% of the talented students belonging to the low-income groups.
12. Curricula of private institutions must conform to the principles laid down in the Federal Supervision of Curricula, Textbooks and Maintenance of Standards of Education Act, 1976.
13. The fee structure shall be developed in consultation with the government.
14. Selective de-nationalization of nationalized institutions shall be initiated.
15. The law pertaining to the setting-up of degree-awarding higher educational institutions and specialized institutes shall be liberalized. The institutions so established shall be placed under the University Grants Commission (now Higher Education Commission) for monitoring the academic programs and the award of degrees (National Education Policy 1998-2010, pp. 107-112).

7.2 Public Private Partnership

Private sector involvement in education is encouraging. The Federal Bureau of Statistics survey (1999-2000) indicates that there are 36,096 private educational institutions in Pakistan. About 61 percent of the institutions are in urban areas and 39 percent in rural areas. The percentage share of private sector in enrolment is 18 percent at primary school level, 16 percent at middle school level and 14 percent at high school level.

It has been observed that most of the private schools select their own curricula and textbooks, which are not in conformity with public schools. Majority of the schools are "English Medium" which attracts the parents for sending their children to these schools. Most of the schools are overcrowded and do not have adequate physical facilities. These schools are usually charging high fees from the students. Most of the schools are unregistered; therefore, in most cases the certificates issued by these institutions are not recognized by public schools. Majority of these institutions are functioning in the rented buildings.

The National Education Policy 1998-2010 proposed that there shall be regulatory bodies at the national and provincial levels to regulate activities and smooth functioning of privately managed schools and institutions of higher education through proper rules and regulations. A reasonable tax rebate shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in-Aid for specific purposes shall be provided to private institutions. Setting up of private technical institutions shall be encouraged. Matching grants shall be provided for establishing educational institutions by the private sector in the rural areas or poor urban areas through Education Foundation. In rural areas, schools shall be established through public-private partnership schemes. The government shall not only provide free land to build the school but also bear a reasonable proportion of the cost of construction and management. Liberal loan facilities shall be extended to private educational institutions by financial institutions.

Despite all shortcomings of private education mentioned above, Pakistan Integrated Household Survey indicates that enrolment rates in public schools have declined since 1995-96 particularly a large decline has been observed in rural areas. It is generally perceived by parents that quality of education in private schools is better than in public schools. Therefore, those parents who can afford, prefer to send their children to private schools. This trend indicates that the public education system is unable to meet public demand for providing quality education in the country.

Objectives of ESR Program

- Increasing access to quality education at all levels
- Improved service delivery through public private partnership.

Targets of ESR Program

5. Provision of incentive package for private sector
6. Involvement of private sector in the management of under utilized public sector institutions
7. Provision of grants and soft loans through restructured Education Foundations.
8. Adopt School Program
9. Community Participation Project (CPP) for school; up gradation in afternoon shifts from primary to middle/middle to secondary and higher secondary levels
10. Introduction of Information Technology courses in schools/colleges through private sector under public-private partnership.
11. Access to public funds – 25% utilization of funds at district level through CCB's and PTA's.

Achievements of ESR Program

- Enabling environment for private sector participation
- Private sector incentive package approved by Federal Cabinet
- 6240 schools upgraded through Public Private Partnerships in Punjab and NWFP with 60.7% girls schools having 60,000 students.
- Computer Education introduced in more than 4000 secondary schools through Public Private Partnership.
- National Education Foundation (NEF) destructed; Ordinance promulgated. Provincial Education Foundations are in the process of restructuring
- 8000 Teachers trained in IT by INTEL Corporation
- SMC's /PTAs provided legal cover through CCBs for school improvement and local governance.

7.3 Expansion of Private Sector

The following table shows clear picture of enrolment growth rate in private schools in Pakistan.

Table-29
Enrolment growth rate

Stages	Growth 2000-2002			Growth 2002-2004		
	Boys	Girls	Total	Boys	Girls	Total
Nursery	11	11	11	15	11	13
Primary	17	11	14	15	10	13
Middle	14	12	13	12	13	12
High	14	18	15	22	9	18
Higher secondary	8	26	13	20	25	21
Total	16	12	14	15	11	13

Source: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, *National Sample Survey of private school, 2004.*

The above table-29 indicates that enrolment growth rate at primary level was 14% in years 2000-2002 and 13% in years 2004. At middle level it was 13% in year 2000-2002 and 12% in year 2004 respectively. Enrolment growth rate at secondary level was 15% in 2000-2004, which increased up to 18% in 2004. In the same way at higher secondary level it increased from 13% in 2002 to 21% in year 2004, whereas, the overall enrolment growth was 14% in 2000-2004 and 13% in 2004 respectively.

7.4 Enrolment Growth rate in Public Sector

Enrolment growth rate of the public sector was calculated on the basis of data provided by the NEMIS, which is presented in the following table-10.

Table-30
Enrolment Growth rate of the public sector

Stage	2001-2002	2002-2003	Growth
Primary	11,989,594	12,416,644	4
Middle	2,863,922	2,912,974	2
High	1,243,431	1,241,633	0
Higher Sec	80,686	90,584	12
Total	16,177,633	16,661,835	3

Source: *Academy of Educational Planning and Management: National Sample Survey of private school 2004)*

Table indicates that overall enrolment growth rate was 3% in the public sector during 2002-2003. However at primary level it was 4% and at higher secondary level enrolment growth rate was 12%.

7.5 Quality of Education in Private Sector

Private sector is producing quality of education in the country. The Academy of Educational Planning and Management conducted a learning achievement study. The focus of the study was to assess the learning achievement of grade five students studying in both public and private schools in Pakistan. For this study, 12 districts from all over the country were selected. From each district 12 primary schools (8 government and 4 private schools) were randomly selected and from each school 20 students studying in 5th class were also randomly picked for testing. The total sample of this study consisted of 3442 (1943 boys and 1499 girls). Standardized tests based on national curricula were designed from the textbooks published by Provincial Textbook Boards for class 1-4. The tests were developed in consultation with the Provincial Governments in Mathematics, Science and Language (Urdu). The test for each subject consisted of 25 items. The study was aimed at assessing learning achievement of grade-5 students of both public and private schools in Mathematics, Science and Language (Urdu). Comparative analysis of public and private in producing quality of education are given below:

Table-31
Grade-wise Distribution of Composite Scores by School Type

Grade	Public			Private			Total		
	Mean	%	Standard Deviation	Mean	%	Standard Deviation	Mean	%	Standard Deviation
A1: Excellent	84	8	4	85	15	5	85	10	4
A: Very Good	74	14	3	75	15	3	74	15	3
B: Good	64	21	3	65	26	3	65	23	3
C: Satisfactory	52	29	4	53	31	4	52	29	4
D: Poor	39	18	3	40	10	3	39	15	3
F: Fail	24	10	7	27	3	6	24	8	7
National	55	100	17	62	100	16	57	100	17

Source: Comparing school performance to understand which schools are doing better by assessing and comparing quality of education (2004 P-30)

The data in above table-31 shows that the mean percentage composite score was 57 (57% questions correctly answered). Half of the students of both sectors got A1, A and B grades, 29% students of both sectors scored grade C, whereas 24% students achieved grade D and F. Comparing the data of the public and private sectors it was observed that the scores of 56% students of private sector fall in category A1, A and B, whereas 43% students of public sector achieved the same grades.

The comparison of the performance of both public and private sector is presented in the following table-32.

Table-32

Average Percentage Composites Score by School Type

District	Public	Private	Total	P.Value	Rank
Islamabad	54	54	54	1.000	6.5
Multan	63	63	63	0.944	3
Attock	53	55	54	0.153	6.5
Bhakker	64	65	65	0.636	2.5
Thatta	48	68	54	0.000	6.5
Khairpur	64	67	65	0.141	2.5
Khuzdar	41	46	43	0.026	8
Zhob	59	51	57	0.000	5
D.I.Khan	59	76	65	0.000	2.5
Kohistan	47	62	52	0.000	5
Khyber Agency	48	54	50	0.002	7
FR Kohat	66	75	69	0.000	1
Gilgit	56	70	61	0.000	4
Rawlakot	50	60	54	0.000	6.5
National	55	62	57	0.000	

Source: Comparing school performance to understand which schools are doing better by assessing and comparing quality of education (2004 P-31)

The scores reported in the above table-32 indicate that there was no significant difference of mean in public and private schools in districts of Islamabad, Multan, Attock, Bhakkar and Khairpur. However, significant difference was observed in districts of D. I. Khan, Kohistan, Gilgit, Thatta, Zhob, Rawalakot and FR Kohat. The students of F.R. Kohat achieved the highest average scores followed by students of D. I. Khan Bhakkar, and Khairpur. The students of the Khuzdar remained the lowest scorers in the composite scores. A significant difference was found in the performance of public and private sector at national level.

Chapter # 8

EDUCATION FOR ALL

8. EDUCATION FOR ALL (EFA) PERSPECTIVE

Discussing the significance of education, Bhatia (1985) cited that Aristotle viewed as "educated men are as much superior to uneducated as the living are to the dead". It is universally accepted that education is a concomitant of all human societies. Considering the importance of education for mankind, a world forum consisting of UN agencies, World Bank and NGOs joined hands and a World Conference on Education for All was held in Jomtien, Thailand, in March 1990. All the nations of the world adopted a world declaration on "Education For All." The declaration included that "education is a fundamental right for all people; women and men of all ages, throughout our world" (World Conference on Education for All, 1990). It declared that every one, irrespective of religion, race and gender, has a right to get education. The following six goals of EFA (1990) were framed and agreed upon by the nations of the world.

- i) Expansion of early childhood care and developmental activities... especially for poor, disadvantaged and disabled children
- ii) Universal access to, and completion of primary education (or whatever higher level of education is considered as "basic") by the year 2000.
- iii) Improvement in learning achievement such that an agreed percentage of an appropriate age cohort (e.g., 80 percent of 14 year-olds) attains or surpasses a defined level of necessary learning achievement.
- iv) Reduction of the adult illiteracy rate (the appropriate age group to be determined in each country) to, say, one-half of its 1990 level by the year 2000, with sufficient emphasis on female literacy to significantly reduce the current disparity between male and female illiteracy rates.
- v) Increased acquisition by individuals and families, of the knowledge, skills and values required for better living and sound sustainable development, made available through all education channels including the mass media, other forms of modern and traditional communication, and social action, with effectiveness assessed in terms of behavioral change.

Since 1990, UNESCO assumed a leading role to facilitate governments of a number of developing countries to move forward to achieve EFA goals. In April 2000, world Education Forum organized EFA assessment conference in Dakar, Senegal. The targets achieved over the decade were reviewed and shortfalls were analyzed. Nations of the world reminded and reiterated their commitment to EFA.

According to World Education Forum Dakar (2000) " Education is a fundamental human right. It is the key to sustainable development, peace and stability within and among countries, and thus an indispensable means for effective participation in the societies and economies of the twenty-first century, which are affected by rapid globalization. Achieving EFA goals may not be postponed any more. The basic learning needs of all can and must be met as a matter of urgency" (The Dakar Framework for Action, 2000).

The forum reiterated that everyone has a fundamental right to get education. Education is prerequisite for sustainable development of countries. Education is indispensable that cannot be avoided; educational facilities should be provided to all, otherwise globalization would be vulnerable. According to Dakar framework for Action, all representatives of the participating countries committed themselves to the attainment of the following six goals:

- i) Expanding and improving comprehensive early child care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.
- ii) Ensure that by 2015 all children, particularly girls in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to compulsory primary education of good quality.
- iii) Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skill programmes.
- iv) Achieving 50 percent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
- v) Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.
- vi) Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all, so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

The goals determined in the Dakar Declaration 2000, are very important and challenging. Stressing the provisions for ECCE, universal free and compulsory primary education, adult literacy, eliminating gender disparity, the declaration required improvements in the quality of education. There are many aspects of quality of education related to school teachers, textbooks, curriculum, teacher training and family factors.

EFA National Plan of Action (NPA) has been developed through broad-based consultations with principal actors of EFA and all stakeholders. Education Sector Reforms (2001-02 – 2005-06) aimed at the development of education sector as a whole with a special focus of EFA goals, served as foundation of the NPA. Allocations of Rs. 1.574 Billion with additional Rs. 2.00 Billion in the current financial year for ESR implementation over and above the regular budget, despite economic difficulties, is a clear expression of political will and government commitment of Education for All.

The planning framework of National Plan of Action (NPA) are the six EFA goals as stated in the Dakar Framework For Action. The main objectives of NPA interalia are (i) to reach the disadvantaged population groups in rural and urban areas with emphasis on girls and women, (ii) to promote community participation and ownership of basic education programs at the grassroots, and (iii) to improve relevance and quality of basic education through enhancing learning achievements of the children, youth and adults. The sector-wise order of priorities of the plan are Primary Education, Adult Literacy and Early Childhood Education.

Separate plan for each EFA sector/area was developed and integrated into a consolidated plan. Each plan covers three main aspects/components of project cycle i.e. planning, implementation and monitoring/evaluation. The NPA has been developed within a sustainable and well-integrated sector framework clearly linked to poverty alleviation and development strategies. It aims at forging a link between basic education and skills development.

8.1 National EFA Plan Goals and Targets:

Population projections of the National Institute of Population Studies quoted the population of primary age group (5-9) to be 17.9 million. This number may rise to 19.6 million in 2005 and remaining almost constant for few years, will decline to 17.5 million in the last year of the plan. Net participation rate will increase from the existing 66% to 100% by the last year of the plan. UPE target for males would be achieved by the year 2010 and in case of females by 2015. Additional year-wise enrolment target of 0.4: 0.7: 0.9 and 0.7 million for the first 5 years of the plan have been fixed. 8250 new primary schools will be constructed to accommodate the above additional enrolment. Physical facilities of 100,000 primary schools will be upgraded along with introduction of double shifts (2006-2010) and (2011-2015) in existing primary schools and opening of new primary schools in private sector. During the 2nd and 3rd phase of the plan more schools in

public sector may not be needed. However up-gradation of primary schools to middle level would be regular feature of the plan.

Population of 10+age group is likely to increase from the existing 101 million to 146 million by the end of the plan (2015). Literacy rate is planned to increase from existing 49% to 86% in next 15 years. Around 81 million population of 10+ age group will become literate during the plan period (2000-15). The innovative approaches and programs should be initiated to meet the targets.

Early Childhood Education is the third priority of NPA. The benchmark population 3-5 year age group is 8.1 million. It may continuously decline due to reduced population growth rate. By the end of the Plan (2015), it may drop to 7.2 million. The plan has to provide ECE to at least half of the said age group population raising the net participation rate from existing 25% to 50% by 2015. To accommodate these children, around 2500 ECE centers/classes in the selected primary schools in public sector and 1500 centers in private sector will be opened during each year of the Plan (kindly reword this statement as there is no evidence on this in the public sector and anecdotal estimates only in private sector).

Quality improvement and school effectiveness are the key elements of the Plan. The main quality inputs interalia, include reforms in curricula (focusing on basic learning needs of child, youth, adolescent and adult) textbook development, teachers training and literacy curriculum. An improved system of examination/assessment i.e. National Education Assessment System (NEAS) will be introduced. Besides, pre-primary education (ECE), programs will be initiated as part of efforts to improve achievement of pupils at primary education level.

Sector-wise estimated cost will be Rs. 202 billion for Primary Education, Rs. 180 billion for adult literacy and Rs. 48 billion for ECE. The total cost worked out to be Rs. 430 billion. Out of it Rs. 178 billion is estimated to be provided through the country's own resources and the gap of Rs. 252 billion may be provided by international development partners, bilateral and multilateral agencies as per Dakar commitment.

8.2 EFA Planning and Capacity Building:

It was strongly felt that capacity building of provinces and districts is one of the urgent needs for EFA planning, implementation and monitoring/evaluation particularly for district based planning and management under the new system and structure. In order to fulfill this need following measures have been undertaken:

8.3 EFA Planning and Capacity Building at Provincial Level

In order to build the capacity of provinces and prepare provincial EFA plans of action following steps have been completed.

- Orientation/awareness workshops/meetings were held in all the four provinces and federating units in the first instance.
 - EFA communication and media campaign launched for awareness, creation and mobilization resources.
 - A national training/capacity building workshop on Education for All was held in Islamabad with an objective to train master trainers for training of EDO Education, EDO Literacy, Nazims and other concerned. The said workshop was held in Islamabad on July 2003. The participants of the workshop were drawn from the provinces and federating units. Group of master trainers from the respective province federating unit, by apply the skills and competencies imparted during the workshop prepared draft plan in all the three areas of EFA i.e. Primary Education, Adult Literacy and Early Childhood Education for respective province/area. Finally the participants were given training to write/describe the plan. Through this training, the master trainers not only learned theoretical concepts and fundamentals of planning but also prepared draft plans and described/wrote the plans. It was termed as one of the most successful and effective workshop on EFA Planning.
 - Master trainers trained in National Capacity Building Workshop were assigned the task of training/capacity building of provincial and district planners, managers and other concerned. Furthermore, to improve the provincial/federating unit draft plans prepared in National Workshop in consultation with Province and districts, a series of training workshops were held at provincial headquarters.
 - All the four provinces i.e. Punjab, NWFP, Sindh and Balochistan have prepared the EFA plans in consultation with provincial EFA forums, Provincial Education Departments and others concerned.
 - As a next step, these plans will be discussed in the respective provincial assemblies, finalized and launched.
-

8.4 District EFA Plans:

Subsequently training workshops for preparation of district EFA plans were held in the provinces to train the district officials and other concerned in EFA planning, monitoring and evaluation. This program was started in August, 2003 and completed in October, 2003. In N.W.F.P province, two such workshops were conducted at Peshawar covering 12 districts. In Punjab first workshops were conducted at Lahore, Rawalpindi/Islamabad and Multan covering all the 34 district. For Sindh province also three workshops were conducted at Quetta. The participants/trainees of these workshops were Executive District Education Officers and Executive District Officers Literacy, nazims, NGOs representatives and other concerned. Draft district EFA plans were prepared by the participants of the respective districts under the guidance of training team. The participants were given the task to finalize the plan in consultation with district EFA forums and others concerned. At present, 20 districts of Punjab, all the 16 districts of Sindh, all the 24 districts of NWFP, all the 5 districts of FANA, all the 7 districts of AJK and 4 districts of Balochistan have prepared the draft EFA plans. These plans may be discussed and approved by the district assembly and district Nazims, for full-scale implementation.

8.5 Sub-district /Tehsil Level EFA Planning

Ministry of Education adopted a different approach i.e. "bottom up EFA planning approach" in district Chakwal (Model District). In the said district after giving orientation and training, data/statistics and other related information on EFA were collected from the households, educational institutions, NGOs and private sector. These statistics pertain to the core indicators of primary education; adult literacy and early childhood education in terms of population enrolment, out of school children, illiterates, causes and factors of low participation rate and dropout etc. etc. Based on the data/statistics so collected sub-district/tehsil EFA plans of all the three tehsils of district Chakwal i.e. tehsil Chakwal, tehsil Choasaiden Shah and Talagang have been prepared in consultation with tehsil EFA forum, councilors, nazims and others concerned. These plans will be discussed and approved by respective tehsil assembly before the same are launched for implementation.

8.6 Union Council level EFA Planning

As mentioned above we have successfully completed union council EFA planning exercise, through the bottom up approach. Union council EFA plans of all the sixty-eight union councils of district Chakwal have been prepared in consultation with union councilors and union Nazims. These plans are based on the actual data/facts and figures collected from the households and institutions.

These union council, tehsil and district Chakwal Model Plans will be shared with other districts of the county to be adopted as model district planning approach.

EFA Forums and EFA Units Established

Effective Coordination in EFA planning, implementation and monitoring/evaluation has been given vital importance almost at all levels. It emerged from the strong realization that unless and until all principal EFA actors and stakeholders are effectively involved at each stage, the achievement of EFA goals and targets may not be possible.

To achieve EFA goals and targets, EFA Forums at national, provincial, district and local levels have been established. The EFA Forum is a representative body of the Government, Civil Society, Private Schools, Deeni Madaris, Media, Support Organizations and Communities. The functions of EFA Forum interalia include Coordination, Awareness Raising, Planning, Collection and Dissemination of Information, Monitoring, Resource Mobilization, Political Support and Capacity Building etc.

8.7 International Development Partners EFA Forum

EFA Partners (UNESCO, UNICEF, UNFPA, UNDP and world Bank) in Pakistan have set up EFA International Development Partners Forum (INDPF) comprising all the development partners including bi-lateral and multilateral agencies and international NGOs and INGOs. Coordination and Resource Mobilization for EFA would be the main function of INDPF.

EFA units at national, provincial and district levels will provide a platform to the respective forum for effective coordination and monitoring/evaluation of EFA activities and programs at respective level.

8.8 Implementation Status:

Primary education:

In EFA Primary Education has been assigned top priority. Universalization of Primary Education (UPE) in terms of universal enrolment/access, universal retention/completion and universal achievement latest by 2010 in case of boys and 2015 in case of girls is the avowed goal and target of national, provincial and district EFA plans.

New programmes and actions initiated to achieve the UPE target interalia include; opening of primary schools; both formal and non-formal establishment of community primary schools in FATA, FANA, AJK and ICT; rehabilitation of existing primary schools; provision of missing facilities in existing schools; provision of incentives to deserving children in the form of free text-books, uniform, stipends, food and nutrition etc; enrolment drive launched by provincial education departments, National Commission for Human Development, International Development Partners, NGOs and INGOs; UPE programme launched by UNICEF in twenty selected districts focusing on girls enrolment; and enactment and enforcement of compulsory primary education act in phased manner.

Punjab Education Department under Punjab ESR Program (PESRP) has taken a major step towards UPE by initializing a 3-year programme for educational development at a total cost of 21.7 billion rupees with current year allocation of 7.2 billion. Major part of this budget will be spent on primary education for provision of missing facilities, provision of free text-books, stipends to girls, restructuring of Punjab Education Foundation, teachers training, capacity building and activation of school councils, awareness campaign; and strengthening of EMIS.

The target of 73% net participation rate under ESR/EFA plan of action for primary education was set. Achievement in terms of net participation rate could not be assessed due to non-availability of data/statistics. However, gross enrolment at primary level (I-V) is estimated to be 83%.

Declining population growth rate; high intake rate in grade 1; increased enrolment in primary classes (I-V); reduced dropout rate (from 50% to 35% to); increased allocations for primary education (more than 50% budget of education sector is allocated for primary education); and adequate infrastructure (around 200,000 institutions including Formal Primary Schools, Masjid Maktab Schools, Primary Sections of Middle and Secondary Schools, Deeni Madaris, Private Sector Schools and Non-formal Basic Education Schools catering to the needs of primary age group children) are the achievements and strengths of primary Education in Pakistan. Whereas, a large number of out of school (more than 6 million) children; gender and area disparities; lack of effective community participation; deteriorating quality of education and shortage of required funds are some of the lacking and weaknesses of the system which need to be addressed on priority basis.

Chapter # 9

*CONCLUSIONS
AND
RECOMMENCTIONS*

9. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

9.1 Access to Basic Education

- a. Lack of access to basic education, is the foremost of all issues. Statistics clearly indicate not only primary enrolment rates are generally low, but wide disparities exist in enrolments across provinces, genders and locations (urban vs. rural). Besides these, the tribal, ethnic and minority groups are deprived of access to education.
- b. Apart from access, the quality of education is very poor, especially in the public sector and rural areas. A dilapidated infrastructure, lack of proper facilities, irrelevant curricula, etc., along with untrained teaching staff, staff absenteeism, paucity of books and teaching aids adversely affect the quality of education. This results in low levels of learning achievement, and wastage of resources through grade repetitions, and high drop-out rates. Majority of boys and girls could not be enrolled in the schools because of:
 - i) Expensive education
 - ii) Non-availability of schools
 - iii) Remote schools and Less conveyance to remote schools
 - iv) No facility for further education
 - v) Providing help at home
 - vi) Teachers' harsh behaviour

9.2 Reasons of dropout:

The reasons for leaving school during the academic year were:

- a) Expensive education
- b) Lack of parents' interest
- c) Large family size
- d) Security problems
- e) Non availability of good teachers
- f) Harsh behaviour of teachers and corporal punishment.

9.3 Lack of Community Participation:

The participation of local communities at the grassroot level is key to the success of basic education programs, especially in the rural areas. This participation has been lacking in the countryside, where parents and communities neither

understand the value of education nor contribute to it in any way. The recent non-formal basic education (NFBE) program, which focuses on girls' education, requires active community involvement. The "home school" based on accommodation provided by the community, and the setting up of parent-teacher associations and village education communities ensure regular participation and monitoring by the parents, and other village influentials.

9.4 Control of Federal Government

According to the constitution, education is a provincial subject. The public education delivery structure is based on a multi-tier system, with provincial Education Secretary being the executive head. It slips down through district and tehsil levels, to the village level. The red tapism and frequent transfer of teachers, which seriously affect the working of schools. More importantly an overly centralized management, hampers effective day to day administration of local schools.

9.5 The Social Action Program

The Social Action Programm (SAP) focused on the improvement of access, and quality of education. To encourage girls' enrolment, some provinces had revised their recruitment rules for teachers, allowing experienced female teachers to resume job even after a gap in service. Some provinces had even lowered the qualification requirements for female teachers, besides giving them extra financial incentives.

Social Action Plan focused on achieving improved governance through decentralization. More powers with the local authorities would also require better standards of monitoring, which can be achieved through active participation of school committees, comprising parents, teachers and other local leaders.

9.6 Financial Constraints

The public resource base for education has not broadened over the past decade except, some misallocation of funds i.e., unusually low amounts were spent on primary education against higher amounts on universities and professional colleges. In addition, a recent survey has revealed the issue of "ghost schools" i.e., schools which only exist on paper, and cause huge losses to the exchequer.

Viewed in the backdrop of the present economic constraints, it is not possible to substantially increase the allocation to education, or other social services. However, it would be practical to curtail investments in mortar and bricks, use the available infrastructure, and re-allocate funds by increasing user charges, in tertiary education (university and professional colleges), to cross-subsidize primary education.

However, in the face of financial constraints, the public sector can not tackle the issue alone. There is a need for community involvement and participation of the non-government sector, to strengthen the education system, especially in the rural and deprived areas.

9.7 Lack of Incentives for Private Sector/NGO Participation

Although the private/non-government sector, has participated well in the provision of basic education, yet most of its investments are concentrated in the urban sector. Survey data shows that 65% of private schools are located in urban areas.

In the early 1990s, Education Foundations were established in the provinces, which announced matching contributions to private investors. Other kinds of fiscal incentives, such as tax exemptions to investments in rural schools, etc. are needed; but more importantly, the provision of physical facilities e.g., electricity, safety, water, sanitation, telecommunications, etc. is needed which would improve the quality of rural life and attract private investors.

Recommendations

Based on some major issues, which have emerged, the Study recommends the following:

1) **Budgetary Allocation to Education**

The major issue in education in Pakistan is low financial public sector investment. Although education enjoys the highest priority on the social sector agenda, yet allocations are not provided according to the requirements. It is strange to note that in the federal and provincial budgets, public sector allocations to education have steadily declined over the past five years from 2.7% of GDP in 1995-97 to 1.8% of GDP in 2001-2002. It is, therefore, recommended that all efforts should be made to enhance the budgetary allocation to education to 4% of GDP as recommended UNESCO for developing countries. In addition, innovative approaches should be adopted to generate additional resources for increasing funds for the education sector, especially to

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Academy of Educational Planning and Management (1989). Involvement of Private Sector in the Promotion of Primary Education in Pakistan-Islamabad.
 2. Academy of Educational Planning and Management, (1998). Role of Private Sector in Expansion of Education: a pilot study- Islamabad.
 3. Academy of Educational Planning and Management, (1999) Pakistan School Education Statistics 1997-98, Ministry of Education, Islamabad.
 4. Akbar, M. (1998), Role of Private Sector in Expansion of Primary Education in Rawalpindi City, (Unpublished), M.Phil Thesis, AIOU, Islamabad.
 5. Ansari, Z.A., Tariq, P.N., & Iftikhar, M. (1990) Educational ability test level-5: Development and validation. National Institute of Psychology & Center of Excellence, Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad, PP.7-11
 6. Ayub Fozia (2001). A study of measuring student achievement in relation to parents' involvement. Thesis: master in education. Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi.
 7. Bhattai Ahmad Mukhtar (1986) "Primary Education improvement" desired measures, NEC, Islamabad.
 8. Butt Reheela (2000) An investigation into the Factors of low enrolment Ratio of Girls in Elementary schools of Rawalpindi district, Thesis of Philosophy in Education, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.
 9. Chaudhary Nuzhat P. and Attaullah Chaudhary (1988). Incentives for rural female students in Pakistan. BRIDGES Harvard University.
 10. Deardon, R.F. (1968). The Philosophy of Primary Education, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, P.3, 60.
 11. Donld, P. W. and F.Reimers, (1995). Hope or Despair, Learning in Pakistan's Primary Schools, Praeger, London, P.2-3.
 12. Encyclopedia of National Systems of Education Second Edition Pergamon New York, P.751-758.
 13. Farooq Sitwat. (2003). The impact of teacher's characteristics on learning achievement of students at primary level in Rawalpindi District. (Unpublished Thesis) of Master level of Fatima Jinnah University Rawalpindi.
 14. Ghafoor Abdul & Islamuddin Baloch (1990). Relationship between five-year schooling and literacy status on parents. - Academy of education Planning and Management, Literacy and Mass education Commission, Islamabad.
-

15. Ghafoor Abdul, (1990) "Primary Education of the girl child in Pakistan" AEPAM, Islamabad.
16. Ghafoor, A. and Farooq, R.A. (1994). Education System in Pakistan.
17. Government of Pakistan (1992). National Education Policy; 1992, Islamabad. Ministry of Education, p.16-19.
18. Government of Pakistan (1998) Pakistan: Increasing Private Sector Participation in Financing Middle School Education, Ministry of Education, Islamabad, p.53, 54.
19. Government of Pakistan (1999) Economic Survey 1998-99, Finance Division, Islamabad. p.114-115.
20. Government of Pakistan, (2000) Economic Survey of Pakistan 1999-2000, Finance Division, Islamabad. p.139-141.
21. Government of Pakistan, Finance Division, Pakistan Economic Survey (1983-84), Islamabad, 1984.
22. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education (1999) "The National Education Policy 1998-2010" Islamabad.
23. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education 2004 "Education Sector Reform Action Plan 2001-02, 2005-06, Islamabad.
24. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, National Education Policy 1979 Islamabad.
25. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, National Plan of Action on Education For All (2001-2015), Pakistan" Islamabad 2003.
26. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, UNESCO, (2001) Report National Conference on Education for All, Islamabad.
27. Government of Pakistan. Eighth Five-Year Plan (1993-98), p.306, 309.
28. Government of Pakistan. Eighth Five-Year Plan, May 1998. p.7.
29. Government of Pakistan. Ministry of Education. Education Advisory Board – Presentation, July 2000. pp.53-54.
30. Government of Pakistan. Ministry of Education. The National Education Policy, 1972-80.
31. Government of Pakistan. National Education Conference: working paper, 1979. p.54.
32. Haq, M. & Haq, K.(1998). Human Development in South Asia. Oxford University Press, Karachi, pp.77

33. Khan et al (2003) A Study on Assessing Visual-Graphics Literacy in Newly Established District Governments in Pakistan, Collaboration with JICA, Islamabad.
 34. Khan et al (2004) A study on Access and Equity in Basic Education, Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad.
 35. Khan et al (2004) A study on Comparing School Performance to understand which Schools are doing better by Assessing and Comparing quality of Education, Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad.
 36. Khan, Habib et al., (2000). Measuring learning achievement at primary level in Pakistan. Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education, Islamabad.
 37. Laeeq Ahmad Khan, Prof. "The Challenge of Basic Education in Pakistan" Islamabad 1991.
 38. McGinn Noel et al. Do difference between schools and between administrators in Pakistan Contribute to the differences in student achievement? Harvard University, BRIDGES Project (1989).
 39. McGinn Noel, Fernando Reimers, and Donald P. Warwick. How do public primary schools in Pakistan differ across provinces? BRIDGES Harvard University.
 40. Ministry of Education & Save the Children, "A report of the Education For All 2000, Islamabad.
 41. MSU. (1995). Determinants of Primary Students' Achievement- National Survey Results (table 2.1). Multi-Donor Support Unit for the Social Action programme, Islamabad.
 42. Mukhtar Eshaya Mujahid Dr. UNESCO, "Female Teachers in Rural Schools".
 43. Mukhtar, Eshaya Mujahid Dr. UNESCO, 1999, "Basic Education in Pakistan.
 44. Qaisrani, (1989), Involvement of Private Sector in the Development of Primary Education in Pakistan, Ministry of Education, Islamabad p.1-3.
 45. Rugh, B.A., Malik, ET AL., (1991). Teaching practices to increase student achievement: Evidence from Pakistan. BRIDGES Research Report No. 8, pp.11) Harvard Institute for International Development, Cambridge, MA, USA.
 46. Savas, E.S. 1987. Privatization: The Key to Better Government, New Jersey: Chatham House Publishers, Inc. p.80.
 47. Shah, M.H. (1984). National Achievement Test: Report on workshop for protocol analysis, Islamabad, Ministry of Education, Primary and Non-formal Education Wing.
-

48. Shami P.A., Kh. Sabir Hussain (2004) National Sample Survey of Private School: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad.
49. The World Bank (1996), Improving Basic Education in Pakistan: Population and Resource Division, p.v, 8-15.
50. UNESCO (2000) "Education for All 2000 Assessment country report Pakistan" Islamabad.
51. UNESCO " (1999) Basic Education and Pakistan". Progress on EFA Targets Dimension in 1990s. A Background Study, Islamabad.
52. UNESCO. (2001). Learning Achievement in primary Schools of Pakistan: A Quest for Quality Education.
53. UNESCO, Ministry of Education, "Education for All 2000 Assessment Country Report" Pakistan.
54. UNESCO, Ministry of Education, "Education for All" Islamabad 2001.
55. UNESCO. (2000) Education for All 2000 Assessment, Country Report Pakistan, Bangkok, Thailand.
56. Walford, Geoffrey 1990. Privatization and Privilege in Education, Roultege, London, p.81-83.
57. Warwick, D.P., Riemers F. (1991). Good Schools and Poor Schools in Pakistan. Harvard Institute for International Development, Cambridge, Mass, USA.
58. Warwick, D.P., Riemers F. (1992). Teacher training in Pakistan: Value added or money wasted? Harvard Institute for International Development, Cambridge, Mass, USA.